CHARM Association

Explorations in Globalization and Glocalization: Marketing History through the Ages

Proceedings of the 18th Biennial Conference on Historical Analysis and Research in Marketing (CHARM)

Liverpool John Moores University, Liverpool, England, U.K.

June 1 – 4, 2017

Program Chair
Richard A. Hawkins
University of Wolverhampton

Local Arrangements Chair
David Clampin
Liverpool John Moores University

Proceedings Editor
Ann-Marie Kennedy
University of Canterbury
# Table of Contents

CHARM Milestones .................................................. i
Past Winners of the Stanley C. Hollander Best Paper Award .................. ii
Past Winners of the David D. Monieson Best Student Paper Award .......... ii
2017 CHARM Sponsors and Acknowledgements .................................. iii
2017 CHARM Conference Committee ........................................... iii
CHARM Association Board of Directors ........................................ iv
2017 CHARM Manuscript Reviewers ........................................... v

## Conference Program

Full Papers ........................................................................ 1

* These papers have been nominated for the David D. Monieson Best Student Paper Award

** These papers have been nominated for the Stanley C. Hollander Best Paper Award

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>A History of the Brand Management System</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Isabelle Aimé, Fabienne Berger-Remy, Marie-Eve Laporte</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The courting of advertisers: The self-advertising of the Swedish press and its depiction of gendered and classed market segments, 1880-1939</td>
<td>17</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Klara Arnberg</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Archiving the Archives: The World’s Collections of Historical Advertisements and Marketing Ephemera**</td>
<td>32</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fred K. Beard</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Black in the Game: Black Male Models, U.S. Advertising, and Changing Culture**</td>
<td>49</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Blaine J. Branchik; Judy Foster Davis; Erika L. Paulson</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A Postmodern History of Internet Advertising Part I**</td>
<td>66</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lilly Anne Buchwitz</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Staying in the Community but Leaving the Union</td>
<td>88</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Jack Bunce and Neil Bendle</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>“Don’t Blame the Shopkeeper!!”: How Food, Drink and Confectionary Brands’ Advertising Dealt with Shortages and British Government Control of the Market During the Second World War</td>
<td>107</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mick Hayes</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Making and Marketing a Canadian Art Icon: Tom Thomson</td>
<td>131</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Leighann C. Neilson</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Vanishing Kyoto Textiles - Effect of The Kimono Business on Kyoto Textiles from 1949 to 2000</td>
<td>140</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Keiko Okamoto</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Selling the concept of brands. The Swedish advertising industry and branding in the 1920’s
Elin Åström Rudberg

Visualizing Winchester: A Brand History Through Iconic Images
Terrence H. Witkowski

“The Greatest Leaders in Extension Work”: The Role of Extension Work in Developing Rural Female Consumers in Early 20th Century New York
Mary Ellen Zuckerman

Extended Abstracts

How to sell Nuclear Energy to the public in the 1950s
Maria Elena Aramendia-Muneta, Joseba De la Torre, Maria del Mar Rubio-Varas

Signaling to Market Baroque Merchant Books
Klaus Brockhoff

The role of universal expositions in the diffusion process of three innovative technologies in France: 1867-1937
Marie Carpenter, Patrick Luciano

Cunard across the Atlantic, an ‘impeccable British service’. Selling the Britishness of shipping lines, c.1893 to c.1969
David Clampin

Office Space: Organising the Australian Advertising Agency in the 20th Century
Robert Crawford

Consumer Ethnocentrism and Consumer Animosity: A Literature Review
Maya F. Farah, Nour Mehdi

Marketing for Immigrants: the Case of Argentina
Karen F. A. Fox

The Changing Focus of Marketing: The Application of Maslow’s Model of Needs to the Analysis of Cunard Advertising Between 1910 and 1940
Graham P. Gladden

Motor Town Wolverhampton: The Rise and Fall of the Sunbeam Brand, 1888-1935
Richard A. Hawkins

Accidental Marketers: The Product Orientation of Early Christianity
Mick Jackowski, Clayton Daughtrey, Jeffrey Lewis

Marketing Ancient Histories in the Early Modern World
Freyja Cox Jensen

The Mouse That Roared: Cyclecars versus the Ford Model T
D.G. Brian Jones, Alan J. Richardson, Mark Tadajewski

Assembling the Ethnic Identity in the Early Modern Ottoman Society through Clothing Consumption
Eminegül Karababa
The Apparently Endless Nature of Endless Chain Schemes
William W. Keep, Peter Vander Nat

Apples to Apples: Corporate Diversification and Trademark Troubles
Steven W. Kopp

A Very Special Relationship – the Government and the Advertising Industry in Sweden 1935 to 1990
Erik Lakomaa

History of US Product Safety and Sustainability Activities
Marilyn Liebrenz-Himes, Robert F. Dyer

A Consumer Cooperative between Market and Stakeholder Orientations: The Case of Coop Atlantique, 1912-2016
Bruno Mazieres, Magali Boespflug

A Model of Historical Analysis for Solving Marketing Problems
Anthony J. McMullan

Gift Rituals and Nationalism of Wartime Japan
Yuko Minowa, Russell W. Belk

Refashioning the Femme Fatale in Vogue, 1892-1900
Yuko Minowa, Pauline MacKaran, Lorna Stevens

Conservation and Consumerism: Commercialising the National Trust in the 1960s
Sean Nixon

On the Road with Disney: Standard Oil, Advertising, and the 1939 Golden Gate Exposition
Susan Ohmer

The US Battle against Brand Marketing: circa 1929-1980
Ross D. Petty

The Founding Five: Advertising Women of New York
Krystl Raven, Jeanie Wills

Historical Analysis of the Evolution of Political Marketing in the United States
Minita Sanghvi

Making a Market for Mexican Food in Australia
John Sinclair, Barry Carr

William Lever: Marketing Pioneer
Jeannette Strickland

Origin and Evolution of the Department Store, pre 1900s
Robert D. Tamilia
Making Advertising Come to Life: Advertising Exhibitions in Early Twentieth-Century Britain
James Taylor

Marks and Spencer’s CSR Approach to Promotion of Healthy Eating
Yumiko Toda, John Dawson

Women’s Advertising Club Newsletters: Building Communities of Practices and Instilling Club Philosophies
Jeanie Wills

Email Addresses for CHARM 2017 Authors and Participants
CHARM Milestones

The Conference for Historical Analysis and Research in Marketing (CHARM) was organized by Stanley C. Hollander and Ronald Savitt in 1983 at Michigan State University. The original title, “The First North American Workshop on Historical Research in Marketing,” was later changed to “Conference on Historical Research in Marketing and Marketing Thought.” The CHARM name was adopted following the 1997 meeting. The Association for Historical Research in Marketing (AHRIM) was established in 1999. AHRIM’s name was changed to CHARM Association in 2005.

Dates, Themes, and Venues

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year</th>
<th>Theme</th>
<th>Venue</th>
<th>Date</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2017</td>
<td>Explorations in Globalization and Glocalization: Marketing History Through the Ages</td>
<td>Liverpool John Moores University, Liverpool, United Kingdom</td>
<td>June 1-4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2015</td>
<td>Crossing Boundaries, Spanning Borders: Voyages around Marketing’s Past</td>
<td>RMS Queen Mary, Long Beach Harbor, California</td>
<td>May 28-31</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2013</td>
<td>Varieties, Alternatives, and Deviations in Marketing History</td>
<td>Copenhagen Business School, Copenhagen, Denmark</td>
<td>May 30-June 2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2011</td>
<td>Marketing History in the New World</td>
<td>Quinnipiac University, New York</td>
<td>May 19-22</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2009</td>
<td>Marketing History: Strengthening, Straightening and Extending</td>
<td>University of Leicester, Leicester</td>
<td>May 28-31</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2007</td>
<td>Marketing History at the Center</td>
<td>John W. Hartman Center for Sales, Advertising &amp; Marketing History, Duke University, Durham, North Carolina</td>
<td>May 17-20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2005</td>
<td>The Future of Marketing’s Past</td>
<td>Aboard the Queen Mary, Long Beach, California</td>
<td>April 28-May 1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2003</td>
<td>The Romance of Marketing History</td>
<td>Michigan State University, East Lansing, Michigan</td>
<td>May 15-18</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2001</td>
<td>Milestones in Marketing History</td>
<td>Duke University, Durham, North Carolina</td>
<td>May 17-20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1999</td>
<td>Marketing History: The Total Package</td>
<td>Michigan State University, East Lansing, Michigan</td>
<td>May 13-16</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1997</td>
<td>Marketing History Knows No Boundaries</td>
<td>Kingston, Ontario, Canada</td>
<td>May 22-25</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1995</td>
<td>Marketing History: Marketing’s Greatest Empirical Experiment</td>
<td>Fort Wayne, Indiana</td>
<td>May 25-28</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1993</td>
<td>Contemporary Marketing History</td>
<td>Emory University, Atlanta, Georgia</td>
<td>May 22-25</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1991</td>
<td>Marketing History – Its Many Dimensions</td>
<td>Michigan State University, East Lansing, Michigan</td>
<td>April 19-21</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1989</td>
<td>Marketing History: The Emerging Discipline</td>
<td>Charleston/Mt. Pleasant, South Carolina</td>
<td>April 29-May 1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1987</td>
<td>Marketing in Three Eras</td>
<td>Michigan State University, East Lansing, Michigan</td>
<td>April 23-26</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1985</td>
<td>Marketing in the Long Run</td>
<td>Michigan State University, East Lansing, Michigan</td>
<td>April 28-30</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1983</td>
<td>First North American Workshop on Historical Research in Marketing</td>
<td>Michigan State University, East Lansing, Michigan</td>
<td>June</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
### Past Winners of the Stanley C. Hollander Best Paper Award

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year</th>
<th>Author(s)</th>
<th>Title</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2015</td>
<td>Lilly Anne Buchwitz,</td>
<td>A Model of Radio and Internet Advertising History</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Dale Miller and William Merrilees,</td>
<td>Historical Ambidextrous Marketing: Antipodean Perspectives 1876 to 1915</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2011</td>
<td>Leighann C. Neilson,</td>
<td>John Murray Gibbon (1875-1952): The Branding of a Northern nation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2009</td>
<td>Stefan Schwarzkopf,</td>
<td>The “Consumer Jury”: Historical Origins and Social Consequences of a Marketing Myth</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2005</td>
<td>Diana Twede,</td>
<td>The Origins of Paper Based Packaging</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2001</td>
<td>John L. Solow,</td>
<td>Exorcising the Ghost of Cigarette Advertising Past: Collusion, Regulation and Fear Advertising</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1999</td>
<td>Donald F. Dixon,</td>
<td>Some Late Nineteenth Century Antecedents of Marketing Theory</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1997</td>
<td>Terrence H. Witkowski,</td>
<td>Gendered Patterns of Consumption in the Early American Household, 1750-1825</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Past Winners of the David D. Monieson Best Student Paper Award

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year</th>
<th>Author(s)</th>
<th>Title</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2013</td>
<td>Julia Große-Boerger,</td>
<td>Racing and the motorization of the German people 50 years of the automobile at the 1935 and 1936 Berlin Automobile Exhibitions</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2011</td>
<td></td>
<td>No prize was awarded</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2007</td>
<td></td>
<td>No prize was awarded</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2005</td>
<td>Garth E. Harris,</td>
<td>Sidney Levy: Challenging the Philosophical Assumptions of Marketing</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2003</td>
<td>Leighann Neilson,</td>
<td>Marketing the ‘Forest Primeval’: Development of ‘Romantic Tourism’ in the Land of Evangeline, 1847-1920</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2001</td>
<td>Leighann Neilson,</td>
<td>The Development of Marketing in the Canadian Museum Community: 1840-1989</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1999</td>
<td>David Bussiere,</td>
<td>Evidence of Marketing Periodical Literature Within the American Economic Association: 1895-1936</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1997</td>
<td>Maureen Hupfer,</td>
<td>Anything in Skirts Stands a Chance: Marketing the Canadian North-West to British Women, 1880-1914</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
2017 CHARM Sponsors and Acknowledgements

We thank the following institutions, and organizations for their contributions to the 18th CHARM, with a special thanks for the generous support of the Faculty of Arts, Professional and Social Studies, Liverpool John Moores University:

---

**2017 CHARM Conference Committee**

**Program Chair**  
Richard A. Hawkins, University of Wolverhampton

**Proceedings Editor**  
Ann-Marie Kennedy, University of Canterbury

**Arrangements Chair**  
David Clampin, Liverpool John Moores University

**CHARM Association President**  
Blaine Branchik; Quinnipiac University
CHARM Association Board of Directors

Russell Belk, Schulich School of Business, York University, rbelk@schulich.yorku.ca

Blaine Branchik (President 2013-present; Vice President 2009-11), School of Business, Quinnipiac University blaine.branchik@quinnipiac.edu

David Clampin, Liverpool John Moores University, d.j.clampin@ljmu.ac.uk

Peggy Cunningham, Dalhousie University, peggyc@dal.ca

Judy Foster Davis, Eastern Michigan University, judy.davis@emich.edu

Ronald Fullerton, fullertonprofron@yahoo.com

Richard A. Hawkins, Faculty of Social Sciences, University of Wolverhampton, r.a.hawkins@wlv.ac.uk

D.G. Brian Jones (Treasurer 2007-13), School of Business, Quinnipiac University, bjoness1@quinnipiac.edu

Maria Kalamas (Secretary 2013-present), Michael J. Coles College of Business, Kennesaw State University, mkalamas@kennesaw.edu

William Keep, College of New Jersey, keep@tcnj.edu

Marilyn Liebrenz-Himes (Secretary 2009-11), George Washington University, liebrenz@gwu.edu

Leighann Neilson (Vice President 2013-present, Secretary 2011-2013), Carleton University, leighann_neilson@carleton.ca

Jacqueline Reid Wachholz (Treasurer 2013-present), Director, John W. Hartman Center for Sales, Advertising & Marketing History, Duke University, j.reid@duke.edu

Eric Shaw (President 2009-2013), Dept. of Marketing, Florida Atlantic University, shaw@fau.edu

Stefan Schwarzkopf, Copenhagen Business School, ssc.lpf@cbs.dk

Mark Tadajewski, Durham University, mark.tadajewski@durham.ac.uk

Robert Tamilia, Dept. of Marketing, University of Quebec at Montreal, tamilla.robert@uqam.ca

Diana Twede, School of Packaging, Michigan State University, tweed@pilot.msu.edu

Kazuo Usui, Faculty of Economics, Saitama University, kaz.usui@attglobal.net
Terrence H. Witkowski (President 2005-2009), Dept. of Marketing, College of Business Administration, California State University - Long Beach, witko@csulb.edu
2017 CHARM Manuscript Reviewers

Ibrahim Abosag - SOAS, University of London, UK
Melodee Beals – Loughborough University, UK
Fred Beard - University of Oklahoma, OK, USA
Russell W. Belk - York University, Toronto, Canada
John Benson – University of Wolverhampton, UK
Blaine Branchik - Quinnipiac University, CT, USA
Sean Campeau - Carleton University, Ottawa, Canada
Marie Carpenter - Institut Mines-Télécom, France
Tasnuva Chaudhury - Carleton University, Ottawa, Canada
David Clampin – Liverpool John Moores University, UK
Robert Crawford - RMIT University, Melbourne, Australia
Judy Davis - Eastern Michigan University, MI, USA
Colin Divall – University of York, UK
Nada Elnahla - Carleton University, Ottawa, Canada
Jenny Evans – De Monfort University Leicester, UK
Richard A. Hawkins – University of Wolverhampton, UK
Michael Heller – Brunel University, UK
Paul Henderson – University of Wolverhampton, UK
Richard Hornsey – University of Nottingham, UK
D.G. Brian Jones - Quinnipiac University, CT, USA
Bill Keep - The College of New Jersey, NJ, USA
Ann-Marie Kennedy – University of Canterbury, Christchurch, New Zealand
Anthony Kent – Nottingham Trent University, UK
Finola Kerrigan – University of Birmingham, UK
Jeff Langenderfer – Meredith College, Raleigh, NC, USA
Marilyn Liebrenz-Hime - George Washington University, MD, USA
Jon Littlefield - Dalton State College, GA, USA
Brent McKenzie - University of Guelph, Canada
Kristy McManus - University of Georgia, GA, USA
Yuko Minowa - Long Island University, USA
Leighann Neilson - Carleton University, Ottawa, Canada
Sean Nixon – University of Essex, UK
Erika Paulson - Quinnipiac University, CT, USA
Ross Petty - Babson College, MA, USA
Jeffrey Pilcher - University of Toronto Scarborough, Canada
Andrew Pressey – University of Birmingham, UK
Karín Rase – Independent Researcher, Germany
Linda Risso – Institute of Historical Research, University of London, UK
Stefan Schwarzkopf – Copenhagen Business School, Denmark
Eric Shaw – Florida Atlantic University, FL, USA
Juliann Sivulka - Waseda University Tokyo, Japan
Ros Watkiss Singleton – University of Wolverhampton, UK
Inger Stole – University of Illinois, Urbana, IL, USA
Robert Tamilia - Université du Québec à Montréal, Canada
Ray Taylor - Villanova University, PA, USA
Laura Ugolini – University of Wolverhampton, UK
Avinash Vinashgm - Indian Institute of Management Bangalore, India
Jacqueline Reid Wachholz - Duke University, NC, USA
Emily Westkaemper – James Madison University, VA, USA
Nick White – Liverpool John Moores University, UK
Lesley Whitworth – University of Brighton, UK
Jonathan Wilson – University of Greenwich, UK
Terry Witkowski - California State University, Long Beach, CA, USA
Mary Ellen Zuckerman - College at Brockport, SUNY, N.Y, USA
# Conference Program

**Explorations in Globalization and Glocalization: Marketing History Through the Ages**

18th Biennial Conference on Historical Analysis & Research in Marketing (CHARM)

**June 1 – 4, 2017**  
(Doctoral Workshop May 31 - June 1)

Liverpool John Moores University, Liverpool, England, U.K.

| Wednesday, May 31 | Doctoral Workshop on Historical Methods in Marketing Scholarship  
| Welcome/Meet and Greet/Dinner  
| The Old Blind School, 24 Hardman Street, Liverpool |
| 6:30 to 9:00 p.m. |  

| Thursday, June 1 | Doctoral Workshop on Historical Methods in Marketing Scholarship  
| Continental Breakfast  
| Location TBA |
| 7:30 to 9:00 a.m. |  

| 9:00 to 4:30 p.m. | Doctoral Workshop on Historical Methods in Marketing Scholarship  
| Redmonds Building,  
| RB/520 |
| 4:30 to 6:30 p.m. | Registration  
| Redmonds Building,  
| RB/523 |
| 6:30 to 9:00 p.m. | Opening Reception and Welcome  
| Redmonds Building,  
| RB/523 |
### Friday, June 2

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Time</th>
<th>Session 1a RB/519</th>
<th>Gender and Advertising</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>9:00 to 10:30 a.m.</td>
<td></td>
<td>Chair: Richard A. Hawkins</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>‘Black in the Game: Black Male Models, U.S. Advertising, and Changing Culture’</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Blaine J. Branchik,</td>
<td>Quinipiac University, CT, USA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Judy Foster Davis,</td>
<td>Eastern Michigan University, MI, USA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Erika Paulson</td>
<td>Quinipiac University, CT, USA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>‘The Founding Five: Advertising Women of New York’</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Krystl Raven</td>
<td>University of Saskatchewan, Canada</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>‘Women’s Advertising Club Newsletters: Building Communities of Practices and Instilling Club Philosophies’</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Jeannie Wills</td>
<td>University of Saskatchewan, Canada</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Time</th>
<th>Session 1b RB/518</th>
<th>Government and Advertising</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>9:00 to 10:30 a.m.</td>
<td></td>
<td>Chair: Graham Gladden</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Erik Lakomaa</td>
<td>Stockholm School of Economics, Sweden</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>‘Marketing to Attract Immigrants: The Case Of Argentina’</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Karen Fox</td>
<td>Santa Clara University, CA, USA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>‘How to sell Nuclear Energy to the Spanish Public in the 1950s’</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>M. Elena Aramendia</td>
<td>Universidad Pública de Navarra, Spain</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Time</th>
<th>Coffee and Tea Break</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>10:30 to 11:00 a.m.</td>
<td>RB/523</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Time</td>
<td>Session 2a RB/518</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>--------------</td>
<td>------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Session 2a</td>
<td>Marketing and Print Media</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chair:</td>
<td>Richard A. Hawkins</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>‘The courting of advertisers: Intertwined and changing notions of gender and class in the depiction of market segments for the Swedish press, 1880-1939’</td>
<td>‘Selling the concept of brands. The Swedish advertising industry and branding in the 1920’s’</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Klara Arnberg</td>
<td>Stockholm University, Sweden</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>‘Signalling by Frontispieces in Baroque Merchant Books’</td>
<td>‘Office Space: Organising the Australian Advertising Agency in the 20th Century’</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Klaus Brockhoff</td>
<td>WHU – Otto Beisheim School of Management, Vallendar, Germany</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>‘Conservation and Consumerism: Commercialising the National Trust in the 1960s’</td>
<td>‘Archiving the Archives: The World’s Collections of Historical Advertisements and Marketing Ephemera’</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sean Nixon</td>
<td>University of Essex, UK</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Session 2b</td>
<td>RB/519</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lunch</td>
<td>12:30 – 2:00 p.m.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Time</td>
<td>Session</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>--------------</td>
<td>---------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2:00 to 3:30 p.m.</td>
<td>Session 3a</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2:00 to 3:30 p.m.</td>
<td>Session 3b</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3:30 to 4:00 p.m.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Time</td>
<td>Session 4a RB/518</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>--------------</td>
<td>--------------------------------------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4:00 to 5:30 p.m.</td>
<td>Retailing</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Chair: Maria Kalamas Hedden</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>‘A Consumer Cooperative between Market and Stakeholder Orientations: The Case of Coop Atlantique, 1912-2016’</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Bruno Mazieres</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>University of Limoges, France</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Magali Boespflug</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>University of Poitiers, France</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>‘An Update on the Origin and Evolution of the Department Store, pre 1900s’</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Robert D. Tamilia</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Université du Québec à Montréal, Canada</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>‘Marks and Spencer’s CSR Approach to Promotion of Healthy Eating</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Yumiko Toda,</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Nihon University, Japan</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>John Dawson,</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>University of Edinburgh, UK</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Time</th>
<th>Session 4b RB/520</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>4:00 to 5:30 p.m.</td>
<td>Brand Identity and Brand Heritage</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Chair: Leighann C. Neilson</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>‘Visualizing Winchester: A Brand History Through Iconic Images</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Terrence H. Witkowski</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>California State University, Long Beach, USA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>‘William Lever: marketing pioneer’</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Jeannette Strickland</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>University of Liverpool, UK</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>‘Motor Town Wolverhampton: The Rise and Fall of the Sunbeam Brand’</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Richard A. Hawkins</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>University of Wolverhampton, UK</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Time</th>
<th>Dinner</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>6:30 to 9:00 p.m.</td>
<td>Tate Liverpool, Albert Dock, Liverpool</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Saturday, June 3</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-----------------</td>
<td>---</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
| 9:00 to 10:30 a.m. | Session 5a RB/518  
Travel and Motor Vehicle Advertising  
Chair: Fred Beard  
‘The changing focus of marketing: the application of Maslow’s model of needs to the analysis of Cunard advertising between 1910 and 1940’  
Graham Gladden  
Liverpool John Moores University, UK  
‘Cunard across the Atlantic, an ‘impeccable British service’. Selling the Britishness of shipping lines, c.1893 to c.1969’  
David Clampin  
Liverpool John Moores University, UK  
‘The Mouse That Roared: Cyclecars Versus the Ford Model T’  
D.G. Brian Jones  
Quinnipiac University, CT, USA  
Alan J. Richardson  
Odette School of Business, University of Windsor, Canada  
Mark Tadajewski  
Durham University, UK |
| 9:00 to 10:30 a.m. | Session 5b RB/519  
Clothing  
Chair: Yumiko Toda  
‘Refashioning the Femme Fatale in Vogue, 1892-1900’  
Yuko Minowa,  
Long Island University, USA  
Pauline Maclaran,  
Royal Holloway, University of London, UK  
Lorna Stevens,  
University of Westminster, UK  
‘Assembling the Ethnic Identity in the Ottoman Society through Clothing Consumption’  
Eminegül Karababa  
Middle East Technical University Üniversiteler Mah, Turkey  
‘Effect of The Kimono Business on Kyoto Textiles From 1949 to 2000’  
Keiko Okamoto  
Hosei University, Japan |
| 10:30 to 11:00 a.m. | Coffee and Tea Break  
RB/523 |
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Time</th>
<th>Session 6a RB/519</th>
<th>Session 6b RB/518</th>
<th>Lunch and Awards RB/523</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>11:00 a.m. to 12:30 p.m.</td>
<td>Branding and Trademarks</td>
<td>Marketing and Politics</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Chair: Mick Hayes</td>
<td>Chair: D.G. Brian Jones</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Ross D. Petty</td>
<td>Minita Sanghvi</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Babson College, MA, USA</td>
<td>Skidmore College, NY, USA</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>‘Comparing Apple to Apple: An Historical Tale of How Corporate Diversification Can Lead to Trademark Infringement’</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Steven W. Kopp</td>
<td>Emil Ghitman Gilkes</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>University of Arkansas, AK, USA</td>
<td>Skidmore College, NY, USA</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>‘The effects of trademarks law over the marketing work of Cognac brandy firms, XVIIIth c. – early 20th c.’</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Thomas Mollanger</td>
<td>Neil Bendle,</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>University of Bordeaux, France</td>
<td>Ivey Business School, Western University, Canada</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Jack Bunce</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Ivey Business School, Western University, Canada</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>‘Gifts and War: The Forbidden Ritual of Wartime Japan’</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Yuko Minowa</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Long Island University, NY, USA</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Russell W. Belk</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>York University, Toronto, Canada</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12:30 – 2:00 p.m.</td>
<td></td>
<td>Stanley C. Hollander Best Paper Award</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Presenter: Blaine Branchik</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>David D. Monieson Best Student Paper Award</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Presenter: Brian Jones</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Time</td>
<td>Event</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>--------------</td>
<td>----------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
| 2:00 to 3:30 p.m. | **Session 7a RB/518**  
**Marketing and Government**  
Chair: Eminegül Karababa  
‘History of U.S. Product Safety and Sustainability Activities’  
Robert Dyer  
George Washington University, MD, USA  
Marilyn Liebrenz-Himes  
George Washington University, MD, USA  
‘The Apparently Endless Nature of Endless-Chain Schemes’  
William W. Keep  
The College of New Jersey, NJ, USA  
Peter Vander Nat  
Federal Trade Commission (Retired), DC, USA  
‘“The Greatest Leaders in Extension Work”: The Role of Extension Work in Developing Rural Female Consumers in Early 20th Century New York’  
Mary Ellen Zuckerman  
College at Brockport, SUNY, N.Y, USA |
| 2:00 to 3:30 p.m. | **Session 7b RB/519**  
**Marketing Systems and Definitions**  
Chair: Peter Vander Nat  
‘A Model of Historical Analysis for Solving Marketing Problems’  
Anthony J McMullan  
Independent Scholar, Australia  
‘A History of the Brand Management System’  
Isabelle Aimé  
IPAG Business School, France  
Fabienne Berger-Remy  
Sorbonne Business School, France  
Marie-Eve Laporte  
Sorbonne Business School, France  
‘A Post-Modern History of Internet Advertising’  
Lilly Anne Buchwitz  
Humber College Toronto, Canada |
| 3:30 to 4:30 p.m. | **Journal of Historical Research in Marketing Editorial Board Meeting**  
(Coffee and Tea)  
RB/520 |
| 4:30 to 5:30 p.m. | **CHARM Board of Directors Meeting**  
(Coffee and Tea) |
| 6:30 to 9:00 p.m. | **Walking Tour – In the Footsteps of the Beatles**  
Directions to be provided at the conference |
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Sunday, June 4</th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| 9:00 to 10:30 a.m. | **Session 8a**  
RB/519  
International Expositions and Heritage Marketing  
Chair: Jacqueline Reid Wachholz  
‘On the Road with Disney: Standard Oil, Advertising, and the 1939 Golden Gate Exposition’  
**Susan Ohmer**  
University of Notre Dame, IN, USA  
‘Making Advertising Come to Life: Advertising Exhibitions in Early Twentieth-Century Britain’  
**James Taylor**  
University of Lancaster, UK  
‘A comparative historical analysis of the role of universal expositions in the diffusion of three innovative technologies in France: 1867-1937’  
**Marie Carpenter**  
Institut Mines-Télécom, France  
**Patrick Luciano**  
Université Paris-Dauphine, France |
| 9:00 to 11:00 a.m. | **Session 8b**  
RB/518  
Meet the Editors Session (We are not sure this session will take place) |
| 11:00 to 11:30 | **Coffee and Tea Break**  
RB/523 |
| 11:30 to 1:30 p.m. | **Lunch and CHARM Association Meeting**  
RB/523  
Adjournment  
*Safe journey home everyone* |
Full Papers
Abstract
Purpose – This essay aims to describe the origins of the Brand Management System (BMS) and to examine the factors influencing the changes and mutations that the BMS has encountered in order to assess its potential effectiveness in today’s digitalized environment.
Methodology/approach – The paper traces the evolution of the BMS from its creation in the 1930s to its recent mutation in the digital era. The article analyzes data from four different sources – research papers, case studies, newspaper articles, and internal documents – to perform an intellectual historical analysis of the evolution of the BMS.
Findings – The paper highlights four distinct periods that show that BMS evolution was non-linear, incremental, and multi-path. Moreover, it demonstrates that the brand manager is now torn between two opposed but complementary directions, as he or she should act both as absolute expert and galvanic facilitator.
Originality/value – This paper provides a broad perspective on the BMS function to help marketing scholars, historians and practitioners to better understand the current issues facing the BMS and its relevance in the digital age.
Keywords – Brands, Brand management system, Brand manager, Product manager, Marketing organization, Marketing history
Paper type – General review

Introduction
Since the 1930s, brand managers have been the “central coordinators of all marketing activities for their brand and responsible for developing and implementing the marketing plan” (Low and Fullerton, 1994, p. 173).

Although substantial literature addresses brand management and the Brand Management System (BMS), it lacks a global picture of the evolution of this organizational function and especially its current status in today’s digitalized environment. This paper builds on the influential work of Low and Fullerton (1994) to create a longitudinal historical analysis of the BMS since the creation of the function until today.

The main themes of this work are twofold: (1) the permanent and necessary adaptation of the BMS, from an American Fast-Moving Consumer Good (FMCG) prototype to the dominant marketing organizational model across countries and sectors after the 1950s, and (2) the current mutations and challenges of the BMS to face environmental changes such as technology or globalization. As a consequence, the principal aims of the research are to:
- Examine the origins of the BMS and its diffusion,
- Investigate the forces behind the different stages it has undergone,
- Discuss its current and future potential status for both managers and scholars.

To those ends, the evolution of the BMS is analyzed from an “intellectual history” perspective as defined by Fullerton and Punj (2004, p. 9): “Critical historical reasoning and evidence [is applied] to intellectual phenomena over time”, to identify “what gives an idea intrinsic strength”.

Since Chandler (1977), whose approach was later replicated in the marketing field (Nevett, 1991), business history has proven itself very useful and complementary to surveys and case studies. It captures the richness and complexity of phenomena by investigating “the time, place and context” along with the intensity and reasons for the changes (Low and Fullerton, 1994, p. 174). In that respect, intellectual history is not a literature review because “it assumes change in environments and influences over time”, whereas “literature reviews as conventionally done in the social sciences present findings over time in a
ahistorical manner, as if they had all occurred in similar social and cultural environments” (Fullerton and Punj, 2004, p. 9).

There are some complex events that history alone can tackle (Smith and Lux, 1993). It allows one to learn from the past, (Shaw, 2015a) and in turn, “to inform current marketing research and practice” (Shaw, 2012, p. 30). Indeed, “the past causes the present, and so the future”. Any time we try to know why something occurred, [...] we have to look for factors that took shape earlier. Sometimes relatively recent history will suffice to explain a major development, but often we need to look back further to identify the causes of change. “Only through studying history can we grasp how things change; only through history can we begin to comprehend the factors that cause change; and only through history can we understand what elements of an institution or a society persist despite change” (Stearns, 1998).

Intellectual history has seldom been used in marketing. Still, it is important to put so-called “marketing revolutions” into perspective and understand the rationale behind current marketing practices to improve them (Volle, 2011). As a consequence, examining the history of the BMS – identifying all the underlying structural movements – should help us to step back and better understand the current situation.

Thus, the historical approach is mobilized to reveal the underlying reasons for change. The paper draws upon marketing articles describing how to use the historical method (Golder, 2000; Nevett, 1991; Savitt, 1980; Smith and Lux, 1993). More specifically, the analysis follows Golder’s five stages (2000, p. 158): “1. Select a topic and collect evidence”, “2. Critically evaluate the sources of the evidence” (i.e., perform an “external criticism”), “3. Critically evaluate the evidence” (i.e., conduct an “internal criticism”), “4. Analyze and interpret the evidence”, and “5. Present the evidence and conclusions”. Starting with stage 1, it analyzes a wide and varied range of sources. These include fifty-nine academic articles published in top-ranking journals between 1969 (Luck, 1969) and 2016 (Wedel and Kannan, 2016); eleven single case studies on specific organizations such as General Motors (Townsend et al., 2010), Henkel (Brexendorf and Daecke, 2012) or Kimberly Clark (Matanda and Ewing, 2012); over one hundred articles from professional and economic newspapers such as Forbes (Cooperstein, 2012) or The Guardian (English, 2015); and eleven internal documents from cutting-edge consulting firms such as McKinsey (Bughin et al., 2015). Thanks to this wide pool of sources, our analysis is performed from three different perspectives: scholarly, professional and expert, all of them playing important roles in the evolution of the BMS. The authenticity of all these sources – stage 2 of the historical method – is well-established. For stage 3, the inclusion of top-level academic articles guarantees a high level of competence, objectivity and reliability, and the multiplicity of sources facilitates corroboration of the evidence (Howell and Prevenier, 2001; Low and Fullerton, 1994). To conduct the analysis and interpretation (stage 4), each data set was analyzed separately. The paper adopts the “context-driven periodization” approach recommended by Witkowski and Brian Jones (2006, p. 77), as it proposes a temporal sequence of events and uses the major external events of the environment as turning points. The historical synthesis is then both chronological and topical to report on the evolution of the BMS. In the 5th and last stage of the historical method, this paper highlights four distinct periods in the evolution of the BMS (summarized in Figure 1). It thus extends Low and Fullerton’s work (1994) by considering the last twenty years and the digital revolution.

The remainder of this article describes and analyses each of the four eras of the BMS. It begins with the gestational age of the BMS in the 1930s-1940s, when it was thought of as brand-dedicated teams taking full responsibility. It goes on to describe how the BMS became the dominant marketing organization model in the consumer society of the 1950s-1970s. It then explains how the pressure for accountability challenged the BMS in the 1980s-1990s. Finally, it outlines the complete mutation of the BMS in today’s digital era because of technological factors. It concludes with a discussion of the results and their implications for business and research on the future of the BMS.
The BMS gestational age (1930s-1940s)

The conception of the BMS

The BMS was first introduced at Procter & Gamble (P&G), through the so-called “McElroy memo” on May 13, 1931 (Gupta, 2003). Neil McElroy was then a junior manager in P&G’s advertising department. While working on a campaign to support the Camay soap brand, he realized that the young brand was having a hard time competing “not only with soaps from Lever and Palmolive but also with Ivory, P&G’s flagship product” (McCraw, 2001). In reaction to it, McElroy wrote the now famous 3-page memo to advocate the creation of specific teams dedicated to each brand. Brands should be taken care of as if they are separate businesses, each with its own target group and positioning, to minimize internal cannibalization. According to this memo, a “brand man” should manage it and take “full responsibility” for all marketing aspects of it (Duffy, 2011). The McElroy memo initiated the BMS. For Neil McElroy, he went on to become P&G’s president, and later the United States Secretary of Defense under President Eisenhower.

A slow diffusion until after the Second World War

Still, the BMS was largely ignored at the beginning, and its diffusion outside of P&G was very slow at first (Low and Fullerton, 1994). Indeed, according to Low and Fullerton (1994), P&G’s innovation went rather unnoticed at the beginning. Johnson and Johnson was the first to borrow it in 1935, followed by Monsanto in 1940 and Merck in 1946. However, it “did not come into general use until the 1950s” (Buell, 1975, p. 4). Furthermore, the name of this new organizational structure was not then set and could vary. For instance, Buell (1975, p. 3) called it the “product management system”. Still, it could be considered as the BMS, since the title of its main function (brand manager, product manager or business manager) did “not alter the basic responsibilities” or the organization of the marketing department (Luck, 1969, p. 32).

How is it that the diffusion of the BMS took so long? The theory proposed by Rogers provides an initial answer. Indeed, it states that the diffusion of innovation needs time to spread from innovators to the majority through early adopters (Rogers, 1962). However, also, the Second World War probably slowed the expansion of the BMS. Nonetheless, it developed strongly afterward during the 1950s-1970s (Buell, 1975; Low and Fullerton, 1994).


The need to understand the consumer

The years of reconstruction after the Second World War observed massive demographic and economic growth, leading to mass production, mass distribution and mass consumption, as well as the development of a middle class aiming to “keep up with the Joneses”. As noted by Fullerton (1988) and Volle (2011), marketing analysis of consumer needs had already existed for a long time. Fullerton (1988, p. 114) stated, for instance, that “many large US firms had [their] own market analysis department by [the] 1920s”. However, after the Second World War, the development of techniques such as consumer panel data usage (Wedel and Kannan, 2016) or focus groups (Merton, 1987) enabled larger-scale market data collection and analysis.

Market research companies were then available in North-America and in Europe to support marketers, with, for instance, the creation of Nielsen in 1923, Burke in 1931 and Gallup in 1935 in the USA, GfK in 1934 in Germany and IFOP in 1938 in France (Volle, 2011; Wedel and Kannan, 2016). These market research firms developed their own tools to assess, for instance, sales data with household panels (following Nielsen’s introduction of the first panel, Nielsen Drug Index, in 1933), advertising efficiency with radio and television audience measurement systems (first introduced by Nielsen in 1936 for radio), or consumer attitudes and behaviors with field experiments. Such surveys could now even be conducted by telephone, which equipped an increased number of households.

Companies also realized the importance of their internal data to assess their markets better. They began to organize their own market research departments. Here, again, P&G had proved to be a pioneer before the Second World War with one of their executives, “Doc” Smelser. He created in 1925 and led until 1959 what was then considered as the most sophisticated internal marketing research department (McCraw, 2001). In particular, Doc Smelser then put in place a team of door-to-door interviewers whose mission was to talk with consumers to extract data, so that brand managers could then fine-tune their marketing strategies. “This kind of market research became the hallmark of P&G’s approach to the development of new products and the continuous effort to improve existing ones” (McCraw, 2001).

The BMS becoming the dominant marketing organization

This development of the systematic use of marketing data called for a new internal organization. At this time, the BMS, which until then only P&G and a few other big companies had established, became visible and expanded, thus becoming “a fad” in the 1950s-1960s among American companies (Low and Fullerton, 1994, p. 182). In 1974, the Association of National Advertisers estimated that 85% of the US packaged goods companies (actually, “93% of those with annual advertising expenditures exceeding $10 million”) and 55% of those producing industrial goods had implemented the BMS (Buell, 1975, p. 4).

The BMS was then transferred to subsidiaries abroad (Cunningham and Clarke, 1975; Venkatesh and Wilemon, 1980). Indeed, “as a management technology, product management was exported from the US to Europe, especially through the multinational corporations, to meet changing competitive environments” (Venkatesh and Wilemon, 1980, p. 68). The BMS thus ended up being used broadly worldwide.

Institutional approaches in organizational studies (DiMaggio and Powell, 1983; Lawrence and Suddaby, 2006) provide an insightful theoretical framework to understand the success of the BMS. DiMaggio and Powell (1983) developed the concept of institutional isomorphism to explain how organizations in the same field tend to become similar. This occurs through three different types of isomorphic processes, which are not mutually exclusive and do not necessarily occur in this order: “mimetic”, “normative”, and / or “coercive isomorphic processes” (DiMaggio and Powell, 1983, p. 150). According to the authors, organizations in the same field tend to model themselves after renowned companies to appear more legitimate and cope with uncertainty – this is mimetic isomorphism. With employees changing firms and consulting firms advising new clients, the model gradually becomes a norm in the field – this is normative isomorphism. Eventually, companies may feel pressured to adopt the new model – this is coercive isomorphism.

Looking at the history of the BMS in the light of institutional isomorphism, BMS became a marketing organization standard first through mimetic isomorphism, when some big companies copied the organization of P&G. This development was followed by normative isomorphism, when many US companies implemented the BMS, following the norm established by these visible companies. It finally
became coercive isomorphism when the US headquarters imposed the BMS organization on their subsidiaries abroad (Figure 2).

![Diagram showing the diffusion of the BMS through institutional isomorphism]

Still, research hardly took an interest in the BMS during its first thirty years (Luck, 1969). “The concept developed entirely within the context of practical managerial necessity and only after two or three decades of its successful development did researchers begin to take note of it” (Venkatesh and Wilemon, 1980, p. 68). The first related article published in an academic journal was not even written by a scholar, but rather by a marketing practitioner, Keith (1960, p. 35), who described “the marketing revolution” that the BMS meant to his own company, Pillsbury. Additionally, researchers did not consider Keith’s article a trustworthy source, since the typicality of the case was dubious (Fullerton, 1988). Consequently, following Golder (2000)’s stage 2 advice on the sources of evidence, we did not consider this article as an academic source. This means that the first scholarly article found on the BMS was that of Luck, published in 1969 in the Journal of Marketing (Luck, 1969).

Scholarly articles were published in significant number only in the 1970s and early 1980s. They studied, in particular, the responsibilities and interfaces of brand managers (Luck, 1969; Buell, 1975; Hise and Kelly, 1978; Cossé and Swan, 1983; McDaniel and Gray, 1980; Venkatesh and Wilemon, 1980; Lyonski, 1985). They noted that brand managers had major responsibilities, such as profit responsibility for their products or advertising, but little formal authority. As a result, it required influential power, which could be exerted thanks to legitimacy gained from recognized expertise but also from personal attraction and charisma (Gemmill and Wilemon, 1972). Still, this was a shift from the initial concept of “little general manager” (Buell, 1975, p. 6). This lack of formal authority (Gemmill and Wilemon, 1972; Venkatesh and Wilemon, 1976) combined with little experience (Giese and Weisenberger, 1982; Hise and Kelly, 1978; Venkatesh and Wilemon, 1980) frequently caused difficulties and weakened the BMS. As a consequence, since the early days of its era, the BMS was accused of producing brand bureaucracy, hindering creativity and customer-orientation (Hise and Kelly, 1978; Knox, 1994; Low and Fullerton, 1994; Shocker et al., 1994).

The BMS under accountability pressure (1980s-1990s)

The globalization of brands

At the turn of the 1980s, the world’s equilibrium, based on three main blocs (the Western allies, the Soviet bloc, and the third world), started to crumble. With the end of the Cold War and the collapse of the Eastern Bloc, symbolized by the fall of the Berlin wall on the 9th of November 1989, one form of globalization process seems to have prevailed, namely, neoliberal globalization. Under the combined effect of greater openness in the markets, reduced transportation costs and increased human mobility, consumer goods were made available almost everywhere in the world. During this period, the number
of organizations with global scope increased considerably. In a famous article published in the May-June 1983 issue of the Harvard Business Review, called “globalization of markets”, T. Levitt, professor of economics at Harvard Business School, popularized the idea of a large market without frontiers, achieved through a convergence of consumer needs and desires (Levitt, 1983). Then, “companies must learn to operate as if the world were one large market – ignoring superficial regional and national differences” (Levitt, 1983, p. 92). In this context, building powerful brands able to gain consumer preference worldwide started to be seen as a core competency. Global brands were even playing a role as elements of the world culture: “nothing confirms this as much as the success of McDonald’s from the Champs Elysées to the Ginza, of Coca-Cola in Bahrain and Pepsi-Cola in Moscow, and of rock music, Greek salad, Hollywood movies, Revlon cosmetics, Sony televisions, and Levi’s jeans everywhere” (Levitt, 1983, p. 93).

Beyond the commercial possibilities offered by a global market, the idea was also to take advantage of economies of scale in manufacturing, promoting, advertising and selling goods. To benefit from these economies of scale, most multinational companies engaged in rationalization of their brand portfolios, downsizing the number of brands drastically in order to retain a small group of large brands with global scope (Douglas et al., 2001; Hankinson and Cowking, 1997). Due to the size and scope of these global brands, they were progressively seen as financial assets, thanks to the brand valuation metrics appearing at that time. Rupert Murdoch included the values of his newspaper brands on the Australian News Group balance sheet in 1984; Interbrand valued the UK’s Rank Hovis McDougall brands in 1988, and has issued yearly since then a ranking of the most valuable brands worldwide (Salinas and Ambler, 2009). From a name on a product, brands have become a source of competitive advantage for companies under the form of intangible assets, as they were seen as valuable, rare, inimitable and non-substitutable resources in the sense of resource-based view theory (Barney, 1991).

This increasing recognition of brand equity put pressure on the brand management organization to be responsible from then on for a strategic resource of the firm. The immediate effect was an organizational split between the strategic branding decisions on the one hand, made at a higher level in the company with the senior executive teams involved, and on the other hand, the execution tasks, which remained at the local level of the brand manager (Gates and Egelhoff, 1986). As described in a case study on Nestlé at the beginning of the 1980s (Hoff and Quelch, 1984), strategic decisions made centrally involved advertising campaign and package design as well as new product development – see also the article by Townsend and colleagues describing the organization at General Motors (Townsend et al., 2010). Meanwhile, issues such as sales promotion were discussed at the country level.

**Greater accountability of brand managers**

Another derived effect was that brand managers were made more accountable for their results in brand-building. Indeed, to realize their potential financial value, brands required a high level of investments such as advertising expenses. Therefore, this era was characterized by professionalization and standardization of the brand manager function (John and Martin, 1984), through formal processes and increased formal accountability. This transformation was achieved through the emergence and spread of computing in the professional context. Brand managers progressively used personal computers (desktops) and software, especially spreadsheets. Usage of spreadsheets such as Lotus (1983) and later, Excel (1985), tremendously increased the pressure on control and monitoring systems, either internally (through dashboards and other balance scorecards) or externally (through computing market data).

Effects on the evolution of the brand manager’s function were twofold: (1) their tasks included a wider range of reporting, to the extent that the function sometimes turned into management accounting, and (2) they spent much more time crunching market data. Indeed, a major market research company launched retail panel data based on scanner data at that time, such as Nielsen point-of-sale scanner data in 1980 or IRI in-home barcode scanning service in 1995. This method implied better accuracy but also a higher frequency of issues and a larger amount of data collected.

**The rise of category management**

During the 1980s-1990s, fierce competition among retailers based on end-user prices to obtain market share led to greater concentration in the retail sector. As a consequence, the power of the retailers’ purchasers increased during negotiation rounds. Manufacturers organized themselves differently to face retailer pressure and created the category management department (Hankinson and Cowking, 1997; Zenor, 1994). P&G was again a pioneer in the implementation of this new organization (Schiller, 1988). This new function initially competed with the brand manager system to the extent that some scholars
predicted its gradual disappearance (see for instance Lindblom and Olkkonen, 2006). Ultimately, the
two organizational forms subsisted in parallel, with the effect of creating a new interface for brand
managers, and somehow also diluting the power of brand managers, who were torn between the
requirements of sales functions and those of management controllers (Chimhundu and Hamlin, 2007).

To sum up, in this era, brand managers tended to lose power in favor of sales, as they focused on
planning and coordinating, mostly internally, without having a strategic orientation (Cossé and Swan,
1983). As they became more and more accountable, they acted as “good little soldiers” or nearly
management accountants. Therefore, in losing sight of the market, they progressively departed from the
original proposal and were even accused of damaging brand assets (Knox, 1994; Shocker et al., 1994;
Starr and Bloom, 1994).

A new BMS paradigm in the digital era (since 2000)

The development of marketing analytics

Since the turn of the century, the digital era has brought a multiplicity of technological inventions which
have transformed marketing practices. A few landmarks illustrate the mutations of the economic
environment and the unprecedented growth of available data. Starting with the creation of the World
Wide Web in 1995, the development of clickstream data has boosted the launch of Customer
Relationship Management (CRM) systems, such as Cloud Computing from Salesforce (1999). With
the advent of Google in 1998 and the keyword search, the volume and variety of data have increased
dramatically with user-generated content, for instance, taking the form of blogs or product reviews. The
introduction of social media platforms – such as Facebook in 2004, YouTube in 2005, Twitter and Flickr
in 2006, Tumblr in 2007, Instagram in 2010, or Snapchat in 2011 – has amplified the phenomenon by
developing vast amounts of text and video data. Furthermore, the widespread use of smartphones
equipped with a Global Positioning System (GPS) since the launch of the Apple iPhone in 2007 has
enabled marketers to capture consumer location data.

As Wedel and Kannan note (2016, p. 3), all those innovations have “greatly reduced the variable cost
of data collection and [have] resulted in unprecedented volumes of data that provide insights on
consumer behavior at exceptional levels of depth and granularity”. According to Rust and Huang (2014,
pp. 207–208), the impact of Information Technology (IT) on services is even greater, as it transforms
the nature of service and leads to a “service revolution”: “Service is not new; it is service plus IT that
transforms service. IT enables service, and its input and output, information, is central to service”.

As an indirect result, those technological advances influence marketing practices as well as
marketing organizations and provoke rethinking of marketing organizations and the BMS (Joshi and
Giménez, 2014). Numerous professional articles predict or recommend a real change in the BMS (see,
for instance, Cooperstein, 2012; or English, 2015).

A shift towards more consumer-centric organizations

Since the very beginning of the 21st century, much research and many case studies have noted that
marketing organizations need to be more customer-oriented to address the new digital and technological
environment better. In an in-depth study of 50 managers, Homburg et al. (2000, p. 467) found that "many
firms that traditionally tended toward product-focused definitions of business units and which structured
their sales units around geographies (typically, regions in the United States or countries in Europe) are
redefining their business units from a customer perspective. While this does not mean completely
abandoning the traditional orientations, their relative importance is diminishing". In the new P&G
marketing organization implemented in 2000, Gupta (2003, p. 2) described the emergence of a “Cohort
management strategy”, targeting cohorts of consumers with similar attitudes and needs. Similarly, a
Harvard Business School case (Shapiro, 2002) proposed as a best practice the creation of a customer-
centric team by coordinating sales and marketing through a CRM program.

However, while some major marketing departments such as Nike or Pepsi Co. are undergoing
massive changes in their BMS (De Swaan Arons et al., 2014; Lau et al., 2015), the organizational
structure of the marketing departments in a large majority of companies – product or brand managers
organized in silos – has not changed that much in the last 40 years. “Most marketing organizations are
stuck in the last century”, and CMOs are struggling to design new efficient organizations (De Swaan
Arons et al., 2014, p. 55).

The mutation toward customer centricity seems so complex to implement that the consulting firm
McKinsey recommends the introduction of a Chief Customer Officer (CCO) as a transitory stage to
accelerate the process and breakdown the silos (Bughin et al., 2015). This new function is aimed at obtaining a master view of every customer through distinct sets of data and fostering co-creation by bringing customers directly into the creative process. If this has not removed the brand manager function however, this may reduce the influence and power of the BMS.

**A loss of control over brand management**

The digital age also changes the way marketers manage brands, leading to new paradigms in research. Quinton (2013) proposes a switch from the relational paradigm described by Louro & Cunha (2001) to a community paradigm to better describe the current situation. As a matter of fact, the advent of social media has resulted in a fundamental shift in consumer interaction with brands present both off- and online, mainly with social conversation, co-creation, brand communities, mobile communication and interactive gaming. By switching from conversation (top-down) to debate (multilayer interactions with multiple stakeholders), brand meaning is co-created during the consumer-brand relationship. The customer-perceived brand meaning is re-interpreted at each touchpoint that a consumer has with a managerially determined brand interface, a brand employee, or an external stakeholder. Iglesias & Bonet (2012, p. 251) call this “persuasive brand management”, as brand managers are progressively losing control over the multiple sources of brand meaning and are only co-producers of stories, rhetoric, and narratives to influence the meaning of the brand.

In this context, brand communication and management are no longer exclusively internally driven. There is a shift of power toward consumers through brand communities and co-creation, which are seen as ways to foster creativity. Consequently, brand managers are expected to acquire new social media skills (De Swaan Arons et al., 2014). Outside the company, brand managers now have to address fragmented specialist service providers. Inside the company, new specialist positions such as digital privacy analysts or native content editors emerge and challenge the generalist position of brand manager (Brinker and McLellan, 2014).

**Brand managers as top-level facilitators**

Several researchers emphasize the new key role of coordination assigned to the position of brand manager. While De Swaan Arons et al. (2014, p. 60) use the word “orchestrator”, Brexendorf and Daecke (2012) underline that the tasks of brand managers have become more multi-faceted than ever, as they need to integrate the new complex ecosystem inherited from digital advances, including multiplication of touchpoints and customer journey management. The brand manager is now asked to “combine the insights of market and brand research with creative, entrepreneurial and implementation-oriented thinking” (Brexendorf and Daecke, 2012, p. 33), often in a global context. In this case, empowerment by top management is even more crucial as global brands require high top-level coordination by creating tight relationships with the CEO, making certain that marketing goals support company goals, bridging organizational silos by integrating marketing and other disciplines and ensuring that global, regional, and local marketing teams work interdependently. From the example of General Motors, Townsend, Cavusgil and Baba (2010) underline the need to encompass both the commonalities and the divergences between markets (global orientation, global market knowledge competencies and global coordination) and plead for global championship.

The brand manager’s tasks then broaden to facilitation, acting as the spokesperson’s office and communication for societal purposes. However, these tasks are traditionally devoted to the communication team, often directly linked to the CEO, which is becoming a key interface for the BMS.

**New skills required**

Data-driven decision-making poses obvious challenges concerning skills, as brand managers are now working at the boundaries of marketing, statistics, econometrics and IT (Joshi and Giménez, 2014). This means that they need to combine a double expertise. They are expected to have strategic and management skills while possessing a “broad and deep set of skills” (Wedel and Kannan, 2016, p. 20) to master different data and analytics requirements. Moreover, their knowledge has to be continuously updated in a fast-changing environment. “They must be strategists, allocating scarce resources to support company priorities and increasing return on investment. They must be technologists, tracking and capitalizing on the most useful of the sophisticated technologies that are flooding their field. In addition, they must be scientists, because the future of their business may not look much like the past” (Joshi and Giménez, 2014, p. 65). This leads to the emergence of more specialized marketing functions, such as
A History of the Brand Management System

that of Chief Marketing Technologist (CMT), a marketing analyst serving as a liaison between the Chief Marketing Officer (CMO) and other internal stakeholders such as IT (Brinker and McLellan, 2014).

In terms of soft skills, experts say that the current brand manager should be able to work efficiently in cross-functional teams as well as to embrace a test-and-learn methodology with the development of experiments (De Baere, 2016; Joshi and Giménez, 2014). Collaboration and networking thus become new focuses of the BMS. Brand managers are now expected to “cross organizational boundaries” and “make and execute shared decisions” (Joshi and Giménez, 2014, p. 65 and 67). These authors describe how companies like Target and Nordstrom have revamped their decision processes and improved collaboration between the BMS and other functions on planning and strategy, execution and operations.

In this fourth era, even though the BMS makes a significant contribution to company performance (Cui et al., 2014; Homburg et al., 2015), it is losing influence in favor of the sales department (Homburg et al., 2015), as was already observed in the previous era.

Discussion and future of the BMS

The BMS was originally conceived in 1931 as a team taking full responsibility for a brand (Duffy, 2011), led by a “little general manager” (Buell, 1975, p. 4). Still, a critical-historical evaluation shows that the BMS has never been implemented this way in reality. It reveals four distinct eras of the BMS (Figure 1) and shows that today, the BMS is torn between two opposing but complementary directions: the “galvanic facilitator” and the “absolute expert”. Indeed, the fourth era of the BMS gives influential power back to brand managers by reconfiguring them into a hybrid form inherited from the two previous periods. Ideally, today’s brand managers should be two-headed. This poses significant challenges for the organization: the main one is to change from a hierarchical to a networked organization, a shift that seems against nature for many FMCG companies.

As a main consequence, it is questionable whether a sole person can hold the position that was formerly held by one brand manager. This introduces the challenges of collaborative work in marketing, including organizational agility, cooperation rules and network mastery. The most challenging task for managers, therefore, consists in breaking the silos while managing the overlaps. Joshi and Gimenez (2014, p. 65) state that “to break down barriers, marketing pioneers are revamping the decision processes at the boundaries between functions, focusing on three areas: planning and strategy, execution, and operations and infrastructure.” Moreover, as the two required profiles (the “galvanic facilitator” and the “absolute expert”) stand miles apart in both behavior and mindset, the alchemy may result in a true management challenge. This situation questions the decision-making process as well as the management control systems, which should be flexible enough to allow both cooperation and a trial-error approach.

Lastly, one might rightfully wonder whether such a dichotomous picture is achievable in a single organization – especially in large corporations, where the set of rules may prevent the galvanic facilitator from breaking the silos (Joshi and Giménez, 2014). A part of the solution may lie in the capability of large firms to foster strategic brand venturing through spin-outs or alliances set apart from the existing business, obeying other rules (Van Rensburg, 2014). However, venturing teams inside marketing departments may stir organizational resistance, and risks of failure prove high. Indeed, in the firms studied by Van Rensburg (2014, p. 13), “a “failure” rate of 75 percent for brand intrapreneurial projects was acknowledged as a very creditable accomplishment”.

Beyond these general concerns, this historical approach of the BMS is useful for scenario planning and foresight. Indeed, “studying the history of any discipline thought, including marketing, is invaluable to developing and improving the ability both to explain and to predict phenomena” (Shaw, 2015b). Regarding the BMS, many outcomes and configurations are possible, depending on whether (1) the focus is more on the exploitation of the enormous amount of consumer data or on a genuine brand story, and (2) the focus is short- or long-term oriented. When juxtaposing these two dimensions, four distinct scenarios can be foreseen (Figure 3). The first two give the power back to consumers, and the last two are more oriented towards the promotion of specific skills, visions and ideologies through brand building.
1st scenario: a buzz word (and world)

The BMS can possibly turn into a community management team working in a social room, where action is driven by the e-reputation of the brand short-term – not to say, in the present moment. This first scenario combines a short-term approach and a content-driven orientation, focusing on awareness. In that vision, brand teams dedicate their time and efforts to participate in on-line conversations at multiple levels. Virality and buzz become the main objectives of the team, which requires more agility or conversational skill than strategic thinking. Product development is seen as a co-creation activity performed on-line with consumers. Power is given back to consumers through horizontal relationships that replace the former top-down communication tools.

A good example of this first possible scenario is Dell and its Social Media Listening and Command Center, which makes sense of the 25,000 on-line conversations mentioning the brand each day (Rooney, 2012).

2nd scenario: the primacy of analytics

In this scenario, where companies are more short-term focused and data-driven, the BMS could disappear and be replaced by a handful of data scientists. The role of the data scientists is to uncover in real-time hidden consumption patterns and consumers’ brand preferences in the enormous amount of data available. Marketing decisions are entirely automatized, with analytical findings determining the actions of the customer service, sales department and R&D teams. As already experienced in some groundbreaking organizations (Harris and Ogbonna, 2003), if consumer knowledge is disseminated and used by all functional teams, a brand manager coordinating the actions is no longer needed.

Companies such as Google, Amazon and Netflix are pioneering examples of this data-driven organizational culture, which is spreading across firms operating in more traditional sectors, such as United Airlines (O’Toole and Leininger, 2016).

3rd scenario: enhancing relational capital

In this scenario, with a long-term and data orientation, the BMS would definitely lose influence against the sales department, which would take over in terms of customer knowledge by better exploiting the possibilities offered by CRM systems for customer acquisition and retention. Here, the sales department would become a “customer journey” or “customer experience” department, dealing with all customer touchpoints before, during and after purchase. This would include the responsibility for customer-care service extended to social network management, as well as sophisticated loyalty programs that would allow a high degree of offer personalization. The BMS could remain, but only for its content, thus
reducing the function to an editor or curator of content - a task that could easily be externalized to a
communication agency or fall into the responsibility of the communication director.

This organizational form is spreading within service firms such as Airbnb (Brown, 2016). Likewise,
major fast-moving consumer goods companies such as Coca-Cola (Esterl, 2014) are creating chief
customer officer positions at a senior level.

4th scenario: the BMS regains its former glory
This last scenario, long-term and brand-content focused, bets on the fact that the data overload could
create a need for more thorough strategic thinking around what the brand should be and what it should
stand for – namely, the brand identity. In an open world with fierce competition, brands could then be
seen and managed by companies as valuable intangible assets fueled with symbolic meaning, and
therefore, difficult to imitate. Building such brand equity would require outstanding creative ideas and
good storytelling qualities to stand miles apart from competition and emerge from the deafening noise.
This would require highly creative people who do not hesitate to break the silos internally so that the
brand “spirit” inspires the whole organization. This definition of skills is far from that of the brand
manager who looked like an accountant in the 1980s-1990s but is ultimately much closer to the initial
idea of Neil Mc Elroy when he invented the BMS. In that context, the BMS would not only remain but
also be reinforced, as the brand becomes more central in the organization and inspiring for decision
making.

Pioneering industries have hired these creative profiles to create the “magic” (Dion and Arnould,
2011), such as David Shing at AOL (Gabbatt, 2014) or Karl Lagerfeld at Chanel (Kapferer, 2012, p.
196). These figures are mediatized outside the company. However, people with similar characteristics
of charismatic leadership exist as well within organizations, where they enroll and inspire their co-
workers (Berger-Remy and Michel, 2015).

Conclusion
In terms of academic implications, this research confirms the interest of an historical approach to take a
more objective perspective and avoid availability or recency bias, which occurs when current
phenomena are over-estimated because they are highly topical (Tversky and Kahneman, 1974). The
historical methodology allows one to take a step back within a discipline and enrich it from a theoretical
standpoint (Shaw, 2011, 2014). Second, as we have included scholar as well as practitioner papers, our
research adds to the knowledge of the BMS and gives a deeper understanding of the current BMS
mutation. The longitudinal frame extends Low and Fullerton’s analysis (1994) and shows that the
evolution of the BMS is non-linear, incremental, and multi-path, which challenges the pre-conceived
idea of its continuous and gradual improvement. Third, we derive from the intellectual history of the
BMS four possible scenarios for the future (see Figure 1), depending on which time perspective (short-
or long-term) and brand orientation (data or content) prevails. Lastly, our research proposes that the
major shifts observed in the digital era have in reality taken almost two decades, due to an organizational
inertia and resistance probably underestimated in recent papers.

Regarding managers, reflexivity on the marketing function may help them to redesign their
marketing organizations – not just by adding a digital function – and highlights the need for
complementary profiles among marketing executives. Moreover, as boundaries between marketing and
other functions such as IT, sales and finance blur with the rise of digital marketing, the interfaces
between functions must be redefined. The whole marketing function has to be “decompartmentalized”
to increase networking and agility. This is particularly relevant for business firms, where these changes
are occurring even faster. Finally, this research underlines the need to rethink management rules in the
organization regarding decision-making, role allocation and control systems.

To conclude, this historical perspective shows that there is no such thing as a marketing revolution,
but rather an accelerated twofold-evolution in a fast-moving environment. Indeed, the seeds of the recent
changes were already sown in the previous periods. The current marketing organization challenge is to
reconcile two opposing ways of thinking which require distinct creative and analytical skills. The
outstanding issue is whether and how it can be achieved in one organization. As Low and Fullerton
already concluded in 1994 (p. 188), “though the brand manager system as we know it could come to an
end, brand management itself almost certainly will continue to thrive”.

Future research is encouraged to more systematically investigate published firm histories or study
cases in company archives to consolidate or adjust the framework suggested in the present paper. From
a methodological standpoint, in-depth interviews with high-level experts and managers may also add to this historical approach to further envisage and assess possible future scenarios.

References


The courting of advertisers: The self-advertising of the Swedish press and its depiction of gendered and classed market segments, 1880-1939

Klara Arnberg
Department of Economic History, Stockholm University, Sweden

Abstract

Purpose – The purpose of this paper is to analyze the press’ self-advertising to the advertisers in order to trace early divisions into market segments primarily based on gender and social class.

Design/methodology/approach – Both qualitative and quantitative analysis are made in order to follow the changes of highlighted consumer groups in the ads. Also a qualitative intersectional analysis is made in order to see how notions of class and gender intersected.

Research limitation/implications – This paper takes an overall perspective of market segmentation in relation to the press and tells less about different market segmentation strategies from single businesses point of view. The sectioning of the press is stressed as a prerequisite for market segmentation and the economic history of mass media is lifted as essential for understanding the latter. Therefore the gendering and classing of market segments were also based on how common interests were interpreted by political movements and their press forums. For surviving in the long run, however, the political press needed to commercialize the political identities in order to attract advertisers and survive economically.

Keywords – market segmentation, gender, class, Sweden, press history

Paper Type – Research paper

It is the mother who, according to common knowledge, herself makes most of the purchases for her family. Without the mother’s consultation, the rest of the family buys practically nothing. Mother is a good customer (Ad for Allers, published in Annonsören 1933:5-6).

This quotation is an example of how weeklies portrayed themselves as optimal advertising forums in ads published in advertising trade journals in the interwar period. Just like in this example, the targeting of a specific readership (here mothers) was not unusual. This paper is devoted to this type of self-advertising of the press and seeks to trace continuities and changes in how newspapers and magazines framed their readers as (gendered and classed) customers.

The division of the press by their targeted readerships is analyzed in relation to the segmentation of the consumer goods market, where producers sought relevant advertising forums to certain groups of customers. In this way, the respective histories of the expansion of commodity retailing and of the expansion of the press in the late 19th and early 20th centuries are intimately connected. Not only the producers and retailers of consumer goods were dependent on the press as an important channel of marketing, press publishers were reciprocally dependent on the incomes from ads.

During the industrialization process, the purchasing power of different groups changed rapidly. New commodities were introduced on the market, and ideas about consumer behaviour and market research were developed. By studying the self-advertising of the press in national ad tariff publications and advertising trade journals during the late 19th and early 20th Centuries, this paper aims to follow changing notions of market segments or consumer groups. How were consumer groups depicted and presented to the presumed advertisers, and how were they divided and framed over time? The study takes a natural end with the outbreak of World War II, when the conditions for advertising changed drastically. In the
An intersectional perspective on segmentation

Market segmentation was introduced as a term in marketing in the 1950s, and has since become a central concept for describing the heterogeneity of consumer needs and the division of markets into sub-categories (Wedel & Kamakura 2000). Therefore, the use of the term segmentation in describing late 19th- and early 20th-century markets might be seen as anachronistic. However, in accordance with previous research, marketing directed at sub-markets based on the (real or perceived) preferences of certain consumers was practiced before being theorized and termed segmentation (cf. Berghoff et al. 2012; Fullerton 2012). In a completely different theoretical tradition, intersectionality as a concept was introduced broadly to critical gender studies in the early 2000s in order to describe the division of different categories of power-relations and how they affected and intersected with each other. Despite their differences, the lines of division relating to gender, social class and ethnical background is common in both traditions. In this paper, the tools of the latter tradition will be used in order to understand the former.

Marketing historians often relate to historical stages in which local markets were broadened due to communications improvements. Simply put, in the late 19th century newspapers achieved nationwide distribution, enabling broad advertising, followed by new printing methods. These changes made it possible to differentiate ads and products. As the organizing of sales was improved, making mass marketing possible, a more mature market with segmentation to different consumer groups, etc., in the post-war period was constructed (Tedlow 1990; 1993; Cohen 2004; Funke 2013). Even if there are different views regarding when the segmentation processes in advertising began and intensified more precisely, the press has definitely become increasingly segmented, making it possible to direct ads to increasingly specific readerships based on aspects such as gender, age, and interests (cf. Larsson 1989; Larsson 2003:112). While the post-war trend of thinking in terms of market segments was driven by theorists and marketing experts based on marketing research, this article follows the segmentation processes driven instead by practitioners in the era often referred to as one of mass consumption and mass marketing (Berghoff et al. 2012; Funke 2013). This paper argues that the differentiation of the press in segments preceded and was a prerequisite for the development of more specialised segmented marketing strategies.

In this paper, advertising is studied as filling the product with ‘connotative meaning’ – often drawing upon notions of class and gender (see Neve 2010). Several studies have enlightened how consumption became connected to notions of femininity and class in Europe and North America, and how these notions affected sales strategies in the early 20th century (Neve 2010; Hermansson 2002; Arnberg 2013). Söderberg (1997) has argued that a gender perspective is essential for understanding changing preferences over time, and also stresses the relation between consumption, the press, and women’s economic power in general (see also Peiss 2001; Sivulka 2009:19). However, by reaching beyond the mere discourse of the female consumer developed by businessmen and the gendered and clasped content of ads aimed at the consumer, I believe the study of the history of the notion of commercial driving forces in relation to gender, class, sexuality, etc., can be further developed.

The ads studied in this paper are seen as part of the communication between the media sector and the advertisers. Other types of contact between them in order to make the latter advertise in media products produced by the former are beyond the scope of this paper (cf. Jonsson 2003). The communication between the various newspapers and magazines and the advertisers is studied through an intersectional analytical lens. This means that I study how different social hierarchies, here primarily based on class and gender, are intertwined and how they are ascribed meaning in the ads. An intersectional perspective thus means that questions of, for example, how class has been gendered and gender has been classed
become a central point of analysis (de los Reyes & Muliniari 2005; Tolvhed 2010). The aim of this paper is therefore to trace how these historical constructions of belonging (in an intersectional sense) were connected to economic considerations (relating to segmentation), and thus how different consumer groups were imagined and economically framed (cf. McCall 2005). The main focus in this text is on the intersection between gender and class, but it also raises questions concerning nationality, ethnicity, sexuality, and other power structures when relevant. The application on an intersectional perspective on segmentation also implies that I do not understand segments as neutral or given divisions, but as part of a system that mirrors and reproduces hierarchical relations.

**Selection of sources**

For the first period, 1880-1923, the ad tariffs of the Gumaelius advertising agency, *Nordisk annonstaxa*, have been studied. There, newspapers and magazines could argue why they were suitable advertising forums. In the publication, tariffs for the various journals and magazines were published together with a section where the press could advertise to potential advertisers. In an article studying some of the same ads from a different perspective, Sverker Jonsson (2003) has pointed out that especially magazines and newspapers with limited circulation had to stress the affluence of their readers. Since reliable statistics on circulation were not established until the 1940s, exaggeration in this respect was common. From the start, advertising agencies like Gumaelius published their own tariffs, but beginning in 1924 the *Svensk annonstaxa* [The Swedish Ad Tariff] was published jointly for all the organized advertising agencies – without ads. During the 1920s, several trade publications for advertisers and ad men appeared on the market as an effect of the upsurge of advertising in general, including a professionalization process and the advent of new marketing theories that connected advertising to the scientific (Hermansson 2002; Funke 2015). With the addition of these trade magazines, the latter period of the study comprises ads published in the Swedish advertisers’ association’s member journal *Annonsören* [The Advertiser] (1926-1939), the business journal *Affärsekonomi* [Business Economy] (1928-1939), the Swedish advertising association yearbook, *Svensk reklam* [Swedish Advertising] (1929-1939), the advertising trade journals *Futurum* (1936-1939), and *Reklam-nyheterna* (1936-1939).

The paper is structured as follows. First, a section presents the ads at an overall quantitative level, divided and compared based on the consumer groups or readerships they address. Second, different qualitatively analytical sections address the affluent readership and all social classes, the working class, women, farmers and the affluent countryside, and in the last section, political affiliation as an argument. The concluding section summarizes and discusses the findings.

**Counting the ads**

The press expanded greatly during the industrial breakthrough of the 1890s with new titles, lower prices, and higher and wider circulation (Schön 2012:246). Press ownership also reflected the growing power of a bourgeoisie class and the formation of the labour movement. In an international comparison, political parties and popular movements have owned Swedish daily papers relatively often (Djerf-Pierre 2007; cf. Schön 2012:216). Just as in other countries, however, commercial stakeholders ran the popular press (Larsson 1989).

The Swedish market for advertising was marked by a cartel from 1915 onwards, whereby authorized agencies were tied to the Swedish Newspaper Publishers’ Association (TU). Advertising agencies and newspapers thus had a formalized symbiotic relationship (Åström Rudberg 2015; Funke 2013).

In 1880, the most influential advertising agency at the time, operated by Sophia Gumaelius, began publishing ads from the press in its ad tariff publication. The first issue consisted of 17 ads. Most of them were from regional newspapers and had selling arguments based on their circulation figures and geographical reach, and the prices for placing ads in them (Jonsson 2003). One of them claimed to reach all social classes, however, and another the affluent classes. The share of ads using the publication’s readership as a selling argument rose during the period up to the 1920s, from 14% in 1881 to 36% in 1891 and 51% in 1921. The total number of ads also rose, from the initial 17, to 91 in 1891, 197 in 1901, and 237 in 1921. As shown in Figure 1, the most commonly depicted readerships were either all classes or the affluent classes.

![Figure 1: Represented segment/readership in ads for newspapers and magazines 1891-1921](image-url)
A clear tendency in Figure 1 is the decrease in the share of ads referring to all social classes or affluent classes, whereas groups such as farmers, workers and women increased their share (or, as in the case of women, emerged as a consumer group). In absolute terms, however, all the groups increased since the total number of ads increased over time.

During the rest of the 1920s, self-advertising by the press appeared with irregularities in the trade press and the publishing of them is therefore not suitable for quantifying. In the 1930s, however, *Affärsekonomi* published what they termed “issue for market analysis” every year, accompanied with massive advertising from the press, compiled into Figure 2.
During the second period, presented in Figure 2, the decrease of newspapers and magazines claiming to have readers of all social classes first halted and reversed in 1931 and 1933, but continued the rest of the period. The share of affluent classes as a claimed segment fluctuated a bit more, but never went back to the high levels of the 19th Century. The share of the farmer segment stabilised at a quite low level and seems to have peaked during the economic crisis of the early 1920s. The worker’s segment however stabilised at a much higher level than during the previous period and the social democratic newspapers increasingly stressed that their readers were workers as we will see. Also the women as a segment increased their share. However, as we will see in the coming sections, the 1920s seems to have been the decade when the stressing of women’s role as consumers were most present in the ads. These arguments were also present in the 1930s copy for women’s magazines, but the most common was instead to stress the new techniques of colour printing. Therefore, the stressing of the readers’ gender was reduced.

During the 1930s, the number of ads was more stable, approximately 150-200 each year. The share of ads that used the reaching of a certain market segment as an argument was also more stable, 40-45 per cent.

An affluent readership or reaching all classes
Already from the start, class aspects were brought up in the ads – often to stress that a publication reached everyone or that they reached an affluent segment of the population. Allehanda för folket [All kind of news for the people], for example, wrote in their ad that they had a nationwide circulation and that their readers came from all social classes. Lunds veckoblad [Lund Weekly], on the other hand, asserted that they had “a solid readership, associated chiefly with the layers of society where consuming power is found". In 1882, Helsingborgs tidning similarly claimed to have their readers amongst “the educated and economically independent public on the countryside and in the towns”. More specifically, Nya Skånska Posten claimed that ads intended for “landowners, office holders, merchants, and great industrialists” would be best placed with them, as they had a greater readership than no other newspaper based in Kristianstad County. The magazine Hvar 8 dag presented their subscribers in shares of “layers of society”: officials (ämbets- och tjänstemän) 55%, businessmen 35%, and diverse professions 10%
The courting of advertisers: The self-advertising of the Swedish press and its depiction of gendered and classed market segments, 1880-1939

The courting of advertisers: The self-advertising of the Swedish press and its depiction of gendered and classed market segments, 1880-1939

(Annonsören, 1926:8). This sometimes connected more clearly to the discussion within the advertising trade, where the “quality” of the audience was said to be of specific importance. During the 1930s, the newspapers and magazines increasingly published information about their subscribers in terms of social class, their marital status and so on (e.g. ad for Skånska dagbladet, 1933:5, p. 191). Svenska dagbladet even made comparisons between the tax register, the car register, and their subscribers to stress the affluence of their readership (Annonsören, 1938 Sep/Oct). The affluence of the audience and the efficiency of advertising were also stressed in images. In 1910, for example, Sydsvenska dagbladet claimed to reach all educated (bildad) homes in southern Sweden. The drawing showed a newspaper vendor boy in the foreground and several men in black coats and top hats in the background. In a similar way, but with the purpose of illustrating that it reached all classes, Göteborgstidningen’s illustration in 1921 featured two men eagerly approaching the vendor boy – one of them in a black coat with a fur collar and a top hat, and the other in thread-worn garments. In the background of the picture, a man wearing more middle-class connoted clothing is reading the paper.

Ad for Sydsvenska dagbladet in Nordisk annonstaxa, 1910; and for Göteborgstidningen in Nordisk annonstaxa, 1921.

Apparently, in these ads class was framed as a masculine category. Not surprisingly, affluence continued to be depicted throughout the period. Both the affluence of the readership and the claim to reach all social classes fits well into the narrative of mass production demanding mass advertising – magazines and newspapers simply tried to convince producers that they reached the most affluent buyers possible. However, when market research was developed in the 1930s, articles discussing how to reach different social classes appeared in the trade magazines (e.g. Törnqvist, 1931; Hallonquist, 1937). Yet even before this, as we will see, other consumer groups or segments were also depicted.

The working class

Workers were increasingly illustrated when labour movement newspapers advertised for themselves. In 1901, for example, the newspaper Arbetet stressed that, since it was owned and read by “the organized workers of southern Sweden (the most affluent of workers) who preferably make their purchases according to ads placed in their newspaper, every sensible businessman should advertise in Arbetet”. A similar argument was used in the ad for Ny Tid in 1910 claiming that 99 out of 100 purchases were the result of successful advertising. Businessmen should therefore search their customers wisely: “Everyone searches for the ‘big audience’, but by different means. One of the most efficient is to advertise in Ny Tid […], which reaches the most diligent and hence also those with the most purchasing power within
Interestingly about the dilemma to support their advertisers (by advertising over time. In 1935, for example, they stated that 54 organisations with almost 43,000 members had “unanimously declared to advise the members to support the advertisers of Social-Demokraten” (Affärsekonomi, 1935:8, 375). The expansion of social democratic newspapers continued until the 1920s, when they experienced a downturn that continued throughout the 20th century. Gardeström (2016) describes how the social democratic press used several parallel strategies in the 1930s to overcome the problem of continued low ad revenues: one of these was courting advertisers through the here studied type of self-advertising; all in order to convince businessmen who did not sympathize with the political aim of the social democratic press to nevertheless advertise in their newspapers. The gap between the social democratic newspapers and the advertising industry was also narrowed due to leading publishers appearing in ads, and the social democratic leader and Prime Minister Per Albin Hansson even spoke at the advertising convention. At the same time, advertising as a phenomenon was continually criticized in the social democratic newspapers.

As we have seen, the courting of advertisers (by advertising to them) did not start in the 1930s, but it did grow increasingly intense and partly diverted from previous social democratic advertising strategies. Social-Demokraten did not mention that the newspaper was directed mainly at workers in ads in 1929 and 1933-34, but simply that it reached an affluent readership. They also stressed that most of the subscribers read no other newspaper, and that an ad in Social-Demokraten was hence the only way to reach them (Svensk reklam, 1933/34).

Workers were increasingly depicted not only as men, but also sometimes as belonging to nuclear families. For example, Social-Demokraten featured a drawing of a family consisting of a young boy playing with construction toys, a mother reading the newspaper, and a father smoking his pipe and reading a book, with bookshelves and a gramophone in the background. The caption read: “The purchasing power of the workers has increased”. The newspaper promised that there was no better way to reach the “working and buying population” than advertising in Social-Demokraten (Annonsören, 1930:9; Svensk reklam, 1930). The fact that the mother was the one reading the paper was certainly not a coincidence, as the mother was termed the “purchasing manager of the home” both by the newspaper’s ad manager and in contemporary advertising literature (Arnberg, 2013; Gardeström, 2016).
The ad for *Social-Demokraten* presents what has become the generic image of the ‘educated’ (*bildad*) and diligent worker family. Parallel to this, however, workers were continually also portrayed as men only (e.g. ad for *Ny Tid* in *Affärsekonomi*, 1931:11, p. 479; ad for *Arbetet* in *Futurum*, 1937:7; ad for *Ny tid* in *Affärsekonomi*, 1937:6).

One way of convincing advertisers to put their ads in the Social-democratic newspapers was to refer to marketing authorities that stressed the affluence of workers. Already in 1931, *Social-Demokraten* did so by citing an article by the liberal economic journalist Anton Lindberger who had proposed a new definition of what an affluent audience was due to the increased disposable incomes for workers – incomes they spent on new consumer products (*Affärsekonomi*, 1931:3, 119; SBL, 23, p. 260). In another ad in 1933, *Social-Demokraten* quoted a managing director Rolf Henriksen, who claimed that the working class was the easiest of all social classes to influence through advertising: “the working population consists of solid purchasing power for mass-produced goods, and due to their collectivistic mind-set, they easily allow themselves to be affected by advertising” (Henriksen quoted in ad in *Annonsören*, 1933:7-8).

Another way to convince the advertisers of the purchasing power of the working class was to refer to newly established labour market agreements or raised salaries for workers (e.g. ad for *Social-demokraten* in *Reklammyhetera*, 1938:2, 3). In their 1937 ad, *Östergötlands folkblad* for example illustrated the relationship between the newspaper and the advertisers with a handshake and the headline: “Cooperation that bring results: You offer the product – We offer the customer base”. The newspaper further emphasized their readership as potential consumers:
You can easily make the thousands and thousands of workers who have their livelihood here – now under significantly improved condition – Your customers. And they will become valuable customers – protected by the current agreement people dare spending their incomes more than under previous days of insecurity (ad for Östergötlands folkblad in Affärsekonomi, 1937:12).

Where workers lacked financial resources, they constituted a great share of the population and were certainly also the consumers of most everyday goods, something the editors apparently tried to convince advertisers of. When the depression hit large shares of the economy in the 1930s, several of the newspapers claimed to have readers from social groups that were not affected by it (from the public sector) or who were workers in industries in more stable markets and regions (e.g. ad for Norra Västerbotten in Affärsekonomi, 1933:5, p. 204; ad for Social-Demokraten in Affärsekonomi, 1933:2, p. 79 and 1933:7, p. 293; ad for Västerbottens-Kuriren in Affäreskonomi, 1933: 13, p. 520).

Female consumers
In the mid-19th century, family magazines based on the idealized bourgeois family life started being published, as did outspoken women’s magazines a bit later (Johannesson, 1980; Larsson, 1989). Newspapers and magazines differed in their functions, as the former often had a broad regional reach and the latter a more specific national reach, which suited their different advertising purposes (Qvarsell, 2005).

When the women’s magazine Idun (with the subtitle “Illustrated magazine for the woman and the home”, but in fact informally connected to the women’s movement) was advertised in 1901, it was not stressed that its readers were female, but instead that it reached the “affluent classes” and had high circulation figures. Likewise, in 1921, Allers Familj-Journal did not mention who its readers were, but instead that they eagerly awaited the magazine’s arrival every week and that they carefully read every page of it. The magazine was therefore the best advertising medium existing in Sweden, the ad stated: “It is comparable to putting your goods on a counter in a store visited by 367,000 people”.

The 1920s saw a shift towards more emphasis on gender than before. This probably connected to revitalized theories of the woman’s role in the consumption process, claiming that the woman was in fact the main deciding party when a family made its purchases (Hermansson, 2002). The intersectional implications of the image of Mrs. Consumer (In Swedish, Fru kund – intensively debated in the 1930s) connected not only to the fact that she was described as married and a mother (as in the opening quotation), but also to her characterization as affluent or middle-class (cf. Arnberg, 2013). This was clear in articles in the trade magazines, but even more so in the ads studied in this paper. Idun, for example, explained: “If you are looking for the readership with purchasing power among the affluent and well educated classes in the Swedish homes, especially everything that affects the woman, you should advertise in Idun, the ‘ladies’ own’” (Annonsören, 1926:2). Just like Social-Demokraten, Husmodern and other women’s magazines reformulated modern advertising theories and ideas as selling arguments directed to advertisers. The idea that women were the main consumers was consequently an obvious pitch for Husmodern:

Women make most of the purchases. But that is not all; they also affect their men’s purchases. And the most important source of inspiration for women is Husmodern.

With consistent advertising in Husmodern, you win not only the women but, through them, also the men (Annonsören, 1930:6).

Idun, as well as Allers and other women’s magazines, reiterated that most men pointed out their wife as the “buying manager” of the household and that an ad should be directed to female consumers to be selling (Affärsekonomi, 1931:4, p. 169; Annonsören, 1933:9-10). In 1931, Stockholms-Tidningen presented a drawing of a family sitting at the dinner table. The caption read: “The managing board is gathered” together with copy presenting the father as the paymaster, the mother as the buying manager and the children as proposers (Affärsekonomi, 1931:7, 304).

Konsumentbladet – owned by the consumer’s association (KF) – which claimed to reach a third of all married women, as well as the largest weeklies, all used the same main arguments pointing towards the purchasing power of the housewife (see ad for Konsumentbladet in Affärsekonomi, 1929:9; cf. Aléx, 1994). Konsumentbladet, however, additionally connected women’s suffrage with their role as
consumers: “The woman of today not only has the right to vote – she also knows how to exercise her authority in other areas, not least in her own home.” (ad for Konsumentbladet in Affärsekonomi, 1929:9). Dagens nyheter illustrated their ad with a picture of a classy young woman with her wallet open: “This is the female Stockholmer. It is she who buys the large share of the thousands of necessities that make up the turnover of the Stockholm retailers” (Front page of Affärsekonomi, 1937:14). Some of the newspapers also stressed that they had several pages directed to women and the home (eg. Ad for Stockholms-tidningen in Affärsekonomi, 1937:14, 831).

However, some of the magazines also stressed their broad (gender) range, possibly (indirectly) referring to the debate in the trade magazine over how accurate the idea of Mrs. Consumer was (cf. Arnberg, 2013). Four of the largest weeklies (directed at different consumer groups in terms of gender) featured a drawing of the silhouette of a man and a woman talking, with the caption “Does she persuade him, or the other way around?” In either case, the ad stated, they would both have seen the ad if it had been placed in any of these four magazines (Svensk reklam, 1930; Annonsören, 1930:10). Vårt hem [Our Home] featured the headline “‘All people’ – you, me, he, she, they; all of them read Vårt hem” (Svensk reklam, 1929) and a few years later Allers featured the similar headline: “to the home – to the family – where father and mother and sons and daughters during the year buy thousands of products for their personal or common use” (Affärsekonomi, 1933:1). In a similar manner, Karlstads-tidningen presented Mr and Mrs Värmland (the name of the province) – a couple in middle-class clothing who were said to eagerly long for their newspaper every day (ad in Affärsekonomi, 1937:12).

Some women’s magazines also stressed their broad range in terms of class. In 1933, Allers claimed that “rich wives as well as poor wives” read the magazine with the same pleasure. They also bought the same products: “They have the same needs and the same taste in choosing countless small and large things that are necessary supplies in all families for the daily lives of their members” (Annonsören, 1933:11-12). An overlapping of gender and class sometimes appeared in the newspapers as well. Sydsvenska dagbladet, for example, declared:

\textit{Not only the big estate’s newspaper, but also in the thousands of farms and homes, Sydsvenska dagbladet snäpposten} is a guest. Sydsvenska dagbladet has long been known as the family newspaper above all others, and the newspaper for the good and affluent homes. Most often, it is the woman in the home who decides on purchases. Homes are the buyers of almost all goods (ad for Sydsvenska dagbladet in Affärsekonomi, 1929:3).

In a similar manner, Stockholms-tidningen characterized the father of the family as the producer of the family’s purchasing power, whereas the housewife conducted it (ad in Affärsekonomi, 1930:12). In a special issue of Futurum on “the woman and the future”, the right-wing daily newspaper Svenska dagbladet claimed to reach not only affluent women who could afford the advertised goods and had the time to react to the ads, but also 20,000 housemaids in Stockholm, representing “the power behind the kitchen door” (ad for Svenska dagbladet in Futurum, 1937:7; Annonsören, 1938 Sep/Oct). In the same issue, Östersundsposten equated an ad placed in their paper with a letter sent directly to the housewives of the region (Futurum, 1937:7). Perhaps as a response to the use of the female consumer by ordinary newspapers, Allers Mönster-Tidning stated: “What’s the point if you waste 77% of your ads on those who are uninterested? If you want to advertise to ladies, you have to place your ad in a magazine that is read by ladies and ladies only” (ad in Affärsekonomi, 1931:3). This message was exemplified in two illustrations, the first depicting papers drifting down over the entire population – presented in groups of 49% men and boys, 23% women between 20 and 55 years old, and younger and older women consisting respectively of 19 and 9% – and a second in which all the papers were concentrated to the middle segment of women only.

The popular press often had better paper quality than newspapers, making it easier to publish spectacular ads in colour. Their lifetime was longer, but so was their production time (Qvarsell, 2005). In the 1930s, several of the magazines stressed their possibility of printing ads in four colours rather than pointing out their readership. In the ad for the Sunday supplement of Stockholms-tidningen, however, colour and gender was connected: “The audiences’ and especially the ladies’ attention are caught with such a full-page” (Affärsekonomi, 1933:1).

The gendering of consumers and producers was sometimes (hetero)sexualized. In an ad for seven of the publisher Åhlén & Åkerlund’s weeklies, the map of Sweden was filled with images of women; the one exception was the Stockholm region, where a man in a suit was turning to the women. The caption...
read: “You’re a big FLIRT, Mr. Advertiser! And you aren’t satisfied with only one or two or ten – no, you flirt with everyone… you want to gain approval among all Swedish women” (ad for Å&Å in Svensk reklam, 1933-34; Affärsekonomi, 1933: referensnummer för marknadsbedömning, front page).

Ad for Åhlén & Åkerlund’s seven largest magazines, Affärsekonomi 1933: referensnummer för marknadsbedömning, front page.

As a group, men were very seldom mentioned explicitly, other than as an uncommented representation of a social class or as part of the family. One exception to this is the ad for the magazine Segel och Motor [Sail and Motor]. Its readers were claimed to be dedicated boat people: “to them, you can sell – apart from maritime goods – practically everything an affluent male audience is consuming” (Futurum, 1936:1, p. 130). Another exception was an ad for the men’s magazine Adam, “the boss’ own magazine”. In his home, the reader could in peace and quiet read articles about politics, sports, literature, men’s fashion, humorous drawings, wine and tobacco: “everything that interests a real man” (Reklamnyheterna, 1939:4, 4). The same can be said about young adults or teenagers. They were mostly seen as part of the family, but on rare occasions mentioned as a group. For example, the magazine Frihet [Freedom] claimed that people in the age of 16-24 earned 453 million SEK yearly and that young people found advertising a natural part of reading a newspaper and that they were easy to influence (Affärsekonomi, 1933:4, back page and 1933:7, p. 298).

Farmers, abstainers and other early segments
Throughout the period, farmers were depicted as an affluent and specific consumer group. Often, local newspapers stressed the soil fertility in their specific area – not seldom with an almost colonial rhetoric that described people there as “a race of its own” or offered the national advertisers the guidance needed for “penetrating” or “conquer” certain areas with the “weapon” of advertising (often in the northern part of Sweden, Norrland). These ads were recurrently illustrated with images of two well-dressed men
looking at a large map of the region. Regional newspapers often cooperated – for example in Svenska provinspressens förening [Swedish association for the Provincial Press] – and the advertiser got a discount if s/he advertised in several of them (see e.g. ad in Affärsekonomi, 1933:17, back page; ad for Nordvästra Söönes Förenade Tidningar, Affärsekonomi, 1935:11, 485; ad for H. Halls boktryckeri AB, Affärsekonomi, 1935:11, p. 493).

When Landmannen [The Farmer] advertised in 1910, they wrote: “excellent ad forum for those who, through their ads, want to reach our most able and energetic and affluent farmers, both large and small”. Jordbrukarnes tidning [Journal for Farmers] spelled this out in an even more straightforward manner: “Remember: ‘An ad in a magazine with only 10,000 subscribers, of whom everyone can afford what is advertised, is naturally a far more excellent advertising method than in a magazine that indeed has a circulation of 50,000 issues but is read by an audience of whom only 5,000 can afford to buy what is advertised.’”

Other sorts of segments were used as well; for example, Svenska journalen [The Swedish Journal] was directed at the Free Church and Temperance movement, a group they described as genuine and affluent (Svensk reklam, 1930; 1931). The temperance publications also depicted their readers as an affluent group (here in an ad from National Kuriren: “Sober people are affluent people, with both the ability and the desire to consume”).

Not only newspapers and magazines directed to consumers directly advertised in the studied material. Other trade journals also did. For example, the journal ERA, Tidskrift för Elektricitets Rationella Användning [Journal for the Rational Use of Electricity] claimed: “One specialist equals hundreds of average readers in terms of real purchasing power” (Svensk reklam, 1929); this because the specialist or retailer (as the advisor or middleman in the field) had influence over a large group of consumers, whereas the price of placing an advertisement in the relevant trade press was low (cf. ad for the gramophone retail trade magazine GRAFO in Affärsekonomi, 1933:13, p. 473). An interesting ad in this context is the one for retailers of men’s clothing in 1933. The ad had a photo of a salesman at the counter of an outfitter asking his client: “Any particular trademark?” and the gentleman answered: “Yes, what do You recommend?” The ad then asked rhetorically: “What is it that determines his choice?” and the copy consisted of an argument of the rationality of placing ads for male clothing in the magazine (ad for Herrbeklädnadsbranschen, Affärsekonomi, 1933: 13, p. 508, cf. Affärsekonomi, 1931:3, p. 96). Similarly, Dagens nyheter stressed that they had certain leading (male) figures amongst their readers, such as purchasing managers of large industries, etc. (e.g. Futurum, 1936:1, p. 264, p. 328).

**Political affiliation as an argument**

In Sweden, the link between newspapers and the political leadership was strong. Often, the parties owned the press and several of the leading publishers also held seats in Parliament. This kind of relationship was especially strong in the social democratic party, which recruited its politicians directly from their newspaper (Social-Demokraten) (Gardeström, 2016; Sundvik, 1974). When newspapers stressed their political affiliation in the studied material, it was most often a liberal (frisinnad) approach. At the beginning of the period, they sometimes also emphasized that they promoted tariff protection – likely hoping that advertisers would support newspapers that asserted their own political views. In the same manner, Svenska morgonbladet addressed advertisers supporting temperance:

Svenska morgonbladet is one of the few newspapers in the country to openly fight with energy and conviction for temperance and the prohibition of alcoholic beverages.

[...]

Is it not therefore a responsibility for the friends of temperance in this country to support such a newspaper? (ad in Skandinavisk annonstaxa, 1910).

However, it was not only the political sympathy of advertisers that the newspapers hoped to gain. In some cases, they also connected their political affiliation to affluence (see also Jonsson, 2003). For example, in 1891 Arvika tidning claimed principally that the more affluent public read it “due to its moderate-liberal approach”. Falkenbergs tidning likewise claimed: “Due to its geographical location and its moderate-conservative political stance, Falkenbergs tidning reaches a very affluent audience that no national advertiser can afford to ignore” (ad in Affärsekonomi, 1930:8). Despite this seemingly close link between commerce and politics, the newspaper Folket [The People] claimed “to talk about politics in business is commonly regarded inappropriate”. However, just like other social democratic newspapers, Folket emphasized the success for the party in the latest election and asked advertisers to...
use Folket if they wanted to win the voters as customers (Affärsekonomi, 1931:7, p. 341; see also ad for Västgötademokraten, Arbetarbladet, Skånska socialdemokraten and Kronobergaren in Reklamnyheterna, 1938:18). Also, Arbetet [Labour] tried to bridge the gap between business and politics by including statements from local retailers who asserted the quality of the content of the newspaper as well as the suitability of it for advertising (Affärsekonomi, 1935:11, 483).

Concluding discussion
When analysing the press’ self-advertising during the industrialisation process both quantitatively and qualitatively, it is clear that the very sectioning of various newspapers and magazines in themselves constituted a channel for market segmentation that advertisers could use. In this sense, the segmentation of the press preceded the idea of market segmentation within advertising thought. The basement for the sectioning of the press was following a somewhat different rationale of perceived common interests by various groups based on region, social class and gender. However, what we have seen in this paper is partly how the press (via the self-advertising) supported the commercialisation of this kind of identity politics in order to sustain economically. It was thus the labour and women’s movement’s own mouthpieces, that together with more commercially driven magazines who propagated ideas about the affluence of the working class and Mrs Consumer rather than ad men, economists or marketing theorists (even if the latter also discussed it from time to time, see Arnberg 2013). At least during this period. In this sense, the segments were already organised through the sectioning of the press when segmentation theory became more developed. There is no idea of developing certain advertising copy or specialised editions of a commercial product to a specific market segment if there is no marketing channel to reach them. Therefore, it is essential to study media history in parallel with the marketing history of the 19th and 20th Centuries in order to understand the commercial organizing of gender and class identities etc.

The communication between advertisers and mass media in the early Swedish consumer culture has not previously been studied to any larger extent. Even if there is reason to believe that advertisers such as local retailers and producers had relatively close contacts to the newspaper in their region, this paper offers examples of how newspapers and magazines constructed a gendered and classed images of their readership in order to fit commercial needs. Also, the focus on this relationship narrows down on how journalism, in the late 19th and early 20th centuries as well as in our time, is dependent on incomes from ads. This made newspapers and magazines – conservative as well as liberal and social democratic – stress the wide dissemination of their products and the affluence of their readers. But the relationship – if not in our time, definitely back then – was mutual: advertisers were dependent on magazines and newspapers to spread information about their products. These relationships are important in understanding how industrialization, democratization, journalism, retail, and consumption were intimately interrelated.

Mass production certainly demanded mass advertising. Therefore, newspapers and magazines often claimed to reach all social classes in a specific region or a third of all households in Sweden. However, broad segments such as workers, farmers and women were nonetheless often depicted as consumers in specific ways. These segments certainly emanated from interest groups rather than constructed consumer groups or market segments. However, the boundaries between them became blurred over time when political and social groups, as well as other intersections, were also framed as consumers. When applying an intersectional perspective, it is clear that the intended group of for example women during the studied period was in fact specifically middle-class mothers. Also, the class-based segments (at least in the beginning) connoted masculinity, and it was only when the theory of Mrs. Consumer had its breakthrough that also newspapers stressed that they reached homes and housewives. Paradoxically, the emphasis on female consumers both broadened the depicted segments (when newspapers included women) and narrowed them (as women’s magazines stressed that they reached women – specifically meaning affluent housewives with children).

References

Printed sources
Nordisk annonstaxa, 1880-1923
Annonsören, 1926-1939
Literature


Hallonquist, T. "Intervjuernas antal och rätta fördelning", *Svensk reklam* 1937.


Sivulka, J. (2009), *Ad women: how they impact what we need, want, and buy*. Prometheus Books, Amherst, N.Y.


Archiving the Archives: The World’s Collections of Historical Advertisements and Marketing Ephemera

Fred K. Beard
Gaylord College, University of Oklahoma, USA

Abstract

Purpose – When advertising historians began searching for substantial collections and archives of historical advertisements and marketing ephemera in the 1970s, some reported such holdings were rare. This paper reports the findings of the first systematic attempt to assess the scope and research value of the world’s archives and collections devoted to advertising and marketing ephemera. Approach – Searches of the holdings of museums, libraries, and the Internet led to the identification and description of 175 archives and collections of historical significance for historians of marketing and advertising, as well as researchers interested in many other topics and disciplines. Limitations – The search continued until a point of redundancy was reached and no new archives or collections meeting the search criteria emerged. There remains the likelihood, however, that other archives and collections exist, especially in non-Western countries. Contribution – The lists of archives and collections resulting from the research reported in this paper represent the most complete collection of such sources available. Identified are the world’s oldest and largest collections of advertising and ephemera. Also identified are quite extraordinary collections of historically unique records and artifacts. The findings make valuable contributions to the work of historians and other scholars by encouraging more global and cross-cultural research and historical analyses of trends and themes in professional practices in marketing and advertising and their consequences over a longer period than previously studied.

Key Words – marketing history, advertising history, advertising archives, marketing ephemera

Paper Type – Research Paper

Introduction

When Richard W. Pollay, noted historian and self-proclaimed “PAC-rat” (an acronym referring to “paper and advertising collector”), first began studying advertisements in the mid-1970s, he reported there were few significant holdings. Two exceptions were the New York Public Library and the U.S. Library of Congress. As Pollay (2011, p. 507) explained, “At both, I gained access to the stacks and made bibliographic notes on their entire holding on advertising. The mere fact that this was feasible working alone evidences the modest size of the holdings.” Curators of the John W. Hartman Center for Sales, Advertising & Marketing History (2015) have similarly proposed that “…advertising has not been as thoroughly documented as other aspects of business. Not all companies that advertise hold on to their past work. Few ad agencies retain comprehensive files of their output. And relatively few libraries, museums, or archives make an effort specifically to document the industry.”

Despite the efforts of some libraries, museums, and industry organizations to acquire collections of advertisements and marketing ephemera (promotional objects or media executions created for a one-time, limited purpose), there has been no systematic attempt to assess the scope, breadth, or historical value of the available holdings. To what extent are the observations regarding the limited nature of these primary source materials still valid? In addition to providing an answer to this question, the effort to locate and describe the world’s archives and special collections of advertising and ephemera reported in this paper make several valuable contributions to the work of historians and other scholars.

First, advertising has been a prevalent feature of society, culture, and the everyday lived experience of people around the world for hundreds of years. Consequently, ads and ephemera are valuable primary sources for marketing and advertising historians, as well as researchers of agriculture, business, consumption and consumerism, ethnic studies, film and media studies, graphic design and printing, health and recreation, political science, popular culture, women’s studies, and many other subjects. Indeed, as noted by the curators at The Huntington Library (2015): “Graphic images have long been valued for their ability to pictorially document the past, but it is only in the last quarter century that printed images have been regarded by historians and other scholars as important historical sources in their own right.” Marketing historians have also noted the value of primary sources that include such imagery (Witkowski and Jones, 2006). Trade cards, for instance, widely used by advertisers and prized...
by collectors for some 400 years, have been studied extensively and many books have been written about them. The curators of the John Johnson Collection of Printed Ephemera at Oxford’s Bodleian Library (2015) insightfully described part of their collection’s value: “Through these uninterpreted primary source materials, we are transported back to an age where commercial streets were hung with colourful shop signs, where a great number of exotic imported goods were available, where provincial shops sold an amazing range of goods, where booksellers sold not only books but also patent medicines and musical instruments, and where women had a surprisingly prominent role.”

Second, locating the world’s archives and collections of advertising and ephemera could contribute to more global and cross-cultural research on marketing and advertising history. Schwarzkopf (2011), who reviewed historical studies published between 1980 and 2010, concluded that much advertising history is limited by at least two methodological-theoretical norms: “Americanization” and “Modernization.” America, as Schwarzkopf (2011, p. 534) observed, “is talked up by historians into the embodiment of a new stage in the development of humanity, a stage dominated by modern consumer capitalism. With the takeover of European culture by the American advertising industry, thus goes the story, history had finally arrived at the level of a globally shared consumerist consciousness.”

Historians confirm the influence of American professional practices and consumer culture during the 20th century. However, some call into question the existence of a globally shared, advertising-induced consumerist culture and, more important, the role of U.S. advertising professionals in creating and sustaining it (Beard, 2016). Industry structures, professional practices, and creative expression often evolved independently from American influence, both before and during the 20th century. Influences flowing from Europe to the U.S. include an early consumer culture, advertising-supported print media and ephemera, poster design and other creative approaches and traditions, and the practices of early advertising agents. Moreover, theories and practices from the U.S. were often adapted internationally according to local economic, social, legal, and cultural conditions. The identification of significant collections of advertising and ephemera and, in addition, advertising agency and corporate archives representing a broad population of countries and cultures, could encourage research that specifically avoids the “Americanization” limitation evident in advertising’s historiography.

Third, identifying the world’s collections and archives may also encourage a more comprehensive analysis of advertising’s history in order to identify trends and themes in beliefs and practices and their consequences during much earlier periods and, thus, avoid the “Modernization” paradigmatic limitation (Schwarzkopf, 2011). Many historians seem to have concluded that advertising is a mainly 20th century phenomenon, an inevitable consequence of modernity’s march toward rationalization, industrialization, and free-market capitalism as they emerged and evolved in most Western countries and cultures. A recent effort to review and summarize the limited research literature on advertising prior to the 19th century, however, confirmed that advertising proliferated much earlier, that it came into use for similar reasons, and that much the same pattern of reasons occurred around the globe, including among the ancient civilizations of the Middle and Far East (Beard, 2016).

In summary, locating and describing the world’s archives and collections of historical advertisements and marketing ephemera could encourage more research on medieval and early-modern advertising across a broader population of countries and cultures. Topics especially ripe for exploration by way of advertisements and ephemera include consumer acceptance of and resistance to various message appeals and tactics and how these helped shape consumerism and long-term developments in advertising. Others include the relationships between advertising and consumers and how societies have chosen to manage the promotion and consumption of potentially harmful products, such as the patent medicines of the 19th century, alcohol, tobacco, and gambling (Schwarzkopf, 2011). Indeed, tackups and handbills for curatives and quack nostrums were among the first advertisements circulated in the streets of London in the 1500s. The identification of advertising agency and influential advertiser archives – such as those of the Foote, Cone & Belding agency, Eastman Kodak Co., and International Harvester Co. – could similarly contribute to historical interest in the adoption of agency practices, provide insights into the more recent culture of mergers and acquisitions that led to the global advertising conglomerates of the late 20th century, and aid researchers interested in the evolution of the relationships among manufacturers, distributors, retailers, and advertising agencies.

Method
As used in contemporary archival theory and practice, an “archives” consists of a variety of different types of records and artifacts related to the history of a particular organization or institution and held because of their historical or informational value (Mannon, 2015). A “collection,” on the other hand,
refers to a group of artifacts or objects linked by theme or type (Powell et al., 1999). With the goal of locating primary sources most useful to marketing and advertising historians, advertising and ephemera archives and collections were initially defined as those held by libraries and museums. In addition to these, however, many industry collections (e.g., Outdoor Advertising Association of America), private collections (e.g., the Virtual Collins Radio Museum), user-generated collections (e.g., Adforum), and dealer collections (e.g., AdClassix) emerged as valuable primary sources in their own right. Collections and archives were included among the findings when they contributed to the goals of this research in one or more of the following ways: (1) they were international in scope, (2) they were especially large, (3) they included pre-20th century records and artifacts, (4) the topic or focus was especially unique, or (5) the topic was not covered extensively by a library or museum collection (e.g., CircusWorldBaraboo.org). An example of a collection that did not meet any of these criteria for inclusion is the one available at Reminisce, an online magazine. The site’s publishers have posted a collection of perhaps 100 vintage advertisements, with no unifying theme. This is also common in the area of trade cards and ephemera and among online user-generated Flickr groups and similar blogs.

Advertising archives and collections were also distinguished from publications that can be searched using “advertisement” as a search term. Examples of these include the ProQuest collection of historical newspapers and the digitized collections of mainly 19th-century newspapers and magazines available online at Accessible Archives. Advertising can also be found in collections of other media, such as the Vanderbilt Television News Archive or The Museum of Television and Radio. While useful primary sources, research access can be difficult, making collections of advertisements preferable to publications and broadcast programming. As noted by curators at the Hartman Center (2015): “Some libraries keep only recent issues or recent years; others may preserve older periodicals and newspapers only on microfilm, which can be difficult to use and which prevents users from viewing images in color.” The limited collections offered by some of the global advertising industry’s more than 450 competitions and award shows were also excluded because they failed to meet the requirements for inclusion.

The search for archives and special collections began with Internet search engines and the use of various combinations of the following search terms: “advertising archive,” “advertising collections,” and “marketing ephemera.” Examination of the resulting archives, special collections, and exhibitions occasionally led to the identification of additional sources in a snowball fashion. Sources were then reviewed for their consistency with the inclusion criteria. The process continued until further keyword searches led to redundant findings and no additional archives or collections emerged.

Findings

The search identified the 175 archives and collections listed in Tables I-III. They are categorized and described based on the type of holder (library, museum, industry organization, or individual), whether they consist of archives or collections, time periods, media type(s), topics or emphasis, collection size, geographic scope, online availability, and whether a subscription or fee is required for access.

The first category consists of museum and library archives and collections. This category — maintained by government, charitable, educational, and other mainly institutional entities — is the most valuable because it includes the oldest records and artifacts, and they are permanent. The second most important category consists of industry and user-generated collections. These collections overcome two of the primary limitations of museums and libraries — their collections tend to emphasize the records of the elite, while excluding those of the average person or marginalized social groups (Neilson, 2005). Although almost none of these sources include pre-19th century artifacts or records, many are global in scope, are very large, and are devoted to unique and important topics. Some of the largest are also searchable. As an example, an online search of the Ads Through the Ages collection using the term “Chevrolet” retrieved more than 1,000 Chevrolet ads from throughout the 20th century. A limitation is that, as a group, some may not remain permanently accessible. The third category consists of dealers, vendors, and for-profit service suppliers. Online dealers offer vintage ads for sale and occasionally substantial digitized collections with unlimited access. Some of these collections would be of value to researchers studying particular products, services, manufacturers, or brands. Sources that merely consist of links to other sources were excluded. An example is tvadsview.com, which consists entirely of links to commercials available on YouTube.

A few sources, mainly museums and libraries, hold multiple collections and archives (e.g., the Hartman Center at Duke University). These important sources are identified in column one of Tables I and II with a footnote and the extent of their holdings described in the findings. Similarly, most exhibitions were not identified separately when they were drawn from a larger archive or collection. An
example is the Bodleian Library’s Toyota Project, which consists of automobile and transportation ephemera drawn from the John Johnson Collection. Other examples include The Emergence of Advertising in America: 1850-1920 and the Medicine and Madison Avenue exhibitions at the Hartman Center, which were drawn from its larger collections. The Women’s Health and Wellbeing exhibition of the Dublin City Library and Archive is listed separately, however, because it was not clear whether the library’s holdings include other advertisements or ephemera.

In some cases, when it wasn’t possible to identify the size of a collection it was because advertisements were included among other items or related artifacts. Good examples are the collection at The Huntington, the collection of circus posters at CircusWorldBaraboo.org, the McCormick - International Harvester archives, or the Images from the History of Medicine collection at the U.S. National Library of Medicine. In other cases, information on the size of some holdings was simply unavailable.

**Museum and library archives and collections.** Most of the museum and library archives and collections listed in Table I are located in the U.S., although the following countries are also represented: Australia, Bangladesh, Brazil, Canada, France, India, Ireland, Japan, the Netherlands, New Zealand, Portugal, Russia, Spain, Sweden, and the United Kingdom. There are also several significant collections with a global scope. Most are collections of advertisements and ephemera. However, especially noteworthy archives or collections, based on size or topical focus, include those held by the History of Advertising Trust (HAT), the National Museum of American History, the Hagley Museum and Library, the Harvard University Library, the Hartman Center at Duke University, the George Eastman House, the Advertising Museum Tokyo, the Stanford Tobacco Advertising Database, the University of Wisconsin Digital Collections, and ReclameArsenaal.

The 19th and 20th centuries are especially well represented among the sources. However, museums and libraries holding the world’s oldest collections are America’s Historical Imprints, the National Museum of American History (Smithsonian), the Library of Congress (U.S.), the British Museum, the Harvard University Library, the New York Museum of Modern Art, the Tri-College Digital Library (Bryn Mawr College), the University of Virginia, The Huntington, the U.S. National Library of Medicine, the Bodleian Library (University of Oxford), the National Library of Sweden, the Advertising Museum Tokyo, the University of Delaware, the University of North Carolina at Greensboro, Magdalene College Libraries, and the State Historical Society of Wisconsin. Print advertisements and ephemera, mainly in the form of trade cards, are the most widely held artifacts. However, substantial collections of television commercials are held by the following sources: the HAT, the Advertising Archives Center, the National Museum of American History, the Julian P. Kanter Political Commercial Archive, the Library of Congress (U.S.), the Ministries of Culture and Finance (France), the New Zealand Film Archive, the Hartman Center, the Advertising Museum Tokyo, the UCLA Film & Television Archive, and ReclameArsenaal.

The collections vary greatly in size, with some of the largest consisting of those held by the HAT, the Ministries of Culture and Finance (France), the Hartman Center, the National Library of Sweden, the Advertising Museum Tokyo, and the University of Illinois Archives. Most include advertisements and ephemera across a variety of product and service types. Some, however, are thematically focused on unique categories of products, services, and communication objectives. These include the collections of runaway slave advertisements at the University of Virginia, Louisiana State University Library, and the University of North Carolina at Greensboro. Other uniquely topical collections are the Images from the History of Medicine (U.S. National Library of Medicine), historical automobile catalogs (New York Public Library), the Kodak Advertising Collection (George Eastman House), The Living Room Candidate (Museum of the Moving Image), the Julian P. Kanter Political Commercial Archive (University of Oklahoma), and the collection devoted to women’s health (Dublin City Library and Archive).

The online availability of the collections and archives also varies considerably. Those offering access to their entire holdings include the Wilson Special Collections Library (University of North Carolina Chapel Hill), the Hagley Museum and Library, the Canadian Museum of History, Tri-College Digital Library, University Libraries (University of Washington), the Brooklyn Public Library,
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Name†</th>
<th>Location/Holderner</th>
<th>Type²</th>
<th>Period</th>
<th>Medium/ Ephemera²</th>
<th>Number of Records/ Artifacts³</th>
<th>Topic(s)</th>
<th>Geographic Focus</th>
<th>Online Access</th>
<th>Subs./Fee</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>The Ads†</td>
<td>History of Advertising Trust</td>
<td>A/C</td>
<td>1800s-2010s</td>
<td>P/TV</td>
<td>3,000,000</td>
<td>Varied</td>
<td>U.K.</td>
<td>Some</td>
<td>Yes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Advertising ‡</td>
<td>The National Museum of American History, Smithsonian Institution</td>
<td>A/C</td>
<td>1700s-1990s</td>
<td>P/TV/E/P A</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>Varied</td>
<td>U.S.</td>
<td>Some</td>
<td>No</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Advertising</td>
<td>Hennepin County Library, Digital Public Library of America</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>19th- Early 20th Century</td>
<td>P/E</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>Varied</td>
<td>U.S.</td>
<td>Some</td>
<td>No</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Advertising Artwork of Dr. Seuss</td>
<td>Mandeville Special Collections Library, University of California</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>1930s-1940s</td>
<td>P</td>
<td>199</td>
<td>Varied</td>
<td>U.S.</td>
<td>Some</td>
<td>No</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Advertising Card Collection</td>
<td>The Kansas City Public Library</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>1860-1905</td>
<td>E</td>
<td>2,000</td>
<td>Varied</td>
<td>U.S.</td>
<td>Some</td>
<td>No</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Advertising Cards</td>
<td>Wilson Special Collections Library, University of North Carolina Chapel Hill</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>1931</td>
<td>E</td>
<td>74</td>
<td>Varied</td>
<td>U.S.</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>No</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Advertising/Promotional Ephemera Collection</td>
<td>Libraries, University of Missouri-Kansas City</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>1890-1960</td>
<td>P/E</td>
<td>120</td>
<td>Varied</td>
<td>U.S.</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>No</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Advertising Trade Cards †</td>
<td>Harvard Library/Baker and Schlesinger Libraries</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>1575-1984</td>
<td>P/E</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>Varied</td>
<td>Global</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>No</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Advertising Trade Cards</td>
<td>Penn State University Library</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>1900s</td>
<td>E</td>
<td>150</td>
<td>Varied</td>
<td>U.S.</td>
<td>Some</td>
<td>No</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>American Memory: Advertising †</td>
<td>The Library of Congress</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>1600s-2000s</td>
<td>P/TV/E</td>
<td>31,000</td>
<td>Varied</td>
<td>U.S.</td>
<td>Some</td>
<td>No</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>America’s Historical Imprints</td>
<td>NewsBank</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>1749-1900</td>
<td>E</td>
<td>3,913</td>
<td>Varied</td>
<td>U.S.</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>No</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Avon Company Archive</td>
<td>Hagley Museum and Library</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>1858-2012</td>
<td>P/TV/PA/E</td>
<td>7,051</td>
<td>Avon Co.</td>
<td>Global</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>No</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bowling Green State University Libraries †</td>
<td>Bowling Green State University</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>1870s-1960s</td>
<td>P/E</td>
<td>1,001</td>
<td>Varied</td>
<td>U.S.</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>No</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Catalogues</td>
<td>Canadian Museum of History</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>1880-1975</td>
<td>P</td>
<td>42</td>
<td>Catalogs</td>
<td>Canada</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>No</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Centre National Des Archives De La Publicité</td>
<td>Ministries of Culture and Finance, France</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>1897-2010s</td>
<td>TV</td>
<td>300,000</td>
<td>Varied</td>
<td>Global</td>
<td>Some</td>
<td>No</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Centre D’Archives Publicitaires</td>
<td>Association des Agences de Publicité du Québec</td>
<td>A/C</td>
<td>1997-2010s</td>
<td>TV</td>
<td>45,000</td>
<td>Varied</td>
<td>Quebec</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>No</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Centre for Ephemera Studies</td>
<td>University of Reading</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>1800s-2000s</td>
<td>E</td>
<td>20,000</td>
<td>Varied</td>
<td>Global</td>
<td>Some</td>
<td>No</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Collection</td>
<td>Institution</td>
<td>Date Range</td>
<td>Type</td>
<td>Size</td>
<td>Country</td>
<td>Notes</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>----------------------------------</td>
<td>--------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>-------------------</td>
<td>------</td>
<td>------</td>
<td>---------</td>
<td>-------</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Charles and Laura Dohm Shields Trade Card Collection</td>
<td>Walter Havighurst Special Collections Library, Miami Univ.</td>
<td>Late 19th- Early 20th</td>
<td>E</td>
<td>1,700</td>
<td>U.S.</td>
<td>1,643</td>
<td>No</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Collection of Trade Cards</td>
<td>Department of Special Collections, UCLA Library</td>
<td>1870-1900</td>
<td>E</td>
<td>400</td>
<td>U.S.</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>No</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Collection of Trade Cards, Mainly British, 1700-1850</td>
<td>The Metropolitan Museum of Art, New York</td>
<td>1700-1850</td>
<td>E</td>
<td>NA</td>
<td>Britain</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>No</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Collections</td>
<td>Online Archives of California</td>
<td>A/C</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>P/R/E</td>
<td>U.S.</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>No</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Collections</td>
<td>The Prelinger Library and Archives</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>NA</td>
<td>TV</td>
<td>U.S.</td>
<td>Some</td>
<td>No</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Early Advertising Collection</td>
<td>Tri-College Digital Library, Bryn Mawr</td>
<td>1790-1910</td>
<td>P</td>
<td>1,044</td>
<td>America, Europe</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>No</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Early Advertising of the West</td>
<td>University Libraries, University of Wash.</td>
<td>1867-1918</td>
<td>P</td>
<td>450</td>
<td>U.S.</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>No</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ephemera Collection</td>
<td>Earl Gregg Swem Library at William &amp; Mary College</td>
<td>1800-2014</td>
<td>P/E</td>
<td>1,200</td>
<td>U.S.</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>No</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Follow the Sun: Australian Travel Posters 1930s-1950s</td>
<td>National Library of Australia</td>
<td>1930s-1950s</td>
<td>P</td>
<td>780</td>
<td>Australia</td>
<td>Some</td>
<td>No</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fulton Street Card Collection</td>
<td>Brooklyn Public Library</td>
<td>Late 1800s- Early 1900s</td>
<td>E</td>
<td>358</td>
<td>Brooklyn</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>No</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Geography of Slavery</td>
<td>University of Virginia</td>
<td>1736-1803</td>
<td>P</td>
<td>4,000</td>
<td>U.S.</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>No</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hartman Center for Sales, Advertising &amp; Marketing History</td>
<td>Duke University Library</td>
<td>1850s-2000s</td>
<td>P/TV/O/E</td>
<td>3,000,000</td>
<td>Global</td>
<td>Some</td>
<td>No</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Historical Automobile Catalogs</td>
<td>New York Public Library</td>
<td>1900s-1930s</td>
<td>P</td>
<td>8,000</td>
<td>U.S.</td>
<td>Some</td>
<td>No</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Historical Prints, Ephemera, and Manuscripts</td>
<td>The Huntington, San Marino, California</td>
<td>1500s-1800s</td>
<td>P/PA/E</td>
<td>200,000</td>
<td>Varied</td>
<td>Britain, U.S.</td>
<td>Some</td>
<td>No</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>An Inventory of Dayton’s Newspaper Advertising</td>
<td>Minnesota Historical Society</td>
<td>1904-1968</td>
<td>P</td>
<td>NA</td>
<td>Dept. Store</td>
<td>U.S.</td>
<td>No</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The John Johnson Collection</td>
<td>Bodleian Library, University of Oxford</td>
<td>1600s-1900s</td>
<td>P/E</td>
<td>1,500,000</td>
<td>Varied</td>
<td>U.K.</td>
<td>Some</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Julian P. Kanter Political Commercial Archive</td>
<td>Political Communication Center, University of Oklahoma</td>
<td>1936-2016</td>
<td>TV/R</td>
<td>90,000</td>
<td>Political</td>
<td>U.S.</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Collection Name</td>
<td>Institution</td>
<td>Accession Year</td>
<td>Date Range</td>
<td>Format</td>
<td>Collection Size</td>
<td>Geography</td>
<td>Access</td>
<td>Value</td>
<td>Notes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>--------------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>--------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>-----------------</td>
<td>------------------</td>
<td>--------</td>
<td>-----------------</td>
<td>-----------</td>
<td>--------</td>
<td>-------</td>
<td>-------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Library for Advertising and Marketing</td>
<td>Advertising Museum Tokyo (ADMT)</td>
<td>A/C</td>
<td>1600s-2010s</td>
<td>P/TV</td>
<td>190,000</td>
<td>Varied Japan</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>No</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Library of Historic Advertising &amp; Ephemera</td>
<td>Middlesex University, London</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>19th -1970s</td>
<td>P/E</td>
<td>150,000</td>
<td>Varied Britain, U.S.</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>No</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Living Room Candidate</td>
<td>Museum of the Moving Image</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>1952-2012</td>
<td>TV</td>
<td>300</td>
<td>Politics U.S.</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>No</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Louisiana Runaway Slave Advertisements, 1836-1865</td>
<td>Louisiana State University Library</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>1836-1865</td>
<td>P</td>
<td>274</td>
<td>Slavery U.S.</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>No</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>M-135: Mallinckrodt Company Advertising Scrapbooks</td>
<td>St. Louis Mercantile Library</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>1940s-1960s</td>
<td>P</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>Chemicals U.S.</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>No</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Marchand Archive</td>
<td>University of California, Davis</td>
<td>C/A</td>
<td>1964-1997</td>
<td>P</td>
<td>8,600</td>
<td>Varied Global</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>No</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>National Archives of Australia</td>
<td></td>
<td>C</td>
<td>1933-1974</td>
<td>P</td>
<td>910</td>
<td>Varied Australia</td>
<td>Some</td>
<td>No</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>National Automotive History Collection</td>
<td>Detroit Public Library</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>1900s-2010s</td>
<td>P</td>
<td>33,000</td>
<td>Automobiles Global</td>
<td>Some</td>
<td>No</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>National Library of Sweden</td>
<td></td>
<td>C</td>
<td>1700-2016</td>
<td>E</td>
<td>14,000,000</td>
<td>Varied Sweden</td>
<td>Some</td>
<td>No</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The North Carolina Runaway Slave Advertisements</td>
<td>The University of North Carolina at Greensboro</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>1751-1840</td>
<td>P</td>
<td>2,300</td>
<td>Slavery U.S.</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>No</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pepys’ Trade Cards</td>
<td>Magdalene College Libraries, Cambridge</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>1650s-1700s</td>
<td>E</td>
<td>41</td>
<td>Varied Britain</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>No</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Perkins Collection 1850 to 1900 Advertising Cards</td>
<td>Historic Map Works</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>1850 to 1900</td>
<td>E</td>
<td>127</td>
<td>Varied U.S.</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>No</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Posters¹</td>
<td>The National Archives</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>1930s-1940s</td>
<td>P/R</td>
<td>17,000</td>
<td>WWII U.S.</td>
<td>Some</td>
<td>No</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Posters and Printed Ephemera</td>
<td>The Wolfsonian Library, Florida International University</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>1880-1945</td>
<td>P/E</td>
<td>4,232</td>
<td>Varied Global</td>
<td>Some</td>
<td>No</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Radio Advertising Bureau Collection</td>
<td>University Libraries, University of Maryland</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>1954-1968</td>
<td>R</td>
<td>3,300 (Disks)</td>
<td>Varied U.S.</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>No</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Robert D. Farber University Archives &amp; Special Collections¹</td>
<td>Library &amp; Technology Services, Brandeis University</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>1910s-1940s</td>
<td>P</td>
<td>350</td>
<td>War Propaganda Spain, U.S.</td>
<td>Some</td>
<td>No</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Source's holdings consist of multiple advertising/marketing ephemera archives or collections;</td>
<td>A (archive), C (collection);</td>
<td>P (newspapers/magazines/posters/labels/catalogs), TV (television/video/film), R (radio), O (outdoor/out-of-home/signage), D (digital), DM (direct mail/marketing), E (ephemera/trade cards/bill headings), PA (packaging);</td>
<td>the number of records/artifacts is approximate, unless counted or specifically reported by the source (N/A = not available).</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Table II: Industry, Media and User-generated Collections of Historical Advertisements and Marketing Ephemera

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Name</th>
<th>Location/Holder</th>
<th>Type</th>
<th>Period</th>
<th>Medium/ Ephemera</th>
<th>Number of Records/Artifacts</th>
<th>Topic(s)</th>
<th>Geographic Focus</th>
<th>Online Access</th>
<th>Subs./Fee</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Ad Campaigns</td>
<td>George Lois</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>1950s-2000s</td>
<td>P/TV</td>
<td>46</td>
<td>Varied</td>
<td>USA</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>No</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ad Library</td>
<td>AdRespect</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>1950s-2010s</td>
<td>P/TV</td>
<td>600</td>
<td>LGBT</td>
<td>Global</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>No</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ad Library</td>
<td>Jay Paull Vintage Print Advertisements</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>1830s-1920s</td>
<td>P</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>Varied</td>
<td>U.S.</td>
<td>Some</td>
<td>No</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Advert Museum</td>
<td>historyworld</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>1890s-1950s</td>
<td>P</td>
<td>1,585</td>
<td>Varied</td>
<td>Britain</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>No</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ads of the World</td>
<td>Mediabistro Inc.</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>2000s-2010s</td>
<td>P/TV/R/D</td>
<td>80,000</td>
<td>Varied</td>
<td>Global</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Yes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ads Through the Ages</td>
<td>Flickr Group</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>P</td>
<td>43,000</td>
<td>Varied</td>
<td>Global</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>No</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Ad Archive</td>
<td>Kenneth Cole Productions, Inc.</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>1982-2010s</td>
<td>P/TV</td>
<td>410</td>
<td>Varied</td>
<td>U.S.</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>No</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Advertisement Archive</td>
<td>Virtual Collins Radio Museum</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>1945-1983</td>
<td>P</td>
<td>400</td>
<td>Collins Radio Co.</td>
<td>U.S.</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>No</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Advertisements</td>
<td><a href="http://www.aresluna.org">www.aresluna.org</a></td>
<td>C</td>
<td>1980s-1990s</td>
<td>P</td>
<td>217</td>
<td>Tech.</td>
<td>Global</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>No</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Advertising</td>
<td>American Apparel</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>1995-2009</td>
<td>P</td>
<td>706</td>
<td>Apparel</td>
<td>U.S.</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>No</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Advertising Archive</td>
<td>Quincy Compressor</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>1923-1959</td>
<td>P</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>Air Compressors</td>
<td>U.S.</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>No</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Advertising Campaigns Archive</td>
<td>Prada</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>1987-2016</td>
<td>P</td>
<td>104</td>
<td>Fashion</td>
<td>U.S.</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>No</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Advertising Icon Museum</td>
<td></td>
<td>C</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>P/TV/R</td>
<td>3,000</td>
<td>Varied</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>No</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Advertising Slogan Hall of Fame</td>
<td>AdSlogans</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>1900s-2000s</td>
<td>P/TV</td>
<td>125</td>
<td>Varied</td>
<td>U.S., Europe</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Yes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Advertolog Advertising &amp; Commercials</td>
<td>Advertolog</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>1970s-2010s</td>
<td>P/TV/R/O/D</td>
<td>2,000,000</td>
<td>Varied</td>
<td>Global</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Yes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The American Package Museum</td>
<td></td>
<td>C</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>E/PA</td>
<td>144</td>
<td>Varied</td>
<td>U.S.</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>No</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Archive</td>
<td>Advertising Archive Bangladesh</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>1973-2010s</td>
<td>P/TV/R/O</td>
<td>16,000</td>
<td>Varied</td>
<td>Bangladesh</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>No</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Art &amp; Beer</td>
<td>Brookston Beer Institute</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>1890s-N/A</td>
<td>P</td>
<td>2,002</td>
<td>Beer</td>
<td>Global</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>No</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Artes &amp; Artistas’d’Ontem</td>
<td></td>
<td>C</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>P</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>Varied</td>
<td>Portugal</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>No</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Basil Rathbone in Advertisements</td>
<td>Marcia Jessen</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>1940-1970</td>
<td>P/TV</td>
<td>47</td>
<td>Varied</td>
<td>UK</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>No</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Collection</td>
<td>Description</td>
<td>Date</td>
<td>Platform</td>
<td>Entries</td>
<td>Country</td>
<td>Global Access</td>
<td>U.S. Access</td>
<td>Notes</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>------------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>------------</td>
<td>----------</td>
<td>---------</td>
<td>-------------</td>
<td>---------------</td>
<td>-------------</td>
<td>-------</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Beer Belongs</td>
<td>Vintage Ads</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>1950s-1960s</td>
<td>P</td>
<td>56</td>
<td>Beer</td>
<td>U.S.</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>No</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bell System Advertisements</td>
<td>Beatrice Companies, Inc.</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>1930s-2004</td>
<td>P/TV</td>
<td>137</td>
<td>Bell System</td>
<td>U.S.</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>No</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BSA Catalogs</td>
<td>The BSA Club of NSW</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>1960-1972</td>
<td>P</td>
<td>220</td>
<td>BSA Motorcycles</td>
<td>U.S.</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>No</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Catalogs</td>
<td>R2RTexas’ Reel To Reel Tape Recorder OnLine Museum</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>1900s-2010s</td>
<td>P</td>
<td>12,680</td>
<td>Audio Equip.</td>
<td>U.S.</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>No</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chris Mullen’s Advertising Archive</td>
<td>Dr. Chris Mullen</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>1920-1980</td>
<td>P</td>
<td>12,200</td>
<td>Varied</td>
<td>U.S.</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>No</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Classic Animated Advertising</td>
<td>Cartoon Research</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>P/TV</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>Varied</td>
<td>U.S.</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>No</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Classic Television Commercials</td>
<td>The Internet Archive</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>1940s-1970s</td>
<td>TV</td>
<td>1,414</td>
<td>Varied</td>
<td>U.S.</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>No</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A Collection of Fine Campaigns</td>
<td>Great-Ads</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>TV</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>Varied</td>
<td>Global</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>No</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Collection of Old Advertising</td>
<td>Toutenparfum.com</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>1897-1988</td>
<td>P</td>
<td>332</td>
<td>Perfume</td>
<td>France</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>No</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Collectors On-Line (Matchbooks)</td>
<td>The Rathkamp Matchcover Society</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>E</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>Varied</td>
<td>Global</td>
<td>Some</td>
<td>No</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Coloribus Advertising Archive</td>
<td>Coloribus</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>P/TV/O/R/D</td>
<td>2,000,000</td>
<td>Varied</td>
<td>Global</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Yes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Commercials</td>
<td>80stvthemes</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>1980s</td>
<td>TV</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>Varied</td>
<td>U.S.</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>No</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Commercials</td>
<td>Adland</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>P/TV/R</td>
<td>45,000</td>
<td>Varied</td>
<td>Global</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Yes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Creative Library</td>
<td>Communication Arts</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>P</td>
<td>2,037</td>
<td>Varied</td>
<td>Global</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>No</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Creative Library</td>
<td>Outdoor Advertising Association of America</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>1996-2010s</td>
<td>O</td>
<td>10,333</td>
<td>Varied</td>
<td>Global</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>No</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Creative Library</td>
<td>Adforum</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>1998-2010s</td>
<td>P/TV/R/O/D/DM/PA</td>
<td>150,000</td>
<td>Varied</td>
<td>Global</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Yes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ducati Brochure Gallery</td>
<td>Steve Allen’s Bevel Heaven</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>P</td>
<td>35</td>
<td>Ducati Motorcycles</td>
<td>U.K.</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>No</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ephemera</td>
<td>Bolex Collector</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>1930s-1960s</td>
<td>P</td>
<td>158</td>
<td>Cameras</td>
<td>U.S.</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>No</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FiberClassics Library</td>
<td>Classic Boat Library</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>1950s-1960s</td>
<td>P</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>Pleasure Boats</td>
<td>U.S.</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>No</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Found in Mom’s Basement</td>
<td>Paula Zargaj-Reynolds</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>1900s-2000s</td>
<td>P</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>Varied</td>
<td>U.S.</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>No</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gallery</td>
<td>The New York Times Madison Project</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>1920s-1960s</td>
<td>P</td>
<td>2,487</td>
<td>Varied</td>
<td>Global</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>No</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gallery of Book Trade Labels</td>
<td>Greg Kindall</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>1720-1970s</td>
<td>P</td>
<td>2,500</td>
<td>Book Trade</td>
<td>Global</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>No</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Collection</td>
<td>Website/URL</td>
<td>Country</td>
<td>Type</td>
<td>Date Range</td>
<td>Language</td>
<td>Media</td>
<td>Geography</td>
<td>Gender Issues</td>
<td>Accession Number</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-----------------------------------------------</td>
<td>-----------------------------------</td>
<td>-----------</td>
<td>---------------</td>
<td>------------------</td>
<td>----------</td>
<td>-------</td>
<td>----------------</td>
<td>---------------</td>
<td>------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Gallery of Graphic Design</td>
<td>gogd.tjs-labs.com</td>
<td>U.S.</td>
<td>P</td>
<td>1930s-1960s</td>
<td>Varied</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>10,930</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Gender Ads Project</td>
<td>Scott A. Lukas</td>
<td>U.S.</td>
<td>P</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>Gender Issues</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>3,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Golden Age Spotlight Collections on Advertising</td>
<td>Digital Deli Online</td>
<td>U.S.</td>
<td>P/R</td>
<td>1930s-1960s</td>
<td>Varied</td>
<td>U.S.</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>N/A</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Inde-Allumettes</td>
<td>Patricia M.</td>
<td>India</td>
<td>PA</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>Matchboxes</td>
<td>India</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>898</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Indian TV Ads</td>
<td>Rekha Technologies Pvt Ltd</td>
<td>India</td>
<td>TV</td>
<td>2000s-2010s</td>
<td>Varied</td>
<td>India</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>278</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Japanese Matchbox Labels</td>
<td>Jane McDevitt</td>
<td>Japan</td>
<td>PA</td>
<td>1920s-1940s</td>
<td>Matchboxes</td>
<td>Japan</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>395</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Jim’s Burnt Offerings</td>
<td>Jim Shaw</td>
<td>U.S.</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>1880s-2000s</td>
<td>Tobacco</td>
<td>Global</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>N/A</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Just Creative Ads</td>
<td>Kodakgirl.com</td>
<td>U.S.</td>
<td>P</td>
<td>1890s-1980s</td>
<td>Kodak Cameras</td>
<td>U.S.</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>99</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Magazine Ads</td>
<td>Matchboxes and Collectible Matchbooks</td>
<td>Global</td>
<td>Matchboxes</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>Matchboxes</td>
<td>Global</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>6,937</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Matchbook Labels</td>
<td>Matchbook Labels</td>
<td>Global</td>
<td>Matchbook Labels</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>Matchbook Labels</td>
<td>Global</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>1,986</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Museum of Advertising</td>
<td>Museum of Advertising</td>
<td>Global</td>
<td>Varied</td>
<td>1900s-2000s</td>
<td>Global</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>P</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Old Car Advertisements</td>
<td>Oldcaradvertising.com</td>
<td>U.S.</td>
<td>P</td>
<td>1903-1989</td>
<td>Automobiles</td>
<td>U.S.</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>12,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Old Car Print Ads and Commercials</td>
<td>Cars and Stripes</td>
<td>U.S.</td>
<td>P/TV</td>
<td>1940s-1980s</td>
<td>Automobiles</td>
<td>U.S.</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>674</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Old Commercials</td>
<td>YouTube Channel</td>
<td>Global</td>
<td>TV</td>
<td>1940s-2010s</td>
<td>Varied</td>
<td>Global</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>N/A</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Old Radio Commercials</td>
<td>Oldtimeradiofans.com</td>
<td>U.S.</td>
<td>R</td>
<td>1920s-1950s</td>
<td>Varied</td>
<td>U.S.</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>150</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Old Time Radio Advertisements</td>
<td>The Best of Old-Time Radio</td>
<td>U.S.</td>
<td>R</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>Varied</td>
<td>U.S.</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>254</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Online Advertising &amp; Marketing Archive</td>
<td>Adverlicious</td>
<td>U.S.</td>
<td>D</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>Varied</td>
<td>U.S.</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>7,500</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Original Player Piano Advertising</td>
<td>The Player Piano Page</td>
<td>England, U.S.</td>
<td>Pianos</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>Pianos</td>
<td>England, U.S.</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>P</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Original Sales Literature Library</td>
<td>Phantom Coaches</td>
<td>U.S.</td>
<td>P</td>
<td>1916-1990s</td>
<td>Service Cars</td>
<td>U.S.</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>1,400</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>OTR Commercials</td>
<td>Louis V. Genco</td>
<td>U.S.</td>
<td>R</td>
<td>1920s-1950s</td>
<td>Varied</td>
<td>U.S.</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>113</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Our Campaigns</td>
<td>The Ad Council</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>1940s-2010s</td>
<td>P/TV/R/O/D</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>Issues</td>
<td>U.S.</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>No</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>--------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>---------------------------------</td>
<td>---</td>
<td>-------------</td>
<td>------------</td>
<td>----</td>
<td>--------</td>
<td>------</td>
<td>-----</td>
<td>----</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Paper Ephemera</td>
<td>jericicat</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>P</td>
<td>1,763</td>
<td>Varied</td>
<td>U.S.</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>No</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Phillip Morris U.S. Inc. Advertising Archive</td>
<td>Philip Morris Incorporated</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>1900s-2010s</td>
<td>P/O/DM</td>
<td>97,850</td>
<td>Tobacco</td>
<td>U.S.</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>No</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Propagandas antigas rural willys</td>
<td>Rural Willys Brasil</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>1940s-1980s</td>
<td>P</td>
<td>102</td>
<td>Willys/Jeep</td>
<td>Brazil</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>No</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Robert L. Parkinson Library and Research Center</td>
<td>CircusWorldBaraboo.org</td>
<td>A/C</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>P/E</td>
<td>10,000</td>
<td>Circus</td>
<td>U.S.</td>
<td>Some</td>
<td>No</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Robert Opie Collection</td>
<td>Museum of Brands, Packaging &amp; Advertising</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>E/PA</td>
<td>500,000</td>
<td>Varied</td>
<td>Britain</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>No</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sexism and Racism in Advertising</td>
<td>Reed Digital Collections</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>2000s</td>
<td>P</td>
<td>880</td>
<td>Sexism and Racism</td>
<td>Global</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>No</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Super Bowl Ad Archive</td>
<td>Advertising Age</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>1969-2016</td>
<td>TV</td>
<td>1,067</td>
<td>Varied</td>
<td>U.S.</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>No</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1960 - 1969 TV Set Advertising</td>
<td>Television History</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>1930-2010s</td>
<td>P/TV</td>
<td>59</td>
<td>Televisions</td>
<td>Global</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>No</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TellyAds</td>
<td></td>
<td>C</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>TV</td>
<td>20,988</td>
<td>Varied</td>
<td>UK</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>No</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TV Commercialpedia</td>
<td></td>
<td>C</td>
<td>2009-2010s</td>
<td>TV</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>Varied</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>No</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Trucking Ads From Days Gone By</td>
<td>Hank Suderman</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>1940s-1960s</td>
<td>P</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>Trucks</td>
<td>U.S.</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>No</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>“Victorian Scrapbook”</td>
<td>The Trade Card Place</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>1870-1900</td>
<td>E</td>
<td>1,420</td>
<td>Varied</td>
<td>U.S., U.K., Canada, Germany</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>No</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Video Game Ads</td>
<td>Tom Zjaba</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>1970s-1980s</td>
<td>P</td>
<td>163</td>
<td>Video Games</td>
<td>U.S.</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>No</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Vintage Ad Browser</td>
<td>Philipp Lenssen</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>1850s-2010s</td>
<td>P</td>
<td>123,311</td>
<td>Varied</td>
<td>Global</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>No</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Vintage Christmas Catalog Archive Project</td>
<td>WishbookWeb.com</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>1933-1988</td>
<td>P</td>
<td>51</td>
<td>Christmas Catalogs</td>
<td>U.S.</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>No</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Vintage Telephone Advertisements</td>
<td>Dennis Markham’s Classic Rotary Phones</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>1916-1966</td>
<td>P</td>
<td>92</td>
<td>Telephones</td>
<td>U.S.</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>No</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Vintage Toaster Ads</td>
<td></td>
<td>C</td>
<td>1908-1940s</td>
<td>P</td>
<td>67</td>
<td>Toasters</td>
<td>U.S.</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>No</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Vintage Tool Ads</td>
<td>Hyperkitten Tool Co.</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>1877-1943</td>
<td>P</td>
<td>296</td>
<td>Tools</td>
<td>U.S.</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>No</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>VintaScope</td>
<td>The Museum of Vintage Commercial and Advertising Art</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>19th-Mid 20th</td>
<td>P</td>
<td>12,683</td>
<td>Varied</td>
<td>Global</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Yes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1920s Transit Posters</td>
<td><a href="http://www.Chicago-L.org">www.Chicago-L.org</a></td>
<td>C</td>
<td>1920s</td>
<td>P</td>
<td>25</td>
<td>Chicago L</td>
<td>Chicago</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>No</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Name</td>
<td>Location/Holder</td>
<td>Type</td>
<td>Period</td>
<td>Medium/Ephemera</td>
<td>Number of Records/Artifacts</td>
<td>Topic(s)</td>
<td>Geographic Focus</td>
<td>Online Access</td>
<td>Subs./Fee</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-----------------------------------</td>
<td>-----------------------</td>
<td>--------</td>
<td>-----------------</td>
<td>-----------------</td>
<td>---------------------------</td>
<td>----------</td>
<td>------------------</td>
<td>---------------</td>
<td>-----------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>100 London Underground Posters</td>
<td>IAQ Graphic Design</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>1911-2013</td>
<td>P</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>London</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>No</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>70 Years of Terrot Posters</td>
<td>Madeleine Blondel</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>1893-1961</td>
<td>P</td>
<td>40</td>
<td>Bicycles</td>
<td>France</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>No</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
| Source’s holdings consist of multiple advertising/marketing ephemera archives or collections; ^A (archive), C (collection); ^P (newspapers/magazines/posters/labels/catalogs), TV (television/video/film), R (radio), O (outdoor/out-of-home/signage), D (digital), DM (direct mail/marketing), E (ephemera贸易/trade cards/bill headings), PA (packaging); ^the number of records/artifacts is approximate, unless counted or specifically reported by the source (N/A = not available).
University of Virginia, the Museum of the Moving Image, Louisiana State University Library, University of North Carolina at Greensboro, the National Archives, Historic Map Works, Stanford School of Medicine, University of Illinois Library, and ReclameArsenaal. Consistent with their institutional missions, few charge a fee or require registration for access to their collections and archives, although many restrict physical access due to the fragility of their holdings or because they are stored off-site.

The first of Table I’s sources holding more than one archives or collection is the UK’s HAT, which holds the following: the J. Walter Thompson London Archive, the HAT Press Tear-Sheets Archive, the BBC “Washes Whiter” TV Commercials Collection (1955-1989), and the HAT Library (www.hatads.org.uk). Although a current online search of the Smithsonian Institution using the term “advertising” (www.siris.si.edu) retrieves nearly 18,000 individual artifacts and records, a review of these shows that the Smithsonian’s National Museum of American History holds dozens and possibly hundreds of archives and collections involving advertisers and brands (e.g., Alka-Seltzer, Federal Express, Krispy Kreme Doughnuts, Marlboro, Nike), advertising agencies (e.g., NW Ayer Advertising Agency archives, which includes more than 400,000 advertising proofs donated in 1975 [Crew and Fleckner, 1986]), as well as important collections of advertisements and ephemera (e.g., The Warshaw Collection of Business Americana).

The Online Archive of California (OAC) offers access to descriptions of special collections and archives held by more than 200 California universities, libraries, historical societies, and museums. A search of the OAC using the term “advertising” currently retrieves 1,909 records. Among them are numerous collections of mostly late-19th and 20th-century print ads, posters, and ephemera representing a wide variety of products and services. The OAC also enables searches of The Huntington (San Marino), which holds several large and early collections of ads and ephemera (including the Jay T. Last Collection of Graphic Arts and Social History), as well as important archives, such as the Albert D. Lasker Papers.

A search of the Harvard Library system (Hollis.Harvard.edu), which includes the Baker and Schlesinger Libraries, currently retrieves 859 records on the topic of advertising, when limited to Archives/Manuscripts. Among them are dozens of collections of trade cards and marketing ephemera, including some 60 devoted to ephemera from the country of Israel. The Library of Congress American Memory lists three collections at its “Advertising” link: The Broadsides and Printed Ephemera – ca. 1600-2000 collection; The Coca-Cola Advertising ~ Films ~ 1951-1999 collection; and the Prosperity and Thrift: The Coolidge Era and the Consumer Economy, 1921-1929 collection. However, holdings also include four collections of television commercials and public service announcements and the By the People, For the People: Posters from the WPA, 1936-1943 collection. Similar to the National Museum of American History and Harvard Library holdings, further searches of the Library of Congress would likely reveal additional archives and collections that meet this study’s criteria for inclusion.

The Bowling Green State University Libraries system holds a collection of advertising proofs (hard, one-off copies of finished advertising production artwork) and a Victorian-era trade card collection. The Duke University Hartman Center for Sales, Advertising & Marketing History holds several important advertising agency archives (e.g., J. Walter Thompson agency), collections (e.g., the Liggett & Myers Tobacco Advertising Collection), advertising and marketing executive career papers, and the Nicole DiBona Peterson collection of advertising cookbooks. The Hartman Center also offers access to thousands of advertisements in the form of three online collections drawn from its larger holdings: The Emergence of Advertising in America: 1850-1920, Medicine and Madison Avenue, and the AdViews digital archive.

The National Archives and Records Administration (U.S.) holds three collections of posters: Sow the Seeds of Victory! Posters from the Food Administration During World War I; Powers of Persuasion: Poster Art from WWII; and A New Deal for the Arts. Similarly, there are two important collections of posters held by Brandeis University’s Library & Technology Services: Spanish Civil War Posters (more than 250 anti-Fascist posters, sent or brought home by American volunteers in the Spanish Civil War) and World War I and World War II Propaganda Posters.

The British Library holds at least three major collections consisting of thousands of posters, print ads, advertising trade cards, and ephemera. They include the Evanion Collection of Ephemera (originally purchased by the British Museum in 1895), the Banks Collection of Trade Cards (Sir Joseph and sister Sarah Sophia), and the collection of Sir Ambrose Heal. The British Library has digitized thousands of these cards and made them available online. The multiple collections held by the State Historical Society of Wisconsin include the McCormick - International Harvester Co. Archives, the Foote, Cone & Belding Records, and the Singer Sewing Card collection. The University of Illinois Library holds four important
collections and archives: The D’Arcy Collection, the Woodward Collection of Advertising, the Stanley F. Cohen Collection, and the Advertising Council archives.

**Advertiser, industry, and user-generated collections.** These sources (see Table II) include individual advertisers (e.g., American Apparel, Prada), industry organizations (e.g., the Ad Council), and industry user-generated collections (e.g., Adforum, Adland, Advertolog). They also include what could reasonably be referred to as “fan” sites (i.e., digital PAC-rats). These are valuable in that they often focus on historically significant topics, are often global in scope, or are very large. The Jay Paull online collection of Vintage Print Advertisements is a good example, as are a few of the user-generated collections to be found on The Internet Archive. Many other digital PAC-rat collections, however, merely consist of Flickr or blog collections of “favorites,” mostly from the 20th century. These were not included among the findings when they failed to meet any of the criteria for inclusion.

Most of the sources in this category hold advertising or ephemera from the U.S., although the following geographic areas are also represented: Bangladesh, Brazil, Europe, France, India, Japan, Portugal, and the United Kingdom. Several collections have a global emphasis, combining advertisements and ephemera from multiple countries. Although many of the sources identify themselves as “archives,” there are only two actual archives among the 90 sources in Table II: the Ad Council, which includes case studies and research findings on campaign effectiveness; and the Robert L. Parkinson Library and Research Center, which holds a variety of documents and artifacts related to the history of the circus in America.

The majority of the sources are collections of advertisements from the 20th century. Collections consisting of ads and ephemera from the mainly late 19th century include those held by the following: Jay Paull Vintage Print Advertisements, historyworld, the Brookston Beer Institute, Jim’s Burnt Offersings, Kodakgirl.com, Philipp Lenssen (Vintage Ad Browser), the Museum of Vintage Commercial and Advertising Art, and Madeleine Blondel (70 Years of Terrot Posters). Print advertisements are the most widely collected artifacts among these collections as well. However, substantial collections of TV and radio commercials are held by AdRespect, Adforum, Mediabistro Inc., the Advertising Icon Museum, Advertolog, Advertising Archive Bangladesh, Coloribus, The Internet Archive (Classic Television Commercials), Great-Ads, Adland, Adstorical, Old Commercials (YouTube Channel), Advertising Age (Super Bowl Ad Archive), and tellyAds. The largest collections are held by historyworld; the Ads Through the Ages Flickr Group; Advertolog; Advertising Archive Bangladesh; Coloribus; Adland; the Outdoor Advertising Association of America; Adforum; gogd.tjs-labs.com (The Gallery of Graphic Design); Oldcaradvertising.com; Adverlicious; Philip Morris Incorporated; CircusWorldBaraboo.org; the Museum of Brands, Packaging & Advertising; tellyAds; Philipp Lenssen; and the Museum of Vintage Commercial and Advertising Art.

Most of the collections and archives include advertisements and ephemera across a variety of product and service classes and categories. Some that are thematically focused on especially unique products, services, and communication objectives include those held by AdRespect, Virtual Collins Radio Museum, Catskill Archive, Brookston Beer Institute, R2RTexas’ Reel To Reel Tape Recorder OnLine Museum, Bolex Collector, Classic Boat Library, Kodakgirl.com, Phantom Coaches, Philip Morris Incorporated, CircusWorldBaraboo.org, Reed Digital Collections, and Madeleine Blondel. Most offer online access to their collections and few charge a fee for access.

A current search of The Internet Archive (https://archive.org) using the term “commercial” or the names of particular advertisers or brands (e.g., Winston) retrieves hundreds of individual items and compilations of TV commercials and print ads. Many of these, however, are links to the AdViews search engine and collection at the Hartman Center, while others are of limited historical value and mainly consist of user favorites from the second half of the 20th century. However, The Internet Archive also includes the Political TV Ad Archive, a collection of 2016 primary election TV commercials. The Found in Mom’s Basement source lists 136 collections of print advertisements, ranging in size from one to dozens. Although most of the collections and ads fall into the “favorites” category, some focus on specific or unique media, products, advertisers, and campaigns. The online Museum of Advertising is a user-generated collection of print ads and magazine covers, organized into approximately 200 thematic categories. As another blog source, the historical value of this collection is similar to that of Found in Mom’s Basement. The Website maintained by the Rathkamp Matchcover Society includes links to several collections of matchbooks. A current search of YouTube using the term “old commercials” retrieves approximately 2,000,000 results. Researchers studying particular advertisers, brands, product or service categories, or decades would find it helpful to begin their search for television commercials on YouTube.
Dealers, vendors, and syndicated/subscription service collections. Some of the sources in this category (see Table III) are valuable because they are especially large, broadly geographic in scope, or helpful to historians studying particular 20th century brands or products. All but one of the sources includes print advertisements, six include television commercials, and three include radio commercials. All the collections consist of advertisements representing a variety of product or service categories except one (Toyadz.com).

Several of the sources hold advertising or ephemera from the U.S. only, while the rest are global in their geographic scope. The majority are collections of advertisements of the 20th century; there are no archives. All but two of these sources charge a fee for access to their collections. The subscriptions or fees, however, are well within many researchers’ budgets. For example, adflip offers access to its collection for an entire year for $204.

Conclusions, Limitations, and Recommendations for Future Research

The findings of this systematic attempt to assess the scope and historical research value of the world’s collections and archives devoted to advertising and marketing ephemera show that prior beliefs regarding the limited nature of these holdings were at least partly incorrect. Taking into account the multiple collections held by some sources, it is apparent there are hundreds of collections and archives and that the combined number of artifacts is in the millions. One explanation for this finding is that digital access to the holdings of libraries and museums and decades of efforts to catalog them have simply made it easier to locate them. Another explanation is that the number of holdings grew during the latter half of the 20th century, as individual and organizational collectors increasingly donated their collections and archives to libraries and museums.

An increase in research on advertising history may also help explain the large number of collections and archives now available. Histories of advertising date to the 19th century (Sampson, 1874), and general historical texts were written in the 1920s, 1950s, 1980s, 1990s, and 2000s. Moreover, the 1980s and 1990s were especially productive decades for advertising historians (Beard, 2016). Another explanation for the availability of the collections and archives revealed by this study is that scholars in a wide variety of disciplines are, as suggested earlier, increasingly recognizing the research value of advertisements and marketing ephemera.

The findings also make a valuable contribution to marketing and advertising’s historiography by highlighting the existence of archives and collections focusing on particular periods, countries, product and service categories, communication objectives, and types of ephemera. For instance, historians interested in pre-19th century topics will find several valuable sources identified in Table I. The first newspaper advertisement in Europe was printed in either 1625 (Presbrey, 1929; Wood, 1958) or 1632 (Frederick, 1925), and by the mid-1700s many newspapers in England and the American colonies existed primarily to carry advertising. Media development, professional practices, and trends in creative expression during this period, however, have gone largely uninvestigated, possibly due to the belief that few comprehensive primary sources existed. For historians interested in marketing ephemera, the findings reveal 42 collections, some of a global scope. Recommendations and additional sources and methods for using ephemera in historical research can be found in Neilson (2005) and Rickards (2000).

As another example, the findings show that researchers with an interest in how medicines and health-related products have been marketed and advertised could helpfully start with the U.S. National Library of Medicine, the Dublin City Library and Archive, and the Hartman Center. However, they would also want to include searches at the National Museum of American History, the Harvard Library, and the Library of Congress American Memory, since the findings show there may be relevant and important collections and archives among their holdings. Indeed, the study’s findings reveal the existence of many topically and historically important collections, ranging from cigarettes to slavery to the advertising of pleasure boats. In addition, historians pursuing cross-cultural topics will find collections and archives representing 16 countries in Tables I and II, as well as numerous collections with a global scope.

The findings of this study are limited in at least two ways. First, there remain possibly hundreds of important archives and collections held by some of the major institutional sources that have not yet been identified (e.g., the Harvard Library system and The Huntington). It would be especially valuable to continue the effort to identify historically significant ad agency archives and the archives of companies that had important influences on the development of marketing and advertising practices, such as the Quaker Company, Procter & Gamble, or Barron G. Collier’s Consolidated Street Railway Advertising Company. Thus, investigations of just the holdings of these major sources would make a valuable contribution to the research literature and the work of historians. Crew and Fleckner’s (1986) exploration
Archiving the Archives: The World’s Collections of Historical Advertisements and Marketing Ephemera

and description of some of the holdings in advertising history of the Smithsonian’s National Museum of American History offers an excellent example of the type of research called for.

Second, the findings of this study are limited by the failure to identify collections and archives representing many countries and cultures, including those in Asia, Africa, and South America. Fortunately, the findings also point the way to how these sources, collections, and archives might be located. Searches for these would best begin with research among national archives, government-funded museums, and major university library holdings. This would undoubtedly be the most direct and efficient method for bringing to light archives and collections similar to those held by the Smithsonian’s National Museum of American History, the National Archives, the Hartman Center, and the Harvard University Library in the U.S., as well as the British Library in the U.K.

References
Presbrey, F. (1929), The History and Development of Advertising, Doubleday, Garden City, NY.
Black in the Game: Black Male Models, U.S. Advertising, and Changing Culture

Blaine J. Branchik  
*Quinnipiac University, Hamden, Connecticut, USA*

Judy Foster Davis  
*Eastern Michigan University, Ypsilanti, Michigan, USA*

Erika L. Paulson  
*Quinnipiac University, Hamden, Connecticut, USA*

Abstract

**Purpose** - This research tracks how blacks specifically and minorities more generally are viewed by society in response to cultural change.

**Methodology** - It does this via a content analysis of black male advertising images culled from over 60 years of issues of two male-targeted magazines.

**Findings** - The analysis contextualizes the imagery in African-American history and general media portrayals periodized into seven historical phases. Results indicate that the number of black male advertising representations has exploded in the past thirty years from virtual invisibility to over 20% of all male ad images. Roles have migrated from representations of black ad models as servants and porters to a wide range of images of black men in professional and romantic contexts.

**Implications/limitations** - The disproportionately large number of black male depictions as athletes and sports celebrities is indicative of remnant racism and minority stereotyping in American society.

**Keywords** - race, advertising, content analysis

**Paper Type** - research paper

American society and culture are adjusting to the increasing diversity of the U.S population, civil rights gains by minorities since the 1950s, and the prominence of minority celebrities in American society. This accommodation relates to demographic realities of an evermore-heterogeneous society. Black or African-American (hereafter referred to as “black”) males have particularly significant impact on popular culture today. Recently, black actors won the coveted Best Actor Academy Awards Oscars in 2001, 2004, and 2006 (Dirks, 2011). Between 2000 and 2014, black athletes won the prized Heisman Trophy for outstanding university football athlete of the year five times (Heisman, 2015). Several recent works examine the disproportionate impact of urban black males on the broader popular culture (see Heath and Potter, 2004; Kitwana, 2006; Perry, 2004; Tate, 2003). Black male sports and entertainment celebrities and advertising models represent the ideal self to a broad swath of the American market – successful, self-confident, assertive, and attractive. Black models and celebrities appear regularly in advertisements targeting all consumers. Their appeal holds particular note to male consumers of all ethnic backgrounds (Bush et al., 2004; Caballero et al., 1989). In a predominantly white marketplace, it is interesting to note this appeal.

Male celebrity endorsers hold unique significance to male consumers. Athletic celebrities account for a large proportion of celebrity endorsers in advertisements targeting men (Branchik and Gosh Chowdhury, 2013). These male consumers, who view consumption and advertisements differently than women (Goffman, 1979; Klassen et al., 1993), are going through rapid changes. This transformation is reflected in men’s increasing focus on their bodies (Alexander, 2003; Pope et al., 2000) and reflected in their shopping patterns (Salzman et al., 2006). Men’s approaches to specific product categories, including personal grooming products, have been undergoing particularly notable transformations. The U.S. market for men’s bath, shower, deodorant, and skin and hair products market grew 36% in the five years between 2004 and 2009 (Euromonitor, 2011a) while the general beauty and personal care market...
grew only 8% (Euromonitor, 2011b) in the same period. The body spray product category alone grew among 18 to 24 year-old males by 62% from 2004 to 2005 (Bosman, 2005).

This changing market and its embrace of black male models is a relatively recent phenomenon. Before 1970, black male models - so common in media today - were typically displayed in subservient or pejorative contexts relative to their white counterparts. Following slavery, emancipation in 1865, two World Wars, the Civil Rights Act of 1964, race riots of the late 1960s, affirmative action, and a growing societal acceptance of minorities in general, it was not until 1965 that a black man had a lead role in a television series, I Spy. Many people today, including most baby boomers, recall a time when black images were virtually invisible in media. One might wonder how this growing acceptance came about; what historical drivers drove this change; and how consumers have reacted. It is therefore useful and important to trace the appearance of blacks in media starting from the mid-20th century into the 21st.

Research Focus and Impact
This research focuses on black male imagery as a reflection of changing male consumer culture via an analysis of black male images in print advertisements since World War II viewed by predominantly white middle class male audiences. It is intended to answer three research questions:

1. How have male black advertising images changed in the post-WWII period?
2. How closely do policy and societal changes precipitate or follow this evolution?
3. Have specific policy or societal changes acted as turning points in this evolution?

In answering these questions, this research builds upon work done by Kassarjian (1969; 1971) on black advertising images and Taylor and Lee (1994) on Asian images in advertising. It entails a content analysis of print advertisements featuring black male models culled from two male-targeted publications from the mid-20th century through the present day.

Advertisements are a particularly useful means of tracing cultural change. Ads provide both an archival record and normative guide for consumers (Belk and Pollay, 1985; Goffman, 1979). Ads both reflect the current state of culture and send signals about how consumers should act, what they should wear, buy, and do, and what denotes attractiveness. As a result, ads provide a unique primary source for cultural research.

These changing depictions do not happen in a vacuum; they are propelled forward by important historical events or turning points (Branchik, 2007, Branchik and Davis, 2009) as societal or marketplace views of these groups change. Therefore, overlying changes in depictions of black male models will be a chronology of policy and societal developments – including legislation, court rulings, news events, and cultural/demographic shifts - that trace the trajectory of African-American history in the U.S. At times it is the media organizations that mediate these changes. This research will therefore include a brief history of African-Americans with a focus on marketplace impacts from colonial times through the 21st century. The research will also integrate the marketing literature on black imagery in advertising and black and general consumer reactions to black ad imagery.

The proportion of the U.S. non-Hispanic white population to the overall U.S. population is expected to shrink from 63% in 2012 to 43% by 2060 (US Census Bureau, 2012). American business practitioners and researchers must understand the origins and directions of these changes in order to accurately predict future trends. This research will impact academics in fields such as marketing, advertising, communications, sociology and history. In addition, it will have relevance to business practitioners as they create business and marketing strategies to meet the needs of this diverse marketplace. Specifically, it will enable them to understand their role in shaping and reflecting societal changes vis-à-vis ethnic groups. Little research has been conducted directly tying historical factors to presentations of black male images in advertising.

This research begins with a brief literature review of research conducted on blacks and advertising. It will then present a summary timeline of African-American history, noting critical events or turning points that significantly impacted blacks and how they were viewed by broader society, and a periodization of this history. Next, the authors will overview the methodology used in conducting the content analysis followed by the results of that analysis. Discussion will then link the results of that analysis with the historical events summary. Finally, the authors will present conclusions, study limitations and avenues for future research.

Literature Review – Blacks and Advertising
Research related to black models and advertisements began in the late 1960s amidst the civil rights movement and societal upheaval associated with changing mores and the Vietnam War. Kassarjian’s
By the 1990s, research indicates that Blacks appear with greater frequency in advertising, but relegated to certain roles, settings, or more likely to appear alongside certain product categories or to specific audiences. Licata and Biswas (1993) found that black models were represented in television advertising at a rate greater than their proportion of the population. However, most ads were in black-targeted shows. Martin’s (2004) analyzed place context of ads featuring black models in *Time, Outside, & Ebony* magazines, finding that black models were seldom featured in outdoor settings. Bailey (2006) examined portrayals of black men in advertisements in white and black-targeted publications during the calendar year 2006, finding that black males in hip-hop magazines *The Source, Vibe*, and *XXL* tended to be featured more often but in non-occupational settings in ads for limited product categories. For publications targeting more mature black audiences including *Ebony* and *Essence*, and mixed audiences including *GQ* and *Spin*, he found far fewer black models but depictions in ads for a more diverse product mix, albeit also in non-occupational scenarios.

Other research has explored the history of ad campaigns targeting black consumers for products such as cereal (Edwards, 1936); baked goods (Chambers, 2008, p. 37); condensed milk, (Mangun and Parcell, 2014); cigarettes (Pollay and Lee, 1992) and insurance, soft drinks, liquor, personal cameras, film and other consumer goods (Davis, 2013).

Throughout the 1970s a body of work emerged that generally found the race of the model to have little effect on consumer’s perceptions. The use of black and white models did not dramatically impact the Muse’s (1971) sample of college students found no difference in ratings of ads featuring white versus black models. Bush et al. (1979) found that a consumer’s level of prejudice impacted their response to black models in advertisements. However Solomon et al. (1976) discovered that blacks and whites in the southeastern U.S. responded in similar ways whether a black, white or integrated set of models was used in a point-of-purchase display.

Twenty years later, Whittler (1991) found that younger consumers did not differentiate between ads featuring black versus white models. However, older consumers did seem to make this distinction. Whittler and Spira (2002) found that identification with black culture impacted how black consumers viewed black models in ads. Watson et al. (2010) and Meyers (2011) found that black respondents rated light-skinned black models higher than dark-skinned black models. Whittler (1989) conducted several studies using ads for a word processing device or laundry detergent and featuring either black or white models and assessing heuristic versus systematic processing of the ad content. LaFerle et al. (2014) found that in a time-constrained situation black consumers expressed higher preference for ads with white models while white consumers did not express different assessments. Without time constraints, neither group expressed a preference. However, historical research indicated that black consumers found positive portrayals of black models or spokespeople in advertisements to be very important and motivating (Davis 2013; Harris 1967).

Some research has explored consumer attitudes towards ads with black models for different product categories, including pharmaceuticals (Ball et al., 2009; Mastin et al., 2007) and business-to-business products (Stevenson and Swayne 2011). Overall results indicated a lessening of prejudice against the use of black models, although racial attitudes – both black and white – did play a role in how the ads were assessed.

This research builds on these earlier studies, extends the temporal reach, and places evolving depictions within their historical context in order to explain these changes.

### African-American History Timeline and Overview

Table I provides a historical summary of blacks in America beginning with the Colonial period and concluding with the 2016 Presidential Election. Important legislation, court rulings, events, cultural and demographic shifts are indicated.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Major Phases</th>
<th>Historical Drivers</th>
<th>Important activities and/or themes</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Oppressed</td>
<td>Colonial period slavery; Civil War</td>
<td>Black slaves owned as property; small population of free blacks assumes elite status in skilled trade and service work.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pre-1865</td>
<td>Emancipation Proclamation; Civil Rights Act of 1866 grants citizenship to all males born in U.S. including freedmen; Supreme Court declares “Separate but Equal” doctrine in 1896, supporting legal segregation; Reconstruction</td>
<td>Rise of Ku Klux Klan and similar hate groups. Establishment of restrictive Black Codes and Jim Crow laws which legally subordinated and segregated blacks. NAACP founded in 1909 to combat lynching and race prejudice concerning the political, educational, social and economic equality of minority citizens in the U.S.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Emancipated</td>
<td>World War I; Great Migration of blacks from rural South to urban North; Harlem Renaissance; Great Depression; World War II</td>
<td>Extreme segregation and anti-black violence are common in the South. Urbanization occurs as blacks increasingly relocate to cities in the North. Cultural arts flourish among black artists and writers in 1920s-1930s Harlem. Jesse Owens’ 1936 Olympics performance challenges Adolf Hitler’s white superiority theory. Blacks serve in the segregated military.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Urbanized</td>
<td>Malcolm X and MLK are assassinated in 1965 and 1968, respectively. Race riots occur in urban areas in late 1960s. The Black Panther Party offers a bold alternative message for Black America espousing self-defense and self-sufficiency. The Congressional Black Caucus is established in 1971 to promote the interests of blacks. Federal and state affirmative action policies concerning jobs and college admission are adopted.</td>
<td>Civil rights gains spur unprecedented college enrollment, access to a broader range of occupations and consumption opportunities for blacks. Interest in black consumers by mainstream marketers explodes as the value of the black consumer market is realized on a wide scale. The Black Power Movement seeks to achieve empowerment through violent and peaceful activist methods. Alex Hayley’s Pulitzer-Prize winning novel Roots is televised as a mini-series in 1977 and captivates the nation as it tells the history of a black American family. Positive black imagery increasingly appears in entertainment and media sources and become increasingly common in ads. More black-</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
### Diversified 1980–2008

| Multiculturalism becomes mainstream as ethnic/cultural diversity increases across the U.S. according to U.S. Census data. Middle-class African-Americans increasingly move from cities into suburban communities. A significant number of African-Americans dominate in sports and entertainment industries and become popular spokespeople for mainstream consumer brands. | Affirmative action policies are challenged as discriminatory towards whites and Asians and are outlawed in some states and by some colleges. Police beating of unarmed motorist Rodney King in 1991 and the O.J. Simpson murder trial in 1995 inflate racial tensions across the nation. However, professional athletes like golfer Tiger Woods and tennis players Venus and Serena Williams excel in sports which were once off-limits to blacks. Black urban professionals – labeled “buppies” - make significant career progress from the 1980s into the 2000s. |

### Empowered? 2008–Present

| Illinois Senator Barack Obama is elected as America’s first black president in 2008 and serves two terms. The Black Lives Matter Movement emerges in 2013 to address systemic racism towards black people. | While some believe the U.S. had entered a post-racial society upon Obama’s election, he faces unprecedented obstruction on many initiatives during both terms. Civil unrest follows the killings of unarmed black men by police and others. Donald Trump is elected U.S. President in 2016, running on a controversial platform associated with white male supremacy. |

---

**Historical Black Male Media Representations**

Images of black men have appeared in advertisements and other media at least since the Colonial period in U.S. history. For example, during slavery black males were described and presented as commodities in ads featuring slaves for sale (see Figure 1).
Figure 1. Colonial period advertisement featuring slaves for sale

Source: Hitchcock.itc.virginia.edu/slavetrade/collection/large/tobesold.jpg
In addition to Tom figures, media caricatures of black men as “Coons” and “Sambos” were also common in the late 1800s - early 1900s. Coons were typically illustrated as lazy, dim-witted, inarticulate and buffoonish, often with red exaggerated lips and bulging eyes. Sambos had characteristics similar to Coons, but tended to be children or portrayed as child-like – often loyal and contented. Lacking the capabilities for independence, Coons and Sambos required the supervision and dominion of whites (Pilgrim, 2012). Sambo and Coon images abounded in media materials such as children’s books and advertisements like the Chase and Sanborn Coffee ad shown in Figure 3.
Featured less frequently in marketing portrayals – but highly potent - were images of black men as “Brutes” or “Nats”. These men were stereotyped as physically strong and prone to violence, destruction or insurrection – and were therefore highly threatening to whites (Gibson, n.d.). For example, a common theme was black men with abundant sexual desires who allegedly raped white women and/or were prone to acts of criminality. These images remained into the 1990s and beyond and were associated with athletes such as boxer Mike Tyson and football player O.J. Simpson who were associated with domestic violence and murder, respectively. Rebellious “Nats”, named for the real-life Nat Turner - who led a slave revolt in 1831, were even more frightening. They were angry and vengeful brutes who hated whites and sought to kill them (Stone, 1992). In addition, Nats were revolutionaries, seeking to change the social order, similar to the Black Panthers of the 1960s and 1970s. As such, these men were deserving of punishment – including death. Their images prompted lynchings of black men during the Reconstruction period through World War II and the U.S. government’s quashing of the Black Panther Party in the 1970s. Therefore, media portrayals often signaled to the public the idea of black inferiority and/or the need for black men to be controlled by whites. Moreover, in an effort to dehumanize blacks, they were sometimes featured with savage, beast-like or animalistic characteristics. In sum, media portrayals were used to justify the dehumanization, segregation, mistreatment, incarceration and murders of black men. It was not until African-Americans were recognized as a legitimate consumer market that such pop culture images diminished (Davis, 2013). Knowing that black people sought respect and positive acknowledgement in the marketplace, black marketing professionals post-World War II were instrumental in developing improved marketing images which underscored black pride, respect and inclusion. Their participation in marketing decisions fundamentally changed the way that black men were portrayed in marketing and pop culture messaging.

Methodology
To investigate the research questions posed above, a content analysis of advertising that appeared in two men's publications was conducted. Male-targeted fashion and grooming ads for male consumers were selected in order to simplify the complex task of locating suitable ads and to address a particularly relevant target audience for black imagery.

Data collection and sampling

All advertisements for fashion and grooming products that appeared in five randomly selected issues per year of *Sports Illustrated* from the beginning of publication in August 1954 and until the end of 2012 were collected, totaling 1,195 advertisements. This period is particularly important because it covers four key periods in race relations (Desegregated, Diversified, Emboldened, and Empowered?). *Sports Illustrated* is also an important choice. The publication is a consistently popular men’s magazine; circulation just a year into publication was more than half a million, and steadily increased to more than 3 million by the 1990s (Audit Bureau of Circulation). It is also the most highly circulated men’s magazine; other higher circulation magazines are women’s service publications such as Better Homes and Gardens or general interest publication such as Reader’s Digest. The only other high-circulation men’s magazine is Game Informer, which wasn’t published until 1991 and thus covers a limited time period. The category was limited to men’s fashion and grooming products. Doing this helps control for the interaction between race and product category (Taylor and Stern, 1997; Mastro and Stern, 2003; Bang and Reece, 2003). Industry association product listings provided appropriate products for ad coding.

The second dataset includes 467 print ads for men’s fragrance products from June and December issues of *Esquire* magazine from its launch in 1934 to 2012. *Esquire* has a readership of 2.7 million, 69.6% of whom are males. *Esquire* is positioned as a “general-interest lifestyle magazine for sophisticated men [that] defines, reflects and celebrates what it means to be a man in contemporary American culture.” Advertisements from both datasets were filtered for those that contained at least one black model.

A total of 96 advertisements including 260 individuals were identified. Individuals were included in the data set if most of the face or eyes were visible, if they were illustrated or if they were human spokescharacters. Individuals were excluded if the image was only a shadow, if the figure appeared on a package label, or only hands or feet were visible. Such guidelines for inclusion allow any figures with characteristics related to race and ethnicity to be included. Repeat figures, such as a person shown in before-and-after style photos, was only coded once in their most prominent image. Duplicate ads were retained, consistent with other research (Wilkes and Valencia, 1989; Stevenson and McIntyre, 1995; Taylor and Stern, 1997).

Each individual was coded along five dimensions. First, the race or ethnicity of each individual was noted. Models were judged to be black if they had dark skin, dark hair, and Afrocentric facial features. Models were judged to be white if they had light skin and European facial features. Images not complying with these criteria were considered “other”. Next, the sex of each individual was noted as male, female, or unknown. Celebrity status was also coded for. An individual was counted as a celebrity if his name was mentioned in the ad. Given the longitudinal nature of the data set, doing so avoids problems with recognition of celebrities from earlier time periods. Celebrity status is important to capture as a number of authors note that blacks are disproportionately, and stereotypically, portrayed as professional athletes (Bristol et al., 1995; Licata and Biswas, 1993; Shuey et al., 1953).

Fourth, the perceived importance of groups has also proven to be a useful measure in a variety of studies (Bang and Reece, 2003; Bristol et al., 1995; Licata and Biswas, 1993; Taylor and Stern, 1997; Taylor et al., 2005; for a review of earlier work see Wilkes and Valencia, 1989). In this work, blacks were found to be shown more often in minor or background roles, as have other racial and ethnic minority groups. The role of each individual was coded as major, minor, or background by adapting the framework provided by Wilkes and Valencia (1989) to print ads rather than television.

Finally, the activity that the individuals were engaged in was recorded. Originally, we were interested in coding occupational categories as another indicator of status. Previous research has long noted that African Americans are often portrayed in unskilled occupations (Kassarjian 1969; Shuey et al., 1953; Taylor and Lee, 1994; Wilkes and Valencia, 1990; Zinkhan et al., 1986; Zinkhan et al., 1990) or as entertainers or athletes (Bristol et al., 1995; Humphrey and Schuman, 1984; Licata and Biswas, 1993; Shuey et al., 1953). However, it quickly became apparent that occupational categories were rarely portrayed in *Sports Illustrated*, and existing occupational coding schemes did not capture professional athletics. Other researchers have noted that Asian Americans are portrayed in business settings but rarely
Reliability
One graduate assistant coded the entire data set. To enhance the reliability of this effort, a number of procedures suggested by Kolbe and Burnett (1991) were used. Measures were pre-tested and refined using ads not in the data set, the coder was trained in two hour-long training sessions, the coder was given written rules and instructions, and coded independently. Inter-rater reliability was established by having one author and the graduate assistant both code a subset of 36 individuals. Inter-rater agreement averaged 90.9% and reliability for each item is reported in Table 2. Each item coded exceeded both the cutoff of 80% reliability noted by Krippendorff (2004) and 85% recommended by Kassarjian (1977). The coding scheme for activity was refined and in a second round of coding with 22 individuals, the reliability was 90.9%. Intra-rater reliability was calculated 10 days after initial coding was complete using a subset of 39 individuals. The average intra-rater reliability across measures was 93.3% and the results by item are reported in Table 2. Measures of reliability are comparable to similar research (Bailey, 2006; Licata and Biswas, 1993; Taylor and Stern, 1997).

Table II: Measures of reliability

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Inter-rater agreement</th>
<th>Intra-rater agreement</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Ethnicity</td>
<td>88.9%</td>
<td>87.2%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sex</td>
<td>97.2%</td>
<td>100.0%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Role</td>
<td>94.4%</td>
<td>94.9%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Celebrity</td>
<td>80.6%</td>
<td>100.0%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Activity</td>
<td>90.9%</td>
<td>84.6%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Average</td>
<td>90.4%</td>
<td>93.3%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Analysis
Because our interest is in comparing representations of blacks and whites within and across each period, numbers for each year are combined and reported by period. Doing so also helps smooth the otherwise noisy or erratic year-to-year differences. The results are analyzed by comparing the proportion of blacks and whites in each period and across periods in each coding category. For example, among all 74 blacks that appear during the Diversified period, 21.6% were identified as celebrities and the remaining 78.4% were identified as not celebrities. Similarly, among the 61 whites that appear during the Diversified period, 4.9% were identified as celebrities, while 95.1% were identified as not celebrities. In addition, the difference between these was evaluated for statistical significance using a p-test. This test considers whether there is a difference between 78.4% of 74 blacks that are not celebrities, and 95.1% of 61 whites that are celebrities. Significance is reported whenever it reaches the 90% level. However, results from the desegregated and emboldened period have sample sizes are 10 or less, making significance difficult to establish.

Results
Counts and Averages
Overall, the number of ads that include black models is quite low compared to the total number of ads that ran each year, although it increases over time. The year with highest proportion of ads that include black models is 2011, where black models appear in 8 of 22 ads or 36.4%. If the proportion of ads that include black models is averaged across a period, the emboldened period averages 1.5% of ads with black models, the Desegregated period averages 1.6%, the Diversified period averages 12.5%, and the Empowered period averages 21.3%. Both counts and averages per period are provided in Table 3 and by year in Figure 4.
Table III: Number and percent of ads including Black models by period

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Period</th>
<th>Number of ads</th>
<th>Ads Including Blacks</th>
<th>Percent including Blacks</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Emboldened</td>
<td>460</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>1.5%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Desegregated</td>
<td>257</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>1.6%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Diversified</td>
<td>439</td>
<td>55</td>
<td>12.5%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Empowered?</td>
<td>80</td>
<td>17</td>
<td>21.3%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td><strong>1236</strong></td>
<td><strong>83</strong></td>
<td><strong>6.7%</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Figure 4: Total number of advertisements and number of advertisements including Blacks over time

Role

In each period, results show that blacks and whites appear in about equal proportions in background, minor, and major roles. There is no statistically significant difference between black and white in any period. The exception to this appears during the Emboldened period in which black figures in advertising appear more often in background roles. However, the small sample size in this period (10 white and 10 black) prevents any determination of statistical significance.

Over time, the role – major, minor or background - in which models appear also changes. Black models only appear in background roles during the Emboldened period. In the Desegregated period, all models appear in major roles, and this shifts to more in minor roles for both black and white models in subsequent periods. A graphical representation capturing both black and white model ad positions during each historic period is provided at Figure 5.

Celebrity

Consistent with prior research, analysis indicates that blacks are more often portrayed as celebrities than whites in most periods (see Figure 6). This finding is statistically significant at the 99% level during the diversified period, and statistically significant at the 95% level during the empowered period. It also appears that blacks are more often shown as celebrities during the desegregated period, although the small sample size in this period precludes statistical significance. Black celebrities are most often professional athletes such as Willie Mays, Kobe Bryant, LeBron James, Scottie Pippen, Tiger Woods, Juwon Howard, Michael Irvine, Adrian Peterson, and Alonzo Mourning. Of course, this is not
particularly surprising for a sports publication, but it is worth noting that white celebrities include actor Mike Rowe as well as African-American musician Winton Marsalis. Over time, black models are more often celebrities than white models (except in the Emboldened period).

**Figure 5: Position of Black and White models per period**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Role</th>
<th>Emboldened</th>
<th>Desegregated</th>
<th>Diversified</th>
<th>Empowered?</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Black</td>
<td>80%</td>
<td>60%</td>
<td>80%</td>
<td>80%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>White</td>
<td>20%</td>
<td>40%</td>
<td>20%</td>
<td>20%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Background</th>
<th>Minor</th>
<th>Major</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Black</td>
<td>20%</td>
<td>80%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>White</td>
<td>80%</td>
<td>20%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Celebrity**

Consistent with prior research, analysis indicates that blacks are more often portrayed as celebrities than whites in most periods (see Figure 6). This finding is statistically significant at the 99% level during the diversified period, and statistically significant at the 95% level during the empowered period. It also appears that blacks are more often shown as celebrities during the desegregated period, although the small sample size in this period precludes statistical significance. Black celebrities are most often professional athletes such as Willie Mays, Kobe Bryant, LeBron James, Scottie Pippen, Tiger Woods, Juwon Howard, Michael Irvine, Adrian Peterson, and Alonzo Mourning. Of course, this is not particularly surprising for a sports publication, but it is worth noting that white celebrities include actor Mike Rowe as well as African-American musician Winton Marsalis. Over time, black models are more often celebrities than white models (except in the Emboldened period).
Activity
As to be expected in *Sports Illustrated*, the individuals pictured in advertisements are often athletes regardless of race. This is the most common activity after those coded as “other”. The proportion of black athletes is about the same as white athletes in the desegregated and emboldened period, but is statistically significantly greater (at the 99% level) during the diversified period: 60.8% of blacks are engaged in sports while 32.8% of whites are similarly engaged. Black athletes are also more prominent in representations during the Empowered phase.

Thirty percent of black representations in ads in the Emboldened phase are in service occupations, such as servant or porter; only 10% of white models are featured undertaking similar activities in that period. It must be noted, however, that the sample size in this period is small and so the difference is not statistically significant. There are no black depictions undertaking such activities in subsequent phases. There are depictions of black male models in romantic activities only during the Diversified (10% of depictions) and Empowered (5% of depictions) phases. However, the proportion of individuals engaged in romantic or professional activities were similar between black and white in each time period. Finally, no ads featuring black models in professional endeavors, such as doctor, teacher, etc., are found in the Emboldened phase, while professional activities represent 25% of representations in the Desegregated, 5% in the Diversified, and 11% in the Empowered phases.

Discussion
This research has assessed the trajectory of the appearance of black male models in advertisements targeting male consumers from the post-World War II period through 2012. It has found on a variety of dimensions that the frequency, position and role of those models has changed in response to various historical, cultural and legal developments in African-American history.

Beginning with the immediate post-War Emboldened phase, the number of ads containing black models grew consistently. Black models appeared in ads representing only 1.1% of all ads studied in that phase, increasing gradually during the Desegregated period and then experiencing a significant jump to over 10% in the Diversified phase, doubling to over 20% of ads in the current Empowered phase. Clearly, this growth reflects American society’s growing embrace of diversity in general and the important role of blacks in popular culture. This aspect is of particular relevance to male consumers, given the predominance of black athletic stars and their marketing appeal which transcends racial lines.

The role or position of black models in ads reflect the increased prominence of blacks in the broader society in that black models only appeared in background roles during the immediate post-World War II Emboldened phase. It was during this phase that blacks began seeking respect and fair treatment in society in a more strident manner. It was also the phase that finished with the passage of the Civil Rights Act of 1964, the impact of which wouldn’t be manifested until the later phases. Beginning with
the Desegregated phase, all images of black models are in major roles; this change in status can be interpreted as a reaction to the rapid societal changes following the Emboldened phase. In more recent times, blacks appear in major, minor or background roles at the same rate as white models.

An interesting finding that confirms past research is that ads featuring black models tend to rely on celebrity status more than those containing white models throughout three of the four latest historical phases. It is not surprising that black models featured in background roles in the Emboldened phase would contain no celebrities. Black celebrities were still relegated to the cultural background in that period and black male athletic celebrities were just coming into the public consciousness. To underscore this point, it was not until 1948 that Jackie Robinson broke the color barrier and became the first African-American major league baseball player. One might wonder, however, why anonymous white models would be common in male-targeted ads while anonymous black models are all but invisible even today. One possible explanation is that, despite the embrace of diversity in society and the popular culture, it is still difficult for the mostly white male consumer to see his ideal self embodied by a non-celebrity black model in an ad targeting him.

Closely related to the preponderance of black celebrity ad models, blacks featured in advertisements are depicted undertaking athletic endeavors more frequently than white models in the Diversified and Empowered? phases. Although the frequent athletic depiction can be explained by the fact that the majority of images came from *Sports Illustrated* magazine, it does not explain the disproportionately larger black model representation. One possible explanation is the stereotype of the black male as an athlete versus other occupation. Another possibility is that black men gained notoriety, respect and hero status through their athletic accomplishments and male consumers enjoyed seeing them in those roles. For example, during the 1980s and 1990s, which corresponds with the Diversified period, major apparel companies like Nike, Reebok, Adidas and Puma often featured iconic black athletes such as Michael Jordan, Charles Barkley, Carl Lewis and Bo Jackson in their U.S. and international advertising campaigns (Barber, 2014), elevating their status as global sports celebrities.

As would be expected, in the immediate post-War Emboldened phase, when black models were depicted in ads, they were often shown as servants or porters. This representation reflects black males as docile and servile “Toms” or “Coons” in other media such as film and television in the early to mid-20th century. The appearance of black models undertaking professional activities in the Desegregated phase reflects a framework proposed by Clark (1969). He describes four phases of media representations minorities pass through, starting with invisibility in media and ending with respect. His third phase, termed regulation, presents images as upholders of the social order such as doctors or policemen. It should be noted that much of the advertising featuring black models was in marketing efforts aimed at black consumers through black media. In those executions, black models were more likely to be featured in a larger variety of roles and occupations than those presented in media vehicles primarily consumed by white audiences. The participation of black marketing professionals in the eras after World War II was instrumental in the diversification of black roles in advertising and marketing portrayals (Davis, 2013). Finally, the appearance of black models undertaking activities associated with romance only in the Diversified (10% of depictions) and Empowered? (5% of depictions) phases potentially harkens back to the historic era when the image of the sexually aggressive “Brute” or “Nat” resulted in less threatening “Tom” or “Coon” media imagery. Recent romantic scenarios, however, may simply be an indicator of the “post-racial” society heralded by the candidacy and election of an African-American president, growing acceptance among younger consumers of the diversity of American society, loosening mores around sexuality in general, and the long-term impact of affirmative action legislation or the Civil Rights Act in previous phases.

**Conclusion**

This research has examined changes over more than 60 years in the representations of black males in print advertisements targeting male consumers. Using a content analysis of ads for men’s fashion and grooming products in two popular male-targeted publications, it has found that these changing representations have largely paralleled developments in African-American history and reflected related societal changes.

This research has limitations. It relied on print ads from only two publications, albeit popular male-targeted magazines with large circulations. This limited selection could have impacted the types and formats of ads presented. Even though over 1500 ads were examined, only 96 advertisements including 260 individuals contained black models. This limitation at times impacted the statistical

---

**Black in the Game: Black Male Models, U.S. Advertising, and Changing Culture**

---

62
significance of some of the results. In addition, the sample ads failed to include some of the most well-recognized black athletes and brand endorsers in history, such as Michael Jordan, Earvin “Magic” Johnson, and Shaquille O’Neill among others. Perhaps this was a fluke of the issues included in the sample or the function of the of product categories included in the analysis.

Future research could expand the number and target audience of publications and product categories and incorporate video as well as print advertisements. This large sample may provide more diverse representations. Finally, given the publication dates of the first issues of the magazine used in this project (1954 for *Sports Illustrated* and 1934 for *Esquire*), ad images appeared only in the post-World War II period. No pre-War black model images were found from the *Esquire* 1934-World War II sample. Expanding the number of publications could increase the historic reach of this research.

The growing diversity of the U.S. population, the widespread influence of African-Americans on popular culture and the historic 2008 election of Barack Obama as the first black President of the United States prompted many to speculate that society had entered a post-racial era. As such, it was anticipated that minority advertising imagery in general and black imagery in particular would continue to grow in a variety of media, including print and video. However, the 2016 campaign and election of Donald Trump as President, with its accompanying rhetoric associated with racist language and other elements of intolerance, caused some to question progress relative to black empowerment. Going forward, assessing advertising images will continue to provide a useful tool for understanding cultural and societal change over time.
References


Audit Bureau of Circulation, Arlington Heights, Illinois, paid and verified circulation reports.


Chambers, J. (2008), Madison Avenue and the color line, University of Pennsylvania Press, Philadelphia, PA.


Harris, J. B. (1967). “Effective advertising to the Negro marketing: some basic guidelines,” Consumer Markets Division, Eastman Kodak Company, Rochester, New York, August 25, unpublished manuscript. John Benjamin Harris Papers, Box 1, John W. Hartman Rare Book, Manuscript and Special Collections Library, Duke University, Durham, N.C.


Abstract

Purpose—This paper explains the methodology and background to A Model of Periodization of Radio and Internet Advertising History (presented at CHARM 2015 Long Beach), which compares the development of advertising on two new media, radio and Internet.

Design/methodology/approach—The research is based on historic and contemporary materials, and mediated through the personal experience of the researcher. It incorporates the methodology of new historicism and is influenced by postmodern historiography and postmodern marketing.

Originality/value—The literature review is itself a history, and the model which emerged from this research is also original.

Keywords Internet history, Internet advertising, radio history, radio advertising, advertising history, marketing history, postmodern marketing

Paper type Research paper

Introduction

When the World Wide Web emerged as a new mass medium for communications in the early 1990s it was quickly embraced by consumers—but not by marketers. Home Internet access was relatively inexpensive, all one needed was a computer and a Web browser for the whole world of information to be available at one’s fingertips. But when the first advertising appeared on a website in 1994 it was immediately despised by those consumers, not to mention harshly criticized by Web developers and ignored by most reputable marketers. Only a few forward thinking, imaginative marketers dared to experiment with the new medium as a platform for advertising. This paper is presented in two parts: Part I, which describes the epistemological foundation of the history of Internet advertising, including the model of periodization of that history; and Part II, a work in progress which describes the history of Internet advertising to the present day, organized according to the model.

Though the history of Internet advertising is short in terms of timespan it is nonetheless rich in detail and significant in terms of the evolution of forms of advertising. It is challenging to document Internet advertising history for several reasons. First, because “Internet time” moves so quickly and changes in the use of the new media happen so rapidly, its history must be documented almost immediately or the opportunity is lost. There exists little academic research into Internet advertising from a historical perspective because Internet advertisements are almost never preserved in their original form, so the more time passes, the more this history will be irretrievably lost. This is due to the nature of the Web as a publishing and advertising medium. Unlike magazines and newspapers which are typically preserved in their original form or which have their pages microfilmed, a Web page comes together only when it is viewed by a consumer. Therefore, even when banner ads and other forms of Internet advertising are saved, they are saved as static images, separated from the Web page on which they appeared. Their form, animation, and context are lost. And perhaps the biggest challenge to the Internet historian is the conflicting interests of advertiser, advertising agency, and content publisher. Though the Internet Archive, a non-profit organization dedicated to the preservation of an Internet library, collects historical versions of websites, including those that sell advertising space, in those collections the advertising is stripped from the content because it is owned by either the advertiser or a creative agency, and when the relationship between that advertiser and its agency ends, the mutually-created ads disappear from the public record.

In the early days of the Internet no one thought to preserve websites, much less Web advertisements, for later study. Though the Internet Archive began archiving websites in 1996, advertisements, because they were served onto the Web page separately from the content, were not captured. For example, if you go to the Internet Archive’s website and use the Wayback Machine
Both personal and public history is offered as an explanatory and illuminative narrative constructed from a multitude of sources (Tuchman, 1982). For this reason the use of the first-person perspective is employed occasionally. The "I was there" perspective, and include details neglected by or unavailable to historians, because the historian has had the opportunity to participate in the events under study. He or she can offer an "I was there" perspective and mediated through the personal experience of the researcher. When the researcher writes after the fact (Tuchman, 1982). For this reason the use of the first person perspective is employed occasionally. The history is offered as an explanatory and illuminative narrative constructed from a multitude of sources both personal and public, in which the main "character," so to speak, is forms of advertising.

This research presents a postmodern narrative history of Internet advertising based on both historic and contemporary materials and mediated through the personal experience of the researcher. When the historian has had the opportunity to participate in the events under study he or she can offer an "I was there" perspective, and include details neglected by or unavailable to historians writing after the fact (Tuchman, 1982). For this reason the use of the first person perspective is employed occasionally. The history is offered as an explanatory and illuminative narrative constructed from a multitude of sources both personal and public, in which the main "character," so to speak, is forms of advertising.

Academic marketing research during the early Internet years made almost no mention of Internet advertising but instead focused on the use of, effectiveness of, and consumer response to, corporate websites—which are not, strictly speaking, advertising. As the years passed, academic researchers began to investigate true Internet advertising as a phenomenon but continued to focus on either measurements of effectiveness or consumer response. In the professional world of Internet marketing, the field in which I worked as a manager for six years, research interests are even narrower. When it comes to Internet advertising the main research questions of interest to marketing professionals are: (1) How effective is the advertisement?; (2) How can effectiveness be measured?; and, more recently (3) How can advertisers and content publishers defeat the use of ad blocking software? Researchers both academic and corporate have been entirely uninterested in the forms of Internet advertising, and in the relationship between these forms of advertising and the growth of the new medium. This gap in historical knowledge, therefore, became my primary interest.

As a professional Internet marketer I remember when the first advertising appeared on the Internet and the controversies it caused, so my first task as an academic researcher was to collect and organize as much data about the early years of the Internet as possible, searching through each piece of data for some information about Internet advertising. The main sources of this data were trade magazines from my personal collection, trade books published during the early 1990s, general newspapers from the United States and Canada, and business and marketing magazines. It was, in fact, my personal collection of historical artifacts from the early years of Internet advertising that originally inspired my academic research, and I later learned that in the discipline of marketing history, “the serendipitous discovery of a neglected lode of important historical evidence may sometimes be reason enough for launching a project” (Witkowski and Jones, 2006, p. 72).

The relationship between the Internet as a new medium and the forms of advertising that emerged and developed upon it up to 2008 was the subject of A Narrative History of Radio and Internet Advertising (Buchwitz, 2012); and a model of periodization proposed that the development of advertising on a new medium advances through four phases: technology, content, advertising, and advertising-becomes-content (Buchwitz, 2015). Part II of this paper reiterates the history of Internet advertising, updates it with recent developments, and proposes that the fourth phase, advertising-becomes-content, is the final phase which continues indefinitely with no ending point, just as the asymptote of a curve approaches, but never reaches, the line.

Methodology
This research presents a postmodern narrative history of Internet advertising based on both historic and contemporary materials and mediated through the personal experience of the researcher. When the historian has had the opportunity to participate in the events under study he or she can offer an “I was there” perspective, and include details neglected by or unavailable to historians writing after the fact (Tuchman, 1982). For this reason the use of the first person perspective is employed occasionally. The history is offered as an explanatory and illuminative narrative constructed from a multitude of sources both personal and public, in which the main “character,” so to speak, is forms of advertising.
History is both a field of study in and of itself and a methodology for the study of other disciplines. Historical research requires an epistemology, a point of view regarding the meaning of history, and the awareness that without historical context, patterns are meaningless (Tuchman, 1994). The term narrative qualifies history in an epistemological sense. It suggests that the knower of facts is recounting a history based on facts that are knowable, or were known and perhaps forgotten, rather than those that were made (up) as in the case of fiction (White, 2010). At its most basic, history is the organization and representation of knowledge (Bentley, 1999), but it is also a forensic study of texts and artifacts such as journals and chronicles which themselves are differentiated from “histories” in that they straightforwardly recount events as they occurred, in chronological order. A history, by comparison, is an arrangement of events, facts, and details according to their relevance and dependence on each other, which implies active and subjective decision-making by the historian. Written accounts of history may begin with objective facts or empirical truths but the historian who pedantically records them produces an unreadable text, and so historical research and writing requires imagination and storytelling ability, or the ability to organize and construct a coherent narrative. It is inevitable, therefore, that works of history contain elements of fiction (Iggers, 1997; Tuchman, 1982; White, 1973).

The history of Internet advertising presented here is not a simple chronicle of events but a narrative, deliberately organized and told. For those researchers who believe that history is an art rather than a science the art is in selecting the details and using them in the right place in the story (Tuchman, 1982). Tuchman views the study and writing of history as an end in itself. It need not prove anything, and to discover a historical generalization while studying the events of interest, such as the model of periodization of radio and Internet advertising history, is the thrill the historian gets. History should inspire passion, and Tuchman states that to write history you must be in love with your subject. History and literature (and marketing) share many characteristics, in fact Tuchman (1982) believes that history should aspire to the condition of literature. White (2010) also identifies narrative history as a literary form, one in which the narrator’s voice plays an important role. This view of history-as-literature has led to the development of a new methodology adopted by historians, literary theorists, and even marketers, called “new historicism.”

The term new historicism was coined by literary theorist Stephen Greenblatt (1989) and employed in his book Will in the World: How Shakespeare Became Shakespeare (Greenblatt, 2005). In it he tells the story of Shakespeare’s early life, based not on any records of the man or recorded histories of his life but rather based on cultural and textual artifacts of that time and place. New historicism has been described as a type of cultural materialism, and a way to communicate stories from the past in the present. It raises questions of narrative voice and point of view and defends the right of the historian to draw conclusions (Veesser, 1989; Winn, 1992; Hoover, 1992; Gallagher and Greenblatt, 2000; Thomas, 1991). It is self-conscious and reflexive in nature, and as such has been embraced by some postmodern thinkers, and by postmodern marketers such as Stephen Brown. This research owes much to the influence of postmodern thinkers such as Lyotard (2002), Jameson (Jameson, 1993), and Stephen Brown (Brown, 1995). The postmodernist position allows one to know something without claiming to know everything (Richardson, 1994). I do not claim to know everything about Internet advertising, but “having a partial, local, historical knowledge is still knowing” (Richardson, 1994, p. 578), and so I offer a history of Internet advertising.

The postmodern condition, or central conundrum, if you will, is the problem of legitimation of the question of who decides what are the conditions for truth. Legitimation is the process by which a legislator (person or body) becomes the authority by which new truths are judged. The problem is, who legitimizes this process? Lyotard viewed this as a mirror-in-the-mirror problem, receding to infinity, and so postmodernism is antiscientific because it questions the right of scientists to both set the rules and to judge new knowledge according to them. Lyotard also defines postmodernism as “incredulity toward metanarratives” (2002, p. xxiv), the idea that there are universal truths or grand theories that explain everything. Therefore, the four phases of development of Internet advertising history is not offered as a theory, however grand, but rather as an organizational construction through which to understand the narrative.

In the field of historical research there is a branch referred to by its proponents as postmodern historiography. Ankersmit (1989), one of its leading champions, states that historiography has always had something postmodern about it. Whereas traditional historians distinguish between the form and the content of their writing and believe that their literary style in no way frames or influences the content, Ankersmit argues that content derives from the historian’s style. To Ankersmit, historiography
is like art and literature in that the nature of the work is formed by the language used to describe it. And language and art, that is, aesthetics, are part of reality. Whereas the modernist historian, one who believes in the scientific approach to history, examines evidence which he or she believes will lead to a description of the reality of the past the postmodernist historian, on the other hand, examines the evidence to find the historical reality in its interpretation. Evidence, Ankersmit says, points not directly to the past but only to interpretations of the past. He employs the parallels between art and historiography in his vigorous contrasting of historiography against science. Postmodernism, he says, is antiscientistic, and so too should be historiography. Postmodern historiographer Alun Munslow (1997) also believes that writing history is a literary undertaking, since history does not exist for the reader until the story is told, and its power to explain resides in its fundamental narrative form. Evidence, says Munslow, is selected, not discovered. Ankersmit (1989) further describes postmodernist historiography as nominalistic and anti-essentialistic, that is, a postmodern historian is not searching for the “essence” of the historical period under study but rather believes that the meaning or “essence” of it is to be found in the small, seemingly unimportant details; the throwaway observations and mundane events. In other words, the essence of the period is in the scraps. In this way, postmodern historiography, as a theoretical perspective for historical research, borrows from new historicism and also informs this research.

The postmodernist view of historiography attempts to introduce theory to an academic endeavor that, traditionally, did not believe in it. To admit that there are “theories” of history presupposes that they are not all alike, which flies in the face of the traditional historian’s belief that his task is to document what, in actual, empirical fact, was. But the postmodern perspective is entirely theoretical, with no claims whatsoever to scientific empiricism. Iggers (1997) defines the postmodern approach to historiography as the denial that historical writing does, or ever possibly could, describe an actual historical past, and White (2010) observes that the postmodern influence demands that the historian admit responsibility for constructing, not discovering, a version of the past. The postmodernist seeks one of multiple truths. Who is to say what was the truth of the pioneering days of Internet advertising since little of it is preserved as it existed at those moments in time, on a long since disappeared Web page? In 1995, the Open Text Index was one of the first and the only full-text Internet search engine. It formed the first search engine partnership with Yahoo! It was one of the first websites to sell advertising to online marketers. These statements come from my personal memories. I cannot prove them, nor do I believe it is necessary to do so.

The subject matter and methodology of this research may cause some to question whether this is in fact research into marketing phenomena. What differentiates marketing from, say, history or media studies? Brown (1995), asks this question and answers that it is neither the subject matter nor the methodology that defines marketing research. Marketing researchers concern themselves with everything from neuroscience (Hamilton, 2004, Roston, 2004), to Madonna (Brown, 2003). Bagozzi (1975) believes that since marketing is, at its most basic level, an exchange, that it has universal applicability. Ways of knowing in marketing include analysis and the search for similarities (O'Shaughnessy and O'Shaughnessy, 2002), and so this thesis, which among other things identifies the similarities between the evolution of advertising on radio and the evolution of advertising on the Internet, and which has as its central object marketing’s most public activity, advertising, certainly qualifies.

Postmodernism is ironic, irreverent, and non-traditional. It treats “low” subjects with seriousness (Brown, 1995)—and nothing was lower than advertising in the early Internet days. Brown (1995) believes postmodernism has much to contribute to marketing, and that understanding it provides insight into modern marketing practices which are changing rapidly and dramatically in light of the Internet. Postmodernism has, in fact, infiltrated all aspects of contemporary marketing (Brown, 1995).

As Lyotard and Jameson considered the postmodern condition and the crisis of representation, Brown (1998) is concerned with the academic marketing condition, which he believes faces its own crisis of representation. The solution, he believes, is that marketing should abandon its scientific pretenses, embrace the fact that it is an art, and aspire to the status of literature (Brown, 1998). Brown is the father of postmodern marketing, the belief that the study of marketing and marketing phenomena should be approached the way one approaches literature: with humour, characters, drama, and storytelling; that marketing histories should be exciting and pageturning; and most of all, that marketing and the study of it should inspire passion (Brown, 1998).
Sources of Data

Both primary and secondary sources were consulted and referenced in the construction of this history, and the primary sources are themselves historical artifacts. White (2010, p. 14) reminds us that when studying a historical artifact the historian must go beyond simply examining it and enter the world of intellect, to reflect upon the purpose behind the artifact’s being created in the first place. It is this realm of thought that distinguishes history from science: we can understand history only after we have “re-thought” the circumstances and context that influenced the creator of the artifact. Hodder (1994, p. 394) adds that when interpreting written texts as sources of data they must always be understood in terms of the historical conditions of their production, because historical artifacts are “produced under certain material conditions...embedded within social and ideological systems.”

In order to construct a history of the development of advertising on the Internet it was necessary also to research the social and ideological influences during each period. To accomplish this, as I collected my historical artifacts I grouped them according to time period and original purpose, then analyzed them together as a group. For example, my personal collection of Internet trade and technology magazines from the early 1990s illustrated the fact that during those years the interest was in the technology, the nuts and bolts of the Internet. Just the fact that there were so many of these publications and that they were so short-lived shows how attitudes changed as Phase I (Technology) gave way to Phase II (Content), because once the new group of non-technical consumers had been established most of those publications ceased to exist. The rebellion against Internet advertising that occurred during the mid-1990s was constructed in this narrative by reading dozens of newspaper articles from that period, mostly in the San Jose Mercury News. In the list that follows each category of artifact is listed and briefly described in terms of its historical context:

1. Newspaper articles from The San Jose Mercury News, the main newspaper of California’s “Silicon Valley;” The New York Times; and The Washington Post, describing the achievements of early Internet companies.
2. Early “how to” Internet books (for example Berger, 2006) written for consumers with home computers to instruct them about how to connect to the Internet, find information on the Internet, and avoid advertising on the Internet.
3. Contemporary (i.e. non-historical) books about the creation or development of the Internet, such as Tim Berners-Lee’s (1999) Weaving the Web.
4. The website of the Interactive Advertising Bureau, at www.iab.net. The IAB website includes the full record of the organization’s activities, including all press releases dating back to the first meeting of the organization in June, 1996 (which, incidentally, I attended). Press releases were mainly used to date events and activities, and to show the growth of Internet advertising in terms of dollars being spent.
5. C|Net, the Internet technology news website that dates back to 1995 and is still in publication.
6. Market research reports from Forrester Research, from my personal collection. These reports are written by professional analysts and are sold (for thousands of dollars each) to technology companies and advertisers to help them plan their marketing activities.
7. Feature articles from popular American consumer magazines Newsweek, Business Week, and Time, describing for non-technical readers the business aspects of the Internet (including advertising).
8. Articles from Advertising Age magazine and its online publication, AdAge.com, the premier American advertising trade magazine, the context of which is to celebrate current achievements in advertising.
9. Short-lived Internet consumer and trade magazines such as Websight, NetGuide, Internet Underground, Internet World, and Red Herring, from my personal collection. These magazines were written and edited by very young Internet enthusiasts, and typically published by their own small, struggling companies.
10. The shareholders prospectus from the year Lycos, one of the first Internet search engine companies, went public. (From my personal collection.)
11. Personal email conversations with *Wired* magazine executives Rick Boyce and Andrew Anker, who were the first people to conceive of Internet banner ads; and with Rosalind Resnick, an early Internet entrepreneur and author.

12. Novels: *Neuromancer* by William Gibson and *Snow Crash* by Neal Stephenson, which inspired the “Internet geeks” of the early 1990s.

13. Transcriptions of recordings: (1) Al Gore’s 1993 speech to the National Press Club is mentioned several times throughout the thesis, and is quoted in section 6.2. This quote is from my own transcription of an audio file of the complete recording of the speech which I found online on an unofficial website. Though the source that published the audio file may be dubious, it is undoubtedly Al Gore’s voice and the person who introduces him identifies the context of the speech; (2) The radio programmes featuring George Burns and Gracie Allen quoted in section 4.5 were transcribed from my own CDs, a commercially available collection called Radio’s Greatest Comedians.

14. Miscellaneous sources including broadcast history textbooks, old advertising textbooks, contemporary marketing textbooks, and books about television advertising.

Some of the online sources mentioned above, such as the articles from C|Net and AdAge.com, exist in my personal files as pieces of paper, printed from those websites either on or not long after the date they were published. The date of printing displays on the printed page, and it is that date that is used as the access date when these sources are referenced in the bibliography. These and many of my other sources existed only as meaningless pieces of paper in a box until I began my research, and as Hacking (2002) notes, artifacts of history have no meaning until they become the object of scientific study. In defense of my use of personal and proprietary materials I cite Baron, who argues for a plurality of method in historical research, including the “locating, reproducing, editing and publishing [of] previously inaccessible documents.” (Baron, 1986, p. 97). In defense of my use of contemporary cultural documents such as popular Internet magazines and popular websites of the time, I refer to Hodder (1994), who describes such documents as “mute evidence,” that is, documents and other artifacts that are separated from their creators, and can only speak to us, so to speak, through their existence. He also states that in addition to the fields of history, archaeology, and anthropology, that technology is a field in which the examination of historical evidence is appropriate, and this thesis is, in part, a history of technology. Hodder also believes that documents that were originally prepared for personal use (as opposed to records) require of the historical researcher a “more contextualized interpretation” (Hodder, 1994, p. 393) as they are, essentially, the recorded speech of the observer or participant. Some of my sources of data were personal documents of this nature, for example the email conversations with Rick Boyce, Andrew Anker, and Rosalind Resnick; and some were my own observations as a participant.

Engaging with textual artifacts and attempting to interpret them may necessitate the employment of the tools of literary theory (Brown et al., 2001)—tools such as new historicism. Hodder also describes the importance of what he calls the traces of material culture (a concept utilized by the new historians), and it is in that spirit that I include as sources of data artifacts like the Lycos prospectus, press releases issued by the IAB, recordings of old radio shows, novels, popular magazines, and Forrester reports. The use of these artifacts as sources of data is also supported by Savitt (1980), who notes that the sources of historical marketing data differ from those of traditional marketing research and may include archived materials, corporate records, public documents, legal documents, as well as written histories of non-marketing subjects, which, presumably, serve to help the researcher to understand the context in which the marketing phenomenon developed. Golder (2000) adds that fortunately, most marketing phenomena of interest to researchers took place in recent history, therefore data, especially in the form of printed and electronically archived documents, is abundant.

Finally, working with the data required “working with large masses of diverse, complicated, and sometimes contradictory evidence,” and a “meticulous approach to the assembling and evaluation of evidence, and the painstaking fitting together of all the pieces” (Neve, 1991, p. 16). It was something of a Rosencrantz and Guildenstern are Dead experience, because advertising was never the main character. In the end, the narrative history which follows is based on my interpretation of these artifacts.

**Literature Review**
This literature review is non traditional in that it incorporates many different types of literature in addition to academic works, an approach supported by Witkowski and Jones (2006) who note that literature, for historical researchers, typically consists of secondary sources and so does not lend itself to the traditional presentation. It is organized according to three major topics, each of which touches upon or informs this thesis: (a) Periodization in Marketing History, (b) Periodization in Internet History, (c) Internet and Internet Advertising Literature, both popular and academic. This research is a contribution to the history of marketing and historical methodology in the form of the model of Periodization of Internet Advertising History. It also contributes to the literature on Internet, Internet marketing, and Internet advertising history.

**Periodization in Marketing History**

Marketing history has never been the most popular branch of academic marketing research, overshadowed as it is by the much more popular view among researchers of marketing as a science. Nevett (1991), however, has suggested that historical techniques can be useful in working with marketing data, and should be used as a supplement to scientific study. Marketers, like historians, must generalize in order to develop solutions to current problems, which typically are problems of understanding why something happened in the past so that it can either be repeated or avoided in the future. Marketers and historians both use language in a less precise, more descriptive way than do scientists, and both marketers and historians recognize that language and terminology change their meanings over time. When marketers and historians work with evidence of past events in order to construct what must have happened, they must apply imagination and judgment rather than empirical testing. And marketers, like historians, should look for both immediate and root causes of events under study, to understand the forces and actors in play, and why things turned out the way they did. Nevett recommends marketers follow these four stages of historical investigation: (1) Put aside facts that are beyond dispute and focus on the rest; (2) Subject the evidence to internal criticism by applying judgment, imagination, and intuition to judge its validity and relevance; (3) Subject the evidence to external criticism by comparing it to other events; (4) Synthesis all evidence to reconstruct an account of what happened.

If marketing history is the underprivileged child of marketing research, advertising history is its neglected stepchild—though it has its champions. Well before the end of the 20th century Pollay (1977) hopefully predicted that advertising would be a central focus when the histories of that century were written. He considered it inevitable, in fact, because advertising acts as a mirror of society, and marketing plays a key role in the development of the economy. He further called upon the academy of historians to take up the task of writing advertising histories since practitioners, though they may be most familiar with the subject, seemed disinclined to do so. A decade later Pollay (1988) repeated his plea, reaffirmed his statements that advertising has important cultural significance, and continued to complain that there are not enough marketing academics who are interested in writing advertising history. It would seem he had a point, since the Journal of Advertising History, which published many of Pollay’s papers, could not sustain itself and it is difficult today to find evidence of its existence. Academic writings about marketing history can be divided into two broad categories: the history of marketing thought and the history of marketing content (Savitt, 1980). The first comprehensive treatise on the history of marketing thought was written by Bartels (1962), who organized the development of marketing thought into decade-long periods, each of which was assigned a name by which to identify it: Period of Discovery (1900-1910), Period of Conceptualization (1910-1920), Period of Integration (1920-1930), Period of Development (1930-1940), Period of Reappraisal (1940-1950), Period of Reconception (1950-1960). Later, Jones and Monieson (1990) examined the literature of historical research in marketing and classified each work as contributing to either marketing thought, marketing content, or methodology. They then created a complex periodization model that classifies the history of historical research in marketing into three significant time periods, and describes each in terms of its focus on each of the three areas (see Figure 1). It should be noted that although they include a discussion of the time period 1980-1989 and describe it in terms of a revival of interest in historical marketing research, Jones and Monieson do not actually name this period.

Periodization is a way of organizing a historical narrative by chronological periods with fairly distinct beginning and ending points, the purpose of which is to impose a structure on the narrative so as to make it more understandable (Witkowski and Jones, 2006). It is a device or a framework for organizing and presenting research results that typically occurs to the historian only after the collection and chronological organization of data has been done, and patterns and themes have begun to emerge.
A Postmodern History of Internet Advertising Part I

(Hollander et al., 2005, Jones and Monieson, 1990). In other words the periods are a construct imposed on the narrative after the fact.

Figure 1: Periodization of Historical Research in Marketing: Jones & Monieson’s (1990) Model

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Period</th>
<th>Name given to period</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1930-1959</td>
<td>Recording the Facts</td>
<td>Focus on recording the facts of the development of marketing thought, concepts, and theories; very few works on marketing content or methodology</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1960-1968</td>
<td>Integration of Practice and Thought</td>
<td>Works on marketing thought become integrated with marketing content; history of marketing activities emerges as a sub-category of marketing content; few works on methodology</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1969-1979</td>
<td>Expanding the Scope</td>
<td>Works on history of marketing thought extend to include previous century and countries outside North America; marketing content expands to include advertising.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1980-1989</td>
<td>Revival</td>
<td>Renewed interest in history as a legitimate field of marketing research; largest proportion of works on marketing content, with advertising history being the most popular topic; works on marketing thought focus on history of ideas; works in methodology describe sources</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Because most historical writing is a chronology of events and because it is typically quite long, it demands a form of organization that breaks up the narrative into chunks. Most historical writing, therefore, benefits from periodization (Hollander et al., 2005). The periods of time that delineate each era may be defined mathematically, for example by century or decade; by geography; or contextually, where the boundaries of each period are defined by an event the precipitated a turning point into the next period (Witkowski and Jones, 2006). Hollander (2005) further distinguishes between context-driven periodization and periodization by turning points, the latter of which he describes as the most logical and acceptable method of periodization.

In addition to being defined by periods of time, periodization in marketing history is characterized by the naming of each period, either by the author of the history in the original work, or after the fact by the reader or teacher as an aid to memorization. Hollander (2005), for example, charts several examples from the literature of the periodization of marketing thought as Discovery, Conceptualization, Integration, etc.; and periods of advertising history as Truth in Advertising and Subsidizing Sizzle.

Fox’s (1984) history of advertising focuses on the changing sensibilities and conventions of advertising content, beginning in what he calls the Advertising Prehistory era, when advertisers wrote the copy themselves, cared nothing about layout or design, and placed their ads through agents who were familiar with the various local publications. He traces the evolution of advertising as businesses first began to care about the words in their ads, then about the design, and gradually came to understand that the visual representation of the advertisement aided in the delivery of the message. He tells the stories of the people who built the advertising profession and who defined each era, and describes how advertising not only reflected the times but helped to shape it. He concludes by defending the business of advertising against those who still damn it as a pervasive hidden persuader by saying that advertising is simply a manifestation of the American way of life (see Figure 2).
Figure 2: Periodization of Advertising History: Fox’s (1984) Model

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Period</th>
<th>Name given to period</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1800s</td>
<td>Advertising Prehistory</td>
<td>Advertising salesmen acted as agents for the media, selling only placement. Advertisers created their own ads. All involved considered advertising something of an embarrassment. By the 1880s, magazines emerge and advertising begins to gain respectability.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1900-1920</td>
<td>The Age of Lasker</td>
<td>Agencies begin to produce ads, hiring copywriters, designers, and artists. Albert Lasker hired by agency J. Walter Thompson as first ever advertising account manager.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1920-1930</td>
<td>High Tide and Green Grass (a.k.a. The Boom Years)</td>
<td>The boom years, and the rise of agencies. Advertising becomes not only respectable but popular in conjunction with the rise of consumer culture after World War I.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1930-1945</td>
<td>Reform</td>
<td>The Great Depression curtails consumer activity and with it advertising budgets. Agencies adapt to new advertising medium, radio. Rise of social criticism of advertising as an unnecessary expense that increases prices and makes people buy things they don’t need.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1945-1960</td>
<td>The Second Boom</td>
<td>Era of greatest prosperity for the advertising business, fueled by the Baby Boom, the demographic shift to the suburbs, and the rise of the automobile. Agencies merge to form mega-agencies.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1960-1968</td>
<td>The Creative Revolution</td>
<td>The era of David Ogilvy, Leo Burnett, and their disciples. A new focus on the creative aspect of advertising; of advertising as art; the development of classic advertising designs, many of which are still in use today.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1968-1984</td>
<td>Real Reform</td>
<td>The era of awareness and change in the ethnic makeup of advertising agencies and the faces in advertisements. The recession of 1971 causes cutbacks an a re-examination of the core of the business. Concern over advertising’s effects on children. The FTC gets involved, and new regulatory bodies are formed. Rise of women in advertising.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Problems can arise when imposing a structure of periodization on a work of marketing history, however. The need to define each period can result in an oversimplification of the era because it reduces or compresses events and omits others that may be significant (Hollander et al., 2005). Furthermore, the names of periods can become catchphrases, the ultimate reduction of information. This is the fate that met Keith’s (1960) periodization of marketing history. Every student of marketing is required to learn about the four eras of marketing thinking and to memorize the progression: Production, Sales, Marketing, and Marketing Control. An oversimplified description of these four eras, complete with their associated catchphrases, appears in every introductory marketing textbook including my own (Armstrong et al., 2012).
Table 3: Periodization of Marketing History: Keith’s (1960) Model

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Period</th>
<th>Name given to period (Catchphrase)</th>
<th>Simplified description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1869-1930s</td>
<td>Era of Manufacturing (a.k.a. Production Era)</td>
<td>Business focus on production based on availability of raw materials</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1930s-1940s</td>
<td>Sales Era</td>
<td>Business focus on sales organization and dealers</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1950-1960</td>
<td>Marketing Era</td>
<td>Business focus on satisfying needs of customers; marketing department established</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1960—</td>
<td>Era of Marketing Control</td>
<td>Future view of marketing being the force behind all business activities</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

As a result of this simple, catchy model being repeated for so long in so many textbooks it has become ingrained in the collective marketing thinking, especially among students and practitioners, as unassailable marketing doctrine. In the marketing academy, however, it has met with criticism and calls for reform. Hollander (2005), for example, claims that Keith’s marketing revolution was nothing more than a return to normalcy after WWII, which Keith fails to take into account in defining his periods. Fullerton (1988) questioned the generalizability of the Pillsbury experience upon which Keith’s model is based, and noted Keith’s unsupported statement that Pillsbury’s experience was typical of all American businesses. He proposed a new, more comprehensive periodization model to describe the evolution of modern marketing (see Figure 4).

Table 4: Periodization of Marketing History: Fullerton’s (1988) Model

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Period</th>
<th>Name given to period</th>
<th>Simplified description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1500s-1750</td>
<td>Era of Antecedents</td>
<td>Beginnings of capitalism and the cultivation of consumer markets</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1750-1930</td>
<td>Era of Origins</td>
<td>Marketing functions emerge to facilitate distribution and communication as the Industrial Revolution separates production from consumers</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1930—</td>
<td>Era of Refinement and Formalization</td>
<td>Development, refinement, and formalization of marketing practices</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Fullerton’s method of investigation for marketing history demanded the consideration of three important factors: first, the awareness that marketing phenomena are complex and should not be oversimplified; second, that historical evidence be systematically and critically evaluated; and third, that the historian’s synthesis and interpretation of the evidence include an explanation of why things happened and their significance (Fullerton, 1988).

In addition to the problem of reducing historical eras to a catchphrase, Hollander (2005) also identifies problems with periods of too short a time span, with consistency, and with a false sense of progress. It is the false sense of progress that is at the heart of Jones and Richardson’s (2007) criticism of Keith’s popular theory of a marketing revolution. The word revolution has the connotation of a rather glorious progress, a victory over some unnamed oppressor, and Jones and Richardson claim there was no marketing revolution at all. In their study of Canadian marketing practices they attempt to triangulate findings against Keith’s U.S.-based study, and in the end find it wanting. Specifically, they find a lack of evidence to support Keith’s description of production-era marketing thinking in Canada during the same time period. Theirs is a positivistic study based on a statistical analysis of coded content from the era, in which they argue that Keith’s periodization of marketing history also fell victim to the problem of reductionism. Though Jones and Richardson make a compelling argument for
authors of introductory marketing textbooks to stop using Keith’s model and replace it with Fullerton’s. I predict, based on my own experience with editors, that the likelihood their advice will be heeded any time soon is slim. Keith’s model has become institutionalized, and it will take a different sort of revolution to overturn it. Jones and Richardson’s study is perhaps more valuable as a lesson in the power that periodization in marketing history has, when the reduction of entire eras to a catchy, easy to memorize phrase makes the idea stick forever.

Debora Spar (2001) developed a periodization model to describe the development of a number of new technologies, which describes them as progressing through four phases (note: Spar uses the term phases, not periods) of development. First come the pioneers, the inventors who develop the technology for the sheer joy of it, not necessarily with a view to profit. Then come the pirates, who recognize the value of the technology and attempt to commandeer it, sometimes by force. Then come the problems associated with commercializing the new technology, and finally the pioneers, who at first reveled in the lack of regulation of their new frontier, demand that government establish regulations to protect their hard-won domains. In Spar’s model, each new technology moves through the four phases in order, but at different speeds and in different ways, and always culminating in the establishment of rules. She begins with the example of the invention of navigation technology which drove global exploration beginning in the 15th century, and in this first example of the application of her model, the pirates are real pirates.

Spar’s model is simplified here (see Figure 5) for the purposes of illustrating it in the same manner as the other models. The names given to the periods are Spar’s, however the lack of a specific time period to define each phase is a product of Spar’s writing. She explains that the phases overlap and are not clearly delineated.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Period</th>
<th>Name given to period</th>
<th>Simplified description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1896—</td>
<td>Innovation</td>
<td>Era of inventors, exploration, and discovery (Marconi, de Forest).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>?—?</td>
<td>Commercialization</td>
<td>Commercial applications of new technology (AT&amp;T, Westinghouse)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>?—?</td>
<td>Creative Anarchy</td>
<td>Problems arise, and without regulation creative solutions are found (RCA and formation of first radio network)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1927—</td>
<td>Rules</td>
<td>The Radio Act of 1927 establishes radio as the province of the federal government</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Though she does not include a chapter specifically on the development of the Internet, Spar does say that RCA was the Yahoo! of its day (Spar, 2001, p. 175). Applying her model to the Internet one could view the creators of ARPANET as the pioneers; date the beginning of the Commercialization period as 1991, the year the ban on Internet commerce was lifted; consider the mid to late 1990s as the era of Creative Anarchy; and view the American Telecommunications Act of 1996 as the beginning of the Rules.

Other researchers have studied the development of the Internet as a mass medium and characterized that development as occurring in phases. Lehman-Wilzig and Cohen-Avigdor (2004), for example, analyze the development of the Internet and its impact on the older media of newspapers, radio, and television, and present what they call a natural life-cycle model of new media development. They identify five phases, and name them: Birth, Market Penetration, Growth, Maturation, Defensive Resistance, Adaptation/Convergence/Obsolescence. In developing their model they reference Merrill and Lowenstein’s 1971 model of media development that focuses on audience type (elite, popular, specialized); Shinar’s 2001 research which adds a fourth stage of experimenting; Shaw’s 1991 model which uses the human metaphor of youth, maturity, and senior citizenship to explain media development; and Caspi’s 1993 four-stage media development scheme of inauguration, institutionalization, defensiveness, and adaptation. Finally, Murphy (2002) writes a critical history of
the Internet, presenting it as an alternative to the current popular narrative (“the triumph of American public sector innovation transformed into private corporate implementation and control”), in which he theorizes that all new technologies develop in a social context and are reformulated according to their use values.

All of these previous models of periodization of marketing and technology history informed the development of The Model of Periodization of Radio and Internet Advertising (Buchwitz, 2012, Buchwitz, 2015), presented here in a format that mimics the preceding models. The history of Internet advertising in Part II of this paper is based on this model.

**Figure 6: Periodization of Radio and Internet Advertising History: Buchwitz’s (2012) Model**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Period</th>
<th>Name given to period</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>RADIO 1899-1923</td>
<td>Technology</td>
<td>The new medium is the realm of technicians who build their own equipment with which to access it, and who are the sole consumers of communications transmitted. They care only about the capabilities of the new technology, and focus on testing and improving it. As the technology improves, an audience of non-technical consumers emerges. There is no formal advertising but some experimentation with using the new medium for commercial or marketing purposes.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>INTERNET 1990-1995</td>
<td>Content</td>
<td>Consumers are established as a class of users separate from technicians. The technicians continue to improve the technology, making it easier to use and thereby causing the consumer audience to grow. Consumers demand content, driving the emergence of a third class of users: content producers. Production of content for the new medium becomes an industry</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>RADIO 1912-1925</td>
<td>Advertising</td>
<td>The consumer audience is large enough for marketers to want to reach them. Many new forms of advertising are developed, but controversies rage over the use of the new medium for advertising. Content producers are established but struggle with revenue models. Eventually advertising is accepted, though grudgingly, as the only practical solution to the business problem.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>INTERNET 1993-1998</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>RADIO 1922-1929</td>
<td>Advertising</td>
<td>Advertising on the new medium is firmly established but sophisticated consumers continually seek ways to control or avoid it, driving advertisers to develop new forms of advertising that blur the distinction between advertising and content.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>INTERNET 1994-2001</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>RADIO 1930-1949</td>
<td>Advertising Becomes Content</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>INTERNET 2001-2008</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Internet and Internet Advertising Literature**

The popular and trade literature describing what later came to be called the Internet begins with Dordick, Bradley & Nanus (1981), who examined the state of technology and society in the United States in an attempt to predict how computer networks might eventually be commercialized. The authors referred to this emerging marketplace as network information services, or NIS, and described it as the connection of computers via telecommunications, also known as computer-mediated services. They envisioned the day when NIS would evolve into a major industry, built on the foundations of the information sector of the economy which, at that time employed 30-50% of Americans. The authors predicted, boldly, that network information services would one day transform not only the way we get information, but our very nature as a society. They suggested that network information services would one day include electronic message delivery (which they hesitantly called electronic mail), funds
transfer, medical services, education, even shopping. They foretold that, should such services emerge, the professions that provide them would themselves be transformed.

The focus of works written during this pre-Internet period was necessarily on the technology, specifically the computer. The vernacular at that time was to describe any form of communication, from data sharing between scientists to simple conversation, as computer-mediated. The term online was expressed as two words, and the computer used by an individual was referred to as a terminal, in fact, the Dordick book devotes an entire chapter to the discussion of different types of terminals: dumb terminals, teletypewriters (TTYs), telex services, facsimile devices, word processors, and electronic fund transfer, or EFT, devices; and ATMs, or Automated Teller Machines; telephones were discussed as a form of terminal, as were radio-operated hand-held devices. The assumption was that these terminals would be connected to other computers on the network either through telephone lines, or through leased or private dedicated lines owned by the telecommunications companies such as AT&T, which, in 1981 owned 80% of the leased lines in the United States. Electronic mail was mentioned interchangeably as electronic messaging services, or EMS. Terms like e-mail and ecommerce had yet to be coined, and no one had yet dreamed of commercialization through the selling of advertising. Dordick imagined that these network services would fall into one of two categories: either software applications such as payroll management, where the users would perform tasks by using software installed remotely (on what eventually came to be called a server); or pure services, where third parties handled these functions on behalf of a client via the network, for example credit card transaction processing. While they envisioned NIS as a new medium of communications where messages could be transferred “at [a] much higher density than human conversation at much greater speed than the postal system, and with much greater selectivity than television and other mass media” (Dordick et al., 1981, p. 6), they did not envision their NIS as a new medium for publication. They did, however, consider that advertising might be one of the elements of information the NIS would deliver. Here the authors describe their vision of the NIS marketplace:

All of the usual services of a marketplace can be offered… [p]roducts and services can be advertised; buyers and sellers can be located; ordering, billing and delivery of services can be facilitated; and all manner of transactions can be consummated, including wholesale, retail, brokering and mass distribution (Dordick et al., 1981, p. 7).

The authors created a list of 52 possible applications of NIS, categorized by business, government, education, medical, consumer, and other. A possible business application was “Mass mail; selective advertising.” Under consumer applications they envisioned “online catalog shopping,” ticket purchases, and the watching of “plays and movies from stored libraries” Though it is not stated explicitly, the unspoken assumption when advertising is mentioned in Dordick’s book is that it would consist of advertising the services offered by the NIS. In the chapter on terminals the authors discuss barriers to adoption of the home computer, and ways to shape consumer expectations. One such way, the authors suggest, would be advertising that characterizes what a service could be used for. These futurists never dreamed of widespread advertising-supported content, modeled after radio and television.

Today, we talk about the increasing fragmentation of media, and its implications for advertising. Where once there were three national broadcast networks in the United States, and television programs broadcast for only a few hours a day, there are now dozens of cable networks, specialty channels, and hundreds of programs for advertisers to choose from. In Dordick’s book the term fractionation is used to denote the same phenomenon, and the authors give the example of the demise of Life, a mass market magazine, and the rise of special interest publications that serve a smaller but more highly specialized (or targeted) readership. They predicted the rise of NIS would “facilitate the further fractionation” making it possible for companies to “response sensitively to very small submarkets” —what today we might refer to as targeting or niche marketing. They also prognosticated the possibility of customization and personalization: “advertising can be tailored to fit a community or individual’s stored profile” (Dordick et al., 1981, pp. 89-90).

As the concept of the network information marketplace gave way to the information highway in the 1990s, the subject of advertising on the new medium continued to be mentioned peripherally, for example by Rust and Oliver (1994), who argued that the new technology would sound the death knell for advertising agencies. “The information superhighway,” they wrote, “will become the global electronic supermarket of the 90s, uniting producers and consumers directly, instantly, and
interactively. Advertising will be transformed from involuntary (and necessarily intrusive) to voluntary (and sought out)” (Rust and Oliver, 1994, p. 73).

Trade books published during this time tended to focus on the technology of the Internet, how to set it up, and how to use it. In the years before the development of the World Wide Web and the marketing and advertising explosion which it unleashed, books about the Internet were written for the network engineers inside corporations; the people tasked with setting up the company’s Internet network and website. O’Reilly & Associates, a well known publisher of technical trade books, issued a book called The Whole Internet in 1992 (Krol, 1992). The whole Internet at that time consisted not of the World Wide Web as we know it today, but of tools and functions such as Gopher, Telnet, Archie, and WAIS. There were trade books published for the Internet hobbyist, such as The Internet Companion (LaQuey and Ryer, 1993), which included a foreword by then American Vice President Al Gore. The titles of some of these books seem quaint in retrospect, for example, The Virtual Community: Homesteading on the Electronic Frontier (Rheingold, 1993). Netiquette by Virginia Shea (1994) educates readers about email, flaming, chain letters, hoaxes, and email privacy. Casting the Net by Peter H. Salus (1995) presents a brief history of the Internet and the first attempts to commercialize it, and The Internet Unplugged by Michael A. Banks (1997) is a consumer-oriented how-to book explaining the software one needs to properly surf the Web. Books such as these also discussed topics such as user identities in online games, and online activism in newsgroups. Advertising, however, was not something that was considered by these early authors.

Edward Burman (2003), a European historian, cultural studies expert, and business consultant, compares the gaggle of how-to Internet business books published during the late 1990s to the pre-Kuhnian paradigm of textbooks that no more accurately describe the enterprises that produced them than an image in a tourist brochure accurately describes a culture. During those years I worked at a series of leading Internet companies who were among those defining the new paradigm of business, communications, and advertising, and I found it fascinating that most of the self-proclaimed experts who were writing those books did not seem to understand the paradigm shift. They forced traditional business and advertising concepts into the new medium: square pegs into round holes. Burman’s book attempts to offer a systematic explanation of how the Internet moved from its beginnings as an academic and scientific tool, to a popular business tool, framed in the context of Kuhnian paradigms.

Thomas Kuhn (1996) illustrated the problems of scientific investigation operating in the wrong paradigm—it leads to the asking of the wrong questions, and the futile search for answers to them. When the Internet banner ad was invented in 1994, advertisers asked, How can we get more people to click on our banner ads? instead of trying to understand how to achieve marketing communications goals through the use of the new medium. The types of companies that traditionally spend millions of dollars on advertising—automobile marketers, and packaged goods marketers—saw no value in using the Internet to advertise their goods, since no one would ever click on a banner ad and immediately buy a new car, or a tube of toothpaste.

**Hoffman & Novak**

One of the earliest and most-cited articles on the subject of marketing on the Internet is Hoffman & Novak (1996). This seminal work introduced marketers to the then new medium of the Internet; to the idea of computer-mediated environments (CMEs); and suggested the new technology would lead to a revolution in marketing communications and advertising.

Though Hoffman & Novak’s attempt to coin a new term, CME, never caught on, the definition of media is mediated communication, and here was an entirely new form of it: marketing communications mediated by a computer. The opportunities for marketers the authors suggested were: using websites as a way to provide consumers with information about products; placing orders for products; direct marketing, direct distribution; and a new and efficient channel for advertising and marketing. The reason this paper is considered by most Internet marketing academics to be a seminal work is that, as the authors point out in their introduction, despite the hype about the Internet in the popular and trade press that year, virtually no scholarly research by marketing academics had yet been published.

Hoffman & Novak continued to collaborate and though their subsequent research focused on e-commerce and other forms of business conducted on the Internet, they nearly always included a consideration of marketing and advertising on the new medium. Their second joint paper (1997) proposed that the marketing concept be applied to the development of the World Wide Web for marketing communications. The Web is transforming the marketing function, they argued, and that
includes traditional principles, methods, and tactics of mass media advertising. Whereas in their first article Hoffman & Novak simply pointed out the fact that advertisers were adopting terminology and metaphors from traditional media advertising and applying them to the Web, in 1997 they raised the alarm and argued that the new medium demanded a new metaphor; a new way of speaking about, experiencing, and offering advertising. The fact that the Web allows one-to-one communication, user feedback, and consumer control means “marketers must reconstuct advertising models for the interactive, many-to-many medium underlying the Web” (Hoffman and Novak, 1997, p. 48).

Alarmed they were, and their cause for alarm has, some ten years later, largely come to pass, at least in the United States and Canada. Advertising professionals trained in the days before the Internet continued to apply the metaphor of one-to-many broadcast media to the Internet. Advertising effectiveness in traditional media is based in large part on subscriber or viewer numbers, or ratings systems that attempt to estimate them. The World Wide Web requires no such estimations, as the number of visitors to a website or the number and rate of people who clicked on a banner ad can be counted and calculated with 100 percent accuracy. “[O]n the Web, advertising effectiveness can be explicitly tied to customer response, and the possibility exists of developing new measurement systems that capture the value of a single consumer’s visit and subsequent response in new and innovative ways” (Hoffman and Novak, 1997, p. 52).

In her introduction to a special issue of Marketing Science Hoffman (2000), pointed out that though four years had passed since her landmark article, still academic research in Internet advertising seriously lagged behind business practice. Though Hoffman mentions that one of the papers considered for publication “conducted Internet advertising experiments” in the end the topics covered in the issue were: consumer behaviour in online environments; what makes for a compelling online consumer experience; how consumers can best use Internet search engines; the distribution of digital information and entertainment via the Internet; and price sensitivity in online shopping. In 2003 Hoffman again collaborated with Novak (Chatterjee et al., 2003) and wrote about Internet advertising, specifically banner ads, the most common form of Web ads at that time. The research studied the consumer response to banner ads driven by the ultimate goal of improving their effectiveness. This paper is indicative of the focus of the body of academic research on Internet advertising since then.

**Contemporary Research in Internet Advertising**

Most contemporary academic research in Internet advertising tries to answer questions like, How many times does a consumer need to see my ad repeated before he clicks on it? and, What can we do to an ad to increase the likelihood that it will be clicked on? Like other academic research on the subject of Internet advertising, most scholars who have chosen the subject for their Ph.D. dissertations have been interested either in measuring the effectiveness of online advertising, or in describing consumer response to the advertising. This author’s dissertation, A Narrative History of Radio and Internet Advertising (Buchwitz, 2012), was the first comprehensive historical study of the development of Internet advertising. There has been some interesting work in the area of the relationship between Internet advertising and the Internet as a medium, for example by McGhie (2003), who defines advertising (not Internet advertising, specifically) as “Something that fixes and defines audiences for the sake of media operations.” He describes the audience as a commodity, over which media producers and advertisers haggle in order to achieve their business goals. It is this common interest of the media content producers and the advertisers that supports any mass media, including the Internet, as a business. McGhie’s thesis locates Internet advertising within the political economy of mass communications, and is interested in the audience as commodity.

In the early years of Internet advertising, academics began to work with industry professionals to study questions of effectiveness. The major Web publishers who sold advertising were motivated to maximize the revenue potential of their product; and major brand advertisers, in making their media spending decisions, needed to know what kind of return on their investment they could expect to receive. One such study of the effectiveness of banner ads (Briggs and Hollis, 1997) was a joint effort between academics, marketers at HotWired (at the time a popular website, and famous for having been the first website to sell online advertising), and international advertising research firm Millward Brown. At that time the banner was by far the most common form of online advertising. By the end of the 1990s the terms Internet and World Wide Web had been widely adopted by marketing and advertising academics and it was rare to come across the earlier terms information superhighway and cyberspace. The Web was being taken seriously by marketers and advertisers, and so academic researchers followed suit by applying their previous research agendas of studying
advertising effectiveness to the new medium. By this time marketers recognized that the results of Internet advertising—page views, visitors, clicks and clickthrough rates—could be measured and counted, and the argument became one of the effects of branding. Yet marketers and researchers alike continued to apply the square peg of traditional print and broadcast media to the round hole of the Web as a new medium. Campbell and Keller (2003), for example, were interested in the effect on consumers of repetition in brand messages, and studied both television ads and “computer Internet ads” using the 1970s concept of wearout and the two-factor theory of repetition. Though their conclusions about the level of brand familiarity and the resulting consumer response may have been quite valid, they never thought to question whether those results might differ in the two media. When the banner ad was the only game in town, measuring its effectiveness was done simply by counting impressions and clicks, then dividing the latter by the former to calculate the clickthrough rate. Early “good” clickthrough rates were typically similar to direct mail response rates, approximately five percent, but tended to decrease as time went along. As advertisers bemoaned declining clickthrough rates, some began to suggest that perhaps banner ads could have a branding effect, similar to traditional advertising. In Briggs and Hollis’s study (1997) they used a system called BrandDynamics, created by Millward Brown, to define and measure the impact of exposure to banner ads. This was one of the earliest studies to question the importance of the clickthrough and to suggest the branding effect:

The accepted wisdom suggests that, yes, ad banners do work as direct marketing vehicles—but only when viewers click on them for transport to the advertiser’s own Web site, where a wide range of customized marketing processes begins. The problem is that only a fraction of all viewers click on the banners they see. As a consequence, a few marketers have elected to pay only for proven click-throughs, while the rest of the marketing community, which pays for ad placements according to CPM (cost per 1,000 impressions), is left to wonder whether the millions of impressions its banner ads generate without click-through are simply wasted (Briggs and Hollis, 1997, p. 33).

They go on to compare the narrow focus on clickthrough rates to measuring the effectiveness of a television commercial for a car brand by counting the number of people who come into the showroom the next day. A visit to the showroom is the ideal response, but not an immediate one, and, in any event, is not the only measure of the effect the ad had on the consumer. The Briggs and Hollis study was one of the first to be interested in measuring the degree to which an online advertisement had been noticed, and the degree to which an online ad might influence intent to purchase. Studies of this kind had long been conducted on the effectiveness of traditional mass media advertising, yet most advertising academics failed to see the transference to the new medium.

As the market for online advertising grew and advertisers and their agencies began to invest more and more in it, they tended to adapt terminology long understood in traditional media advertising to the new medium: impressions, for the number of times a banner ad was viewed; CPM as a pricing model; evaluating response rates in the manner of direct mail. Later, researchers tried to adapt more theoretical concepts to the new medium. For example, a 1998 study (Bezjian-Avery et al.) compared the effectiveness of Internet advertising to traditional advertising by constructing an experiment in which the only difference between the two situations studied was the interactive aspect of the ad. The researchers wished to understand whether interactive advertisements were truly superior. They concluded that interactivity does not necessarily improve effectiveness as measured by intent to purchase, and suggested the reason might be because interactivity interrupts the process of persuasion.

Of greatest interest to Internet advertising academics is the measurement of effectiveness, but the second most common interest is the effect Internet advertising has on consumers. In 1999 Cho attempted to apply the classic Elaboration Likelihood Model to online advertising in an attempt to understand how people information-process online advertising (Cho, 1999). He hypothesized that people in high-involvement situations were more likely to click on banner ads than those in low-involvement situations, just as the ELM theorizes that consumers in a high involvement situation are willing to exert higher degrees of effort to cognitively process advertising information. That same year, Rossiter and Bellman (1999) called for research into a comprehensive theory or model of how Web advertising works, and proposed one such model based on the consumer’s construction of a Web ad schema, which mediates their processing of the advertisement. According to the model, consumers
move through four stages in their experience of a Web ad: exposure, processing and schema formation, communication effects, and action.

Our advertising schema is that part of our brain that first recognizes a communication as advertising, then guides us through an interpretation of its persuasive message (Dahlén and Edenius, 2007). Previous research, for example De Pelsmacker, Geuens & Anckaert (2002) and Dahlén (2005), has shown that both the form of media, as well as the editorial or entertainment content surrounding the ad, influence the consumer’s reactions to the ad (again, with the underlying interest in the ad’s effectiveness), but Dahlén & Edenius went one step further to investigate how the media context influences the perception of the advertising as advertising. They argue that when an ad is placed in a traditional advertising medium, such as television or radio, we as consumers recognize it as advertising because we access our advertising schema, referencing previous experience; but when an ad is placed in a non-traditional medium we may not recognize it as advertising. In their study, the researchers placed an ad for an insurance company on an egg inside an egg carton, and an ad for an energy drink in an elevator. They found that advertising in a non-traditional media context was less readily identified as advertising, that it was perceived as having less of a persuasive intent, and that consumers had a more favourable response to it. Consumers learn how to identify an advertising message as an advertising message at least in part through their experience with the communications medium. Because the World Wide Web is still a relatively new medium, it stands to reason that consumers are still learning in the process of learning how to identify advertising on it as advertising. In other words, our collective schemas are still under construction.

As Internet advertising moved into the new millennium the focus in academic research continued to be on improving the effectiveness of online ads. For example, Chandon, Chtourou & Fortin (2001) studied the effect of banner ads and exposure on clickthrough rates and hypothesized that banners targeted to the content of the Web page would enjoy a higher clickthrough rate than untargeted banners. They also posited that the size of the banner, animation, and images would affect clickthrough rate. This may have been the first academic research to suggest a relationship between the success of an online advertisement and the content in which it was placed. In the professional world advertisers were also experimenting with ways to improve the effectiveness of their banners through targeting. In addition to targeting by content (for example, an ad for golf clubs on a golf magazine’s website), online ads were targeted by geography, time of day, and number of times they have been downloaded to the same IP address (in theory, the number of times they have been viewed by the same person). Banner ads targeted by keywords typed into the search fields of portal websites and search engines came to be called keyword banners or “smart banners.”

Though keyword banners were commonly sold on all the major search engines as early as 1995, no empirical studies had been done on their incremental effectiveness, according to Dou, Linn & Yang (2001), who set out to do so. Their study reveals the naiveté of the academic community at the time with respect to the functioning of Internet advertising. They state their research questions as follows:

How effective are search engines in delivering exact banner matches to user searches? How does specificity in the meaning of keywords affect the accuracy of banner matches? In the absence of exact matches, can the search engine deliver close matches for user keyword searches? Do natural language search engines (e.g., Ask Jeeves) do a better job of displaying keyword banners through the correct interpretation of search keywords? (p. 32).

Dou and his colleagues do not seem to understand that to a search engine, which is nothing more than a computer program, a keyword is simply a string of characters. The computer cannot parse meaning, it can only recognize the order of those characters. If a user types the word car into a search engine the computer cannot know that the string of characters a-u-t-o is a reasonable substitute. It might, however, think that “cas” was a close match. Furthermore it was, and still is, the purview of advertisers to choose which keywords they want their banners to appear in response to, so whether they choose to purchase both “car” and “auto” is entirely up to them. So the answers to the researchers’ four questions above are a simple matter of understanding the technology: They are 100% effective. A keyword is, by definition, a specific string of characters, therefore the question of specificity of meaning is meaningless. There is no such thing as a natural language search engine; all search engines work the same way, by searching for occurrences of strings of characters in a body of text. Furthermore, Dou and his associates had no way of knowing which keywords had been purchased by advertisers on
which search engines, and so their list of 115 keywords upon which their study is based is also meaningless. Nevertheless, the reason why this study is mentioned here is because, like nearly all academic literature on the subject of Internet advertising, its focus is on measuring effectiveness, however misguided.

In 2001 the Journal of Advertising Research published a special issue on Web Advertising comprising six articles. The first was a positivist study of the effectiveness of Web advertising with respect to website content using the Elaboration Likelihood Model as a basis for differentiating the study according to ads for high involvement products versus ads for low involvement products (Shamdasani and Stamaland, 2001). The second was another empirical study attempting to show the differences in clickthrough rates of banner ads for familiar versus unfamiliar brands (Dahlen, 2001). The third was the research by Dou et al. discussed above. The fourth paper in the special issue was yet another empirical study of consumer responses to banner ads, but this time the particular area of interest was forced exposure (Cho et al., 2001). The researchers studied consumers’ responses to four different levels of forced exposure, from the most forced, where an ad appeared on the screen and the subjects had no choice but to wait for it to play before being allowed to view the content; to the least forced, where a banner ad was presented on a page of content. Interestingly, though the researchers use the term banner ad for all four of their levels of forced exposure, the first type of ad they describe is actually called an interstitial, and the type of ad they describe in their third level of forced exposure is actually called a pop-up, not a banner ad. The last two articles in the special issue are Gallagher, Foster & Parsons (2001a), comparison of the effectiveness of Web ads and traditional print ads, in which they argue that Web ads need not be interactive in order to be effective; and Gallagher et al. (2001b), a replication of the study. Viewed as a whole, these articles have several things in common: First, in their introductions there is always a view to the future, never to the past. All the articles mention the fact that revenues for online advertising are growing, but the numbers they cite as proof are always those projected for the next three-to-five years. The articles are all positivistic in ontology, and strive to be scientific in proving their theories, all of which are related to the effectiveness of Web advertising. And all demonstrate a profound lack of familiarity with the real world of Internet advertising.

In the fall of 2002 The Journal of Advertising published a special issue on Advertising and the New Media. Topics included the power of curiosity for effective Web advertising; an image communication model; measures of perceived interactivity; impact of product knowledge and brand attitude on purchase intention; banner advertisement pricing; affiliate marketing; and the intrusiveness of pop-up ads. It is interesting to note that until very recently academic literature on Internet advertising was almost exclusively published only in special issues of respected marketing and advertising journals. It suggests a lag time between the interests of academic researchers and the interests of professional advertisers. In the real world Internet advertising has been the fastest growing form of mass media advertising every year since measurements of advertising spending online began in 1996, even during times of economic recession, and in 2016, for the first time, spending on forms of online advertising in both Canada and the United States surpassed spending on television advertising. This research trend may be turning, however. Although academic research on Internet advertising in the new century continues to focus on measuring and improving effectiveness and on consumer responses, in the summer of 2008 a study investigating the ways in which the effectiveness of banner advertisements might be improved was published in a regular edition of the Journal of Advertising (Yaveroglu and Donthu, 2008). The researchers believe that the reason for this focus on increasing effectiveness is the fast growth in spending on Internet advertising, a phenomenon they noticed 12 years after it was first documented. They also note the increasing advertising clutter in the online medium, and the increasing difficulty for an advertiser’s message to stand out. In this sense, Internet advertising seems to have reached par with other forms of mass media advertising, and perhaps this will drive new avenues of research into advertising on the new medium.

**Historical Research in Internet Marketing**

Kanter (2001) theorized that the lack of interest in the history of the Internet is the fault of the United States which, though it is the country that created the Internet, is also a country where history is not valued; where, instead, there is a constant drive to discover the next new thing. She writes, “The Internet economy exaggerates antihistorical tendencies, offering a premium for new ventures and new ideas deliberately detached from tradition” (Kanter, 2001, p. 4). Harris and Cohen (2003) offer a historical review of Internet marketing topics such as e-commerce and customer relationship
marketing, and briefly mention that Internet advertising has changed the paradigm of one-to-many, but suggest that historical studies of Internet marketing are looked down upon by academics in their rush to be progressive.

In 2008 a different sort of historical research paper was published in the Journal of Advertising (Kim and McMillan, 2008). It was not historical research per se, but rather an examination of bibliographic citations of academic literature on Internet advertising, which rather pompously sought to describe how such scholarly research has shaped the Internet advertising field since the mid 1990s. Though the researchers examined a narrow body of literature in only four journals, Journal of Advertising, Journal of Advertising Research, Journal of Current Issues and Research in Advertising, and Journal of Interactive Advertising; their definition of advertising is disproportionately wide, as they include among the 113 journal articles studied many about e-commerce, the function of websites, and the interactive nature of the Web. Still, Kim and McMillan support two points that were made earlier in this literature review: They note that Donna Hoffman was the most cited author in the field, and that her 1996 paper with Thomas Novak was the most cited reference; and they identify the study of the effectiveness of Internet advertising as the most prevalent research theme. Other common research themes in the very broadly defined field of Internet advertising identified by Kim and McMillan were: the study of interactivity as a feature of Internet advertising, electronic commerce, how online advertising works, attitudes of consumers toward Internet advertising, and comparisons of Internet advertising to traditional media advertising.

More than thirty years ago marketing academic Ronald Savitt bemoaned the lack of historical research in marketing being conducted by academics and offered as a solution a rationale and a method (Savitt, 1980). Historical research, says Savitt, establishes an identity for a discipline. If Internet advertising is a discipline, it would seem its identity is still in need of establishment, as very little academic research into its history as history has been done to date. Part II of this paper is an effort to change that.

References
Burman, E. (2003), SHIFT! The Unfolding Internet Hype, Hope and History, Wiley, Chichester.
A Postmodern History of Internet Advertising Part I


Jameson, F. (1993), Postmodernism, or, the Cultural Logic of Late Capitalism, Duke University Press, Durham.


Staying in the Community but Leaving the Union
Jack Bunce and Neil Bendle (corresponding)
Ivey Business School, Western University, Ontario, Canada

Abstract

Purpose - This research aims to better understand the communication strategies used by the political campaigns involved in the 1975 and 2016 UK referendums about leaving the European Community/Union.

Design/methodology/approach - We combine a descriptive approach with text mining of materials related to the referendum. This involved digitizing leaflets from 1975 and comparing these to materials available on websites related to the 2016 referendum. We uncover word usage and examine how this changed between the campaigns.

Findings - We note the role that the precise question wording played, the involvement of key participants, and the communication approaches used. Our text analysis suggests how the focus of the campaign changed in the four decades between 1975 and 2016.

Research limitations/implications - The greatest limitation is the non-scientific sample of texts. As such our results are exploratory; we look for interesting features but do not provide a comprehensive and definitive assessment of all campaign activity. The practical implications are that the automated textual analysis method we employ has commercial application and great potential to aid future historical and comparative marketing research. How the campaigns changed over time gives an idea of each period’s big issues. We are also able to cast light on political marketing theory, specifically assumptions about voter decision making.

Originality/value - Our topic is an important one at the intersection of politics and history. The comparison of similar marketing campaigns over time is a way to understand the evolution of marketing techniques in politics and beyond.

Paper Type - Research Paper

Our research looks at two referendums on the United Kingdom’s relationship with Europe, one in 1975 and one in 2016. We describe key features of the campaigns and the communication strategies used. To better understand the messages used in the political campaigns we digitized print materials from the 1975 referendum on the European Community and downloaded data from the 2016 European Union (EU) referendum. We reviewed the official documentation used by the two official campaigns each year and some ancillary materials from political parties. This allowed us to understand areas of interest in both referendum, such as the role of the constituent countries of the United Kingdom (UK). We looked at the word use in both referenda seeking to uncover similarities and differences. From this material we are able to see clues to the messages used to sway the voters. Implicit in the use of messages by the campaigns is their views of what the voters care about, and the best way to communicate with the voters.

Our approach is novel in that we are able to compare materials from a generation apart. We digitized materials from 1975 and analyzed this with materials from 2016 using text mining routines in Wolfram’s Mathematica, an advanced mathematical software that allows for programing and is ideally suited to textual analysis. We are able to analyze large amounts of text to see what the various campaigns were saying.

Britain In Or Out Of Europe?
The United Kingdom has had a somewhat ambivalent relationship with mainland Europe for many years. At various times a full involvement with the continent has been embraced. In such times the UK’s interests have been seen as irrevocably tied to those of the continent and foreign policy has revolved around maintaining influence over the affairs of the mainland. At other times the continent could be seen as an alien place, of little importance to the UK. A view exemplified by Prime Minister Neville Chamberlain’s Munich declaration in 1938. Chamberlain famously declared a proposed
invasion of a European state a “quarrel in a far-away country between people of whom we know nothing” (Faber 2008, page 356).

This ambivalence is encapsulated by the role played by the memory of the former Prime Minister Winston Churchill in the 2016 referendum debate. Boris Johnson, widely seen as the leader of those campaigning to leave, sought to emulate Churchill’s flamboyant style and claimed that Churchill would have voted to leave (Ross, 2016). This claim was seen as consistent with many people’s perception of Churchill (Bromund, 2016) as the epitome of an old-school Englishman, yearning for the British Empire and interested mostly in English speaking nations (see for example, Churchill 1956). Yet despite this Churchill was an early proponent of the United States of Europe (Best, 2001; Klos, 2016) and so he can also be claimed by those who wanted to remain in the European Union.

The European Referendums of 1975 and 2016

In 1973 the United Kingdom entered the European Community under the leadership of Conservative Prime Minister Edward Heath. The main opposition, the Labour Party, was divided between pro and anti-Europeans. Labour’s division led its leader, Harold Wilson, to promise to renegotiate the terms of the UK’s membership and after this hold a referendum on whether to stay in the European Community. After Labour won two general elections in 1974 Wilson became Prime Minister and his promise resulted in a referendum. (The European Community at the time was also know as the Common Market and many referred to the vote as a referendum on the Common Market). The UK had no history of referendums, indeed it was not until twenty-five years later and the passage of the Political Parties, Elections and Referendums Act 2000, that a formal referendum process was created (Her Majesty’s Stationery Office, 2000). This vote was so unprecedented, and disturbing for some, that Harold Wilson a few days after the vote even made an explicit promise never to repeat the experiment of the referendum (Nairne and Independent Commission, 1996).

The 1975 referendum campaign saw the Conservatives, now led by Margaret Thatcher, and the Liberals actively campaigning for staying in the European Community. The Labour Party was still split on the issue of Europe. After his renegotiation the Prime Minister and most major political figures, such as the Chancellor of the Exchequer Denis Healey, and Shirley Williams, Secretary of State for Prices, supported staying in Europe. The Labour Home Secretary, Roy Jenkins, even chaired the campaign to stay in the Community. Despite this many leading Labour figures campaigned to leave. Out campaigners, who were predominantly on the party’s left, included future Labour leader Michael Foot, Barbara Castle the Health Secretary, and the Secretary of State for Industry, Tony Benn.

Given the issue divided parties to manage the referendum campaigns ad-hoc, but official, groups were formed. These were known as Britain In Europe (the In campaign), and the, surprisingly un informatively named, National Referendum campaign (the Out campaign). These groups each sent a publicly funded pamphlet to every house in the country laying out their case. We included these pamphlets and other printed materials from the campaigns in our analysis. Example pages from these pamphlets are shown in Figure 1.
The materials from the 1975 referendum are visually of modest appeal, relying upon words rather than photos or graphics. The materials often contain relatively dense textual appeals designed to be digested at length by the careful reader. The implicit assumption of how voters decide (Lau and Redlawsk, 2006) is of a careful voter diligently thinking through how the decision will impact the national interest and their family.

When the results came in it was clear that the country had voted comprehensively to remain part of Europe with all the UK’s constituent countries voting to stay part of the European Community, see Figure 2. England and Wales had proved the most pro-European parts of the UK voting 67.8% and 64.8% respectively to stay in. Scotland was more mixed but still with a sizeable stay majority, (58.4% voted to stay). Northern Ireland was the least enthusiastic part of the UK towards the European Community. Here only a relatively narrow victory (52.1%) was obtained by the stay campaign.
Over the next four decades there were many changes. The designation of the European Community changed to the European Union reflecting a gradual strengthen of ties between the constituent states (European Union, 2016). Between the 1975 and 2016 referendums there was a massive political realignment in the UK. The political stances of the political parties essentially reversed. Margaret Thatcher, the Conservative leader who had supported staying in Europe in 1975, became Prime Minister in 1979 and moved her party in an increasingly antagonistic direction towards Europe; known as Euroscepticism (Fontana and Parsons, 2015). European policy lay at the heart of internal party conflicts for years but over time the generally pro-European business friendly Conservatives lost power relative to their more Eurosceptical colleagues who emphasised the patriotic aspects of national identity. The Conservative party never fully rejected the European Union and some feared that this mixed message could lose the party supporters to the United Kingdom Independence Party (UKIP) – a new party focused almost exclusively on leaving the European Union. The Conservative leader David Cameron, who personally may have seen the arguments about Europe as an unnecessary distraction, promised another referendum on membership to placate his now quite Eurosceptical base of supporters. This maneuver led to the 2016 vote (Menon, Minto and Wincott, 2016).

While the Conservatives became less convinced about the benefits of European ties the Labour Party went in the opposite direction but it was a winding process. Many of the pro-European centrists who had supported staying in the European Community in 1975 left the party in the following decade. They would eventually join with the Liberals to form the Liberal Democrats. This new party was relatively consistently pro-European party but by 2016 the party had been dramatically weakened by a period of coalition with the Conservatives, 2010-2015. Working with the Conservatives had alienated much of the Liberal Democrat base and not delivered on the hoped for electoral reform that would have benefited their electoral prospects.

The departure of senior figures from Labour coincided with the party adopting a platform that was wary of any tie, whether the tie be with Europe or the US. The dramatic failure of the anti-European wing of the party in the early eighties under Michael Foot -- the 1983 manifesto was dubbed
“the longest suicide note in history” (Mitchell, 1983) -- led to the Labour party supporting increasingly centrist leaders. Labour gained power but with power came decisions that alienated the party’s base – especially support of the US in the Iraq war. After losing power to David Cameron’s Conservatives Labour stumbled leftward eventually choosing Jeremy Corbyn as leader. This improbable winner of the Labour leadership had a history of scepticism towards Europe (Foster, 2016) which made his efforts to lead his party’s wholehearted support of the European Union challenging.

One party that was in an ideal position to campaign on membership of the European Union was the Scottish Nationalist Party (SNP). They had largely routed Labour from its traditional Scottish strongholds and adopted a strongly pro-European policy. The SNP only targeted voters in Scotland and such voters represented only a little under one tenth of English voters. There was a very real possibility, indeed this occurred, that whatever Scotland voted would not determine the result. The same applied to Wales and Northern Ireland. In the final tally 86% of votes would come from England, 8% from Scotland, 5% from Wales, and only 1% from Northern Ireland. How England voted would determine the result. (This may explain the relatively limited attention to the smaller UK countries displayed in the 2016 election materials we analyse later).

Entering 2016 saw the parties that were strong in England in a strange position. The Conservative Prime Minister followed through on his promise of a referendum to leave the European Union despite believing that leaving would be a terrible mistake. Many of his party’s supporters did not agree with their leader and some were openly contemptuous. UKIP had made no significant electoral gains but had gained a lot of media attention. This party had a core support that could be safely counted on to reject the Europe Union. The Liberal Democrats wholeheartedly embraced Europe but were at a low ebb still struggling to apologize to their supporters for the compromises made working with the Conservatives in the coalition government. Finally, the Labour Party’s parliamentary representatives were strongly pro-European with an activist base, especially in London, similarly committed. The party’s leader, however, seemed ambivalent and many traditional Labour areas, for example the industrial areas of Northern England, seemed dubious about the European ideal.

Figure 2 shows how the UK voted. The result was surprising to many but when the dust settled it was clear that the UK had voted to leave the European Union. The sheer scale of change over the four decades since the initial referendum can be seen in Figure 3. The most pro-European areas in 1975, England and Wales, had had voted to leave. The areas that were previously more suspicious of Europe had increased their support. Scotland voting strongly to remain part of the EU.
The questions asked were quite controversial and have fascinating implications for marketing theory. In 1975 the question faced by the U.K. voters was:

**Do you think that the United Kingdom should stay in the European Community (the Common Market)?**

This was a relatively simple question although it is undoubtedly unbalanced. The suggestion is that any status quo bias (Gintis, 2000) would, perhaps coincidentally, benefit the campaign to stay in the European Community.

An interesting political marketing theory question arises concerning voter decision making. Voters often have relatively modest knowledge of the alternatives they choose between. In 1975 knowledge would have been relatively high. The public had recent experience of being out of the community, and now had experience of being in it. To help them make effective decisions the voters could compare their impressions of being out, and then in, the community and decide which they perceived as better. (Although one could argue that the good and/or bad effects of being in the European Community may not have fully materialized by 1975). Of course, such a comparison is always a challenging task given the world’s complexity but at least some relatively recent baseline for comparison of the benefits of change was available.

In 2016 this question had changed to be more consistent with the changing designation of the European Community to:

**Should the United Kingdom remain a member of the European Union or leave the European Union?**
This question was agreed by the Electoral Commission (The Electoral Commission, 2015) which had been set up as part of the 2000 Political Parties Elections and Referendums Act. In some ways this question was very simple. A straight in or out question. The addition of the “leave the European Union” option (compared to the 1975 question) was to prevent the perception of bias. To avoid the status quo looking like the “correct” answer. The Electoral Commission tested the proposal and taken academic advice which suggested that the new question was less leading than if leaving was not mentioned. Marketers and political scientists have long known that question wording matters (Schuman and Presser, 1996). Indeed back in 1975 the research company NOP had “tried seven formulations of a question about UK membership of the EC [European Community] and got ‘yes’ majorities that ranged from 0.2% to 16.2%” (Nairne and Independent Commission 1996, page 46).

The, probably unsolvable, problem facing the Electoral Commission’s attempts to allow for an informed choice, and the challenge for political marketing theory (Ormrod, 2005; Lees-Marshment, 2009), is that it is not clear how a voter could meaningfully compare the alternatives. Political marketing theory generally suggests politicians should aim to give the voters what they want. A major challenge to the theory occurs when what exactly the voters want is not clear. Did voters understand what they were voting for? It was relatively easy to envisage the results of one option (the status quo, i.e. remain) but very hard to envisage the outcome of the other option. The alternative might be a lot better, or a lot worse, and assessing which is a task arguably beyond any human’s prediction capacity even if one studied the problem extensively. The UK had been part of the EU for over four decades so it wasn’t immediately clear to anyone what a UK outside the EU would be like.

The lack of clarity about what exactly was on offer enabled both sides to cast the other as peddling falsehoods about what a post-Brexit UK would look like. (This situation remains true at time of writing as details are still unclear). Those supporting leave accused the remain side of scaremongering – arguing remainers were painting an undulling pessimistic vision of an apocalyptic UK outside the EU. The leave side named this “Project Fear” (Bennett, 2016). On the other side the leave campaign unveiled a bus suggesting that $350m a week could be reclaimed from EU related spending and spent on the NHS (the UK’s single payer health service). The remain side countered that this was an inaccurate figure – that much of the money labelled as EU funding was actually spent in the UK and some was purely notional (Henley, 2016).

Even more pertinent to the decision problem facing the voter is that the referendum would set policy towards the European Union but the government sets the NHS budgets. The new Conservative government – led by Theresa May who had supported remain -- shortly after the vote for Brexit made it clear that they did not feel bound to increase NHS funding (Borrelli, 2016). If anyone had voted for Brexit solely to save the $350 million a week it was claimed that was sent to Europe – and polling suggested that nearly half of voters believed this figure to be accurate (Stone, 2016) -- they seem to have been voting under an inaccurate assumption. Even the leader of UKIP, Nigel Farage, the day after his side had won the referendum suggested that the promise to increase NHS funding was a “mistake” (McCann and Morgan, 2016).

How informed the public are (Delli Carpini and Keeter, 1993) or need to be to make informed choices is a contentious issue (Rose, 1967; Caplan, 2007; Bendle and Thomson, 2016). A referendum provides an even trickier problem than is faced in traditional elections. A referendum is a one off; if a government is elected and implements a new tax policy this can typically be reversed and the public can punish retroactively those advocating undesirable policies or flat out lying. The political challenge of a referendum comes from the divorce of the players in the referendum from the government. Neither side, especially those who are not expecting win future elections, have an incentive towards good policy or honesty given there is nothing to keep the promises of the participants in line.

In 2016 after the decision to leave the European Union was taken came a host of administrative challenges. Some major figures, especially UKIP leader Nigel Farage who retired from politics upon the results, had no connection to the implementation. Others such as key Vote Leave leader Michael Gove, the Justice Secretary, attempted to be involved in implementing Brexit but failed. After David Cameron’s resignation Gove launched an ill-judged leadership bid that only managed to destroy his Vote Leave colleague Boris Johnson’s hopes of the top job. Gove was removed from his government post. A remain voter, Theresa May, became Prime Minister. She bore ultimate responsibility for making the UK’s biggest geo-strategic decision in a generation work despite apparently not believing it was a good idea (Dunford and Kirk, 2016). She appointed Boris Johnson,
the former Mayor of London, and several other key Brexit campaigners to key posts for the Brexit negotiation.

Institutional Details of the Referendums

In 1975 the referendum had been called in response to a split in the ruling Labour party. The intention was to allow the public to weigh in on a matter that the government itself could not come to a collective position on (Nairne and Independent Commission, 1996). As such the government couldn’t take a lead on the referendum – there was after all no unified government position. Instead two campaigning bodies were created for the purpose, Britain In Europe (In) and the National Referendum Campaign (Out).

The 1975 referendum was a constitutional aberration. There existed no independent electoral oversight body charged with organizing it which led to considerable logistical challenges. A special Referendum Unit was set up in the Cabinet office with inputs from the Home Office and the Foreign and Commonwealth Office (Nairne and Independent Commission, 1996). The strangeness of the process, given the UK’s prior political history, led the referendum to be deemed merely advisory. The power of parliament could not be constrained by the results but the Labour government committed itself to respecting the decision of the electorate.

In 2016 although the Conservative government of David Cameron had called the referendum the Prime Minister advocated for the UK to remain in the EU. Controversially the government sent a pro-EU leaflet to UK homes at an expense of around £9 million (Landale, 2016). As this was deemed government, not campaign spending, it was not officially counted as part of the referendum activity. The leaflet was titled “Why the Government believes that voting to remain in the European Union is the best decision for the UK” (HM Government, 2016).

The Electoral Commission oversaw the referendum process and had the right to grant official status, called the lead campaign, to an organization backing each side. With official status came a grant of up to £600,000 (BBC News, 2016). The remain campaign relatively painlessly coalesced around an umbrella organization called Britain Stronger In Europe under its chair Stuart Rose, a Conservative businessman and peer. This was not universally welcomed as he seemed to be an uninspiring political leader. According to one commentator Britain Stronger In Europe had a “charisma-free frontman in Stuart Rose and initials that may remind people of bovine disease [BSE]” (Crace, 2015).

Given their shared principle was the desire for independence it is perhaps not surprising that those on the leave side had a challenge agreeing who should lead them. A group allied with the UKIP leader Nigel Farage, Grassroots Out, was rejected by the Electoral Commission who designated the official campaigns (Mance, 2016). The official leave campaign was Vote Leave, which was dominated by senior Conservative figures such as Michael Gove and Boris Johnson.

From a marketing perspective modern UK election law is especially fascinating as it creates a heavily regulated political market. Election law requires considerable disclosure of those funding campaigns. It imposes limits on spending by political parties and strongly curtails spending by all others (Her Majesty’s Stationery Office, 2000). Being a lead organization entitled the group to spend up to £7 million. Political parties were able to spend on their own campaigns but other groups were allowed to spend significantly less on influencing the referendum (The Electoral Commission, 2016). The rules on what spending entails are complex – volunteer time does not count but notional spending, such as seconded staff’s salaries do. This leads to considerable expertise being developed within political parties as to the effective management of these returns.

Advertising is a staple of UK politics but this is mostly outdoor media with a recent move to online advertising. The bus with the NHS message on its side was and example of using advertising to drive earned media. The idea being to use the advertisement as part of an event the message of which the press recirculates. This is a much more cost effective way of advertising than attempting to reach all the public through paid advertising and takes advantage of the fact that political parties find it much easier to get press coverage than comparable commercial entities.

Over recent years the most famous UK political advertising has generally employed messages on billboards. In 1979 the Conservatives “Labour isn’t working” poster showed what appeared to be long queues at the unemployment office. This certainly gained attention; Denis Healey, then Chancellor of the Exchequer, even denounced it in parliament as dishonest and selling politics like soap-powder. Indeed, it was claimed that this poster won the election for the Conservatives. The advertisement helped propel the Saatchi’s to advertising celebrity, and was voted poster of the century by advertising executives (BBC News, 2001). That this was a staged event, and not an actual line at an
unemployment office, generates an interesting discussion point in respect of marketing ethics. Opponents argue that the advertisement may have tricked people but supporters claim the advertisement merely captured in visual form worries about the UK economy in 1979 and so did not need to be a literal picture of an unemployment office queue.

Few posters seem to have been as effective as Labour Isn’t Working, although many are relatively memorable. In 1997 the Conservatives unveiled the “demon eyes” posters of Tony Blair. The message of Blair as demonic failed to resonate with voters and was widely denounced. The Advertising Standards Authority’s Committee on Advertising Practice, however, seemed keen to avoid becoming involved in politics. The suggestion was that political advertising, although in many ways potentially more significant, did not need to live up to the same standards as commercial advertising (McCann, 1997). In 2005 the Conservatives launched “Are you thinking what we’re thinking” a puzzling slogan to which the British public responded that no, they weren’t thinking the same thing as the Conservatives (The Telegraph, 2016). Labour’s advertising has often been less memorable perhaps with the possible exception of 2001 when Conservative leader William Hague was shown morphed with Margaret Thatcher. This poster was designed to imply that Hague would take the country backwards to the days of Thatcher but the visual looked slightly perturbing and was condemned as negative campaigning (Tempest, 2001)

Communication in the Campaigns

There is a considerable difference in the challenge of analysing the two referendums. This helps illustrate the massive changes in campaigning that have occurred since the 1970’s. Rather than the rather plain mini-booklets/pamphlets used in the earlier campaign the materials were of much higher quality in 2016 and much more easily accessible. One hypothesis that could be advanced is that the provision of essentially zero cost information in 2016 has significantly impacted campaigning. In an ideal world given the low costs of information provision the most recent referendum would have seen an extensive discussion of all the important issues facing the UK. We suggest that sadly this wasn’t the case.

The communication methods used changed considerable in the four decades since the first referendum. Most obviously, the materials for the 2016 were all hosted online, as well as a selection being made available in print form. This makes research much easier but also allows for more material to be produced by the campaigns. Messages could be designed for specific groups, for instance, Britain Stronger In Europe produced messages for youth and for small business owners.

One problem with the ability to produce and disseminate multiple messages cheaply is the potential confusion that can be created by ambiguous messages, or even deliberately distorted messages going to different groups. In 2016 even the care taken to ensure that the messages were internally consistent seemed limited. For example, Vote Leave laid out their case for leaving suggesting that the UK’s £350 million a week contribution to the EU (a controversial number in itself) would soon rise to £400 million. Only two pages later in the same piece of material a vote to remain is said to mean “Permanent Handing Over of £350 million a week to Brussels” (Vote Leave, 2016). Apparently even those producing the leaflet did not think their numbers were worth paying serious attention to.

Unsurprisingly given advances in technology the quality of the materials was much higher in the more recent vote. In 1975 the government produced a leaflet advocating for staying in the European Community that was of relatively high quality for the time. It was a three colour leaflet predominantly white with blue and red elements but contained a photo of the Prime Minister, a map of Europe, and graphics for flags of European countries (HM Government, 1975). While modern campaigners would be ashamed of the production quality it seemed significantly more appealing than the official materials of the campaigns. The official In leaflet was a rather drab brown text piece with yellow highlights (Britain In Europe, 1975). The out leaflet was of similar dull appearance only with a greater use of brown backgrounds (National Referendum Campaign, 1975).

The modern materials produced in 2016 make extensive use of photographs and varied visual styles. Many of the materials were designed to be shared on social media and make relatively little use of text. This high visual, low text style means that all sides make claims that are hard to judge given the lack of evidence supporting the statements made.

The tone of much of the material we analyzed, especially from Vote Leave, had a distinctly populist edge. Vote Leave suggested that EU judges had made the “cost of your pint” of beer go up. This mirrored much of the material from 1975 where pocket book issues where critical to much of the
information given – according to the Out campaign in 1975 staying in the European Community must mean still higher food prices” (National Referendum Campaign 1975, page 4).

Some of the materials from 1975 now read as strangely formal, often giving titles to those referred to. The official stay leaflet refers to foreign leaders as, for example, Mr. Gough Whitlam and Mr. Wallace Rowling. They also read more politely in the sense that the 1975 materials seem to have less ad hominem attacks than the extensive personal attacks displayed in the more recent vote. In 2016, for example, the Britain Stronger In Europe visuals feature personal attacks on Boris Johnson, stating apparent contradictions in his positions, while Vote Leave were happy to do the same for David Cameron.

Many of the messages are simply outlining who supported various positions. Both sides seemed to believe that Barack Obama’s support for the UK remaining in the EU strengthened their case. While Britain Stronger in Europe were keen to tar the Vote Leave campaign with an association to Donald Trump, see Figure 4 for some example visuals.

Figure 4. Example Visual Campaign Materials from 2016

Use of Celebrities

Beyond the use of political figures one common feature of the 1975 and 2016 campaigns is celebrity endorsement. The In campaign in 1975 had the vast majority of the bankable stars. “…a galaxy of actors, sports stars and celebrities, such as the boxer Henry Cooper, the Olympic gold medalist Mary Peters and the former England cricket captain Colin Cowdrey. Football managers Brian Clough, Sir Matt Busby and Jock Stein …, while novelists as diverse as Agatha Christie, Karl Popper and Tom Stoppard signed adverts in the press.” (Saunders, 2016).

The higher quality celebrity endorsers may have favoured remain in 2016; JK Rowling and Stephen Hawking chose remain, as opposed to Vote Leave’s British TV stars Keith Chegwin and Vicky Pattison. Still both sides had vocal support. Business people, whose commercial interests may
have been impacted by the decision weighed in. Karen Brady and Alan Sugar (of the UK’s apprentice show) and Richard Branson (Virgin boss) endorsed remain while James Dyson (inventor) and Bernie Ecclestone (Formula One boss) were for leaving.

Sports stars also weighed in. Gary Lineker, former England football captain and TV Host, and the Beckhams supported remain. Former England captains Sol Campbell (football) and Ian Botham (cricket) chose leave. In an interesting reflection on modern UK life the most famous football manager to give an opinion was a Frenchman – Arsene Wenger – who was for remain. In a populist turn, much of the debate revolved around what would be good for the success of English football. Some argued leaving the EU would entail more homegrown talent being used in the premier league.

From music Elton John and Bob Geldoff supported remain while Elaine Paige and Roger Daltrey were for leaving the EU. Similarly, actors split between the campaigns, Idris Elba, Keira Knightley, Ian McKellen, and Benedict Cumberbatch supporting remain while Michael Cain, Elizabeth Hurley, and Joan Collins favoured leaving. (McGeorge, 2016).

Celebrity endorsements is an important marketing topic (McCracken, 2016) and while some marketing approaches have changed celebrity interventions are nothing new. In 2016 no celebrity needed to sign a press advert, however one could easily find out a celebrity’s thoughts from their Twitter account. Whether these endorsements influenced the referendum is hard to say for certain but campaigners certainly value most endorsements. Although some endorsements can be controversial. In 1975 Ian Paisley (a strident unionist) and Enoch Powell (who had been sacked for racially insensitive views) were anti-European Community advocates with the potential to alienate some voters. Similarly, the endorsement of WikiLeaks founder Julian Assange may have been a mixed blessing for the leave campaign in 2016 (McGeorge, 2016; Saunders, 2016).

Analysing the Texts

To get more detail on the messages being used we text analyzed the materials from the two referendums. The texts from the 2016 campaign were relatively easy to download from campaign websites. Documents (pdfs) were extracted from the websites and pages archived from the day after the referendum. These were then imported into Mathematica for analysis.

Gaining the texts from the 1975 campaign was possible with the generous assistance of the London School of Economics, which maintains a store of election materials. The material had to be digitally photographed and then converted into text using ABBYY Finereader, an Optical Character Recognition (OCR) program. (Although Mathematica offers OCR functions, ABBYY has been developed exclusively for such purposes and has been used more extensively by academics). While such technologies have made great strides in recent years, and can be surprisingly effective, it still remains a challenge to convert digital photos to text. This is especially true for older materials where the quality of the original may be less than perfect some forty-one years after it was produced. After the software had produced digitized text this had to be manually reviewed to ensure that any optical character recognition errors were caught. For some documents the entire document had to be digitized by one of the authors typing it out where the character recognition was especially weak.

Of these 1975 materials twenty-one documents we received supported staying in the European Community. These documents came from the Conservative Party, Britain in Europe and the Labour Party. Thirty-five documents came from the campaign to leave the community including the National Referendum Campaign and some less well known groups such as the Campaign for an Independent Britain. Five documents were unclassified. Interestingly the Socialist party took time to issue documents in respect of this referendum, two of which are included in our materials. This party’s position was that the European issue was of “no consequence to the vast majority of people in Britain or any other country” (The Socialist Party of Great Britain, 1975). Rather than engage with the options given supporters were urged to write “socialism—common ownership” on the ballot paper.

In 2016 four documents we analysed were from the UK Independence party. Four documents from the 1975 and 2016 file. We then prepared the text files using the Flatten command to remove
structure from the files. These files thus created are known as bags of words – these sort of files (without structure) can be the simplest inputs when analyzing word usage but such a reductive approach can sacrifice some nuance. For instance, given the specific approach used here we cannot easily detect whether the discussion is saying that jobs would be lost, or gained, from leaving the EU – we can only see that jobs are being discussed.

Our approach allowed us to see what was being talked about in the two referendums – but not compare approaches within a single referendum. Comparing approaches within each campaign would be interesting but would require a larger sample size.

Comparing between 1975 and 2016 allows us to see how the discussion changed over the years. We used the Tally function to understand word frequency. A key element of textual analysis is considering what to do with stopwords. These are common but uninformative words – such as “the”, “and”, “of”. They are uninformative in the sense that they don’t help differentiate between documents given they have little unique meaning and are used in practically all English writing. Using Mathematica’s in-built stopword dictionary we removed the stopwords from the files.

Table I. Descriptive Details of Documents Analysed

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>1975</th>
<th>2016</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Documents (includes webpages in 2016)</td>
<td>63</td>
<td>37</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Words (including stopwords)</td>
<td>122,285</td>
<td>36,265</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Words (after stopwords removed)</td>
<td>58,278</td>
<td>19,787</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Proportion of words that are stopwords</td>
<td>52%</td>
<td>45%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Words per document (average)</td>
<td>1,941</td>
<td>980</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table I gives a description of the data we used. While it would be dangerous to draw firm conclusions given our sample is a convenience one and not necessarily representative we can highlight a couple of general points. Firstly, the proportion of stop words drops from 52% in 1975 to 45% in 2016. The number of words per document is also considerably less in 2016. We suggest this may be a result of the different type of campaign materials being produced in the later referendum. The 2016 materials were generally more focused, with greater use of simple bullet points. The 1975 materials were more discursive. This greater use of essay style in 1975 would explain the larger number of words and the greater use of stopwords – such words are often omitted in bullet point style language.

We also adopted a second approach and partitioned (using the Partition function command) both datasets into two- and three-word length n-grams. A bigram is a two-word n-gram, (two words found together), and a trigram is a three-word n-gram (three words found together). For instance, the most common 2016 bigram is “the EU” and the most common 1975 trigram is “the common market”. We then calculated frequencies of the various n-grams. Table II shows the top trigrams from 1975 and 2016. This suggests that there has been a slight narrowing of the focus in 2016 compared to 1975. The earlier election shows a wider range of terms, such as discussion of the various technical features of the European Community such as the Council of Ministers. (The Council of Europe being an organization that goes beyond the European Community/Union).

A marketer might wonder about the rebranding of the European project from the European Community to the European Union. While the idea of a Union may have captured some people’s hope for increasing cooperation across Europe renaming the project as the EU may not have been the wisest choice. It is clearly impossible to formally assess the implications of the naming of the European project on voting intentions but the EU, a union, which suggests tones of centralized control, may have appealed less than the more cooperative idea of community.
Table II. Top 10 Trigrams from 1975 and 2016

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>1975</th>
<th>2016</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>the common market</td>
<td>in the EU</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>of the community</td>
<td>the European court</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>the European community</td>
<td>to the EU</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>the council of</td>
<td>of the EU</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>of the European</td>
<td>the EU is</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>membership of the</td>
<td>if we vote</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>of the common</td>
<td>we vote leave</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Council of Europe</td>
<td>the EU and</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Council of Ministers</td>
<td>with the EU</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>the British people</td>
<td>the EU</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The Campaign’s Focus in 1975 and 2016

To better understand the focus on the campaign in the two referendums we created word clouds from the texts. (A word cloud is simply a representation of the words used in a text with greater emphasis given to words used more often). Figure 5 was created after removing the stopwords -- a standard practice given these are relatively uninformative (Wang et al., 2015). We see that the (European) Community was the central feature of discussions in 1975 but this had been replaced, consistent with the findings of the trigrams and the evolution of European institutions, with EU by 2016. One sees the term trade features in both years with food being an important term in 1975 -- memories of post-war rationing were still relatively fresh in the seventies. 2016 sees the emergence of specific topics central to the more recent campaign – such as the NHS which was suggested would be the recipient of any savings on EU funding. The 2016 campaign also featured much talk of immigration which shows in that year’s word. Interestingly this topic was barely mentioned in 1975, the suggestion being that people leaving the country was more of a concern back then (Saunders, 2016). Control features in the 2016 word cloud. One might also notice the prominence of UKIP, the party dedicated to an anti-EU vote. Turkey also featured – Vote Leave suggested that this populous Muslim nation was about the enter the EU, a reason they saw for the UK to leave the EU and not be bound by the Union’s free movement of people.

The Countries in The UK

We turned to considering the countries discussed in the materials analysed, see Table III. The UK is made up of four countries: England, Scotland, Wales and Northern Ireland. Britain is the UK without Northern Ireland. Over the years many people have been relatively careless about the distinction between these two entities, the UK and Britain. 2016 may show a greater awareness that the
entire UK was involved in the European debate as terminology had shifted. Extensive use was made of the term Britain in 1975, which excludes Northern Ireland. We saw increased popularity of the UK as the term of description in 2016.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Country</th>
<th>1975 % of Words</th>
<th>2016 % of Words</th>
<th>Growth in Use of Term</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Britain</td>
<td>1.03%</td>
<td>0.69%</td>
<td>-33%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UK</td>
<td>0.09%</td>
<td>1.33%</td>
<td>1419%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>England</td>
<td>0.02%</td>
<td>0.06%</td>
<td>260%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Wales</td>
<td>0.02%</td>
<td>0.00%</td>
<td>Not Applicable</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ireland</td>
<td>0.05%</td>
<td>0.01%</td>
<td>-78%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Scotland</td>
<td>0.09%</td>
<td>0.01%</td>
<td>-94%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The mentions of the individual countries within the UK are relatively rare – here our non-scientific sample may especially cause problems. A relatively small number of specific mentions of a country could change the data. That said there are a number of stories that we can highlight as being consistent with the data we see. As previously discussed England is by far the largest of the four countries – 86% of votes cast in 1975, and 85% in 2016, came from England. This means that English voters can override the voters of the other nations in any UK wide poll. (Conservative governments in recent years had controlled the UK despite some abject performances in Wales and, especially, Scotland). The materials we reviewed rarely mentioned Wales – indeed they did not mention Wales at all in 2016. Mentions of Scotland fell despite the real possibility that voting for Brexit might create a rift between Scotland and England and, thereby, shatter the UK (Lowe, 2016). There seems to have been a relatively lack of attention to the constitutional implications of the decision in the materials we reviewed.

Although Scotland was relatively sparsely mentioned, attention to England increased sizeably. While we should not conclude anything with certainty from the sparse data this is consistent with the interpretation of the result in 2016 being as a consequence of the rise of English Nationalism (O’Toole, 2016). England in 1975 had been the epicentre of the desire to maintain links with Europe but by 2016 there were signs that the English were the least keen of the UK nations on European links.

Like the position of Scotland the ramifications of the Brexit vote could be especially important to Northern Ireland. The UK as a whole voted for Brexit but Northern Ireland did not, yet it is bound by the result. From being the least pro-European area in 1975 Northern Ireland had become second only to Scotland in its support for European integration. The implications of Brexit on Northern Ireland seem practically non-existent in the materials we reviewed from both sides. Indeed, the very term Brexit (British exit from the European Union) seems to exclude consideration of Northern Ireland. Mentions of Ireland show a sizable fall in 2016 relative to 1975. This suggests that the voters may not have been informed of all relevant facts when they made their decisions -- even by remain campaigners who might have been expected to highlight the challenges Brexit would cause to Northern Ireland as a reason to remain.

Post Brexit one of the most challenging issues is what border there will be between Northern Ireland and the Republic of Ireland. A return to a traditional border with passport checks could harm trade, would turn back the clock on the peace process, at its very worse, could prompt an re-escalation of violence. A solution is the maintenance of a soft border allowing free movement between Northern Ireland and the Republic. This would, however, threaten the UK’s ability to create border controls with Europe to stem immigration – a key appeal of Brexit to many. Aiming for a soft border with the Republic and controls on European migration could entail an unpopular internal border within the UK between Northern Ireland and the British mainland or somehow persuading the Republic of Ireland to install a border with the rest of the European Union (McDonald, 2016). The limited discussion of this
issue prior to the vote suggests that voters, on either side, may not have been fully informed. We might argue that information is not necessary to effective decision making if some sort of ecological rationality is generated. When ecological rationality applies effective decisions emerge from the interactions of a large number of admittedly fallible decision makers (Smith, 2003; Bendle and Cotte, 2016). Time will tell whether this is the case. If so it will be an important case for political marketing theory – if not it will fuel discussions of the ability of the marketing concept (Houston, 1986) to be applied to politics.

One historical footnote is the decline in interest in the Commonwealth between the two campaigns. In the early years of the twentieth century Britain was focused on its empire (Moore, 2016). Later in the century this had morphed into a relationship of more equal partners – the Commonwealth. In 1975 this international grouping still held an important place in UK life. Reviewing the 1975 materials shows 0.2% of the words used mentioned the Commonwealth. This had fallen to a mere 0.02% in 2016. The place of the Commonwealth in the thinking of those in the UK seems to have declined precipitously.

**Topics of Interest**

We turned to consider words used relevant to specific topics, see Table IV. We searched for terms related to trade, expense/value for money, and the legal system, all important topics in discussions of the UK’s relationship with Europe. All appear with a modest number of occurrences but certain potentially interesting results emerge. Notably the focus of interest on trade appears to have changed. Imports and exports occurred with similar frequency in 1975 but in 2016 exports gained much more focus that imports. We also see some evidence of an increase in legal related terms, e.g., charter, law, legal, between the referendum. Our raw data shows more use of the words costs (but not expense), value, and economy.

**Table IV. Key Words Used in 1975 and 2016**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Term</th>
<th>% of words in 1975</th>
<th>% of words in 2016</th>
<th>Growth In Use of Term</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>costs</td>
<td>0.04%</td>
<td>0.14%</td>
<td>293%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>expense</td>
<td>0.01%</td>
<td>0.01%</td>
<td>-26%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>value</td>
<td>0.02%</td>
<td>0.05%</td>
<td>104%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>legal</td>
<td>0.06%</td>
<td>0.12%</td>
<td>83%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>charter</td>
<td>0.01%</td>
<td>0.11%</td>
<td>1962%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>law</td>
<td>0.13%</td>
<td>0.36%</td>
<td>172%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>commerce</td>
<td>0.01%</td>
<td>0.01%</td>
<td>-26%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>imports</td>
<td>0.05%</td>
<td>0.01%</td>
<td>-80%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>exports</td>
<td>0.05%</td>
<td>0.14%</td>
<td>174%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>economy</td>
<td>0.09%</td>
<td>0.21%</td>
<td>125%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>deal(s)</td>
<td>0.08%</td>
<td>0.10%</td>
<td>22%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Limitations and Implications**

Textual analysis is already being used in commercial market research (Tirunillai and Tellis, 2014; Bendle and Wang, 2016) and a fascinating topic for future marketing historians will be how the market research industry was changed by the emergence of such approaches. In the meantime such work has considerable potential to assist academic research focused on marketing in a historical context (Savitt, 1980; Tadajewski and Jones, 2014).

Before discussing this, we re-emphasize a specific challenge with our analysis. We do not have a scientific sample of texts; indeed, it is not clear how a scientific sample of texts could be arrived at. Furthermore, a complete sample of all relevant texts relating to the referendums is impractical even given improving technology. As such while we can raise interesting issues, such as the countries and topics referred to, we cannot precisely quantify the points we note with full confidence. We certainly cannot give statistically based assertions that, for instance, discussion of Scotland decreased between 1975 and 2016. Our sample may have just been more focused on Scotland in 1975 because of the materials that happened to survive and so made it into our sample rather than what materials were
produced. While in an ideal world we could make statistical claims, historians often have to cope with incomplete data. Interesting insights can still be gleaned even from imperfect data.

While text-mining approaches have great potential to revolutionize academic research the approach is far from a solution to all research problems. Consider what an automated text analysis gains and loses compared to a skilled researcher. Textual analysis delivers a quantified reading of a text – this reduces the potential for bias on the part of the researcher. Automating textual analysis eliminates the need to consider inter-coder reliability – as it removes the human subjectivity that manual categorization inevitably has. Bias, however, does remain an important consideration, especially when discussing politically related issues given the researcher choses what to investigate which is likely to be influenced by past experiences and knowledge.

A key benefit of textual analysis is the speed with which it can be done. Especially for more modern materials the text can relatively easily be brought into analytical software. Older materials can be more challenging but even here new methods greatly increase the speed of digitizing them. Once digitized the materials can be relatively quickly analysed and a range of investigations conducted.

The main challenge, assuming data is available, is that automated textual analysis generally does not cope well with nuance. Analysing texts as a bag of words throws away sentence structure. Similarly, the analysis method that we use captures if people are mentioning trade. It does not, however, record a difference between a piece of material that claims that the EU promotes or reduces trade. Given this, and other limitations, one still needs detailed reading by experts to uncover some of the deeper meanings of texts. Automated textual analysis is far from a replacement for traditional text based research but it is an exciting potential additional tool. We see automated text mining as similar to many other forms of automation. It will improve certain activities but room remains for work at a very sophisticated level that cannot be effectively automated. In car manufacturing automation has made the process a lot easier but there remains a market for high-quality non-standardised approaches, especially for high end cars.

Conclusion
This research discussed the two referendums on the UK’s relationship with Europe. We noted the importance of the precise question wording and the institutional arrangements. We considered the key participants in the referendum and the materials used. We analyzed texts related to the referendum and delivered some preliminary ideas on how the focus of the campaign changed in the four decades between 1975 and 2016. A key contribution is raising the profile of automated text analysis which has great potential to make further impact on historical research in marketing.

References
Europeanism?',

Proceedings CHARM 2017


Vote Leave (2016) ‘Why should we Vote Leave on 23 June?’, p. 16.

“Don’t Blame the Shopkeeper!!”: How Food, Drink and Confectionary Brands’ Advertising Dealt with Shortages and British Government Control of the Market During the Second World War

Mick Hayes
Marketing and Sales Subject Group, Portsmouth Business School, University of Portsmouth, Portsmouth, UK. PO1 3DE.

Abstract
Purpose – The purpose of this paper is to present research into how shortages and Government regulation of the food, drink and confectionery industries during the Second World War impacted on brands’ advertising.
Design/methodology/approach – The study consisted of a content analysis of more than 10,000 advertisements from the Daily Express and Daily Mirror newspapers, of which more than 1,800 were specifically for food, drink and confectionery brands. Building on previous work by Burridge (2008) it explores different message strategies used by brands in response to rationing, shortages, zoning and pooling
Findings – While rationing has been discussed at length in the historiography of the Second World War, the other forms of Government control of industry and markets, have not. The advertising of food, drink and confectionery brands illustrates that while brands provided information to their customers about rationing, shortages, zoning and pooling, the latter three also prompted brands to apologise, look to the future and urge patience. These different messages offer an insight into the impact that shortages and control had on consumers and business.
Research limitations/implications – This study is based on the Monday to Saturday editions of the Daily Express and Daily Mirror from August 1939 to September 1945. Further research could explore other publications or the period after the war as rationing and control continued. Exploration of brand and agency archives could also provide more background into brands’ objectives and decision making.
Keywords – Advertising history, Business history, Second World War, Britain, Rationing, Zoning, Pooling, Shortages

Paper type – Research paper

Introduction
The Second World War saw extensive intervention in the food, drink and confectionary markets by the British Government, as they attempted to influence both the demand for, and the supply of, food available to British consumers. Much of the discussion of food on the home front in the historiography focuses on rationing. A content analysis of food, drink and confectionary advertising, in the Daily Express and Daily Mirror across the war however, illustrates that government control was more extensive than this. These sectors were chosen because they represent all of the main forms of government market interference experienced during the war, with the exception of utility, giving a good illustration of most of the ways this interference affected advertising. The Daily Express and Daily Mirror were chosen due to their high level of circulation. According to Pugh (1998, citing Jenkins, 1986), in 1945 their circulation was 3.23 million and 2 million respectively.

This paper will explore how advertising dealt with zoning and pooling, both from the point of view of brands which were themselves in short supply or absent, or those which were offered as alternatives to brands in short supply. The exploration of these different types of control will expand the historiography beyond the current concentration on rationing and allow a more nuanced discussion of government control generally during the war and its impact on advertising in particular. The examination of newspaper advertising and the historiography indicates several different reasons for absences or shortages, each of which will be discussed. First, the Government’s attempts to systematically control the supply of certain brands. Second, brands which were not necessarily controlled but which were in short supply for other reasons. Third, brands which were not affected by control or shortages but which were positioned as being useful ways to extend supplies of those products which were in short supply. Fourth, the paper will explore how some brands’ advertisements reflected the ways in which the brands were affected by shortages in raw materials or in packaging. Next, the paper will discuss advertising by brands which were absent. Throughout the paper, different positioning strategies used by advertisers in response to shortages or absences will be discussed and tabulated, building on and extending the work done by Burridge (2008). Finally, these strategies will be tabulated to highlight how these issues impacted on advertising.
The paper begins, however, by providing context through a discussion of advertisements which specifically mention rationing, or some element of it such as ration coupons.

Rationing

Food rationing was planned before the start of the Second World War as a way to prevent the social unrest which resulted from food shortages and inflation in Russia, Austria-Hungary and Germany in 1917, as well as in Britain in 1916 (Mackay, 2003). While petrol rationing began in September 1939, due to public concerns about government interference, food rationing was not introduced immediately (Longmate, 1971). The war began with what Mackay (2003, p. 53) describes as “four months of free-for-all” before rationing of bacon, butter and sugar began in January 1940 (Longmate, 1971), in response to the end of “imports of butter and bacon from Denmark” (Alcock, 2008). A detailed list of “the main commodities” rationed as of the beginning of 1942 is given by Richardson (1942). Table I gives a brief illustrative timeline of the introduction of rationing.

As Table I shows food rationing began in a fairly limited fashion in January 1940 and was extended over the course of the next two years, first to cover more types of food and then clothing. Changes to the rationing system continued throughout the war both in terms of what was rationed and the amount that was allowed each person, all of which meant brands needed to be flexible in the way their advertisements dealt with rationing as well as zoning and pooling. In the months after the introduction of food rationing, the number of advertisements explicitly mentioning rationing (or ration coupons) increased. In part, this was due to a number of brands anticipating the introduction of rationing, sometimes incorrectly. The increase was not consistent however, since in some cases the brands carried on discussing similar issues, but just stopped specifically mentioning rationing. This issue will also be discussed in more detail later in the paper.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Date</th>
<th>Product</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>22 September</td>
<td>Petrol rationing began.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>November 1939</td>
<td>Registration with retailers for rations ordered.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8 January 1940</td>
<td>Ham and bacon, sugar and butter rationed.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11 March 1940</td>
<td>Meat rationed to just over 1lb or $1 10d worth per week.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>By July 1940</td>
<td>Margarine, butter, cooking fats and suet reduced to 2oz per week; Tea rationing introduced; National Milk Scheme introduced; Rationing of chocolate and sweets begun.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7 July 1940</td>
<td>Marcom Ltd set up to replace branded margarines.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>March 1941</td>
<td>Jam, syrup and marmalade rationed (followed by honey and lemon curd).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5 May 1941</td>
<td>Cheese rationed.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7 June 1941</td>
<td>Points rationing introduced for clothes.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>July 1941</td>
<td>Cheese ration reduced to 1 oz per week.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>November 1941</td>
<td>Controlled Distribution of liquid milk began.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>December 1941</td>
<td>Points system extended to “non-perishable commodities”.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9 February 1942</td>
<td>Soap rationing introduced.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table I. Timeline of the Introduction of Rationing and Control. (Adapted from, Alcock, 2008; Bell, 2008; Brady, 1950; Gardner, 2005; Harvey, 1991; Jobling, 2005; Longmate, 1971; Minns, 1980; Zweininger-Bargielska, 2000)

As Burridge (2008, p. 392) states “As well as being a problem, rationing was also a resource for advertisers – it was something that could be invoked and used in various ways” (emphasis in original). Therefore, the response to the introduction of rationing differed between industry sectors and brands, although most of the advertisements mentioning rationing in January, February, March and April 1940 were from brands in the food and drink sector.

A number of brands, as early as October and November 1939, anticipated the beginning of rationing of food and domestic fuel (coal, gas and electricity), which was never rationed, which was possibly driven in part by the requirement for consumers to register with a retailer for their rations (Longmate, 1971). According to diarist Constance Miles (Miles, 2013), ration cards for gas were issued in October 1939 only for an announcement to be made a week later that neither gas nor electricity would be rationed (no mention was made of coal), indicating that anticipating fuel rationing was reasonable.

Anticipation was also a feature of the advertisements in December and early January, since they predate the beginning of food rationing. Many of these early advertisements, featured positioning
strategies, i.e., attempts to influence how consumers perceived the brand, and messages for the brands which would be repeated throughout the war. The idea that different positioning strategies might be used was proposed by Burridge (2008) who identified seven strategies in advertisements in women’s magazines across the whole period of rationing (Table II). A contribution of this paper to the historiography is the identification of the extent to which variations of these strategies can be found in the newspaper advertisements identified in this study, taking into account Burridge’s point that more than one strategy can appear in an advertisement. First however, each will be briefly described.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Positioning Strategy</th>
<th>Woman’s Own</th>
<th>Woman &amp; Home</th>
<th>Total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Product is available and a solution or substitute for rationed goods</td>
<td>35</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>41</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Product is available, because it is “essential”</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Product is the same as pre-war, or, better now</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Product is scarce _ but worth it when you get it</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Product is currently unavailable _ provision of a substitute service</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Product is currently unavailable _ it will be back soon</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The product is back now or available again</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>68</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>84</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table II Incidence of positioning strategies by magazine, 1940-1955 (Burridge, 2008, p. 323)

Overall Burridge’s (2008) typology is a very useful beginning to exploring the nature of advertising in the Second World War. However, by failing to differentiate the impact of rationing (designed to ensure equal shares of a limited supply by limiting demand) from the impact of the measures that limited supply, a good deal of nuance is lost. This is particularly true in cases where influences on both demand and supply were present. These cases will be discussed later in the paper, but first messages related to rationing will be discussed.

Messages Relating to Rationing
Interestingly the Bovril advertisement shown in Figure 1, below, which predates the rationing of food, introduced in January 1940 (Minns, 1980) contains the explicit statement that “Bovril isn’t rationed!” As Clampin (2009, pp. 58-60) states however, “the producers of sauces, meat extracts, condiments and soups” anticipated that shortages would increase demand for their products. It is possible that either Bovril anticipated that food rationing would begin earlier than it did or were simply trying to position themselves in the mind of consumers as a non-rationed product for when rationing actually began. The requirement in November 1939 for consumers to register themselves with retailers for certain foodstuffs (Bell, 2008), may have prompted either of these reactions. Either way, as Clampin (2009) indicates, the positioning strategy of offering ‘a solution or substitute for rationed goods’, in particular by making them go further was followed through the war by “the producers of sauces, meat extracts, condiments and soups”. The further claim that Bovril helped to get “more good from all your food” supports the view that the advertisement was intended to position Bovril as something consumers needed “now more than ever”. This positioning matched closely the stance of the Ministry of Food which revolved around making the best use of the available food, however unusual or unappetising (Minns, 1980). In relation to a different type of product, desserts, Chivers (1940) took a similar approach, suggesting in an advertisement in January in the Daily Express in January 1940, “in these days of food rationing” their range of jellies meant that “hospitality need not make demands upon your family sugar allowance”. One of a variety of messages around rationing and shortages was a similar approach taken by Weetabix, based on the pre-war habit of having bacon for breakfast and positioning the brand as a replacement meal (Clampin, 2014, p. 83).
This approach was also aimed, by a number of different brands, at parents who were worried about the impact of rationing and shortages on the health of their children. This began very early in the war by brands such as Virol, Figure 2, and as will be seen continued throughout the war by a number of other brands. The Virol advertisement in Figure 2, takes both an informative and emotional approach, comparing the brand to ‘other “extras”’ in its positive impact on children’s growth. The photograph of a happy smiling girl playing hockey is also an example of a common technique used to both imply the health and happiness of the children who are given it. Also interesting is the fact that winter is mentioned more prominently than rationing, probably because winter was a certainty while rationing was only a possibility. Overall the likelihood is, as with other brands mentioned above, that Virol were simply anticipating rationing as a general possibility and attempting to position themselves early as a response.
Virol positioned themselves to replace the benefits of products no longer available, as a ‘solution’, even though they might not be able to fulfil the role of the product in consumers’ diets. In February 1940, Walters’ Palm Toffee (1940) took a similar position, as a way to replace the sugar that was now missing from children’s diets. As will be seen, this was a position which would be taken by other confectionery brands as the war progressed, in relation to shortages generally, rather than rationing in particular.

The final approach taken in relation to the ‘solution or substitute’ positioning, could be called ‘doing without’, in which the brand claims that using it would allow consumers to do without the rationed product, when their ration ran out. For example, this was the approach taken by Ryvita (1940), in Figure 3, claiming that their brand was so good that it meant butter was not necessary. A similar approach was taken by Hovis (1940), again in relation to butter and Creamola Custard Pudding (1940) in relation to eggs.
The Ryvita advertisement in Figure 3 also contains a different execution from the other advertisements explored so far. Rather than a simple presentation of facts with supporting imagery, the advertisement features two women in conversation, which presents the information about how to make the best of rations. This could be considered to be an example of the technique of slice-of-life advertising, along with what Jones and Gerard (1967 cited by Moschis, 1976) describe as a “co-oriented peer”. This is defined by Moschis (1976, p. 237) as “an individual or groups whose outlook and values are similar to one’s own”. The women represent the housewives who were the most likely customers for the brand with the advice being given as if from a friend in a similar situation. It is easy to imagine that even in the early days of the war, this image would resonate with consumers, with conversations like this quickly becoming a part of the lives of the target audience as rationing, control and shortages increased.

The provision of information is a role of advertising, particularly in the case of high involvement purchase decisions, where the consumer has more incentive to seek and take in information (Petty, et al., 1983). While food would normally be considered a low involvement decision, it could be argued that during the Second World War, this changed. For example, according to Minns (1980, p. 89) “for women war workers, shopping was usually a nightmare” due to the need to fit shopping around shifts. Adding to this, the complexities of the rationing and control system and shortages of familiar foods or absence of favoured brands, it all meant that more thought and planning was needed by (mainly) women, than in the pre-war period. This point was made by Gardiner (2005, p. 181) who stated that “rationing was essentially something that women organised and mediated”.

There is a degree of overlap between certain positioning strategies and the provision of information. For example, between the making things go further aspect of the ‘solution or substitute’ positioning and the provision of information. While the first makes a claim that the brand can make other goods go further, the second shows how. This will however, be more relevant, particularly in the early years of the war, for advertisements relating to shortages generally, rather than rationing specifically in part, as
will be shown, because rationing of the product was not often explicitly mentioned, instead the short of the brand would be.

The provision of information, therefore can be seen as an important message style adopted by brands in response to rationing and to other aspects of control and shortages generally, as will be seen later in this paper. This information took a number of forms, though specifically in relation to rationing, it often centred on the administration of the process. For example, Figure 4 illustrates how Bassett’s Liquorice Allsorts, as well as using their brand character Bertie Bassett and familiar cartoon style to exhort customers to contribute to “Wings for Victory” and to “keep smiling” also informs them that this is the “2nd Week of Ration Period No. 9”. In the context of this research, the information message does not mean ‘general’ information, such as brand names or addresses, but instead only information specifically relevant to rationing, zoning, pooling, shortages or absent brands. As will be seen, beyond the area of rationing, quite complex information could be provided by advertising brands in response to zoning, pooling, shortages and absent brands. In some cases, for example, brands provided detailed information in the form of recipes, or even recipe books and services, as in the case of Stork Margarine (Clampin, 2014).

Food rationing was an attempt to control demand for various products in short supply, in order to maintain social order and to reduce price inflation (Longmate, 1971; Jobling, 2005). Other official efforts to interfere in the food and confectionary markets were made on the supply side, on firms themselves to control production and transport, and both had an impact on advertising; they were zoning and pooling.

Zoning

Along with pooling of brands, discussed later, zoning has received very little attention in the historiography, generally being hidden within the broader discussion of rationing. A major contribution of this paper will be to address this gap as well as discuss why the difference is important. According to Hammond (1954, p. 127) zoning was an “attempt to save transport by limiting the area within which a certain manufacturer’s goods might be distributed”. In effect it meant that the manufacturers of certain brands were limited to supplying customers in the area of the country in which the production facilities were located, to limit what would now be called the ‘food miles’, and hence the use of transport and fuel, associated with the brand. Hammond (1954) refers to syrup and treacle being zoned, while Brayley and McGregor (2005, p. 20) refer to ‘chocolate and other sweets’ being included in the scheme. A review of the advertising indicates that cakes (see Figure 5), biscuits and cereals were also zoned.

For brands, zoning presented a quite complex situation for their advertising to deal with. First, brands had to explain a new and complex system to their customers and how it affected the brand.
Second, they had try to sell their brand to one group of consumers who may still be able to purchase it, albeit in limited quantities, while trying to maintain brand awareness and keep a good image with another, larger group who could not obtain the brand. Compared to brands which were simply rationed, the need for information was therefore much greater. As Figure 5 demonstrates, in some cases part of the burden of educating consumers was taken on by temporary industry bodies, such as the Cake and Biscuits Manufacturers War Time Alliance Ltd., created to support the industry during the war.

More transport released by Cake Zoning

In order to release more transport for essential war work a Zoning scheme for Cake is now in operation. Cake Manufacturers will confine their distribution to the zones allotted to them, thus saving not only time but road transportation, with a corresponding saving in man-power.

This may mean the cake which you have been accustomed to may not now be available. But of this you can be assured: all cake is wholesome and nourishing.

Issued by the Cake and Biscuit Manufacturers War Time Alliance Ltd., in explanation of the zoning and distribution plan affecting Cake and their Confectionery.

Figure 5 Industry Zoning Advertisements, April and June 1943 (Cake and Biscuit Manufacturers War Time Alliance, 1943; Chocolate and Sugar Confectionary (War Time) Association, 1943)

The use of a map to illustrate the zones by brands such as Fox’s Glacier Mints and Vita-Weat crispbread continued at least into 1944, as shown in Figure 6. This illustrates that even once the initial scheme was in place, and had been for a while, brands still felt the need to explain where they were, and hence were not, available. In part this need could be a result of in-consistency between the schemes. For example, comparing the three maps in Figures 5b, and 6 indicates that the zones were not consistent across different industries. For example, the Vita-Weat advertisement indicates that for crispbreads there are only two zones and the Southern Zone extends up to The Wash and incorporates much of the Midlands. For sweets and chocolates, however, there are four zones and the Southern Zone stops on the approximate northern border of Essex and extends on a slightly erratic, but generally east-west line across the country. It is likely that this would have caused some confusion for consumers, particularly if the zones for other products were different, necessitating the continuing use of the maps.
This represents the next message type used by brands in relation to control, shortages and absences of brands, the ‘explanation for shortage / absence’. In the case of Fox’s Glacier Mints, the explanation is relatively implicit, rather than explicit; by stating ‘we are not available in the southern, western and Scottish zones’ the brand specifies the zone where the brand is available. By stating “the whole of our output is being delivered into the EASTERN Zone” they offer what could be termed an explanation by omission. Vita-Weat, using the brand characters Mr Peek and Mr Frean, take a more explicit approach, but again concentrate on the presence on the brand in one zone rather than its absence from the other. Explanations do not appear on the list of positioning strategies provided by Burridge in relation to rationing advertisements, possibly in part because brands did not need to explain rationing, since it affected the demand for the product, rather than the supply of the brands. This indicates the importance of considering zoning separately from rationing, since different messages were required by brands to deal with the consequences of different forms of control. This recognition of the role of explanations is another contribution of this paper.

As Figure 7 shows, some brands, in this case Fox’s Glacier Mints and Bassett’s Liquorice Allsorts also used some of their advertisements to apologise to their customers in the zones where they were not available and to retain brand awareness for when the brands would be available everywhere again. The apologies in these advertisements were used in relation to zoning, but not in relation to rationing, even though, as Figure 4 shows, chocolates and sweets were also rationed. As will be seen, apologies were used in relation to other causes of brand shortages or absence but not rationing. The two advertisements illustrate that an apology could either be a major part of the advertisement, in the case of Figure 7a, or almost an afterthought as in Figure 7b.
Figure 7 Fox’s Glacier Mints and Bassett’s Liquorice Allsorts Advertisements. (Fox’s Glacier Mints, 1943; Bassett’s Liquorice Allsorts, 1944)

In both cases however, there is the implication that the zoning of the brand is playing a part in ending the war, although the Bassett’s advertisement links the return more to progress in the war, while Fox’s Glacier Mints merely refers to the return of the brand to the whole country in more oblique terms. This is possibly because the Bassett’s advertisement appears later in the war after the D-Day invasion when victory seemed certain. Additionally, the placing of Bertie Bassett in the position of a British soldier, which was consistent throughout the war, allowed an association with the war effort, which Fox’s Glacier Mints could not match. Brand characters in a number of sectors often had a role to play in ensuring the brand “remains at the forefront of the audience’s thoughts” (Herskovitz and Crystal, 2010, p. 21).

While shortages of a brand meant that supplies may be limited or intermittent, it was still reasonable for brands to advise customers to seek out the brand or wait for it to come into stock (as indicated by Burridge’s, 2008, positioning strategies). The need to maintain loyalty and brand awareness was important, but could be reinforced by at least occasional use and some degree of visibility. For brands which were zoned, however, most consumers would not be able to get the brand at all until the end of war. This leads to one of the main roles of advertising during the Second World War, helping brands attempt “to keep their names before the public, even though their goods might not be available” (Nevett, 1982, p.169). In these cases mentions of the return of the brand gave consumers a reason to remember it, while the use of brand imagery and characters, such as the Fox’s bear and Bertie Bassett, acted as a heuristic for brand memories and feelings.

Arguably this was even more important in the absolute absence of those brands in industries which had been pooled.

Pooling
As stated earlier the pooling of brands has received limited attention in the historiography, even though it had an impact on some major products, for example margarine. In the margarine industry, it involved what
Brady (1950, p. 456) however, notes that this was “merely the new name for the Joint Executive Committee of the [Edible Oil Association of England and Scotland]”, which was likely to have made the process of zoning in this case at least run more smoothly.

Pooling impacted on advertising in two main ways. First through advertisements for the original brands and second for the newly created “national brand”. The most common advertiser among the “de-branded” brands, was Stork Margarine, which along with the other margarine brands, was subsumed into Marcom. Stork continued to advertise across the whole war (and in the period after the war when rationing and pooling continued). In August 1940, “in order to keep the name alive” (Harvey, 1991, p. 12) and “in an effort to add value to the Stork brand” (Clampin, 2014, p. 52), Stork introduced the Stork Margarine Cookery Service. The announcement was made through “a modest press campaign” (Harvey, 1991, p.12), such as Figure 8 below. The language used, stating that the brand “joins up” along with the imagery of the Stork brand character standing in a military manner with a rifle and helmet, gives a clear implication that the disappearance of the brand was intended to aid the war effort. This is language and imagery that would have been familiar to consumers at the time, both from the First and Second World Wars. This, similar to the use of Bertie Bassett discussed earlier, is a clear attempt to position the disappearance of the brand as a positive thing, a necessary sacrifice to win the war. Stork’s use of their character in this way however, was only temporary, as can be seen in Figure 8b, as opposed to Bassett’s more consistent portrayal of Bertie Bassett as a British soldier.

What Stork also did was begin to make use of another positioning strategy outlined by Burridge (2008) (see Table II), specifically ‘brand is currently unavailable - provision of a substitute service’. Indeed, Burridge uses this campaign as an example of this positioning strategy. However, Burridge discusses this in relation to the rationing of margarine and other products, more than the disappearance of Stork. Stork itself was absent (more detail on absent brands will be given later) due to pooling so could not serve as a solution or a substitute for rationed products, but by providing expertise to consumers, in the form of ‘a substitute service’, the brand provided a solution to the problems caused by control and shortages. The hope being that as the war progressed and the service solved more of the consumers’ problems the name would be associated with expertise and gain other positive associations of helpfulness at a time of need. While the associations actually made are impossible to judge so many years after the war, it is clear that the number of consumers seeking help from the service increased, from 10,000 in 1940 “to 1 million by 1947” (Harvey, 1991, p. 12). In part this success is likely to have resulted from the flexibility of the service, adapting to different seasons, different levels of food supply and as in Figure 8b, a variety of food types, both rationed and not (Harvey, 1991).

This approach of promoting the individual brand outside of the pooled product was not unique to Stork, although Stork were the only pooled brand in the two newspapers to advertise consistently over the course of the war. Other brands began to advertise in the later years of the war, anticipating their return, when victory began to seem more certain. Kraft Cheese (1943) for example, advertised in late 1943, apologising that “there’s no Kraft Cheese now being made!”, using a similar approach to Stork (see Figure 9), of providing a recipe for consumers, without explicitly mentioning pooling. In this case though, Kraft implies pooling, stating that “Kraft plants [are] making cheeses, but not Kraft”. In fact, cheese was pooled under an organisation called BACAL as margarine was under MARCOM (Nicol, 2009). Kraft’s approach differs slightly from the Stork Cookery Service by concentrating on recipes that use the product (if not the specific brand) being advertised, a likely attempt to reposition cheese as “a main dish”, which would be likely to increase sales of cheese after the war. These advertisements also feature an apology.

Pooling also affected the advertising messages used by the new industry bodies. As these new entities did not have any direct competition, their only purpose in advertising would be to inform consumers of the new situation and persuade them that the new brand was worth buying. As J. W. Fletcher of the Co-operative Society (cited by Harrison and Madge, 1940, p. 371) noted in 1940, in relation to the pooling of margarine, consumers had “no confidence” in the pooled brand and viewed it as “a poor substitute, not only for butter, but for the brand of margarine with which she has been satisfied for many years”. As this was written in 1940, it is likely that the government had noted this problem by the time other industries were pooled, hence the efforts of the industry bodies to promote the pooled brand.

Figure 10 illustrates how the pooled Soft Drink Industry (S.D.I.) used advertising to persuade consumers of the value of the new pooled brand. Figure 10 also indicates that as well as being pooled, soft drinks were also zoned and points out, in a simple, informative advertisement the benefits of the system.
Figure 8 Stork Margarine Cookery Service Advertisements. (Stork Margarine Cookery Service, 1940a; 1940b)
The importance of rationing to Second World War advertising is clear, and while the other elements of control, zoning and pooling arguably have less influence, they still have a major impact. For example, as this paper shows, zoning and pooling both required explanation and apologies. Perhaps however, shortages had a greater influence than both.

Shortages
As Gardiner (2005, p. 22) points out “just because something was not rationed, it did not mean it was in plentiful supply – quite the reverse”, in fact as Longmate (1971, p.22) states, “there was a great deal of nothing about”. In fact, more advertisements mentioned some aspect of shortages than mentioned rationing. There are two issues that need to be noted about this difference. Firstly, there is some degree of overlap between mentions of rationing and shortages, as some advertisements will mention both. For example, Palm Toffee, which was discussed earlier had positioned itself as a way to replace sugar in children’s diets, was one of the few brands to specifically announce it was rationed. The explicit positioning of the brand as a replacement for sugar had been replaced, once sweets were rationed, with a more oblique link that the brand “strengthens, sustains”, as Figure 11 shows. This Palm Toffee advertisement specifically mentioned they were rationed, but also requests that disappointed customers “Don’t blame the shopkeeper”, a sub-set of the ‘Wait for supplies, be patient’ message, illustrated in Table III. Secondly, quite often advertisements for products which were rationed, would quite often not mention rationing, but rather say that the brand was in short supply. This seems at first glance to be odd, however it does fit with the discussion of Burridge’s (2008) positioning strategies listed in Table II. Most of the advertisements discussed in his study which mentioned rationing adopted the Burridge (2008) strategy of ‘the product is available and a solution or substitute for a rationed good’ position. Therefore, it was brands which were not rationed products which mentioned rationing. For the rationed...
products themselves, the rationing was not mentioned, possibly because it was imposed at product level and on the consumers rather than impacting the brand particularly.

Figure 10 Soft Drinks Industry Advertisement, (Soft Drink Industry, 1944)

Figure 11 Palm Toffee Advertisement, (Palm Toffee 1941)
A number of different messages relating to shortages appeared across the war, though they varied in popularity across the whole period. The most consistent message to appear throughout the whole war was related to ‘Making things go further / make do and mend’. In fact, before November 1939, no other messages related to shortages appeared at all. Before more detailed discussion of some of the messages which appeared, it is also important to note that as Burridge (2008, p. 391) states, “an advert can do more than one thing at a time” and so, as will be shown, quite often advertisements carried more than one message about shortages at a time.

These messages are different from Burridge’s positioning strategies and represent a contribution to the historiography. Extrapolated from Burridge’s strategies, the messages in Table III represent a number of different responses to various forms of market control and causes of shortages. The rest of the paper will explore these messages and indicate which aspects of control and shortages they were used in response to.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Message</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Brand is not rationed</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Doing without</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Information</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Explanation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Apology</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>After the war / victory</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Be patient and wait for supplies</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Be patient with the shopkeeper</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Making products last / go further</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Make do and mend</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table III Advertising Messages Relating to Market Control and Shortages

**Make Things Go Further / Make Do and Mend**

The most common rationing and shortages related messages concerned making things go further or to make do and mend. There is an overlap here with the ‘solution or substitute’ positioning strategy identified by Burridge (2008), in that some of these messages relate to the brands used to support other products that are rationed. As discussed earlier, this included “the producers of sauces, meat extracts, condiments and soups” (Clampin, 2009, p. 60) who positioned their brands as being useful in making wartime diets more interesting and making the limited available food go further. An example of this is Bisto explicitly claiming to “make the most of your ration” (Figure 12).
Rowntree’s Cocoa added the claim that their brand made “every meal go further” soon after the war began (Rowntrees, 1939a), using a similar positioning to their pre-war claim (Rowntrees, 1939b), which was just about stretching budget.

Other brands used the approach of positioning themselves as alternatives to products in short supply, similar to Burridge’s (2008) first positioning strategy, throughout the war, for example Weetabix (1940) and Kellogg’s Corn Flakes (1943), positioned themselves as a way to save both fuel and bacon, since they could replace the traditional British breakfast choice of bacon and eggs (Clampin, 2014, citing the Statistical Review of Press Advertising). Also Clampin (2014, citing the Statistical Review of Press Advertising) indicates that Kellogg’s Corn Flakes had the biggest increase in advertising spend in late 1939, from £15 to £3,009, in response to the announcement of the rationing of bacon on 1 November 1939. The positioning of cereals as an alternative to traditional cooked breakfasts continued throughout the war, even after cereals were rationed themselves in 1942 (Mackay, 2003), as shown in Figure 13. The Kellogg’s Corn Flakes advertisement, from January 1943, includes another tactic used by many advertisers, to help consumers deal with shortages, providing instructions on how to make up for shortages in other products or how to make the brand either last longer or be more useful. As discussed earlier, the provision of information is common in advertising for high involvement purchasing decisions.

Rather than make suggestions about other products, some brands in short supply actually suggested that consumers make the brand itself last or use it sparingly and sometimes gave advice on how to do that. This is discussed as a separate message, as it is not a position that the brand is attempting to achieve, rather it is an attempt to extend usage. This ‘make the brand last / use sparingly’ message begins to become relatively common at the end of 1940 and the beginning of 1941. From the point of view of the brand this served a double purpose, firstly it portrayed a patriotic message of self-denial and secondly it reduced the risk of consumers trying (and perhaps liking) competitor brands. In some cases these were fairly straightforward, a Mars Bar and Starry Way (1942) campaign suggested cutting the bars into sections to make them last longer. Other brands offered more complex instructions often in the form of recipes, frequently including ways for brands, such as Weetabix (1941), to be used in unfamiliar ways to extend limited food supplies. In some cases the brand simply suggested that consumers use less of the brand, for example a number of chocolate brands beginning in 1941 asked consumers to “leave it for the children” (for example, Fry’s, 1941a).
Finally some advertisements simply referred to the ‘Make do and Mend’ campaign. In some cases these were actually quite general branding advertisements, seeking to associate a brand that was absent or in short supply with a patriotic campaign, as in Figure 14.

In some advertisements using the ‘make do and mend’ message, there was little direct relevance to the brand, as in the case of Quick Quaker Oats, although the comparison to “cheerfully accepting the ‘next best’” does create a link. This is an attempt by the brand to prevent consumers permanently switching to the new brands they were forced to try by the absence of Quick Quaker Oats.
While the ‘making products go further / make do and mend’ message was the most common at the beginning of the war, by the beginning of 1941, this had changed. Messages relating to patience and to explanations for shortages began to become more prevalent.

*Wait For Supplies / Be Patient / Be Patient with Retailers*

As with the Quaker advertisement, it is likely that part of the reason for brands asking for patience from consumers in this way, is an attempt to prevent brand switching. As will be seen however, most of the ‘be patient’ messages do not mention explicitly that the brand will be back soon, simply that patience is needed.

The confectionary sector made most use of the ‘patience with shopkeepers’ message from December 1940 and the first few months of 1941. In part this is because of the large number of individual brands owned by single organisations in the confectionary sector. In particular Rowntree, as illustrated by Figure 16, produced a number of different brands, each of which asked customers to be patient with shopkeepers when stocks were short, and each of whose advertisements appeared in both papers. Mass Observation (MO) diaries and publications give an indication why these messages were considered necessary. For example, shopkeeper S.J. Cartey’s MO diary for 5 and 8 February 1941 indicates that on both these days he was “unable to supply” “nearly every other person who comes into the shop” (Cartey, 1941). That these problems could lead to confrontations between customers and retailer is illustrated by Kathleen Hey’s published MO diary (Hey, 2016), which indicates the level of abuse some shopkeepers were subject to from customers frustrated at not being able to get the products they want. According to “one girl observer who serves in her father’s shop” this could even sometimes escalate to violence (Harrison and Madge, 1940, p. 128).

It can be seen, however, that these messages of patience from Rowntree are much more low-key than that from Palm Toffee in Figure 11. Rather than being a central part of the message, the request...
for ‘patience with shopkeepers’ appears only at the bottom of each advertisement, using almost identical language. The request, “don’t blame the shopkeeper” is followed by a claim that both the shopkeeper and the brand “do their best to keep a fair supply all over the country with the materials available”. What is likely is that this difference is because the Palm Toffee advertisements were from individual brand campaigns, each with its own message, relating to the patience message. However, those in Figure 16 are from different brands within the same organisation, with different main messages that are not about patience. Whatever the reason, it seems that these discreet messages would be more likely to be missed by consumers, though the repetition of the messages in different advertisements, would have compensated for that a little by increasing the opportunities to see the message.

**Explanation for Shortages**

The final major message to appear in advertisements in relation to shortages, concerned explanations for shortages and to a related but lesser extent apologies. While a variety of industry sectors included explanations for shortages in their messages, it was the confectionary and the food and drink sectors that both made the most use of explanations and used them most consistently.

The use of explanations began in earnest in September 1940, and took a variety of different forms. For example Figure 15, illustrates the “brand is so good that it is more necessary than ever, so demand exceeds our ability to supply it under wartime conditions” explanation, implying that it is not in short supply, but is rather experiencing excess demand. This is similar to Burridge’s (2008) ‘Product is available, because it is ‘essential’” positioning strategy, although it concentrates on the demand side of the market, rather than the supply side. The Cadbury’s advertisement in Figure 17a illustrates two different explanations in that it mentions limitation of supplies of raw materials (in this case caused by rationing) and other demands on those goods the brand could produce, identified vaguely as “government orders”. Some brands use both, for example, Fry’s (1941b) although, as Fry’s was a subsidiary of Cadbury (Fitzgerald, 2005) it is not surprising that they would share the same message. Other brands, however use either the ‘government work’ explanation, such as Shredded Wheat or the limited supplies of raw materials, such as ‘Camp’ Coffee (1941). Again, these were messages which were used throughout the war, linking the shortage of the brand to the war effort, and hence acceptance of the shortages becomes a patriotic duty. As Figure 17c indicates, the linkage to ‘government work’ evolved as the end of the war came closer to become more specific about the use to which the government was putting the brand.

The advertisement for Tyne Brand Products in Figure 17b gives another quite common explanation for shortages, government restrictions. In some cases there were, as here, restrictions on what can be made, or on what can be sold. An alternative approach is shown in Figure 17c, which combines an implication that the brand is helping the war effort with an attempt to position the brand as endorsed by the armed forces.

Explanations for shortages were quite common, as were explanations for brands which were absent.
Absent Brands

The government control of the market resulted in either the total or partial absence (either for a short period of time or in certain parts of Britain) of some brands. Zoning for example, meant, as discussed above, that brands in several industries such as margarine and soft drinks disappeared. Other brands disappeared as ingredients disappeared.

As discussed earlier, some brands, such as Stork and Quick Quaker Oats, attempted to maintain a presence in the consumers’ lives during the brand’s absence, while other brands which were absent simply stopped advertising, either for the duration or until close to the end. Some absent brands, such as Meltis “New Berry” Fruits simply looked ahead to the end of the war for their return (for example, Meltis “New Berry” Fruits, 1941), while others used military imagery to explain where the brand was. As has been mentioned, this was an attempt to position the brand with the war effort to remind consumers about its existence and maintain positive feelings about it for when it returned.

For some brands as the war developed their absence was a strategy of the brand to avoid negative brand associations, by changing its name and branding rather than produce an inferior product, as a result of shortages of raw materials. An example of this was when Cadbury produced Ration Chocolate once the government banned the use of whole milk in chocolate (Figure 18a). In cases like these advertising was needed to announce the change and simultaneously link the new brand to the old, while at the same differentiating them. The hope would be that customers of the original brand would transfer to the new.
but would also recognise that it would not be up to the same standard as the original, so no negative associations would transfer back.

“Don’t Blame the Shopkeeper!!”

A number of confectionary brands took this approach, including Cadbury, launching the new Ration Chocolate and KitKat Chocolate Crisp which became Kit Kat (Figure 18b), a name which has survived, albeit slightly adapted, to this day. The Ration Chocolate advertisement points out that “there’s none too much of it” and requests self-restraint on the part of customers, to “only ask for it if you really need it,” again demonstrating how two messages can appear in the same advertisement.

**Conclusions**

While the impact of the war on the availability, or lack thereof, of goods and services for the consumer has been discussed quite extensively in the historiography, little is known about the causes of this lack of availability. While rationing and shortages have been covered, other forms of control such as zoning and pooling have largely been ignored, possibly because their effect on consumers was in many ways so similar. However, this paper provides fresh insight into both shortages and the different forms of control such as zoning and pooling and illustrates that the effect on both brands and their advertising was very different. The reason for this is simple, brands were not in short supply because they were rationed rather they were rationed because they were in short supply.
This paper also contributes to the historiography by first highlighting the different forms of control the government used in the Second World War and then discussing the specific ways advertisers in the food, drink and confectionary sectors reacted to these controls. Table IV lists these forms of control in a new Advertising Message Framework, along with shortages and absent brands, and indicates which messages were used in relation to them.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Message</th>
<th>Rationing</th>
<th>Zoning</th>
<th>Pooling</th>
<th>Shortages</th>
<th>Absent Brands</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Brand is not rationed</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Doing without</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Information</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Explanation</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Apology</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>After the war / victory</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Be patient and wait for supplies</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Be patient with the shopkeeper</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Making products last / go further</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table IV Advertising Message Framework

The Advertising Message Framework indicates that the widest variety of messages were used in relation to both rationing and shortages, suggesting why there has been a concentration on rationing in the historiography. However, zoning, pooling and the simple absence of brands all prompted a variety of advertising messages designed to keep consumers informed about, reminded of and interested in, brands.

References


Bisto. (1940a). “In These Days ...” Daily Express, 5 December, p. 3.


Sutton, Stroud, UK.
Cake and Biscuit Manufacturers War Time Alliance. (1943). “More Transport Released by Cake Zoning”, *Daily Express*, 21 April, p. 3.
Fry's. (1941b). “Where is all This Chocolate Going?”, *Daily Express*, 1 September, p. 4.
Kit Kat. (1941). “No more Chocolate Crisp till after the war”, *Daily Express*, 14 August, p. 2.
Nicol, P. (2009), Sucking eggs: what your wartime granny could teach you about diet, thrift and going green, Chatto & Windus, London, UK.
Tyne Brand Products. (1940). “Get them when you can! – they are still the best”, Daily Express, 7 November, p. 3.
Weetabix. (1940). “You’ll be better off with a little less meant if you eat more Weetabix”, Daily Express, 4 April, p. 3.
Abstract

**Purpose** - The paper traces the making and marketing of Thomson, his myth and his art, up to the 1950s. It argues that family members, fellow artists, Canadian art institutions and patron Dr. J.M. MacCallum, acting as ‘citizen marketers’ collaborated to establish and maintain the reputation of Tom Thomson. In order to do so, they shaped his story to conform to the classic tragic hero myth.

**Design/methodology/approach** – traditional historical narrative approach based on archival research.

**Research limitation/implications** – digital copies of archival records were used.

**Keywords** - arts marketing history, Tom Thomson, Canadian art.

**Paper Type** – research paper.

On July 8th, 1917, Canadian artist Tom Thomson paddled his grey-green canoe away from Mowat Lodge, in Ontario’s Algonquin Park, and out onto Canoe Lake. It was the last time he would be seen alive. A few hours later, an overturned grey-green canoe was spotted off Big Wapameo Island by a family of summer visitors on a fishing trip. When this sighting was reported the next morning to Shannon Fraser, owner of Mowat Lodge, he recognized the distinctively colored canoe as Thomson’s. By Tuesday morning, July 10th, an alarmed Fraser initiated the search for Thomson by informing Park Ranger Mark Robinson’s office that Thomson was missing. That same day, Fraser sent telegrams to Thomson’s family in Owen Sound and to his patron, Dr. James MacCallum, in Toronto. The telegrams read simply, “Tom’s canoe found upside down. No trace of Tom since Sunday.” [1]

Thus began one of the ‘great unsolved mysteries in Canadian history’ [2]. How Thomson died, under what circumstances and even where his body was finally laid to rest, after it surfaced eight days later, remain unanswered questions. Over the intervening years, the legend of Tom Thomson has continued to fascinate academic researchers, journalists, art lovers and other Canadians [3]. It is of interest to economic, business and marketing historians because the making and marketing of Thomson serves as an historical example of the construction of an iconic brand. Sherrill Grace (2004) has argued that interest in Thomson has fluctuated over the last 100 years, with a wave of interest following his mysterious death until the first biography in the 1930s, a lapse until the 1950s, and fairly steady interest since. If this is so, it provides us with an excellent opportunity to examine what actions caused the uptick in interest, and thus by extension, to identify the processes involved in creating a cultural icon.

Tom Thomson was a friend and forerunner of the Group of Seven, artists who sought to establish an art that was truly Canadian. Born in Claremont, Ontario in 1877, Thomson worked as a successful commercial artist in both Canada and the United States (Murray, 1991). In the last five years of his life he produced the body of art work on which part of his legend as a Canadian art icon is based. The recent ‘Masterpiece in Focus’ exhibition of Thomson’s paintings *The West Wind* and *The Jack Pine* at the National Art Gallery in Ottawa described the works as “iconic images… representing the grandeur and beauty of a uniquely Canadian environment.” That his work was good and “closely identifiable with the spirit of Canada” (Harris, 1948, p. 39) is an argument that has been well-established. But that alone can’t account for his iconic position almost 100 years later. The first purpose of this paper is to investigate what other forces were at play in establishing Thomson as “the most legendary of Canadian artists” (Cameron, 1999, p. 185).

Tom Thomson is more than an icon in the art world – he has become a brand whose meaning resonates with Canadian values and ideology. What went into the making and marketing of the Tom Thomson ‘brand’? I will argue that family members, fellow artists, Canadian art institutions and his patron, Dr. J.M. MacCallum, worked to establish and maintain the reputation of Tom Thomson. None of these people were professional marketers, instead they operated as ‘citizen marketers’, performing many of the tasks traditionally assumed by channel intermediaries in the art world. The image they created of Thomson takes its form from the characteristics of the tragic hero as explicated by another
Canadian icon, literary critic Northrop Frye. Thomson-the-brand speaks to us because its brand personality [4] has been scripted to highlight the parallels between Thomson’s life and development as an artist and that of the nation his paintings came to represent – Canada.

What Becomes an Icon?
Does Thomson qualify to be considered an icon? The Canadian Oxford Dictionary (Barber, 1998, p. 701) among its definitions of the word ‘icon’ includes “an object of particular admiration, especially as a representative symbol of something.” How much and what kind of admiration must an object receive to be considered ‘iconic’? Emeritus Professor of the History of Art, Martin Kemp (2012, p. 3), argues that the adjective ‘iconic’ has been applied so liberally to people and things of passing celebrity as to become debased and meaningless. He prefers instead to distinguish between the ‘very famous’ and the ‘iconic’ by suggesting that:

An iconic image is one that has achieved wholly exceptional levels of widespread recognizability and has come to carry a rich series of varied associations for very large numbers of people across time and cultures, such that it has to a greater or lesser degree transgressed the parameters of its initial making, function, context, and meaning… the very famous still tends to reside within the parameters of reference that governed its original making.

Kemp goes on to note that truly iconic images “accrece legends to a prodigious degree” and that “an extraordinary image demands an extraordinary explanation, ideally involving some kind of ‘secret’.”

Among his examples of iconic things, people and images, Kemp includes the Coca-Cola bottle, Che Guevara and Da Vinci’s Mona Lisa. He draws attention to the way that Guevara, and especially certain stylized images of Guevara based on Alberto Korda’s 1960 photographic portrait, have come to embody youthful idealism and passionate rebellion. Guevara’s positioning as a ‘rebel with a cause’ appealed to a generation of American students who were politicized by the war in Vietnam. In explaining the appeal of the Mona Lisa, Kemp (2012, p. 142) notes that “some artists can make their image live in an uncanny way that transcends the inert material they are using… It is a question of working the spectator’s mechanisms of perception, of giving them enough to see what is needed but not giving them so much that they have nothing left to do.” Kemp’s writing is useful to the current exercise in that it establishes, first, the possibility that both a person/artist and product/artwork may become icons and also because it points to characteristics of each which may tend to make them more susceptible to becoming iconic.

An initial examination of Thomson as icon suggests that in many ways he fulfills Kemp’s definition. Although his work was originally known only to a small group of people – colleagues he worked with at Rous & Mann [5] and Grip Limited, prominent design and photo-engraving shops in Toronto – with the exhibition of his first major canvas, A Northern Lake, at the 1913 Ontario Society of Artists Exhibition, Thomson met with unusual commercial success. The painting was purchased by the Government of Ontario [6]. That painting, and others which followed, have come to symbolize the Canadian nation. Today, “his paintings are frequently reproduced as symbols of the Canadian nation in such varied forms as postage stamps, coins, coasters, and posters. They are iconic in Canada… Thomson is, for many, the important Canadian artist…” (Cameron, 1999, p. 185). Interestingly, artist, art work and legend blend together to create this iconic brand. In 1947, fellow artist Arthur Lismer wrote of visiting a school and asking the pupils to name one Canadian artist, “The answer came immediately Jack Pine! The integration of personality and subject was complete” (p. 62).

How are Icons Made?
How did Thomson become an iconic figure? Sherrill Grace (2004, p. 6) observes that the Tom Thomson we think we know has in fact been ‘invented’ by many creators, each using his life story as the raw material for their cultural output [7]. In a way, Thomson was ripe for (re)invention. As Grace further explicates (2004, p. 3), “[B]ecause he was so little known in his lifetime and left so little behind him in personal markers of identity (few letters, no memoirs, no journals; no intimate friends, spouse, or children), it is easy for others to imagine the man and invent a life for him; his outlines is there, full of suggestion, but it is empty, inviting others to fill in the gaps.” This quote is reminiscent of Kemp’s (2012, p. 142) comments about giving spectators of an art work “enough to see what is needed but not giving them so much that they have nothing left to do.” Biographers, playwrights, poets, novelists, filmmakers, visual artists, art historians and curators, musicians, and television scriptwriters have all mined the deep vein that is Tom Thomson.

I want to focus on this process of invention or construction. Howard Becker (1974) challenged the idea that great art is created by artistic geniuses, individuals specially endowed by the gods,
demonstrating instead that it is the outcome of a network of collaborators. I want to focus on the how, how did a network of people including Thomson’s artist friends, his patron, his biographer and others shape Thomson’s legend into an iconic brand. I will argue that one of the reasons the making and marketing of Thomson works so well is that it shaped him, perhaps quite unwittingly, into the form of the tragic hero.

Consumer researcher Barbara Stern (1995, p. 165) introduced the field to Northrop Frye’s Anatomy of Criticism (1957) by describing it as a “comprehensive classification of all [western] myth narratives into four great categories associated with nature’s seasons and the human life cycle: comedy/spring (birth), romance/summer (growth, gestation), tragedy/autumn (maturity), and irony/winter (death).” Stern suggested that by closely examining the myths contained in consumer’s stories (plot, heroes), we might uncover the values that advertising stories tap. In similar fashion, if we analyze the mythic plot of Thomson’s life, as it was constructed by his friends, family and admirers, we may uncover the source of his iconic position.

Following Frye, then, at the center of the tragic myth form is the hero’s isolation. The tragic hero is fated to suffer; his focus is on internal battles and self-confrontation. Located somewhere between the divine and the all-too-human, the tragic nature of the hero’s story is linked to maturity and gaining wisdom. The plot of the tragic myth form focuses on serious events and conflict which situated the protagonist in opposition to fate or the Gods. The tragic hero is doomed by a ‘fatal flaw’. The ending of the tragic myth is often gory and at best is ambiguous (Stern, 1995). Given this ‘template’, we can investigate the ways in which Thomson was transformed into Thomson-as-iconic-brand.

The Making of Tom Thomson

The making of the Tom Thomson legend began even before his body was found. An article in The Globe newspaper on July 13th (Anonymous, 1917) called him “one of the most talented of the younger artists in the city”, noting how he had “risen rapidly in esteem: and suggesting that “his interpretation of the north…could only come from a deep love of nature.” The article goes on to state that Thomson’s painting, Northern River, had not only attracted attention at the Ontario Society of Artists Exhibition, but had been purchased by the National Gallery, in Ottawa [8]. The article thus positions Thomson in two ways, first as a ‘natural man’ with a deep knowledge of and comfortable in nature and, second, as a talented artist whose work had met with high approbation. Although uncredited, Neil Lehto has argued, I think convincingly, that the article could only have come from Dr. MacCallum.

Dr. James MacCallum was a Toronto ophthalmologist and faculty member at the University of Toronto. “Comfortably but not fabulously wealthy” (Vance, 2009, p. 288), he nevertheless became a patron of several members of the Group of Seven who he met through Lawren Harris, a fellow member of the Toronto Arts & Letters Club. MacCallum’s cottage on Georgian Bay became the base from which several Group members painted during the summers. J.E.H. MacDonald visited during the summers of 1911 and 1912; Arthur Lismer lived and painted on MacCallum’s houseboat in 1913, and Thomson used the cottage as his base during the summer of 1914 (MacCallum, 1918; Mason, 1996; Vance, 2009). Together, Harris and MacCallum bought land on Severn Street in Toronto and shared the costs of erecting a studio building. When MacCallum met A.Y. Jackson in 1913, he was sufficiently impressed by his work to offer him space in the studio building and purchase enough of his work to support him for a year. He later made the same offer to Thomson, in whose work he had a special interest. A.Y. Jackson (1943) would later comment that, “It was the Doctor’s unswerving belief in the genius of Tom Thomson that kept that artist going” [9]. Indeed, MacCallum was an important component of the network behind the creation of the Thomson legend.

MacCallum would eventually own the largest collection of Thomson’s work and would work tirelessly after the artist’s death to ensure his art work received the attention he felt it deserved. Jonathan Vance (2009, p. 289-90) comments that

MacCallum took upon himself to help the family by promoting Thomson’s work. He convinced the Montreal Museum of Art to buy a major work in 1922, but had less luck with the Art Gallery of Toronto; it acquired The West Wind in 1926, but only as a gift from Canadian Club of Toronto. So perturbed was MacCallum with the Toronto gallery’s disinterest that he contacted. Eric Brown at the National Gallery of Canada and offered him his entire collection, 134 works in all, including eighty-three by Tom Thomson. When MacCallum died in 1943, the paintings went to Ottawa, a memorial to the Group but also to the patron who made it possible for them to paint as much as they did.

Canadian curator and art historian Dennis Reid (1969, p. 7) described MacCallum’s efforts on Thomson’s behalf as “the natural culmination of an almost paternal concern for Tom Thomson, and of
his selfless desire to establish that painter’s place in the National Collection and thus in the continuing history of Canadian art.” Reid goes on to note that after Thomson’s death,

…there was a real sense of mission in his systematic propagandizing… There is no doubt that, to the Doctor, Thomson represented something of an artistic ideal, and that in his opinion, Tom as the greatest of the artists in the new movement. A.Y. Jackson has related how ‘after Thomson’s tragic death Dr. MacCallum became a kind of Patron Saint to the Group of Seven. He lived in a house with the walls covered with Thomson’s sketches and loved to show them to his visitors.’

There is no doubt that MacCallum was a major shaper and contributor to the Thomson myth.

According to Frye, at the very center of the tragic myth form is the hero’s isolation. In Thomson’s case, this meant a physical isolation which saw him living and working close to nature for part of the year and retreating into his own space upon his return to the city. Although Thomson welcomed company at times both his patron MacCallum (1918), and his fellow painter Lawren Harris (1948), speak of this desire to be away from the city and in the wilds. MacCallum (1918, p. 375) characterized Thomson as “a unique personality… Living in the woods and even when in town avoiding the haunts of artists…He lived his own life, did his work in his own way, and died in the land of his dearest visions.” Arthur Lismer (1947, p. 61), who joined Thomson on more than one occasion during his summer painting trips, says Thomson, “brooded and thought alone, seeking seclusion, finding companionship in the friendliness of things like skylines and weather.” Harris (1948, p. 32) explains that although he, Jackson and MacDonald all had studios in the purpose-built studio building, “it was altogether too pretentious” for Thomson. Instead, a ‘shack’ was fixed up with a new roof, floor, window, electricity and stove. Thomson moved in, building an easel and what furniture he needed.

It is perhaps in Blodwen Davies’s biography of Thomson that the image of him as ‘at home in nature’ is most strongly depicted [10]. Her biography is replete with examples illustrating Thomson’s knowledge of the natural world, such as this:

At one time when he was camping with Thomson, Arthur Lismer remarked that he had never seen a porcupine. Thomson disappeared and then returned presently for Lismer and led him quietly to a place where a family of them could be observed. “There’s your porcupines,” said Thomson. At another time, they were paddling back to camp at dusk when Thomson suggested that they pause a while. “If we wait for about half an hour, we’ll see some deer here,” he said. Lismer was willing but skeptical. Very soon four deer came down to the water’s edge to drink and they had an excellent view of them (Davies, 1967, p. 48).

Davies (1967, p. 48) portrayed Thomson as comfortable inhabiting isolated places and at ease with wild animals:

A relative once asked him if he was not afraid to be alone in the bush with so many wild animals about. “Why, no, of course not,” was his reply, “for the wild animals are our friends. I have picked raspberries on one side of a log while a big black bear picked them on the other side.” Then he went on to tell of an experience when he had heard some big creature coming towards him through the underbrush. A huge timber wolf emerged, the largest he had ever seen. Its head, neck and breast were black and the rest of the body was grey. He said it was the most beautiful animal he had ever seen. Thomson had no fear for his first reaction was one of admiration for the magnificent beast. It came so close to him that he could have reached out a hand to stroke it. The wolf sniffed Thomson up and down. “Apparently he decided I was alright,” is the way that Thomson told the story, “so he turned and went his way and I went mine.”

Soon after Thomson’s death, Dr. MacCallum, J.E.H. MacDonald and J.W. Beatty designed and erected a memorial cairn on the shores of Canoe Lake. The message on the cairn raised at Canoe Lake reads, in part, “He lived humbly but passionately with the wild. It made him brother to all untamed things… and it took him to itself at last” (Grace, 2004, p. 6). Once again, Thomson is being positioned as a ‘natural’ man, beloved by nature and therefore taken into its bosom.

Cameron (1999, p. 191) provides the historical context necessary to understand the importance of these depictions of Thomson when he explains that “many members of the Anglo-Canadian elite… exhibited the anti-modern anxiety about the effects of urban growth, industrial development, cosmopolitan immigration, and corporate consolidation that were features of modernising Canada.” In the mindset prevalent at the time it was thought that “through the wilderness vacation, middle-class men could get in touch with a more primal masculinity that, it was thought, would counteract the enervating effects of the modern, urban lifestyle” (Cameron, 1999, p. 191). Davies (1967, p. 37) emphasizes that in Thomson’s time, trips into the wilderness of Algonquin Park “were rare and considered very venturesome, for the north had not yet been turned into a vast complex of playgrounds for thousands of
city dwellers. The trappers and lumberjacks were still lords of the wilderness.” So, when MacCallum (1918, p. 378) states that Thomson dressed more and more like a ‘backwoodsman’ and that his work showed his “hidden strength, confidence and resources of the voyageur”, he is doing more than commenting on clothing choices, he is referencing cultural stereotypes of strength and independence.

Former US Ambassador to Canada, Ray Atherton (1947, p. 57), noted that while the covered wagon is a symbol of westward expansion for Americans, the “story of the canoe is Canada’s story.” He then goes on to say, “Of Thomson it may literally be said that he lived and worked and died in a canoe in Canada’s north country… But it is more important that he alone was able to express the feelings, the deep faith in nature, the wild, mute emotions of all the strong men in canoes who created this country [Canada].” Here we see the linkage being made between Thomson, Canada’s history and the stereotype of ‘primal masculinity.’ If, as Ross Cameron (1999, p. 186) suggests, the facts of Thomson’s life and his experiences in nature were rewritten to transform him into a “modern reincarnation of the coureur-de-bois… to emphasize Thomson’s solitary and intimate contact with nature” as part of mythologizing of the man after his death, then these authors certainly established Thomson’s isolation, both physical and emotional, as being at the center of his myth.

In addition to his isolation, the tragic hero is fated to suffer; his focus is on internal battles and confronting his own failings. That Thomson ‘suffered’ is a minor theme in the writings of his supporters, but it is there. Harris (1948, p. 32) says that Thomson was, “…sensitive and given to occasional fits of despondency.” Thomson apparently didn’t value his own work; if a visitor to the studio admired a particular sketch, he would give it to them. Davies (1967, p. 61) records that A.Y. Jackson “discovered that Thomson had happy moods, sometimes, when something he did ‘came through’ as he wanted it to do. However, his self-confidence was intermittent. In spite of his obvious development, he was still sometimes prey to those old haunting moods of mistrust of himself and his powers.”

The relationship between Thomson and his patron, MacCallum, was not always an easy one. In what correspondence remains, we find evidence that Thomson was careful to keep his patron advised of his progress. However, there were times when MacCallum’s guidance was seen more as a hindrance than a help. In the summer of 1914, when Arthur Lismer joined Thomson at Canoe Lake, he passed along a message from MacCallum to the effect that he should not let A.Y. Jackson influence him unduly. According to Davies (1967, p. 62), “Thomson cursed bitterly and dropped what he was doing to work off his blaze of temper in gathering firewood. Any such attempt at authority over him aroused his deepest resentment.” Here we see Thomson struggle to assert his independence while at the same time occasionally having doubts about his abilities.

The tragic hero is typically portrayed as being somewhere between the divine and the all-too-human. The plot of the tragic myth concerns itself with a hero who is gaining wisdom and growing toward maturity. Although Thomson had received training as a commercial artist and had taken some painting classes (Murray, 1991), it was from his contemporaries that he learned the most. During the winter of 1914, he worked with A.Y. Jackson on an almost daily basis, benefitting from Jackson’s formal training (Davies, 1967). Harris (1948, p. 32) credits Jackson with inspiring not only Thomson but also the Group with respect to color: “Jackson’s sparkling, vibrant, rich colour opened his eyes, as it did the rest of us, and Tom saw the Canadian landscape as he had never seen it before. It amounted to a revelation. And from then on nothing could hold him.” Joan Murray (1991, p. 29) suggests that Thomson received assistance from many of his colleagues, some of whom are rumored to have touched up his canvases. But for his part, Harris (1948, p. 28) noted the reciprocal influence of Thomson as contributor to the Group of Seven, saying, “I have, in my story of the Group, included Tom Thomson as a working member, although the name of the Group did not originate until after Tom’s death. Tom Thomson was, nevertheless, as vital to the movement, as much a part of its formation and development, as any other member.” Thus Thomson is seen as maturing as an artist, able to learn from and also teach others.

Thomson was at a stage in his artistic career when his style was maturing. MacCallum says that Thomson enjoyed appreciation of his work and could handle criticism of his methods, but that he placed no particular value on the paintings themselves. To Thomson, “his most beautiful sketches were only paint. He placed no value on them. All he wanted was more paint, so that he could paint others” (MacCallum, 1918, p. 378). Davies (1967, p. 89) suggests that, “Thomson’s friends agree in saying that he was indifferent to recognition. He painted for the sake of creating and attached no value to his work once it was completed.” Indeed, during the spring of 1917, Thomson was reported to have painting a sketch per day, for 62 days [11], trying to capture the changes in the natural environment as winter turned into spring, yet he had not signed these sketches. Dr. MacCallum, J.E.H. MacDonald and J.W. Beatty
stamped Thomson’s sketches with a newly designed studio stamp (Reid, 1969) in order to assure they would be recorded as Thomson’s work for posterity.

In the last three years of his life, Thomson seemed to come into his own, producing the paintings on which his reputation rests. Harris, in the quote above, speaks of it in other-worldly terms, as a ‘revelation.’ MacCallum (1918, p. 378) said Thomson was ‘compelled’ to paint, that “he had a message.” The impression is left on the reader that Thomson’s talent was inspired by a higher power; that he had no worldly cares – his concern was only for art and for beauty. This image of the inspired artist stands in stark contrast to his all-too-human behaviour, the “heavy drinking, his solitary ways, his documented swings in mood, and his inarticulacy” (Grace, 2004, p. 4). Murray (1991, p. 30) also notes his heavy drinking and records that Harris and some of Thomson’s other colleagues recalled him flicking matchsticks at wet canvases in a ‘blue funk’.

The basic plot structure of the tragic myth focuses on serious events and conflict which situates the protagonist in opposition to fate or the Gods. Thomson’s coming to maturity as an artist occurred during the First World War, a time of great conflict for the nation and for him personally. In addition, the art that he and his colleagues were producing was not positively received at first.

World War I brought about chaos, disruption, failure and moral uncertainty. Thomson struggled over the morality of his position. He had tried to enlist for the Boer War in 1899 (Huff, n.d.), but was rejected due to poor health. Once again, health reasons prevented him from enlisting, but many of his group either enlisted or went overseas to work as war artists. Lawren Harris (1948, p. 33-34) remembered that WWI had the effect of dispersing the group. “MacDonald, Lismer, Varley, and Johnson were too much occupied to give much time to painting. Jackson was wounded in France. During the third year of the war I was discharged from the army as medically unfit and devoted over a year to regaining my health.” Yet, in spite of the fact that he did not serve in the military, Cameron (1999, p. 191) suggests that the maturing of Thomson’s work represents the maturing of the Canadian nation and its coming of age through the First World War.

The creation of this legend was structured by a variety of influences. The nationalism of the growing urban, central Canadian intelligentsia in the early twentieth century expressed a pride in Canada's contribution to the Great War and an enthusiasm about Canada's recent and future growth. Anglo-Canadian nationalists of various stripes saw Canada as maturing as a nation in these years. Thus, National Gallery Director Eric Brown could hold Thomson up to the world in 1917 as evidence of a national cultural maturation.

Grace (2004) argues that Thomson’s death during the war years, the loss of his potential, of his talent, came to represent what was lost by so many.

As noted above, Dr. MacCallum played a major role in establishing and maintaining Thomson’s reputation; his efforts can best be understood when placed in historical context. MacCallum (1918) acknowledged that Thomson and others of his group were under attack from critics and held up to ridicule for producing paintings that were ‘untrue and impossible.’ Group members were breaking with tradition. They painted subject matter that did not match accepted definitions of the ‘picturesque’ within nature – instead they painted swamps, burned over lands, wild, untamed landscapes. They also painted in a style that while perhaps borrowing from the Impressionists, used color and paint in different ways. Their work did not meet with immediate acceptance.

With reference to a sketch showing snow pillars hanging in the air, MacCallum (1918, p. 377) remarked that even he doubted the veracity of the depiction of the environment, until it was confirmed by “an old French Canadian lumber-camp foreman” who would presumably have had knowledge of the area and its weather patterns. In response to the critics, MacCallum made note of the fact that Thomson lived in the park for up to eight months of the year, and that, “Only one who has so lived is in a position to attack the colour or truthfulness of his pictures.” In the early 1920s, a collection of works by Group of Seven members, including four works by Thomson, were exhibited in a number of American cities. Almost forty exhibitions were held in separate towns over two and one-half years, but Arthur Lismer reported that sales were “practically nil” (Hill, 1995, p. 120) [12].

Writing some years later, Lawren Harris (1948) commented on the reception of the group’s work. He suggests that a few ‘laymen’ who actually knew and had a feeling for the country the Group was painting were among the first to respond positively, because their paintings represented …the first satisfying expression of the country they loved. One or two of these men wrote in enthusiastic terms about the work of the Group, and a steadily growing number of people came to appreciate that the new paintings meant something vital to the country. This feeling of appreciation grew and spread, in part because the artists were not concerned with art movements as such but with
interpreting the country to the people. The whole endeavour functioned as an interplay between the arts and the country... It was because the work of the Group no only possessed the quality of merit but was so closely identifiable with the spirit of Canada that the vilification of the critics went for nothing. During the last years of the group, three exhibitions of Canadian paintings were sent to England where they were received very positively by the critics. Harris (1948) seems to note with some pride that a painting by A.Y. Jackson was purchased by the Tate Gallery.

In the tragic myth form, the hero is doomed by a fatal flaw. In Thomson’s case, this fatal flaw can be linked to the ambiguous circumstances under which his life ended. The death of a skilled canoeist and woodsman by ‘misadventure’ seems too ironic [13]. The gash that was reportedly observed on his temple was offered as evidence that he had been assaulted and possibly murdered. The cause of the assault was reportedly variously as the aftermath of a drunken argument that raged between Thomson and an American visitor of German descent, a fight with Mowat Lodge owner Shannon Fraser, and/or the outcome of Thomson’s reluctance to marry Winnifred Trainor, who some say was carrying his child.

How Thomson would be viewed by the public became a matter of some concern. Lehto (2005, p. 209) argues that MacCallum played a key role in guiding the family’s handling of how Thomson’s death would be portrayed to the family and to the public by advising his older brother, George. George, “put down Shannon Fraser’s rumors of suicide and shunned Winnie Trainor’s [14] claims against the estate. George Thomson molded how the wider family of Canada came to embrace artist, woodsman, and guide Tom Thomson, as brother, colleague, and discoverer of the nation’s spirit.”

But debate about how Thomson died did not end with his burial. On October 1, 1956, William T. Little [15] and three companions dug up Thomson’s gravesite at Canoe Lake (Lehto, 2005). This escapade was followed by a series of newspaper stories and a book written by Little [16]. Little’s actions served only to fuel the mystery – where was Thomson’s body? Thomson had reportedly drowned in Canoe Lake and been buried in Mowat Cemetery. His body was supposedly later exhumed and reburied in the Auld Kirk Cemetery (Lehto, 2005). Yet, in 2010 a forensic reconstruction was done of the skull found at the Mowat Cemetery site, with many commentators stating that it looks like Thomson. The ambiguity over the nature of Thomson’s death and the location of his remains has only added to the public fascination with his legend.

Grace (2004) helpfully enumerates that factors that make Thomson works so well in the role of tragic hero: his Scottish heritage fits the dominant narrative of Canadian development, he died young before he could disappoint and he died a mysterious death, he left behind little to define him (no journals, few letters) creating an ‘outline’ that could be filled in by others, he lived at a time of great change, and his death during the war years came to represent what was lost by so many. But none of this happens without the passive and active intervention of interested parties. Thus, in 1943, A.Y. Jackson could say that Thomson “is today the inspiration of all the young artists of Canada, and his painting ‘West Wind’ is the best known painting in this country. It is well to remember that, without the Doctor, there would have been on ‘West Wind’ or ‘Northern River’ or all those other previous records of our country” (p. 19).

Discussion and Next Steps
To this point, the paper has traced the making and marketing of Tom Thomson as a cultural icon roughly up to the period of the 1950s. His story seems to fit the model of the tragic hero described by Northrop Frye fairly well. Frye’s work attempted to demonstrate that there was a unifying pattern to Western cultural products (Stern, 1995, p. 165), four categories of myth narratives that paralleled the seasons and the human life cycle. Stern’s (1995) application of Frye’s work to consumption narratives demonstrated that consumers, often unknowingly, adopt these same conventional plot structures as organizing devices in order to tell the story of their consumption experiences. These plot structures are so ingrained in Western cultures as to be invisible to the individual storyteller. What I have attempted to do here is demonstrate how a group of storytellers, that is, Thomson’s patron, friends, biographer and others, shaped his story to position him as the tragic hero. By doing so, they made his story easier for us to understand and caused the disparate and sometimes unseemly parts of his life to become more coherent.

Thomson’s story does not end in the 1950s. Thus, the next steps for this project involve examining what Grace might call the next ‘wave’ of his popularity – the publication of Tom Thomson: The Silence and the Storm (Town and Silcox, 1977) to mark the 100th anniversary of his birth, the major exhibition of Thomson’s work by the National Gallery of Canada in 2002, and his continuing ‘popularity’ as evidenced by his inclusion in the storyline of a recent episode of the Murdoch Mysteries television series,
aired by the Canadian Broadcast Corporation. Does Thomson’s life story continue to conform to that of the tragic hero or has he been remade for contemporary audiences?

Notes
[2] Thomson’s death is so labelled by the website, “Death on a Painted Lake: The Tom Thomson Tragedy” (available at: http://www.canadianmysteries.ca/sites/thomson/home/indexen.html). Funded by the Department of Canadian Heritage, University of Victoria, Université de Sherbrooke and York University, the site facilitates access to government documents, journal articles, newspaper articles, and much more connected to Thomson’s life and death under mysterious circumstances.
[6] Huff (n.d.) notes that purchase price of $250 amounted to a considerable sum. Thomson’s weekly salary as a commercial artist was $35 in 1912. In 2016 dollars, the purchase price was just over $6,000.
[7] Cameron (1999, p. 186) similarly argues that the legend we now know as Tom Thomson was created after his death by his colleagues and admirers.
[8] David Silcox (2013) notes that the painting was purchased for $500. This is twice what Northern Lake had been purchased for only two years earlier, and is equivalent to a purchase price of almost $12,000 today. Study for ‘Northern River’ is part of the Art Gallery of Ontario’s collection.
[9] The editorial text accompanying Jackson’s 1943 article in Saturday Night identifies MacCallum as “eye-specialist, canoeist, sailor, woodsman, and individualist, was also a father of modern Canadian art.”
[10] Shortly before her death in 1966, Davies asked A.Y. Jackson to help her get the biography republished. While the quotations in this paper come from that 1967 edition, I have compared the two editions and noted that the changes made to the main body of text for the second publishing are for the most part fairly minor.
[11] In 1991, Joan Murray noted that as part of preparing a catalogue raisonné of Thomson’s work she had found only about half of these sketches (p. 37).
[12] Hill is quoting Lismer from the following source: Glenbow Museum: M1134 Inglis Sheldon Williams Papers, Box 1, f.8, Norman Mackenzie to Sheldon-Williams, 12 August 1922.
[13] Harris (1948, p. 33) talks about Thomson sleeping in his canoe, adding to the idea that falling out of it would be very unusual. “In the north on fine nights he would sleep in the bottom of his canoe. He would push it out into whatever lake he was on, crawl under the thwarts, roll himself in his blanket and go to sleep.”
[14] Winnie Trainor’s role in Thomson’s life has been a matter of some dispute. She is often portrayed as a woman he was intimate with, and that the revelation of a pregnancy and thus impending need for marriage may have pushed him to suicide. Probably the most in-depth look at Trainor’s role in Thomson’s life is Roy MacGregor’s (2011) Northern Light: The Enduring Mystery of Tom Thomson and the Woman Who Loved Him.
[15] Little was a reform school superintendent in Brampton and later a provincial judge in the family court of York County, Ontario, Canada (Lehto, 2005).

References


Vanishing Kyoto Textiles
- Effect of The Kimono Business on Kyoto Textiles From 1949 to 2000

Keiko Okamoto
Faculty of Business Administration, Hosei University, Japan

Abstract
Purpose – Kyoto, the former capital of Japan, has been the center of textile dyeing (Kyoto textiles) for hundreds of years, and Muromachi merchants have been handling the business. The purpose of this paper is to review the influence of kimono wholesale business on Kyoto textiles, especially hand-painted yūzen dyeing, between the post WWII era and 2000, from the following perspectives; 1) the relationship between powerful/wealthy wholesales and artisans of yūzen dyeing; and 2) competition with rapidly spreading Western ready-to-wear clothing in the market. Today, the kimono is becoming a form of ready-to-wear clothing like Western clothing; however, those kimonos are unlikely to use traditional Kyoto textiles dyed by artisans. They tend to use mass production techniques at reasonable prices. The author discusses both the future kimono and Kyoto textiles, and further suggests the possibility of handmade Kyoto textiles apart from the kimono outfit.

Design/methodology/approach – Literature, companies’ history, industry’s publications, and industry magazines were examined, and interviews were conducted to those who have been in the industry since the early stage of the post WWII era.

Research limitation/implications – Some sources do not have author, publisher, or date information. In order to cover multiple activities of the merchants and artisans of Kyoto textiles, examinations on each topic were limited. Further research will be needed. Historians and textile scholars will gain a better understanding of the kimono business and its products/production on how a tradition based industry adapted to rapid change in consumer demand.

Keywords – Japan, textiles, kimono, clothing, trading history, marketing strategy.

Introduction
Kyoto, the former capital of Japan, has been the center of textile dyeing for hundreds of years. Among the various methods of textile dyeing for kimono fabrics produced in Kyoto (Kyoto textiles), hand-painted yūzen [yu:zen] dyeing has been one of the most prestigious methods since it was developed in the mid-17th century. In addition, several modern dyeing techniques were developed for Kyoto textiles after the Industrial Revolution in the mid-19th century.

Western observers viewed the kimono in a context, together with its alluring wearer and exotic Japan (Milhaupt, 2012), but without deep appreciation for the beauty and distinctiveness of the kimono and its textiles, they would not have featured it or painted the kimono wearer. However, the popularity of the kimono in the Western art scenes declined in the latter half of the 20th century, even though the Japanese kimono business experienced its historical peak (production and sales) in the early 1970s. For example, “Kimono: A Modern History” covers very limited information in the latter half of the 20th century, and the exhibition, “The Kimono Inspiration” focused on the kimono as a medium by American artists in the late 20th century. In the 21st century, forty plus years after the peak, the kimono is recognized as a part of Japanese pop-culture (Milhaupt, 2014) with new types of textiles. But we seldom see Japanese wearing the kimono as part of their routine wardrobe (Adachi, 2015) [5]. Why have Western observers and, to some extent, the Japanese themselves lost interest in the kimono?

The outfit style of the kimono and the dyeing techniques of the textiles have survived for the last 150 years, handled by the merchants in Muromachi [muromatto] district in Kyoto, Japan. During that era, the kimono industry faced several wars, dynamic advancement in dyeing techniques, and competition from Western clothing culture. These factors profoundly affected the business strategies of the industry, which in turn affected the kimono and its textiles.

This paper reviews how the kimono and Kyoto textiles, especially hand-painted yūzen dyeing, have been treated in the rise and fall of the business in the post-WWII era (1945 to 2000,) focusing on the relation between powerful/wealthy wholesalers in Kyoto (so-called Muromachi merchants) and artisans, and the transformation of the kimono business over this time. Finally, a possible way to preserve hand-made Kyoto textiles is proposed through their application in the form of art or art-to-wear.

**Background**

The history of the kimono business since the country opened to the West can be divided into two periods: before and after WWII. After Japan opened to the West in the mid-19th century, Japanese citizens were allowed to wear silk clothing that had been only for noble people in the previous era (Yamanobe, 1994, p. 10). It was the time when silk yarn production for exports increased because of the Industrial Revolution, which was followed by cheaper silk residue more available for domestic consumption (Toya, 2015, p. 13). German synthetic dyestuff and weaving/printing machines were also imported to the Japanese textile industry together with advanced technologies, which accelerated the textile production that had formerly been done only by hand (Murakami, 1927, pp. 153-154). Colorful silk fabrics from various production centers in Japan - woven or printed – with new technologies became available for people who had had to wear cotton or hemp for their entire lives (Toya, 2015, p. 11). But still, silk was too precious for many of the Japanese to wear. In the first quarter of 20th century, thousands of fabrics for daily casual wear were produced for city people who became conscious about trends in fabric designs and colors. It was the beginning of mass production and mass marketing for the fashion business in Japan (Toya, 2015, p. 14). The production numbers gradually increased to blossom right before Sino-Japanese war started in 1937 (Yamanobe, 1994, p. 16).

The period between 1940 and 1950 was the dark era for Japanese fashion as the Japanese government banned producing or wearing fashionable clothing due to the wars during that time (Yamanobe, 1994, p. 14) [6]. As the war progressed, people needed tickets to get food and clothing [7]. Further more, the Allied bombing followed by uncontrolled fires burnt everything in the cities including kimonos in the drawers. Precious silk kimonos that survived were illicitly bartered for rice and vegetables with peasants. The kimono was considered more valuable than money at that time because there was nothing left to buy with money in Japan.

When the war was over, people rushed back into the textile industry, which consisted of three business categories depending on the types of textiles they dealt with: narrow-width textiles for the kimono and wide-width textiles for Western clothing and upholstery, both of which were for domestic consumption, in addition to wide-width textiles for exports. Kimono business officially restarted in 1949 when the silk fabric business restriction was lifted (Kyoto Orimono Oroshi Shōgyō Kumniai Sōritsu 10 shūnen Kinenshi Inkanai ed ed, 1979, p. 72). The textile industry led the way to revitalize the Japanese economy in the beginning of the post-WWII era. One of the examples of how quickly the Japanese textile industry recovered from the war was witnessed by the request from American government for Japan to agree to a voluntary export restraint as early as in 1955 (Dickerson, 1999, pp. 341-342).
The key players of the kimono wholesale business were *Muromachi* merchants in *Muromachi* district in Kyoto, Japan.

**The Kimono Business**  

*Muromachi Merchants*

*Muromachi* merchants (henceforth M.M.) (Kyoto Orimo Oroshi Shōgyō Kumiiai Sōritsu 10 shūnen Kinenshi linkai ed ed, 1979, pp. 3-61) [9], were named after *Muromachi* district in Kyoto where textile business originally started in the mid-15th century. M.M. first dealt with imported textiles and domestic woven textiles (*Nishijin Ori* [nijin ori] Nishijin textiles) for Kyoto Imperial Palace located to the north of *Muromachi* district. Later on, they started dealing with dyed textiles, Kyoto textiles, for affluent people [10]. There always has been M. M. in *Muromachi* district, and even when newcomers settled in, they dealt with textiles. In this way, the kimono business has been handed down by M.M. for more than 500 years. By the end of the 18th century, M.M. in *Muromachi* district in Kyoto dominated the wholesale business of expensive silk textiles and silk yarns [11].

When WWII was over, M.M. came back to *Muromachi* district; some came back to restart their business and others came in to establish a new kimono business there [12]. But since there were not sufficient fabrics being produced yet, M.M’s first task was to collect greige fabrics from suburbs of Kyoto to dye and sell (Tsugita Gurūpu Shashi Hensan iinkai ed., 1978, p. 114).

The size of the kimono fabric is about 37 centimeters in width (14.6 inches) by 12 to 15 meters (13.3 to 16.6 yards) in length. Traditionally, kimono fabric was sold by the bolt, and it was sewn into a kimono outfit after a consumer bought it. That means, when Japanese said, “I bought a kimono,” it meant “I bought a bolt of kimono fabric and will have someone sew it into a kimono outfit,” or “sew it by myself.”

M.M. business after the war followed pre-war style at the beginning. Figure 1 shows the industry structure of the Kyoto Textile business in 1940 (Tokunaga, 1958, pp. 109-127). It was the structure before the war, but since the business had been low key after 1940, it was likely that M.M. tried to reestablish this business structure in the aftermath of the war. The structure looks very complicated, however, it remained unchanged or even became more complicated as business expanded in the years to come (Honda, 2015).

In the top layer in Figure 1 were consumers. Retailer types, in the second layer, were divided into two; one was custom-made fabric sale and the other was ready-made fabric sale. Custom-made agencies used to be a division of a retail store or a stand-alone agency. They worked with an agent, *Shikkai-ya* [jitkaiya], who arranged to dye a bolt of brand new fabric upon consumer’s request [13], to re-dye consumers’ old kimono into a solid color, or to do laundering (the kimono was un-sewn when it was washed). In this paper, sales route for ready-made fabric is discussed (shown in pink in Figure 1).

Retail stores for ready-made fabrics were such as department stores and kimono shops. Wholesalers between the 4th and 7th layers were M.M. that have retail stores and peer local merchants (sales agents and regional wholesalers) as their distributors. There were two types of M.M. depending on what tasks they were devoted to. One emphasized production and the other wholesale (sales agents and regional wholesalers) as their distributors. In this paper, sales route for ready-made fabric is discussed (shown in pink in Figure 1).

The business model of M.M. required sufficient amount of capital as they had two main functions. One was to provide their inventory greige fabrics to artisans and have them dye into Kyoto textiles, and the other was to distribute those Kyoto textiles to retail stores all over Japan with marketing support. M.M. purchased greige fabrics and consigned them to artisans or artisans through Artisan Dyer Manager. When fabric dye was completed, M.M. paid fees for dyeing and then distributed them to kimono shops and department stores. M.M. collected money about 120-180 days after kimono shop received the kimono fabrics, but as for department stores, they paid only after they sold them to consumers. As a whole, M.M. carried the risk of the cost of the fabrics from greige fabric, labor, distribution (Izushi, 1971, pp234-237; Kyoto Orimono Oroshi Shōgyō Kumiiai Sōritsu 10 shūnen Kinenshi linkai ed ed, 1979, p. 87), and sales assistance at department stores to consumers’ hands [15].
M.M. mainly dealt with Kyoto textiles (Kyō-zome, [kyō:zome]) (Tokunaga, 1958, pp. 109-127) [16] dyed in the neighborhood of Muromachi district and/or Nishijin woven fabrics made in Nishijin district [17]; but gradually, as they gained capital, they started dealing with dyed and woven fabrics from production centers all over Japan (Kyoto Orimono Oroshi Shōgyō Kumniai Sōritsu 10 shûnen Kinen shi linkai ed ed, 1979, p. 87) [18] as they had been doing before the war.

Typical M.M. business style was also carried over from the pre-war period. The first 3 or 4 days of every month, M.M. held an exhibition with hundreds of Kyoto Textiles displayed on the tatami-matted floor (Figure 2) in their shop or sometimes a leased hall of a decent temple. They invited buyers from department stores and owners of the kimono shops. In order for buyers and owners not to go and shop at other M.M.’s, the account holder picked up his guests at Kyoto Station, brought them to the exhibition, to lunch, to dinner, and for sight seeing, and saw them off at Kyoto station the following day. After the exhibition was over, the account holder put bolts of sample fabrics in a wrapping cloth (furoshiki [furōshiki]) and went on a business trip for about a week or two. Later in that same month, he again visited those customers to collect sales proceeds. M.M.’s competitors had always been M.M. in Muromachi district until recently [19].

The recovery of the kimono business after the war was so rapid that M.M. business soon exceeded the pre-war level and went into the period of Japan’s high economic growth. By then,
Japanese consumers, who had had very few chances to buy or wear silk kimonos for a long time before the war, could afford them as their income increased year by year (Izushi, 1971, pp. 234-237). Actresses and models appeared in kimono outfits in movies and magazines encouraged consumers to be interested in the kimono (Some to Ori, 1958, pp. 131-134).

The kimono business peaked in the early 1970s, but unfortunately, it was the time when the Western ready-to-wear clothing started spreading all over Japan that coincided the diminishing timing of kimono business.

Yūzen Dyeing

Among various types of Kyoto textiles, hand-painted yūzen dyeing (tegaki yūzen [tegaki yu:zen]), the most prestigious method, was developed in the mid-17th century. The technique enabled artisans to depict images that had formerly been only represented by embroidery, jacquard, tie-dye, Japanese ikat, or Japanese batik methods, with free-hand drawn lines with paste-resist dyes. It made motifs look more realistic compared to other methods. The process was done all by hand and supposed to be done as such even at present.

The dyeing method of hand-painted yūzen dyeing consists of a sequence of 10 to 20 dye steps as shown in Figure 3 [20]. Each dyeing step is processed by a professional artisan or artisans who is/are specifically skilled for the technique. Steps are such as design, draft drawing (small size), draft drawing on basted fabric, applying paste resist (for outline), painting/coloring, applying paste resist (on colored motifs), background dyeing, steaming, rinsing, applying gold leaves and embroidery, and finish painting/drawing. Steaming is needed for several times to fix the dye onto the fabrics and steam ironing for the next process. The fabric was basted (eba [ebo]) at the beginning and at the end, but during the dye process, pieces of fabrics were sewn into one bolt of fabric. The order of the process can be rearranged depending on the types of paste they use, but theoretically, the finished pieces will not be able to be reproduced or duplicated exactly the same because they were all done by hand.

A master artisan dyer ran a studio that used to consist of several to several dozens junior artisans and apprentices who all specialized in the same skills of the master. Gradually, the studio structure turned into a company system. One studio applied one step, and the duration they needed depends on the amount of workload they apply. The sequence of work by studios was organized under a certain Artisan Dyer Manager (Sen-shō) who was introduced as an agent, Shikkai-ya, in Figure 1. When one step was done, Artisan Dyer Manager brought the fabric to the next artisan studio to do the next step, and one after another until the dyes were complete. If each step took an average of five days (including transportation), and had 10 steps for a certain bolt of fabric, the total production term would be 50 days. It is a time consuming process to dye by hand, but this hand-painted yūzen dyeing techniques has not been changed much for the last 70 years or more.

On the other hand, printing techniques that had been brought into the industry by the Industrial Revolution in the late-19th century had been kept improving after the WWII and made Kyoto textiles more available in shorter lead-time at reasonable costs [21]. Fabrics that used advanced technologies such as screen prints and roller prints were also called yūzen dyeing. In order to distinguish printed yūzen dyeing from the hand-painted version, the latter was sometimes called hon-yūzen [hon’yu:zen](real yūzen dyeing) (Yamanobe, 1994, P. 13).

In general, dyed fabrics for the kimono are considered more formal compared to woven fabrics. Among dyed fabrics, larger/dense motifs placed on certain parts on the kimono are more formal than smaller/scattered/sparse motifs, and hand painted fabrics are more formal than stenciled
and *kata-zome* [katazome] (hand printed) fabrics [22], which are more formal than screen-printed fabrics of repeated patterns. The types of kimono – the degree of formality of the kimono and the age range of the wearers - are determined by the combination of these techniques processed on the fabrics, and motifs and colors. Dyed kimono fabrics are usually accompanied with woven fabrics as Obi-sash belt, for which woven fabrics are considered more formal, to tie the kimono around the body.

Figure 3. Process of paste-resist hand-painted *yūzen* dyeing by *Kyōto Kōgei Shō Kyōdō Kumiai* (Kyoto Artisan Dyer Manager Association)
when it is dressed. Kyoto textiles as a whole have one of the highest degrees of formality among narrow-width textiles for the kimono and Nishijin textiles for Obi-sash belt.

**Artisans**

As a wholesaler, M.M. provided their inventory, greige fabrics, to artisans and had them dye into Kyoto textiles. Since M.M. risked the fabrics, they decided what types of fabrics they wanted under a certain budget. When a bolt of fabric was processed with hand-painted yūzen dyeing, M.M. passed the greige fabric to Artisan Dyer Manager first so that the manager could organize the multiple steps processed by various artisans. M.M. discussed in detail with the Artisan Dyer Manager about the final image of the motifs, degree of the formality, and the budget. The Artisan Dyer Manager then discussed with artisans for each step in process and instructed them to fulfill the requirements. In order to produce high-quality Kyoto textiles, Artisan Dyer Manager needed to possess the sense of design, while artisans for drawing and coloring to have painting abilities, and others to have skills and techniques.

In this way, artisans dyers did not have freedom to dye what they liked or wanted; they had to follow what they were expected to do to meet M.M.’s requests. On the other hand, artisans had plenty of opportunities to brush up their professional skills with the greige fabrics that M.M. provided.

In the early 1950s, however, several artisans who had been in the business since before WW2 and had skills of doing more than one step by themselves expressed their wish to design and dye fabrics with their own idea and to have them as their own piece with their signs and seals. They even wanted to have their merchandise, in the shape of kimono, admired as a work of art. They complained about how M.M. had been handling everything from production through distribution and treating their hand-painted yūzen textiles simply as merchandise to pursue their sales profits (Todate, 2007, P. 114).

They insisted that artisans had the skills to design and dye kimono fabrics, not M.M., and that it was important to create the kimono (fabrics) using their skills without being pressured by M.M. or any other retailers. They established an artisans’ association and worked with the Ministry of Education to appoint a holder of an important intangible cultural property (Jūyo bunkazai hoji-sha [ju:yo mukei bunkozai hoji[5], known as Living National Treasures) in order to archive their traditional dyeing skills. Katsuma Nakamura, Tameji Ueno, Uzan Kimura, Kihachi Tabata, and Eiichi Yamada were the first five of artisan yūzen dyers who were appointed Living National Treasures (Okada, 1981) [23]. Some of their pieces are in the permanent collections of The National Museum of Modern Art, Tokyo. Even though their pieces were preserved to archive traditional skills, fabric designs were very modern and innovative at that time.

But, unfortunately, even after they were appointed Living National Treasures, especially artisan dyers in Kyoto had no other efficient way to sell their kimono fabrics than through M.M [24]. This implies how M.M. were powerful in dealing with Kyoto textiles. They had money and distribution networks that artisans did not have.

When M.M. found that kimono fabrics with signs and seals sold well with more expensive prices, they started contracting their own designer dyers. Sometimes those designers were licensed clothing designers from overseas (Kyoto Orimono Oroshi Shōgyō Kumniai ed., 1989). As witnessed in Western Clothing market, “a designer” became a strong marketing tool in the kimono business, too. As one would imagine, M.M. controlled all the designer brands by themselves.

**M.M.’s Marketing Strategies over Western Ready-to-Wear Clothing**

**Variety of Formal Wear (Textile Design)**

It was about 150 years ago when Japanese were encouraged to wear Western clothing for the first time. Government officials, businessmen, kids and students gradually started wearing it, but still, about 70 years later when WWII was over, most of the Japanese women still wore the kimono every day [25]. There was some mass-produced Western clothing before WWII, but consumers had to buy a piece of fabric and have it made into Western clothing or they had to sew it by themselves like they had been doing with the kimono. In the 1950s, department stores started carrying “easy-order clothing,” for which consumers tried sample garments in several sizes and ordered one in the their sizes. Then they were switched to ready-to-wear clothing. However, it was not until 1970 when the ready-to-wear percentile of women’s dress crossed over 50%, with that of men’s suits quickly following in 1973 (Kajima, 2006, p. 37). High class dresses and suits continued to be custom-made until more recently. As we can see, it has been only a little more than 40 years since Western ready-to-wear clothing prevailed in Japan.
In the 1970s, men wore business suits at work, while they changed to the casual kimono at home to relax. In those days, adults seemed to be more comfortable with the kimono on. Elderly women wore casual kimonos at home, even when they did housekeeping. Younger people wore Western clothing as everyday wear, but when married women were out, they preferred wearing the kimono, especially when they needed to dress up (Izushi, 1971, pp. 234-237), such as for shopping, theater going, tea ceremonies, flower arrangement gatherings, school reunions, wedding receptions and kids' ceremonies and school events. They wanted to wear the kimono and they wanted to own at least one (dress-up) kimono. This was what many Japanese women did in the 1950s and the 1960s because they had been dreaming of dressing up with the kimono for a long time before, including during, and right after the war (Kyoto Orimono Oroshi Shōgyō Kumniai Sōritsu 10 shūnen Kinenshi linkai ed ed, 1979, p. 72). Rural and small town people who did not possess many silk kimonos before the war, as they have a few occasions to wear them, and city people who lost of most of their kimonos during the war bought them to enjoy fashionable clothing.

The factors of fashion trend of the kimono and of Western clothing are very different. In Western clothing, fashion trends refer to the form of the clothing, while fabrics are the materials to shape the form of the clothing. Regarding the kimono, the form of the T-shaped, straight-seamed, front-wrapped style has been always almost the same so that the most important factors of kimono trends were colors of the kimono fabrics, motifs depicted on the fabrics, the fabric construction [26] and the types of fibers [27]. The age range of the wearers and the degree of formality dictated different types of kimonos whose qualities were determined by these factors so that Japanese people have been very conscious about textiles. As a result, M.M. played the important role of making the kimono trends because they provided greige fabrics and instructed how to dye those greige fabrics into Kyoto textiles. As many Japanese women wanted to wear the kimono for dress-up occasions and ceremonies, M.M. introduced various grades of formal kimonos to fulfill the demands. Among them, yūzen dyeing, printed or hand-painted, were the most suited textiles for dress-up, semi-formal and formal kimonos.

M.M. first introduced fabrics with small pattern. The small repeated pattern kimono (komon [komon], Figure 4) were easily produced with pattern dyed (kata-zome) or screen-prints. Komon and solid color kimono (iromuji [iromuji,]) were the most produced kimonos in the early post-war period.

These kimonos were considered semi-formal wear but at the least level. A black jacket (haori [haori], Figure 5) was introduced to wear over the small repeated pattern kimono (komon) and the solid color kimono (iromuji) to make the outfits into semi-formal attire. However, haori went out of date in the 1970s.
The kimono with large motifs (hōmongi [hɔ:mongi], Figure 6) [28], whose motifs were placed on left front shoulder, right back shoulder, left front sleeve, and hem was for dress-up and formal occasions. The motifs were placed as if they were painted on a kimono canvas when it was displayed. In the 1960s, M.M. introduced kimonos with fewer motifs (tsukesage [tsukesage], Figure 7) [29] more formal than the small pattern kimono (komon [komon]) or the kimono with a jacket (haori) but less formal than the large motifs kimono (hōmongi.

In hōmongi categories, there had been a stylish motifs kimono (osharegi [oʃaregi], Figure 8) worn between formal and casual wear since before WWII, but it didn’t last long after the war period because unique motifs were not suited for mass production.

(Kyoto Orimono Oroshi Shōgyō Kumniai Sōritsu 10 shūnen Kinenshi linkai ed ed, 1979, p. 74).

The black formal kimono (kuro-tomesode [kurotomesode]) was for married women and was mostly worn at wedding ceremonies and receptions. In the late 1980s, when the black formal prevailed in the market, M.M. developed the color formal kimono (iro-tomesode [irotomesode], Figure 9) instead of black. The motifs of both the black and the color formal kimono were only placed on the hemline with family crests (mon [mōn]) on the upper body. The loose flowing long sleeve kimono (furisode [furisode], Figure 10), the most celebratory attire for young women, which used to have been only for daughters from very wealthy families, became available for common people in the 1960s [30].

In the late 1970s, when more Western ready-to-wear clothing became available, the functional side of Western clothing fit Japanese busy daily life and it expanded widely into Japanese clothing culture. Japanese women switched their everyday wear to Western clothing; however, they kept wearing the kimono for special occasions. This was not only because there was not enough formal ready-to-wear clothing (Western) on the market yet, but also, in all likelihood, because
consumers (Japanese women) were not yet confident about the trend or the value of the Western fashion at that time. On the other hand, they knew very well the value of the silk kimono made with Kyoto textiles.

According to the statistics of Office of the Prime Minister quoted by Izushi, kimono fabric retail sales increased 183% (in square meters of fabrics) between 1956 and 1966, while silk kimono fabric sales increased 230% (in square meters of fabrics) during the same period (Izushi, 1971, pp. 234-237). It can be guessed that the fabric used for the kimono shifted to silk from other types of fibers. Later between 1970 and 1978, the amount of kimono fabric sold (in bolts) reduced by half, while total sales (in yen) increased 170%. The average price per bolt increased roughly 3.4 times because of the increase of silk fabric sales as well as the price increase of raw materials due to Japan’s economic growth (Izushi, 1980, pp. 48-68).

The production of woven silk fabrics declined earlier than Kyoto textiles because woven fabrics were considered less formal compared to dyed fabrics. For example, *meisen* kimono, woven silk fabrics for casual wear, whose production peak in the early 20th century in eastern Japan, disappeared from the mainstream sometime in the early 1950s (Toya, 2015, p. 13) and woven silk fabrics, *o-meshi* [omeʃi], that had been popular in the late 1940s to 1950s in Western Japan almost disappeared in the early 1960s (Kyoto Orimono Oroshi Shōgyō Sōritsu 10 shūnen Kinenshi linkai ed ed. 1979, p. 73) even though they both used advanced technologies of the time.

Thus, the types of fabric that M.M. dealt with shifted toward formal – dyed fabrics (rather than woven fabrics) and silk fabrics (rather than fabrics made of other fibers.)

**Shift to Formal to Ceremonial Attire (Textile Design and production)**

While Western clothing, especially formal wear, slowly expanding into Japanese market in the post-war era, the kimono revived sharply. Figure 11-1 shows the production of Kyoto Textiles from 1968 to 2014 by Kyō-yūzen Kumiai Rengōkai [kyo: yu:zen kumixi rengɔ:kai] (Kyoto textile dyers’ guild association) [31]. The association combined the data from multiple dyers’ guilds that had sprung up in Kyoto during the 15 years after the war [32]. Although there were other production centers in other parts of Japan, Kyoto has been the largest center of textile dyeing so that the statistics show the outline of Japanese dyed-textile production over the years. The figure doesn't show before 1967, but it was obviously close to zero in 1945 so that it can be guessed that the amount of production
had steadily increased from 1945 to 1967 [33]. The production was peaked at an all-time record of 16 million bolts in 1971.

As seen in the Figure 11-1, jackets (haori) peaked in 1971 and then almost disappeared by the early 1990s. The fewer motifs kimono (tsukesage) experienced its production peak in 1974 and kept a high level until the mid-1980s. The ratio of the most celebratory types of the kimono, black formal (kuro-tomesode), color formal (iro-tomesode), large motifs (hōmongi), and loose flowing sleeve (furisode), relative to all types of kimono increased over the years. These figures exactly reflect M.M.’s marketing strategies. When something was in trend, almost all the M.M. in Muromachi district tried to follow it. The percentile of total production of the four formal kimonos was only 7.74 percent in 1974, but it increased to 14.4 percent in 1983 and it exceeded 25 percent in 1989. The ratio settled at around 30 percent after 2000. The production had been concentrated on to formal wear from semi-formal wear.

As the demand for kimono shifted toward formal wear, M.M. tried to bring more variety in the formal kimono and to make it look more expensive. M.M. and artisan dyer managers facilitated the fabric production by optimizing the mixed use of several methods to meet their requirements for the merchandise in order to reduce costs and to shorten production lead-time. For example, screen print substituted applying paste resist by hand (the 6th steps in Figure 3), which made possible to duplicate hand-painted yūzen dyeing; also, instead of applying gold flakes by hand, gold paint was used (the 14th step in Figure 3) (Shiraki, 2015).

Originally, those mass-production print techniques were developed for repeated print patterns; however, M.M. and the industry people used them for dyeing non-repeated motifs. As stated earlier, formal kimono has different motif designs on different parts of the bodice, such as front and back panels of the sleeves, right and left, front and back panels of the bodice and hem so that they cannot be produced as prints with repeated patterns (see Figure 7). M.M. tried to print it with as many as 100 screens (ex. 10 screens x 10 parts.) The expensive screen frame costs could be easily depreciated when the production quantity was large, but when the production quantity got small, the depreciation of the screen costs burdened the price of each fabric. Other than using print techniques, several steps were skipped to reduce costs, such as using paper draft instead of draft drawing directly on basted greige fabrics. A lot of Kyoto textiles used mixed media to make more fancy fabrics with effective costs.

The kimono production by machine printing peaked in 1971, which was the same year as the peak of the Kyoto textile production. But as the sales declined because of the mass-production reduction, M.M. focused on selling more expensive formal and ceremonial wear to keep sales profits. Figure 11-2 shows the fiber types of the Kyoto textiles, while Figure 11-3 shows the methods of the dyeing. Synthetic and wool reduction rates were larger than those for silk fabrics and the rate of reduction for hand-paint was smaller than that for other types of the dyeing methods even though the absolute production number remained small.

Another kimono trend that M.M. tried to market was to make the kimono be worn three seasons out of four [34]. Traditionally, the kimono motifs limit the wearing season because motifs...
were taken from the natural scenery that Japanese had been surrounded by in that season, such as plum flowers, cherry blossoms, dayflower, maple leaves, and so forth. Those motifs were supposed to be worn in early spring, spring, summer, and autumn respectively. However, M.M. put several different seasonal motifs in one kimono so that it could be worn for different occasions in different seasons and marketed it as “a lot of happiness” in the kimono or “a kimono that you can wear for your entire life” [35].

As a result, less and less innovative designs were developed. In spite of these M.M.’s marketing efforts, the production of Kyoto textiles continued decreasing year by year to less than 400,000 bolts in 2014, as seen in Figure 11-1. The volume of production today is only one-fortieth of what it was at its peak in 1971.

Even after Western ready-to-wear clothing permeated Japanese everyday life, Japanese women still considered the kimono to be a “must” for their wardrobe. Until the 1970s, women were supposed to prepare the kimono when they got married, and still in the 1980s, wealthy families prepared them for their daughters’ wedding. As a result, quite a few Japanese women owned the kimono but seldom wore them. They always considered wearing it for special occasions, but they finally decided not to wear the kimono because they could not wear it by themselves, they needed to go to a hair salon, it took time to wear it, and it needed special care afterwards (Izushi, 1980, pp. 48-68). They did not lose interests in the kimono, but they were more attracted to functional, convenient Western ready-to-wear clothing for their everyday life.

Luxury Kimono (Marketing and Sales)
A great number of artisans and others joined the kimono business in the post-WWII era as it was the leading industry in the Japanese economy then. But many stayed in the industry even after the number of kimono consumers started declining in the 1960s, resulting in excess inventory in the industry (Kyoto Orimono Oroshi Shōgyō Kumniai Sōritsu 10 shūnen Kinenishi linkai ed ed, 1979, pp. 81-86). At the same time, the increase of raw materials prices and labor costs in the 1960s and 1970s also affected the high prices of the kimono. This made consumers to perceive the kimono as luxury goods, “the more you pay, the better quality (Izushi, 1980, p.55),” which was not quite accurate. In 1980, Izushi reported that 43.6% of the kimono consumers were from the wealthy families of company owners or sole proprietors (Izushi, 1980, p.62). The use of the kimono had become a mark of the wealthy family.

The Act of Equal Opportunity for men and women in 1985 put more Japanese women in the job market and reduced their chances to wear the kimono. M.M. had to focus on more ceremonial occasions such as wedding receptions, observing the New Year, and children’s celebrations of turning 3, 5, 7, 13, and 20 years old. M.M. especially pinpointed marketing the loose flowing long sleeve kimono (furisode) for the coming-of-age (20 years old) ceremony because every municipal office invited its coming-of-age citizens to the ceremony every year (Kyoto Orimono Oroshi Shōgyō Kumniai ed., 1989). The association of M.M. (Kyoto Orimono Oroshi Shōgyō Kumniai [orimono oroshi kumiai]) planned and executed five to seven kimono events for who had interests in traditional kimonos (Kyoto Orimono Oroshi Shōgyō Kumniai ed., 1989). Kimono beauty pageants, for example, were for young women who showed interests in the loose flowing long sleeve kimono (furisode) for their coming-of-age ceremony.

As for M.M., they started inviting consumers to their exhibitions together with their customers (owners and buyers of retail stores.) They tried to turn their exhibitions into sales events for their customer retailers. For example [36], the exhibitions announced that “A celebrity will come and pick a kimono for the consumers,” or that “This is a tour to Kyoto with kimono attire and [where you can] purchase your favorite kimono at a traditional M.M.’s shop in Muromachi district,” or invited customers to “Have a party at a hotel ball room after shopping”. They even offered a trip to abroad with kimono attire for customers who spent a certain amount on purchasing the kimono.

Retailers also executed their own sales exhibitions and asked M.M. to support them. Those events costs were apparently added into the retail prices of the kimono and thus were guessed to make the kimono more expensive. This was in the 1980s when Japan experienced a bubble economy; so higher prices were acceptable. However, the situation changed when the bubble economy collapsed in the early 1990s.

The history book of the merchants’ association repeatedly mentions that they tried to terminate their old business practices that caused high-cost structure of M.M. ’s business, but they had not been much improved (Kyoto Orimono Oroshi Shōgyō Kumniai 10 shūnen Kinenishi linkai ed., 1979, pp. 103, 146-148). Those practices were such as ambiguous contracts, breach of contracts, return of products, discounts, long-term payment notes, delay of payment, and delay of delivery. In addition, kimono shops started asking M.M. to lend the fabric instead of buying them during their sale week. This was what department stores had been doing after the WWII. As imagined, those retailers reluctantly returned the merchandise after the sale since they wanted to keep options open for their customers for shopping. As a result, M.M.’s inventory level increased on retailers’ shelves. Mr. H. Tsugita, one of the retired M.M. who inherited his father’s business in the1970s, recalls a time when only 5 bolts of fabric were sold when they lent 100 bolts of fabric for 3-4 weeks. Ninety-five bolts were returned to the M.M., some of which had stains and/or faded colors to be fixed. He also mentioned that this type of request increased in relation to the sales decline.

Aging the Kimono Industry (Pricing)

When the economy was good, M.M. spent abundant capital to have artisans draw designs for Kyoto textiles and let them dye, but the economic downturn risked M.M.’s financial status, they gradually started reducing their provision of greige fabrics to Artisan Dyer managers and artisans. When Artisan Dyer Managers and artisans did not receive greige fabrics, they had to purchase them by themselves to produce Kyoto textiles. However, in this case, they would not be paid before the kimono was sold to the consumers. The risk was all on Artisan Dyer Managers and artisans. With the risks on them, they began to select designs and fabric colors that would be more generally preferred by the majority of people. Moreover, in order to fit the aging consumers, the colors became
subtle, the motifs got smaller and more scattered, and the sizes of the motifs were reduced. These facts limited the variety of fabrics produced for the kimono (Honda, 2015).

To make things worse, when bubble economy collapsed, the trend of cheaper is the better prevailed in the Japanese market, which was totally opposite to the direction of what M.M. had been marketing after the war: more formal, more expensive was the better. Finally, in the early 21st century, M.M introduced digital prints to the industry. Digital printing means scanning old fabrics and printing them out directly on a greige fabric. A close look at the fabric will reveal the aesthetic differences between the fabrics dyed by artisans and by inkjet printers, but those differences were less important for someone who only wears a kimono once and takes a commemorative picture (Figure 10). Further more, Kyoto textile dyer’s guild association (Kyō-yūzen Kumiai Rengōkai) allowing the fabrics made with digital printers be called kyō-yūzen (yūzen dyeing) just as mass-produced prints were called as such. At present, digital print machinery is very expensive, but it will eventually produce attractive fabrics with very cheap costs.

Over the years, as the number of kimono-clad women diminished, M.M. shifted the kimono trend to silk and formal attire with more expensive prices, which made consumers think that the kimono was a luxury good. Yet, by contrast, the production method that M.M. took was to optimize mass-production techniques to reduce costs, while they kept the retail price high. The traditional business model of M.M. and the conventional structure of the industry played the roles in preventing the reduction of prices. However, they were not the only reason.

The labor costs of artisans deeply affected the cost of hand-painted yūzen dyeing, the most labor-intensive method among Kyoto textiles. It can be estimated based on the labor costs. As mentioned earlier, each steps of dyeing was assigned to a certain professional artisan, with some steps taking a few days and others more than a week depending on the workload processed on the fabric. Suppose each of the 10 steps takes 5 days, the labor cost is 80 US dollars (USD) per day, and the cost of a bolt of greige fabric is 500 USD (1 USD = 100 yen) [37]. Table 1 shows the estimated cost of the fabric. The labor cost of one step will be 400 USD and that multiplied by 10 steps is 4000 USD. The total costs including greige fabric will be 4500 USD. The M. M. usually double the cost when they sell to retailers, and when the retailers sell those to consumers, they also will double their cost. A kimono fabric costing of 4500 USD, then, will be sold for 18000 USD at a retail store. When several dealers and wholesales were situated in between the producer and the retailer as shown in Figure 1, the profits were adjusted accordingly. The high cost of hand-painted yūzen dyeing is deeply affected by the expensive labor costs of all the steps and the costs have kept almost the same for the last 30 years (Tsugita, 2015). The total cost of buying and wearing a kimono, however, is not limited to the cost of the kimono itself.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Fabrics</th>
<th>M.M.’s cost</th>
<th>Retail price</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>MM: M.</td>
<td>US$4,500.00</td>
<td>US$18,000.00</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 1. Estimate cost of hand-painted yūzen dyeing

In order to wear the kimono, many other items are also needed. Fabrics for obi-sash belt, lining, under kimono, and a collar, all need to be sewn into final products to wear. Foundation (shirts and petticoat,) socks (tabi [tobi,] ) and several strings to tie the kimono are also needed. In addition, a handbag and slipper-type thong sandals (zōri [zō:ri]) are needed along with jewelry such as a broach on obi or a comb as one’s preference. Each of those items or materials has its own artisans as manufacturers. The cost of each is from several hundred to several thousand dollars, but many of these items are now mass-produced with synthetic materials. They are not the same as what Japanese formally used so that the artisans of those materials are even more exposed to being out of business than are the artisans of Kyoto textiles.
In the peak era, one of the Artisan Dyer Managers, Shiraki Senshō (Shiraki, 2015), did business with 300 artisan studios, the biggest of which hired more than 90 artisans. When they were very busy, they had 500 subcontractors to outsource the jobs. Now, the manager does business with 80 artisan studios, and each studio consists of one to three artisans. The average age of artisans of Kyoto Textiles is increasing. Many of them were apprentices during the industry’s heyday of the 1950s and 1960s and worked with the designs of the flourished era. Even those artisans who got in the industry in the 1980s are now called masters.

The lack of successors in the textile production had been a topic in the industry since the 1970s. But the difference between now and then is that they needed labor force in the mass-production factories in the 1970s because their production was deeply dependent on labor even though they were called mass-production. But now, the lack of the successors means the disconnection of the production loop. A lot of artisans have died or have closed their business. Consumers who have been wearing kimonos since the peak time in the 1970s are also getting old, and their numbers are decreasing. Furthermore, few younger consumers, who follow the path of the conventional kimono consumers, are coming into the market.

Even worse, M.M.s have started leaving Muromachi district. Some have closed their businesses and others have experienced bankruptcies. Whenever old M.M. went out of the district, there were new comers who established new kimono businesses there, but now, this is not the case. High-rise condominiums are erected one after another in the district recently. It is less likely that new M.M. will come in the district to start new textile businesses there.

Discussion

Seventy years ago, M.M. restarted the traditional kimono business by following the traditional business model. However, against their intentions, the kimono they produced gradually shifted from what Japanese had been wearing to what Japanese women would wear. In other words, the expanding Western clothing culture that prevailed in the market gradually pushed the kimono into dress up clothing, then into formal wear, and finally into ceremonial attire. During that era, M.M. put special effort on optimizing advanced technologies in producing traditional Kyoto textiles efficiently, which was quite successful, as seen in the fact that production volume (of Kyoto textiles) exceeded ten million bolts of fabric per annum for several years in the early 1970s. When the sales figures started declining, M.M. concentrated on producing and selling more profitable, expensive kimonos.

The rise and fall of the kimono business after the WWII era transformed the kimono trends, such as the combination of motifs and colors, fabric constructions, and fiber types, which eventually limited the variation of Kyoto textiles compared to those from the previous era while providing plenty of mass-produced products for the market. These changes must have been the cause of distraction for Western observers who had been looking at the kimono as a represent of exotic Japan. Certainly, the kimono and Kyoto textiles were not produced for Western observers but for Japanese consumers, who also seemed to have lost interest in wearing them. But it is hard to think that Japanese women truly lost interest in wearing the kimono because they always had excuses for not wearing the kimono. They enjoyed wearing both types of clothing, Western and the kimono, and are proud of having both of them in their closet and drawer, respectively. They just had to give up everyday use of the kimono because of the Westernization that Japan had experienced over the years.

But the environment started changing around the turn of the century. The younger generation who grew up with very little kimono experience started wearing summer casual cotton kimono (Yukata[yukata].) Some of the retailers outside of the kimono industry started selling cheap cotton kimono outfits as ready-to-wear in their Western clothing stores. In recent years, second hand kimono outfits are sold at one tenth or even one hundredth of the original fabric prices. The kimono outfits made of cost-effective fabrics can be borrowed as cheap as 70 USD for four days including all the items needed to wear the kimono along with a handbag and shoes (zori) [38]. They are all prepared as ready-to-wear kimono so that people can pick up whatever they want to wear for the day. There is no strict coordinate regulation anymore; anyone who wears the kimono can decide how to wear it. The sales figures are still small, but as long as these kimonos are within the reach of young Japanese, the future of the kimono outfits will be bright.

Still, many people in the kimono industry, including M.M., seem to consider that Kyoto textiles or other traditional kimono textiles cannot survive without thekimono outfits or vice versa. They have been complaining that Japanese should wear the kimono made of Kyoto textiles more often; otherwise, the kimono culture will distinguish (Honda, 2015). It is less likely that the Japanese will wear the
kimono again as they wore it 50 to 100 years ago. The kimono is fashion and it should be fashion; it is not tradition. In order to see the kimono in the future, the author believes that the kimono outfit and Kyoto textiles should be considered separately at this point.

The T-shaped kimono outfit will survive into the future fashion market as ready-to-wear clothing, but it does not have to use hand-painted yūzen dyeing or other hand-made kimono textiles. Kyoto textiles of screen, roller, and digital prints can be used if they are reasonably priced, but the kimono can use any type of fabric; narrow or wide width; silk, cotton, wool, or synthetic; prints, woven, knitted, or even embroidery lace. There are many attractive fabrics around the world. The shape of the kimono outfit is very unique and attractive so that if more kimono outfits are sold at decent prices as ready-to-wear and if they are washable, men or women, young or old, can enjoy wearing them as one of the many choices in their wardrobe. Even non-Japanese may come to love the kimono outfit as fashionable ready-to-wear clothing. What is needed now is to develop attractive kimonos with reasonable prices.

However, it is less likely that those future kimonos will use the hand-made Kyoto textiles that the artisans’ predecessors dyed with plant dyes and that M.M. had been producing and selling as traditional kimono textiles in the post-WWII era because they are too expensive to be used for clothing. In addition, Japanese are somehow trapped with the idea that Kyoto textiles should only be for the kimono and its accessories. A few traditional kimonos may survive into the future, like French Haute Couture, but those hand-made articles of clothing will be made for a few wealthy people.

Looking back the history, many of the hand-made materials of the past were destroyed by the invention of new technologies in the 20th century, why not hand-made Kyoto textiles? It could have been terminated at any stages of screen, roller, or digital prints were developed and introduced in the industry. Instead, hand-painted yūzen dyeing and other hand-made Kyoto textiles have been survived into the 21st century as one of the most prestigious techniques of dyeing. One of the reasons for this fact is that Japanese admired them as real Kyoto textiles (such as real yūzen dyeing and hon-yūzen.) Another reason is that M.M. played the role of preserving the skills and conveying the products. If there weren’t M.M. in Muromachi district, the skills of artisans and Artisan Dyer Managers to produce hand-made Kyoto textiles would not have survived until today in the shape of the kimono.

Nevertheless, this does not mean that the future Kyoto textiles must be created only for the kimono. It is important for us to recognize the present situation of hand-made Kyoto textiles and consider future possibilities to preserve them.

The demand decline for Kyoto textiles and the increase of the average age of artisans limit the opportunities for artisan successors to obtain skills that have been passed down over the years, which will eventually result in the vanishing of Kyoto textiles, especially hand-painted yūzen dyeing. Yet, if the future kimono can survive without Kyoto textiles, it will release Kyoto textiles from M.M.’s business model and let artisans create original hand-made Kyoto textiles. They do not have to consider the age range of the wearers or the cost of the products. Artisan Dyer Managers and artisans can dye whatever they want using their exquisite textile designs and techniques.

Sixty years ago, when the first several human national treasures archived their skills and wanted their merchandise to be admired as fine art, they tried to convey foreign and domestic motifs set in a traditional kimono fabric design with traditional techniques and structures. The motifs and designs of the fabrics were innovative at that time and even now, and influenced not a few artisans. Unfortunately, their pieces had to stay in the kimono business then. In the case of many of those hand-painted yūzen dyeing, the single piece of fabric [no duplicate] was produced, sold to a consumer, and then put in the drawer for good so that it is hard to capture the exact designs and trends of what the past masters developed. There are very few archives left in M.M.’s or Artisan Dyer Managers’ hands, but from what we can see, the dynamic designs of the industry’s flourishing era are attractive even now.

This may be the last chance for surviving artisans who experienced the industry’s golden era to dye Kyoto textiles with innovative designs as contemporary art or art-to-wear. And possibly, the eyes of Western curators could help Kyoto textiles break free from the traditional kimono industry and revitalize the imaginative exotic designs that artisans of 1950s and 1960s had. It is proposed that, for the survival of vanishing Kyoto textiles, especially those hand paint applications should be archived, and the extraordinarily beautiful and skillful contemporary Kyoto textiles should be produced and marketed to the world as fine art or art-to-wear.

Conclusion
The environment for kimono fashion has been changed dramatically in the last 150 years since Japan’s opening to the West. The kimono experienced the Industrial Revolution, wars, and has been exposure to Western clothing culture, yet it survived every challenge. It could have been completely replaced by Western clothing somewhere along the way, but it was not because it found a secure niche among the changing fashions. Western clothing came to play the role of business and casual attire for Japanese everyday life, leaving the kimono for formal attire. M.M. also played an important role by incessantly promoting the kimono to Japanese consumers, and their success consequently patronized artisans and helped to preserve their skills. If it were not for Western clothing or M.M., the kimono as it is now would not exist. However, the admiration of the kimono and its textiles by Western observers did not last in the post-WWII era. As for the Japanese, they feel that nothing has been changed in the kimono, but a closer look at it reveals that the kimono has been changing continuously to the present, just like Western clothing trends. The kimono at present is not the same as what Japanese had in the past, and it will keep changing into the future.

Those future changes, we have seen, will almost certainly lead to the virtual extinction of traditional hand-made Kyoto textiles if their only use continues to be as kimono fabric. To take them to the next stage where they can once again be admired by observers around the world, Kyoto textiles will need to be developed apart from the present kimono outfits. For this reason, one can only hope that the key stakeholders involved in Kyoto textiles will recognize the importance of archiving applications of hand-made Kyoto textiles and creating a new, living future for them as a form of art or art-to-wear.

Notes

1. Exhibitions about Japonisme are very popular in Japan. The most recent exhibition was “Bosuton bijutsukan, kareinaru japonizumu-ten” (Boston Museum, Great Japonisme) held at Setagaya Museum between Jun. 28 and Sep. 15, 2015. http://www.museum.or.jp/modules/im_event/?controller=event_dtl&input%5Bid%5D=81932

2. Meisen is woven kimono produced in eastern part of Japan, explained in “Variety of Formal Wear” section

3. The period between 1603 and 1867 in the history of Japan.

4. Corwin mentions, “American interests in Japan after 1920s was shifted from the elegant silk garments that first attracted to American attention to the handcraft movement in folk art, mingei.”

5. Adachi mentions that only 0.3% of the women wear the kimono as everyday use among whom had worn the kimono at least once in life (36.2 percent of all.)


8. Kyoto Orimono Oroshi Shōgyō Kumniai Sōritsu 10 shūnen Kinenshi Iinkai ed., Muromachi - Sono seiritsu to shinten, Muromachi - Sono seiritsu to shinten, 24-25. Cotton, hemp and other imported materials were more dealt in Tokyo and Osaka.


10. Yūzen dyeing has not been invented yet in the 15th century.


12. Tsugita, in discussion with the author, October 24, 2015. Many of new comers had been employees of M.M. before the war.

13. In this case, consumers provided greige fabrics.


15. The author learned it from her grandfather and the fact was endorsed in the discussion with Hirokazu Tsugita on October 24, 2015.

16. Tokunaga mentions that Kyō-zome, translated into Kyoto textiles (translation by the author), means “dyed in Kyoto.” Yūzen dyeing dyed in Kyoto are also called Kyō-yūzen. Kyoto textiles consist of yūzen dyeing (Kyō-yūzen), solid color dyeing, gradation dyeing with a brush, and other dyeing methods produced in Kyoto. Stencil, Kata-zome, screen, roller, and digital printing
methods are also called yūzen dyeing (Kyō-yūzen). Among these, hand-painted yūzen dyeing is categorized the highest class of Kyoto textiles (industry common knowledge).

17. Kyō-yūzen and Nishijin-ori are the two main dyed and woven materials respectively in Kyoto. Kyoto textiles are dyed (painted or printed) on greige fabrics while Nishijin textiles are woven materials made of dyed yarns.

18. Kyoto Orimono Oroshi Shōgyō Kumniai Sōritsu 10 shūnen Kinenshi linkai ed., Muromachi - Sono seiritsu to shinenten, p. 87. In1978, M.M. dealt with 94% of Nishijin textiles produced in Nishijin district, 90% of textiles produced in Tango, 60% of Kagoshima, 50% of Amami, 45% of Shiozawa, Ojiya, and Yūki, 30% of Tōkamachi, Ashikaga, Isezaki, and Murayama, and 20% of Hachioji, Yonezawa, Kiryū, Bingo, and Hashima.

19. Industry common knowledge between 1950s to early 1990s, endorsed by Tsugita & Shiraki in discussion with the author on Oct. 24, 2015

20. Process of yūzen can be seen on YOUTUBE; https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=MKG13KDqKj8


22. The difference between kata-zome and screen printing is that the latter has a frame on the stencil pattern.

23. Tameji Ueno, Kihachi Tabata, and Eiichi Yamada were artisans from Kyoto, Katsuma Nakamura from Tokyo, and Uzan Kimura from Kanazawa.

24. The author’s recognition endorsed by the discussion with Hirokazu Tsugita on October 24, 2015.

25. Women had been wearing modified kimono with narrow sleeves and pants during the WWII. Such as plain, twill, satin, crape, or jacquard, etc.

26. Such as silk, cotton, wool or synthetics, etc.

27. According to Kyoto Orimono Oroshi Shōgyō Kumniai Sōritsu 10 shūnen Kinenshi linkai ed., Muromachi - Sono seiritsu to shinenten, p. 73, hōmongi became popular among general consumers because of the economic growth and the fever of the marriage of the crown prince in 1960.

28. Tsubesage fabric can be dyed as a bolt. It does not have to be basted (cost saving) before draft painting because it has fewer motifs (no need to adjust motifs on the seams) compared to hōmongi and other larger motif kimonos.

29. Yamaguchi, (1967) pp. 32-37; Some to Ori, (April, 1977), pp. 32-33. These articles mention that fabrics for furisode had been made with hand-painted yūzen dyeing for upper class people, but as more and more people started wearing them in the 1960s and 1970s, fewer fabrics were produced by hand-painted yūzen dyeing. Also in “Kyoto Orimono Oroshi Shōgyō Kumniai Sōritsu 10 shūnen Kinenshi linkai ed., Muromachi - Sono seiritsu to shinenten”, pp. 74-75, M.M. outsourced furisode fabric production in Tōkamachi, Niigata with technical support, where multiple yūzen steps were processed in one studio so that the production cost could be reduced. The furisode production in Tōkamachi peaked at 210,000 bolts in 1973.

30. The Rengōkai (federation) consists of associations of yūzen dyers of every process. The data has been released every year since 1968.

31. Kyō Yūzen Kimiai Rengōkai established as the present name was in 1971.


33. Summer kimonos use special greige fabrics and do not use lining, while kimonos for other seasons use lining.

34. Sales pitch, “omedetai-gara desu” and “Isshō-mono desu.” Both do not imply “fashionable,” but “a happy garment” and “a garment for your entire life” respectively. These were the most frequently used words by kimono salespersons. Common knowledge.

35. Industry common knowledge at that time, endorsed by Hirokazu Tsugita in discussion with the author, October 24, 2015.

36. The website of Kimono rental shop – wakana: http://wakana-kimono.com, for example.

**References**


Dickerson, K. G. (1999), Textiles and apparel in the global economy. Merrill, U.S.A.

Honda, Y. (2015), in discussion with the author, October 23.


"Kongetsu no Senshoku Gyōkai, Shōwa no Kimono – Chūburisode," (1977), [Kimono industry this month, Kimono of Showa-era - Loose flowing long sleeve, Furisode]. Some to Ori, April, pp. 32-33.


Kyoto Orimono Orosi Shōgyō Kumiai Sōritsu 10 shūnen Kinenshi linkai, Ed. (1979), Muromachi - Sono seiritu to shinten, [Muro-machi, The establishment and development]. Kyoto Orimono Orosi Shōgyō Kumiai.


Process of yūzen on YOUTUBE: https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=MKGI13KDqKj8


“Sukurin koso ryūkō no gendōryoku – eiga niyori kimono no sendenkōka–” (1958), [Movies are the driving force of marketing the kimono]. Some to Ori, January, pp. 131-134.


The website of Kimono rental shop – wakana-: “http://wakana-kimono.com

Selling the concept of brands.
The Swedish advertising industry
and branding in the 1920’s¹

Elin Åström Rudberg

The Institute for Economic and Business History Research and the Department of Marketing and Strategy, Stockholm School of Economics, Stockholm, Sweden

Abstract

Purpose: The paper seeks to contribute to research on the history of brands and branding by examining the Swedish advertising industry’s branding practices and perception of brands during the 1920’s.

Methodology/approach: the paper is based on a study of primary sources from the Swedish advertising industry, producers and retailers, using an approach that seeks to assess different actors’ actions and motives.

Findings: The paper shows that the Swedish advertising industry had an emerging knowledge about the importance of modern brands and branding and also how it used that knowledge for strategic purposes to affect the market, especially through a nationwide advertising campaign for brands launched in 1925. It also shows how the advertising industry, producers and retailers had different views upon and interests in brands. The findings are discussed in relation to the institutional setting of the advertising industry and to previous research.

Implications/limitations: The paper argues that the increased prevalence of brands should be perceived as the result of the efforts and interests of different actors rather than a “natural” consequence in the wake of mass consumption.

Originality/value: There is still limited research on how brands became one of the characteristics of modern society, both in Sweden as well as the international literature.

Key words: Advertising history, history of branding and brands, business history

Paper type: Case study

Introduction

In 1925, the largest advertising agencies in Sweden carried out an ambitious advertising campaign for branded goods in the daily press. The campaign represented a strategic attempt from the advertising agencies to enlarge their own market but also reveals the agencies’ perception of brands and branding at the time. This paper studies the campaign from two perspectives. First as an example of how the advertising agencies tried to “advertise advertising” in order to promote their own business and second as an example of how brands were described and perceived at the time. The campaign was designed to persuade and educate large parts of society about the benefits of brands and offers a unique insight into the views and ideas of the advertising agencies. It also shows how an important part of the advertising industry tried to affect and shape both the prevalence and meaning of brands during a period that preceded the postwar mass consumption boom in Western Europe.

The increased prevalence of brands and the practice of branding during the 20th century is often portrayed as a relatively straightforward development (see e.g. Larsson et al., 2013, p. 14). Recent research has tried to provide a more nuanced description of the historical development of brands, but has done so on a relatively aggregate level (Bastos & Levy, 2012, Mercer, 2010 and Moore & Reid, 2008). This paper argues that the increased prevalence of sophisticated brands and branding practices cannot be understood simply as a “natural” development in the wake of mass production and consumption but should be perceived as the result of several different actors’ ambitions and interests in such a development. Although not owners of brands themselves, the advertising agencies in Sweden

¹The author is grateful to the participants at the 2nd Workshop on the evolution of the retail trade in the 20th century, the seminar at the Institute for Economic and Business History Research at the Stockholm School of Economics and two anonymous reviewers for helpful comments. The research for this paper is financed by Torsten Söderberg’s Foundation.
during the 1920’s understood the potential of brands for their own business. Of importance to the analysis is the specific nature of the Swedish market for advertising, especially advertisements, which was highly cartelized at the time (Funke, 2015, pp. 224-226 and Gustafsson, 1974). Since the Swedish advertising agencies had agreed to not compete with each other over clients they were forced to enlarge the market by turning more and more companies into frequent advertisers.

**Aim, sources and method**

The aim of the paper is to contribute with more knowledge to how and why brands in the present-day sense became such an important characteristic of the modern consumer society. The approach is based on the fact that actors often have diverging interests and use their resources in different ways to try to affect the future development of the market. The first empirical part of the article describes the institutions in the advertising industry and the market actors that had an interest in brands and branding. I also seek to assess the Swedish advertising agencies’ knowledge about branding at the time. In doing this, I explain the context of the Swedish advertising agencies and the rationale behind why the campaign was carried out. This also includes understanding other key actors’ interests in brands, primarily from the retail industry and brand owners’ side. The second empirical part analyzes the campaign in itself and seeks to answer the questions how the campaign was designed and what the key arguments were. This reveals how the advertising agencies viewed brands and how they presented the benefits of a modern brand.

For the paper both unpublished and published sources have been used. Sources concerning the campaign come from the archive of the Association of Advertising Agencies (Annonsbyråeramass Förening, henceforth AF). The campaign itself was, besides being published in newspapers across the country, also printed (Propagandan för varumärkta varor sommaren 1925, 1925). Sources from the Swedish Newspaper Publishers’ Association (Svenska Tidningsutgivareföreningen, henceforth TU) are also used. From the sources pertaining to the advertising agencies and their organization, AF, and the campaign in itself, I have systematically gone through all material that is likely to contain information about the campaign in particular and branding in general. The same method was used for the sources from TU and I have also gone through all the issues of their trade journal during the 1920’s, Pressens Tidning. Furthermore, I have read all the issues of other main trade journals that are likely to contain content about brands and branding, such as Svenska Varor (a magazine by the Swedish Exhibition, published from 1927) and Annonsören (the magazine of the Swedish Advertisers’ Association, published from 1926). In addition, other published sources have also been used. In analyzing the sources, I have specifically aimed at understanding what the advertising agencies knew of branding at the time and what the context looked like, in terms of other actors’ viewpoint and interest in brands. Such an approach enables a comprehensive understanding of the actions of the advertising industry in relation to brands at the time.

It is important to note the difference between a trademark and a brand. The trademark represents what is legally protected, upon which the brand rests. The brand is thus a wider concept including the trademark but also intangible associations that consumers make in relationship to the product (Mercer, 2010, p. 18). In Swedish there is only one word for brand and trademark, varumärke (literally “product mark”). Thus, it is not clear from the wording in the sources if the actors referred to the notion of trademark or brand. However, it is clear that the actors had something more in mind than only the legal term trademark, when they were discussing brands. That is not to say that their idea of brands was the same as the one that is predominant today. Instead, the sources indicate that the actors were in a period of formulating an understanding of brands somewhere in between a trademark and the more elaborate perception of brands.

**Branding and advertising**

Previous research on the history of brands and branding has tended to focus on specific case studies of branding practices in industries and companies. The importance of entrepreneurship and technology for early brands has been recognized and also, evidently, the emergence of trademarks and trademark law (Tadajewski & Jones, 2014, pp 1246-1248. See also e.g. Howard, 2008 and Larsson, 2013). Research on the development of advertising and the advertising industry has also, often as part of a more general analysis, treated the emergence of a more branding focused business in the modern sense of the expression (see e.g. Funke, 2013, Hermansson, 2002, Laird, 1998 and Pope, 1983). There are also a few overview articles that surveys the development of brands and branding in a long-term perspective (Tadajewski & Jones, 2014, Bastos & Levy, 2012 and Moore & Reid, 2008). However, there is still
limited research on the growth of brands and branding practices in the 20th century from the perspective of the advertising industry. An exception is historian Stefan Schwarzkopf’s article about American and British advertising agencies during the 1920’s, which shows that the agencies developed an understanding of the emotional and symbolic capacities of brands much earlier than usually acknowledged (Schwarzkopf, 2008b).

In 1955, marketing researchers Gardner and Levy published an influential article that discussed brands in a new way and recognized that consumers were guided by their “brand image” (Gardner & Levy, 1955). The article introduced the modern way of thinking about brands noticing the importance of symbolism and “brand personality”. According to Schwarzkopf the article was a revelation for advertising professionals since it made explicit a practice that many of the inventive advertising agencies had already practiced for at least three decades (Schwarzkopf, 2008b). It follows that leading advertising agencies in the U.S. and Britain practiced a more sophisticated approach to brands, market research and advertising already in the 1920’s (see e.g. Schwarzkopf, 2009). Later marketing research has claimed that the “brand personality” aspect is actually the ultimate role of brands (Aaker, 1996). Brands should carry and communicate cultural meaning both of transactional character (related to information about quality and origin) and of transformational character (image-related) (Moore & Reid, 2008, pp. 430-431).

Most research on the history of branding do not go into detail about exactly why and how modern brands become a significant trait of the 20th century society. The accounts often recognize that mass production meant that customers got more goods to choose from which lead to a need from the producers’ side to differentiate their products. With increased urbanization the relationships between consumers and local retailers was weakened and a branded product was a way for consumers to differentiate among products. Brand owners tried to keep the quality level in line with the expectations so that consumers would stay loyal to the brand (Larsson et al., 2013, p. 14). This kind of description is accurate but fails to acknowledge the historical events and actors who acted, with different interests, in order to affect the development of brands and branding in different directions.

**Brands and advertising in Sweden in the early 20th century**

To understand the empirical results of the paper, it is necessary with a brief historical account of brands and advertising in Sweden. Of particular importance is the introduction of the first modern trademark law in 1884, which was developed in the wake of several international conventions on the topic (Dahlén, 2013, p. 73). Two decades before, the guilds had been abolished, which opened up for a new market for brands and also for new regulation that offered protection for companies’ patents, copyrights and trademarks. The law of 1884 offered protection for the combination of words and shape/image in a distinctive form, but even after the law was passed there was continuous discussion about exactly what significant properties of a product that should be protected. In Sweden, especially the chemical-technical industry was early in terms of creating sophisticated brands, while the grocery retail was characterized by a lot of unbranded goods. The grocery retail was also fragmented with most retailers in the 1920’s still being specialized in e.g. meat, milk, vegetables and fruits and more general grocery stores (Gerentz & Ottosson, 1999, pp. 230-239).

The Swedish advertising agencies of the late 19th century were mostly concerned with mediating advertisements to the press. During the first decades of the 20th century and especially during the 1920’s and 1930’s, the agencies were in transition period, moving from being advertisement brokers to the daily press, towards becoming more like what we today associate with an advertising agency: supporting and advising clients with their broader marketing and advertising problems, including brand development. This development path was on a general level similar to the one observed in other countries such as Britain and the U.S. (see e.g. Schwarzkopf, 2008a and Fox, 1997). The campaign of 1925 should also be interpreted against this background.

**The organization of the Swedish advertising industry in the 1920’s**

The Swedish advertising industry developed in a unique way during the 20th century due to an extensive and long-lived cartel on the market that included the largest advertising agencies. There were attempts to organize the market in a similar way in other countries but these attempts were only partially successful and only in the short term (see e.g. Schwarzkopf, 2008a, p. 65, Johnston, 2000, pp. 120-122 and Pope, 1983, pp. 154-162). The cartel was initiated by the advertising agencies in 1915 and in 1923 it was formalized through a central agreement between AF and TU, an arrangement that lasted until 1965. The main and most important mechanism of the cartel was TU’s right to authorize agencies and
the main goal was to avoid price pressure on newspaper advertisements. Only with an authorization was an agency allowed to mediate advertisements on a national level and to receive commission from newspapers, which was the dominant advertising channel. In the 1920’s, the number of authorized agencies varied between eight and twelve of which two were dominant and accounted for around 50 percent of the market (Protocol 9 June 1926, AF, vol. 3). The industry was still very small seen from the perspective of the national economy. However, there was optimism within the wider advertising circles in Sweden and a certainty that advertising belonged to the future (Björklund, 1925). The advertising cartel aimed at eliminating price competition; advertisers should learn that there was no difference in price between the agencies. This way, the agencies argued that focus would shift to the quality of the work of the agencies and ultimately, the services that were provided.

During the 1920’s there was also an agreement in the cartel not to acquire each other’s clients. This affected the room for maneuver of the individual agencies and the strategy of AF. It also upset advertisers that saw themselves reduced to “barter goods” on a market controlled by AF and TU (Annonsören, 1926). As a consequence, it became crucial for the agencies to enlarge the market by turning more and more companies into advertisers or by making existing clients advertise more.

**The Swedish advertising agencies and brands in the 1920’s**

How developed were the Swedish advertising agencies’ ideas and practices connected to brands and branding during the 1920’s? Brands were intimately connected to advertising. A brand needed advertising on a large scale to reach its purpose and large-scale advertising needed a brand to advertise. In this regard it is of interest that in the late 1930’s one of the largest advertising agencies in the cartel funded what was probably the first academic research report on brands and advertising in Sweden, written by researchers at the Stockholm School of Economics (Studier över Märkesvarudistribution och Märkesvarureklam, 1947). Even though being written in the late 1930’s, the report refers to research on brands from the late 1920’s and early 1930’s (mostly from Germany but also from the U.S.), which makes it probable that at least some of the report’s ideas and knowledge about brands was familiar to advertising professionals in the 1920’s. In addition, the report shows the continued importance that the advertising agencies paid to brands and branding.

The report tried to reach a common definition of what a brand (varumärke) really was and discussed the role of brands for the different parts in the distribution chain. Common characterizing traits of brands were mass production, advertising, a distinctive form, an established quality and a set retail price. It was also acknowledged that the “consumer’s subjective impression” was of importance: “a brand is a sort of good that has become well-known through a mark (or particular form) with which the consumer links a notion of the goods’ quality and type” (Studier över Märkesvarudistribution och Märkesvarureklam, 1947, pp. 12-13).

On a practical level, an interesting example of how the advertising agencies viewed brands is from an account of a modern campaign for advertisements by the agency Gumaelius in 1927. The account is from a celebratory book and concerned a fictional case, however it was written with the purpose of giving an accurate (but of course idealized) description of the agency’s core business practice. The described case concerned a producer who contacted Gumaelius about the launch of a new product on the market. After a first initial meeting the “acquisition man” together with an artist and perhaps a photographer from the agency would travel to the factory to learn about the production of the new product. To actually visit the client was a relatively new part of the agency’s service offer, only a few years earlier it had been unusual (Gumælius’ revy, 1920). Important questions were raised such as how the product should be packaged, what the name should be, and what the firm mark (firmamärket) would look like. After returning from the visit several artists would create independent proposals for a brand and the packaging and the editorial staff would be given the task to propose a suitable name and ideas for a series of advertisements (Sydow von, 1927, pp. 87-93). The name should ideally be unique, short, and if possible suggest one of the most important properties of the product (Grafström, 1924). It is clear that the product that was to be branded, its properties and quality was of key importance for the advertising agencies. If the product was not good enough, branding and also advertising would be useless (Svenska Dagbladet, 1926). The emphasis on the need of high quality for branded products was an aspect discussed by scholars at the time too (Bastos & Levy, 2012, p. 353).

Besides learning about the product and its properties, the advertising industry was also fully aware of the importance of the market conditions and competition and had ideas about how to research such aspects. The CEO of Gumaelius, Ernst Grafström, recognized that for a new product, it was often wise to test it on a small suitable district to learn about how it fared on the market. Supported by the knowledge...
of the product and the competitors it was possible to define the selling points of the product, and these must be given a prominent place in the advertisements (Grafström, 1924). A similar account was given by another advertising agency executive (Törnblom, 1927). The mentioning of the importance of identifying the selling points implies that these advertising professionals had an emerging knowledge concerning a more modern approach to advertising and brands (later developed into what is called the “unique selling proposition” of a product).

A more explicit example of how Gumaelius was involved in the creation of a brand was the agency’s work for the Swedish Sugar Factory (Svenska Sockerfabriks AB) (Björklund, 1929, p. 38). The agency had worked out proposals for new packaging, posters and an advertisement campaign in 1923, but the project was not launched until 1926 due to a cautious company board (Björklund, 1967, p. 219). Apparently it was not uncontrovertial for the company to launch pre-packaged sugar. Another of the agencies in the cartel, headed by Folke Stenbeck who would become one of the most influential persons in the Swedish advertising industry, was also a forerunner in brand development. Stenbeck had been studying advertising at Columbia University in New York and brought home new ideas and inspiration. In a much-noticed advertisement campaign for a chocolate brand in 1921, he introduced elements beyond the direct properties of the product, which was considered to be very novel at the time (Edman, 1958, pp. 14-25).

The accounts above reveal that the creation of a modern campaign for advertisements was intimately connected to the creation of a brand. In fact, one could even say that the agencies described their work as brand development work. It is uncertain exactly to what extent the agencies of the cartel were trusted with the creation and control over a new brand in the way described above, but it surely points at what the ambition was and what they judged to be within the realm of their business. The agencies’ employees did not only mediate advertisements, but wanted to be perceived as skilled experts in a variety if sub-fields connected to both branding and advertising such as name ideation, packaging design, market knowledge and ultimately the creation of advertisements. Great effort seems to have been taken in order to understand the prerequisites for a new brand and an advertisement campaign based on the client’s production and the product’s properties. However, the importance of consumer knowledge was less developed but generally focused on evaluating the readers of different newspapers, which seems less sophisticated than the methods used by e.g. the British and American advertising agencies around the same time (cf. Schwarzkopf, 2009). On the other hand, since the Swedish advertising agencies were so intimately connected to the newspapers, it was logical for them to think about consumers mainly in terms of newspaper readers.

Brands, retailers and producers

Within the retailer and producer circles at the end of the 1920’s there were disagreements on brands and how different interests should handle them. The founder of the Swedish Advertisers’ Association, Bertil Andersén, complained about the fact that retailers often abandoned the “original” brands of certain products in favor of cheaper copies (Andersén, 1928). Andersén also denounced how certain stores with a cheap profile sold branded goods for a price much lower than in the regular retail stores (Andersén, 1929). When the advertising manager of a large packaging company encouraged retailers to sell brands for a slightly lower price than the set retail price (as a trick to boost sales) it upset many brand owners and prompted the manager to apologize and change his statement (Annonsören 1930). That brands per definition should have a set price in retail seems thus to have been a strong ideal, at least from the producer’s side. A set price was also an aspect that was highlighted by the early German research on brands as integral to what types of products that could be considered to be brands (Studier över Märkesvarudistribution och Märkesvarureklam, 1947, pp. 12-13).

From the retailers’ side, they worried about loss of independence (Baltzer, 1931). An article in an industry magazine noted the downgrading of the retailer’s position: “[the grocer] does not sell anymore, he dispatches the goods that have already been sold through the advertising” (Bergendahl, 1932). What brands that should be sold (the so called producer brands or the retailer’s own brands) and who should carry out and pay for the advertising was also discussed by Andersén and the CEO of one of the largest department stores in Stockholm. The background was that large department stores had increased their opposition towards brands since they had to carry large stocks of products without having a full assortment (Andersén, 1932 and André, 1932).

The discussions in the trade press between retailers and producers from the late 1920’s shows many similarities to the academic discussion in the Swedish research report from the 1930’s. It recognized that brands were a potential source of conflict among manufacturers, wholesalers and retailers who competed
to position themselves as the dominant brand for consumers (Studier över Märkesvarudistribution och Märkesvarureklam, 1947, pp. 17-37, see also Bastos & Levy, 2012, p. 353 and Hermansson, 2002, pp 122-126). For the retailer, it was recognized that brands meant easier control when purchasing, easier handling of the goods and most importantly, it facilitated the sales work in the store. The time saving aspect of brands in grocery retail was considered to be of great importance and was also one of the major findings of a study by the researcher Gerhard Törnqvist, who would later become a pioneer in marketing research in Sweden (Törnqvist, 1929). The main disadvantage was that producer brands risked undermining the independent position of the retailer towards consumers.

In 1930, Törnqvist contemplated about the future for brands. Based on his account both retailers and producers were thinking about in which direction the development was going. A brand was a way to establish the valuable intimate contact with the consumer and at the time producer brands had a strong position but the future development was an open question. Retailers could either focus on selling producer brands or start to develop their own brands, which had happened in e.g. the U.S (Törnqvist, 1930).

**The campaign for brands in 1925**

After the economic downturn that followed the end of World War I the Swedish advertising industry tried to recover. In 1925, there was still a feeling of crisis within the advertising agencies, it was difficult to acquire new clients and the agencies put down a lot of resources in their sales work. In an attempt to remedy the situation, the agencies in the cartel decided to initiate a new agreement in addition to the already existing agreement between themselves and TU. The new agreement was based on quota calculations aimed at completely eliminating all price competition between the agencies (Rättviksavtalet, 1925, AF, vol. 3). Each agency would be allotted a certain share of the market based on its market share from the previous year. Lists of new potential clients would be created by a central committee and distributed to the agencies according to certain rules.

As part of the agreement it was also noted that the market needed to be enlarged. For this purpose, all agencies were to carry out an extensive campaign for branded goods in order to create new objects of advertisements (Rättviksavtalet, 1925, AF, vol. 3). A sum of 10 000 Swedish Crowns was dedicated to the campaign, where each agency would contribute with a sum that equaled its market share. However, the agencies tried to get the advertisements published for free. The argument towards the newspapers was that the purpose of the campaign was to stimulate the advertisements of Swedish products, which would be beneficial for both the advertising agencies and the newspapers (Protocol, 9 October 1925, TU, vol. F5:9). At the outset, AF also wanted different Swedish companies to endorse the campaign by signing the advertisements together with the advertising agencies. This however, turned out to be difficult so AF had to settle with signing the advertisements themselves (Protocol, 3 July 1925, AF, vol. 3).

Before the campaign was launched, Graaström introduced the idea for the newspaper publishers (Graaström, 1925). He especially highlighted that the campaign would be beneficial for “all interested parties”: the public would get better products and be guaranteed that they really bought what they wanted, the business world would be strengthened and new advertisement objects would be created from which both the newspapers and the advertising industry would profit. He also maintained that brands – on the condition that the product was good and worth its price – would lead to more stable sales within Sweden and a greater probability of success on foreign markets. Hence the campaign was also of importance for the national economy.

The finished campaign consisted of a series of 16 advertisements that were published in Swedish daily newspapers throughout the summer and fall of 1925. The timing was chosen since it was believed that business leaders had more time at their hands during the summer, but they would still read the newspapers and thus be more susceptible to the message (Graaström, 1925). Also, the newspapers normally had less advertisements during the summer months so it would be easier to have the campaign published.

Below is a table listing all the advertisements (with the original Swedish headline in brackets) as well as the intended recipients and main argument of each advertisement. The intended recipient is based on an interpretation of whom the advertisement spoke to. This was more or less explicit with appeals in the ads to e.g. “house wives” or “producers”. The order is chronological in the sense that the first advertisement was always published first, followed by the second and so on.

Table I. List of advertisements, recipient and main argument in the campaign for branded goods in 1925.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Advertisement headline</th>
<th>Intended recipient</th>
<th>Main argument</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. About the importance of the brand (Om varumärkets betydelse)</td>
<td>General (producers, retailers, consumers)</td>
<td>The brand has a value for all interested parties.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. The brand – a valuable asset (Varumärket – en värdefull tillgång)</td>
<td>Producer</td>
<td>The brand is a valuable asset for the producer.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. The brand and the advertising (Varumärket och reklamen)</td>
<td>Producer</td>
<td>A brand and advertising are mutually necessary.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. Even stronger (Allt starkare)</td>
<td>Producer</td>
<td>It is difficult to create an original brand.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. The development of the store (Butikens utveckling)</td>
<td>Retailer</td>
<td>Brands have contributed positively to the development of the store.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6. The work in the store (Arbetet i butiken)</td>
<td>Retailer</td>
<td>Brands have greatly simplified the work in the store.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7. The window display (Fönsterskyltningen)</td>
<td>Retailer</td>
<td>Brands are contributing to more appealing window displays.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8. The importance for the shop keeper (Betydelsen för affärsinnehavaren)</td>
<td>Retailer</td>
<td>Brands are contributing positively to the retailer’s sales.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9. Mark of origin on products is beneficial for all parties (Ursprungsbeteckning å varor till fördel för alla parter)</td>
<td>Consumers</td>
<td>Brands are beneficial for the buying public.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10. Draw the consequences of your own experience (Drag konsekvenserna av Eder egen erfarenhet)</td>
<td>Consumers</td>
<td>It is better for consumers to always ask for a branded product.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11. Brands are the silver stamps of retail (Varumärkena är handels silverstämplar)</td>
<td>Consumers</td>
<td>A brand is the best guarantee for the quality of a product.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12. The branded good – everywhere the same (Den varumärkta varan – överallt densamma)</td>
<td>Consumers</td>
<td>Brands make it easier to anywhere and always find the same product.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13. A lot of reasons speak in favor of buying branded goods (Många skäl tala för köp av varumärkta varor)</td>
<td>Consumers</td>
<td>It is always better to buy branded goods, especially from a safety perspective.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14. Packaged goods contribute to hygiene and comfort (Paketerade varor medverka till hygien och trevnad)</td>
<td>Consumers</td>
<td>The branded good offer an invaluable guarantee (especially simplifying storage at home).</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
The campaign was published in at least nine daily newspapers throughout roughly a five-month period. AF wanted to spread the advertisements geographically in the country. For the three larger urban areas in Sweden, the campaign was published in the major newspapers: in Stockholm Stockholms tidningen, in Gothenburg Göteborgsposten and in Malmö Sydsvenska Dagbladet. Stockholms tidningen was among the largest newspapers in Sweden at the time with high circulation figures (Gustafsson & Rydén, 2001, pp.152-153). In addition, the campaign was also published in at least six other papers from across Sweden with different political color [2]. For example, Norrländska Socialdemokraten was a regional paper of the Social Democratic party in northern Sweden and turned to working-class readers while Göteborgsposten was a liberal paper. There was thus nothing strange with communicating a highly commercial message in the working-class papers. By the 1920’s the Social Democratic movement had taken on a more pragmatic viewpoint towards advertising and realized that it was necessary to finance its newspapers, but also that it could be beneficial in the creation of a modern and more equal society (Gardeström, 2005). Also, as the income increased for groups of workers they turned into a new consumer group that could be targeted with advertisements.

The size of the advertisements of the campaign varied, but they were all relatively large, and published on different pages in the newspapers (from the front page to inside the paper). The size and placement of the ads probably depended on how well AF could negotiate with the different papers and the influx of other advertisement orders. Even though the ads spoke to different audiences the whole campaign was always published in the same paper and all advertisements in the same order.

The campaign was designed according to what the advertising agencies believed was the most efficient method at the time. The style was the American so called reason-why technique, which had, according to Ernst Grafström, proven to give very good results (Svenska Dagbladet, 1926). It ideally consisted of a catchy and well-written headline, a large image and a relatively long text where the benefits of the product were presented “objectively” in order to persuade the reader about the superiority of the good. In addition, another component was that each advertisement of the campaign tried to highlight one reason, or benefit, rather than several. This was also believed to be a key factor when creating efficient advertisement campaigns. Too many arguments in one ad would only confuse the reader and make the message less efficient. Consequently, the campaign was created based on several different building blocks that together formed the whole story that the agency had interpreted the reason-why style literally. The advertisements had headlines such as “the fourth reason”, “the fifth reason” etc. (see e.g. Nya Dagligt Allehanda, 1925, p. 5).

Behind the new ideas about how to best design advertisements was a movement towards more scientific advertising. The underlying psychology and “laws” concerning how consumers responded to various messages were believed to have been discovered (Hopkins, 1986 & 1966, pp. 213-219, see also Kreshel, 1990, p. 49). These ideas were picked up and used by various actors within the advertising world in

---

2 The other newspapers were: Norrländska Socialdemokraten, Örnsköldsviks Allehanda, Dalademokraten, Norrköpings Tidningar, Nya Wermländs Tidningen and Östgöta Correspondenten. There are no lists of newspapers that states where the advertisements were to be published. Hence, I have made searches in different newspapers in order to get an understanding of the scope of the campaign. Thus, the campaign might have been published in even more newspapers than the ones specified here.
Sweden (Nilsson, 2010, pp. 148-197) and also within the advertising agencies. However, at the advertising fair 1927 in conjunction with the Swedish Exhibition an observer complained about the poor understanding of scientific advertising in Sweden (Granath, 1927). Against the backdrop of scientific advertising it is not surprising that Gumaelius adopted the slogan “rational advertising” in the beginning of the 1930’s (Svensk Reklam, 1931, p. 160). However, the advertisements that were created using the rational and scientific approach seldom lived up to such alleged rationality or objectivity but consisted of a mix of factual and emotional arguments (Marchand, 1985, pp. 10-11 and Pope, 1983, pp. 237-243).

Image 1. Example of how one of the advertisements was published. Front page of Norrköpings Tidningar, 6 August 1925. The title of the ad reads: “The brand and the advertising”, the third advertisement in the series.
Selling the concept of brands.
The Swedish advertising industry and branding in the 1920’s

Image 2. Example of how one of the advertisements was published. Stockholmstidningen, 6 November 1925. The title of the ad reads: “A point in which everyone should be able to unite”, the last advertisement in the series.

The campaign – presentation and arguments
What were the arguments of the campaign and what do they say about how the advertising agencies perceived brands at the time? In the study of the campaign focus has been on identifying the main arguments found in the advertisements as well as how they were presented in terms of in which context they were portrayed. Due to the reason-why style of the ads they contain a lot of text, which has been the focus of the analysis, while the accompanied images have been used as supporting material.

Brands belong to the future
The ads were often embedded in a story of progress and modernity. The descriptions started with a “past”, which was portrayed as inefficient, unorganized and unappealing for producers, retailers and consumers alike. Then “the present” was introduced, which was a world where brands had entered society. In the four advertisements that were directed towards retailers this impression was strengthen by two images where one was labelled “past” (förr) and the other an ideal “now” (nu) as seen in image three below (Advertisement no. 8, The Importance for the shop keeper). The shop keeper of the old type of store that sold mainly unpackaged products stands in front of his shop with no customers in sight. With the new type of store, customers are stopping by and the entrance is crowded. The images were designed to show the greatest possible difference between the past and the present when it came to the general development of the store, the work in the store, window displays and the situation for the retailer.
The present was often portrayed as being part of the future rather than the past. To connect advertising in general to modernity and the progress of society was a common trait of the advertising industry in the U.S. and Britain (Marchand, 1985; Pope, 1983 and Laird, 1998). The rhetoric and presentation of advertising and brands was thus similar. The industry argued that advertising was enabling material prosperity since it was a prerequisite for mass consumption and mass production. One advertisement of the campaign (Advertisement no. 14) suggested that the commercial world had entered the future and that brands were an important part of this development:

“Throw a glance at the shelves in food store, look in the window displays of a shop or open the door to a pantry of today, and you shall immediately notice the large change that has happened within a few years considering the storage of goods and how they are sold. The production technique has advanced, the hygienic demands have been sharpened, the variety of different goods has increased rapidly and last but not least the interest from consumers has shown a positive increase [...]. These days, more and more producers realize the benefits it means to them to during production immediately weigh the product and package it and put on it a name and brand. More and more retailers realize that it is easier and more convenient to store and sell products in ready-made original packaging. More and more housewives and other consumers learn from experience that the branded goods – within a large variety of categories – offer an invaluable guarantee. Buy branded goods!”

By producing, selling and buying branded products all parties were able to benefit from progress and modern technology. A brand could help the producer to survive and prosper in an increasingly competitive environment (Advertisements no. 2 and 4) and it also enabled use of the modern sales technique’s “most efficient weapon: advertising” (Advertisement no. 3). For the retailer, to sell branded goods meant to have a “modern shop” (Advertisement no. 5) and that he “followed his time”
Selling the concept of brands.

The Swedish advertising industry and branding in the 1920’s

One exception to the connection between branded goods and the future is found in one advertisement where the old tradition of putting a mark on, for example, silver and gold items was highlighted (Advertisement no. 11). The use of this argument connected well with the traditional use and perception of brands as mainly a guarantee of quality and origin.

It is noteworthy that the campaign preceded the introduction of retail self-service stores in Sweden with several decades (Gerentz & Ottosson, 1999, pp 313-314). In a self-service store, the brand becomes even more important, however, the concept was not yet within the advertising agencies’ frame of reference. This is clear from one of the advertisements in the campaign depicting the interior from a grocery store, one from “the past” and one from “the present”, as seen in image four below. The image of “the present” still shows a store of the old type, with a shop keeper serving customers over the counter.

Image 4. The development of the store, advertisement no. 5. The past (förr) vs. now (nu). Image has been cropped.

The notions of progress through brands were connected to responsibility and sound business principles. When launching a brand on the market, a producer vouched for its quality. Responsibility and transparency towards consumers were thus important for a producer that introduced a new brand. In this sense, a brand also served as check on the producer, making sure that it was impossible to cheat the market. If the brand did not live up to the promised properties, which was of course not an option for any responsible business, it would be rejected by consumers. “The branded goods, for which the producers know and feel their responsibility are generally of considerable higher and even quality than others since the producer does not want to risk his good name or that his product gets a reputation as inferior” (Advertisement no. 9).

Interestingly, the underlying connection to modernity and progress were less present in the advertisements that were directed towards consumers. Those advertisements did not contain direct appeals for consumers to “follow the time” or to take part in progress, but the arguments were focused on practical and functional benefits of brands. As mentioned above, branded products were portrayed as having higher and more even quality. Avoiding products “of which you do not know anything” would give an increased sense of comfort (Advertisement no. 10). Cigarettes, which were already branded to a great extent, were used as a reference. In addition, brands enabled consumers to find exactly the same product everywhere (Advertisement no. 12), it was more hygienic and safer (Advertisement no. 13) and contributed to more order in the pantry at home (Advertisement no. 14).

The functional benefits of brands

Besides the embedding of brands in an overarching rhetoric about progress, all ads contained a perception of brands which focused on functional aspects (e.g. order, quality and origin). These aspects
Making everyone agree on the benefits of brands

Above all, the campaign was carried out in order for more brands to be created and to increase the number of advertising clients. For this purpose, all advertisements clearly exhibit arguments and presentations that were designed to bridge over possible differences in opinions about brands. As discussed above, there were diverging opinions within the business world on brands. Some retailers perceived brands as a threat to their independence and producers disliked when retailers sold brands cheaper than the set price or tried to compete by introducing brands of their own. Yet, the campaign did not only speak to the business world, but also to consumers, which shows that the agencies wanted consumers to start asking for brands when they went shopping. Thus, even though the advertising agencies did not yet conduct systematic consumer research when they were supporting clients with the creation of a new brand, they clearly saw the importance of creating a favorable attitude among the buying public.

Women consumers believed that brands belonged to the future but were divided on their benefits (Svenska Varor, 1932, p. 133). From the 1930’s there was also an emerging political discussion in the parliament in Sweden, influenced by neo-classical economic ideas, that brands risked distorting markets and bring higher prices for consumers (Karlsson, 2013, pp. 1075-1079). At the time of the campaign, which thus preceded the political discussion in the Swedish parliament by a few years, the advertising agencies wanted to portray brands as a way to stimulate the economy that would lead to economic growth. To produce and sell brands was of importance for the nation’s economy (Graström, 1925). As one advertisement stated with a proud and encouraging tone: “The Swedish industry, Swedish business men, and the Swedish buying public are together paving the way for better times, sounder business morale and a safer economic development if they all in their cities pay attention to the importance of brands and act in accordance” (Advertisement no. 1).

Two years after the campaign was published, the Swedish Exhibition in Gothenburg planned a “brand competition” as a part of an ambition to make consumers buy more Swedish goods (Svenska Varor, 1927). The leadership of the exhibition believed that the question of brands had been neglected and wanted to stimulate an increased interest. The example shows that the idea about brands as beneficial
for the Swedish economy spread into other business circles and was also exploited for nationalistic purposes. In 1925, the same approach, but on a much larger scale, had been used by the advertising industry in Great Britain in a campaign to package, brand and distribute produce of the British Empire (Schwarzkopf, 2008, p. 144).

In the AF campaign of 1925, only one advertisement, directed towards housewives, contained counter arguments to possible objections towards brands. The idea that brands were more expensive than unbranded products was dismissed since branded products were of higher quality (Advertisement no. 9). The higher quality outweighed a higher price and it made sense from an economic perspective to buy brands. However, in the other advertisements, counter arguments were avoided and only the benefits were highlighted.

The advertising agencies were relatively modest in terms of highlighting their own role in relation to brands and advertising in the campaign. Only one advertisement explicitly mentioned that since it was not easy to produce, market, distribute and sell branded goods, companies needed expertise and knowledge that could be found within the advertising agencies (Advertisement no. 4). In relation to this one can reflect upon the choice of topic for the campaign from the perspective of the advertising agencies. AF could very well have designed a different kind of campaign in order to fulfill their purpose, for example about the merits of advertising in general. Such campaigns were for example created in the 1930’s by the main advertising agency association in Great Britain and also by the large radio broadcast listings magazine Radio Times (Futurum no. 5, 1936, p. 269 and Futurum, no. 6, 1936, p. 374). To promote brands was a more indirect strategy, where more advertising was not explicitly argued for, but simply followed as a logical consequence of the arguments. Unfortunately, the sources do not reveal the exact motivation behind the topic of the campaign. The advertising agencies could have been inspired by the success of brands in some parts of retail, for example chemical-technical products, or perhaps by the developments in the U.S., just as the advertisements were inspired by the American style.

**Discussion**

In the history of brands and branding, there is still limited research on how advertising and brands developed during the period preceding the breakthrough of the “brand image” approach to brands and the consumption boom after the Second World War. The actors in this study, and especially the advertising agencies, had an emerging knowledge concerning the prospects and possibilities for modern consumer brands, how they could be used and for what purpose. The discussions that have been studied contained a mix of traditional perceptions of brands together with a more modern approach during a period which was, in a way, the bridge over from a pre-brand to a brand-society. The purpose has been to contribute with knowledge to the early development of brands.

The paper has analyzed different actors’ perspectives on brands and the ambitious advertising campaign for brands that was carried out by the largest advertising agencies in Sweden in 1925. At the time of the campaign the advertising industry in Sweden was small but there was optimism within the wider circles of advertising professionals that the future belonged to advertising. At the same time, the economic situation for the advertising agencies was difficult, hence a need to enlarge the market for advertisements and the campaign for branded goods was a strategic choice in order to get more clients. In a Swedish context, even though many businesses had already realized the potential of brands from a sales perspective, to communicate various aspects of brands as in the campaign was unusual. Due to their position on the market, the advertising agencies realized early on the potential of brands for their own business. It is also noteworthy that when the advertising agencies described their work, around 1925 and later, the creation and development of a brand was integral to the process.

Above all, the campaign of 1925 tried to present brands as a beneficial phenomenon for all actors: consumers, retailers, producers and society at large. It is also relevant that the campaign was published in newspapers across the whole political spectrum – brands could be appreciated by both working-class as well as more upper-class consumers. The fact that the campaign did not only target business leaders shows that it was important not only to convince potential clients, but also consumers about the benefits of brands. In the campaign, brands were also portrayed as being part of progress and the future. In this sense, the results are similar to those in previous research about how advertising industry representatives often connected their work to modernization (see e.g. Marchand 1983 and Laird 1998).

How “modern” the advertising agencies’ understanding of brands really was, is another question. The campaign and the other sources indicate that the industry was busy trying to understand and formulate what modern brands and advertising really meant. Some of the actions reveal that the agencies were
beginners when it came to implementing modern advertising methods (like Gumaelius’ interpretation of the reason-why technique in their campaign for the Stockholm Gas Company in 1925).

The paper also suggests that the growth of brands and branding was not a straightforward development. Retailers and producers contested brands and sought to influence the development in different directions. Research during the period and discussions in trade press show that there was a struggle over whom should be closest to the consumer: the producer through the brand or the retailer through the natural contact with customers (Studier över Märkesvarudistribution och Märkesvarureklam, 1947, see also Bastos and Levy 2012). An increasing growth of brands could change the power relations and positions on the consumer goods market. However, recent research has not really acknowledged or studied this process. More could probably be done in this regard in order to get a more comprehensive understanding of the development of brands during the 20th century, by for example looking into discussions and different actors’ interests during different points in time. In this case, the ambition of the campaign to make everyone agree upon the benefits of brands can be perceived against this background. For the advertising agencies it probably mattered less exactly which actor on the market that was in charge of the brand and the consumer relation, as long as conditions were beneficial for advertising. The campaign however was created based on the preconception that brands equaled producer brands.

The benefits of brands as presented by AF involved arguments about quality, safety and origin. These were the traditional perceptions of brands, in terms of guarantee of a product’s origin and quality – but they were presented as part of progress and modernity. The viewpoint of the advertising agencies was that the new brands were packaged and designed using modern technology and based on insights about the scientific principles of advertising. Despite the influence of “scientific advertising” it is unclear exactly how well the advertising industry had developed a more systematic and sophisticated toolbox and theoretical understanding of brands. However, the sources clearly show that the agencies already during the 1920’s described their work as working with and creating brands as well as advertisements, from the creation of a suitable name to packaging and marketing. The advertising agencies at the time were thus performing tasks that went well beyond their “old” role as being simply the extended arm of the newspapers’ sales departments.

**Literature and published sources**


Futurum (1936) no. 5, p. 269.

Futurum (1936) no. 6, p. 374.


Gumælius’ revy. (1920), Maj. S. Gumælius annonsbyrå, Malmö.


Propagandan för varumärkta varor sommaren 1925. (1925), Annonsbyråernas ekonomiska förening, Stockholm.

Nya Dagligt Allehanda (1925), 9 juli, p. 5.


Studier över Märkesvarudistribution och Märkesvarureklam (1947), Meddelande nr. 26, Affärsökonominiska Forskningsinstitutet vid Handelshögskolan i Stockholm, Stockholm.


Svensk Reklam (1931), Svenska Reklamförbundets årsbok, Stockholm, p. 160.


Unpublished sources

AF, The archive of the Association of Advertising Agencies (AF)
Vol. 3 Protocols 1922-1929
Protocol 9 June 1926, from meeting with AF appendix 4.
Rättviksavtalet 1925. Appendix to protocol from meeting with AF, 23 and 24 April 1925.
Protocol 3 July 1925, from meeting with AF.

TU, The archive of Swedish Newspaper Publishers’ Association (TU), Riksarkivet, RA
Vol. F5:9 Annonsnämnden 1923-1927
Protocol 9 October 1925, meeting with the executive committee in TU’s advertisement board, p. 2.
Selling the concept of brands.

The Swedish advertising industry and branding in the 1920’s

Figure 1

Radio Times (1938) Listing for Lord Baldwin’s Radio Appeal
Selling the concept of brands.

The Swedish advertising industry and branding in the 1920’s.

Figure 2

First Advertisement: Daily Mirror (1938h).

Wednesday, December 28, 1938

The DAILY MIRROR

Page 17

CASSANDRA

Of the sixteen hundred and thirty-eight emigrants who sailed to the New World in 1630, nearly three hundred arrived before Christmas. In present popular portrayals of colonial commerce their names are often given, but in reality, it is probable only a limited number of the actual passengers were represented.

It was possible for only a limited number of the settlers, however, to observe Christmas in the true sense; the festivities were conducted in the way that the early settlers were accustomed to them. But it is certain that the Christmas spirit was observed, if not celebrated so much as the activities, which were enjoyed in the form of Christmas parties.

The full circle has been turned for the production of branded products, and in the same way the advent of Christmas parties has been transformed into a great social event.

The Fall Circle

The year 1938 saw the advent of the Christmas party in America. These parties were held in various parts of the country, and were attended by many people. They were usually held in private homes, but in some cases they were held in public places such as hotels and restaurants.

Bad Reception

If ever a year passed by more pleasantly, another memorable Christmas party awaited the guests which was suitable.

The sumptuous spread was enjoyed by the guests who were hosts to the festivities, and the guests were entertained with a variety of songs, dances, and games.

Belated

This column is not yet finished. This column is not yet finished. This column is not yet finished.

This soothing SYRUP will stop her Cough!

Mother! Here is the Ideal Treatment!

Here’s Something That Can Be Done About it

If you’re interested in helping refugees—why not support the Lord Baldwin Fund for Refugees. Money should be sent to the House, Millbank, S.W.I., or may be paid in at any bank.

Beechams LUNG SYRUP now.

1/2 or 2/6
Second Advertisement: The Times (1939b).
Selling the concept of brands.

The Swedish advertising industry and branding in the 1920’s

Figure 4

Second Advertisement: Daily Mirror (1939a).

STARS DUPER
BY ‘DOCTOR’
BY A SPECIAL CORRESPONDENT

Shall they live?

Before it is too late
get them out!

Useless Eustace

Tear out this form now

This space has been given to the Baldwin Fund by a sympathiser.

![Advertisement](image)

There are 600,000 of them calling to you for rescue, Jews and Christians, men, women, and children. They must be rescued—quickly. Either that, or abandoned finally to the fate from which a speedy death will be the most merciful release.

The Lord Baldwin Fund for Refugees has been set up to find temporary sanctuary here for these outlaws whose only crime is their birth—to keep them alive in safety until they can be permanently settled elsewhere.

They will not be allowed to take the jobs of British workers here or receive unemployment benefit. The Trades Unions are satisfied on that score.

Will you give something to the Lord Baldwin Fund*? Not at the expense of any other charity, but something extra—a thankoffering, if you will, for the freedom we enjoy. It is literally a matter of life and death for these poor people. Give now—before it is too late!

---

**TEAR OUT THIS FORM NOW**

**WHAT YOUR GIFT WILL DO**

1. It will help to get the refugees out of Germany and transport them to their temporary refuge.
2. Then it will help to maintain them in quarters, etc., until they are accepted for permanent settlement.
3. It will help in settling them finally in a home where they can lead a new and useful life.

Amount:

---

**LOD Leo Baldwin Fund for Refugees**

The Secretary is: Canon Coates, Liverpool 11, England. Contributions are welcomed in any currency and should be sent to the fund's account at the Liverpool Alliance Bank, 33, Lord Street, Liverpool 1.

This advertisement is issued by the Committee of the Lord Baldwin Fund to tell the public about its aims and activities.
Figure 6


**BEFORE IT IS TOO LATE ...**

Homeless, hated, hopeless — 600,000 doomed to a living death in Germany unless you will rescue them soon. Christians as well as Jews, many of them children who once had no fear of life. What will you give to the Lord Baldwin Fund for Refugees, so that they may be removed to safety here while awaiting settlement overseas?

They will not be allowed to take the jobs of British workers here or receive unemployment benefit. The Trades Unions are satisfied about that.

Because we in this country are free to show our pity, will you not give yourself the joy of giving? Are not these lives worth saving? Then give — before it is too late!

**WHAT YOUR GIFT WILL DO**

1. It will help to get the victims out of Germany and transport them to their temporary refuge.
2. There it will help to train them in agriculture etc., while they are awaiting emigration overseas.
3. It will help to settle them finally in a land where they can lead a new and useful life.

**TEAR OUT THIS FORM NOW**

Here is my gift to the Lord Baldwin Fund for Refugees.

Name ........................................................................................................................................

Address ....................................................................................................................................

Amount (£ £ s. d.)

You can send this form with your gift to any branch of any bank in the country, or post it with a cheque or postal order to Lord Baldwin, 42, Belgrave Square, London, W.C.2. Cheques must be made payable to Lord Baldwin and made out to Lord Baldwin Fund for Refugees.

This advertisement is one of a series issued by the Committee of the Lord Baldwin Fund to tell the public about its aims and activities.
Figure 7

Fifth Advertisement: *The Times* (1939o).

These have been rescued...

BUT THERE ARE THOUSANDS MORE CALLING TO YOU FROM GERMANY

In the land where they were born it was suddenly decreed that over 600,000 men, women, and children—Protestants, Roman Catholics, and Jews—no longer possessed the most elementary human rights. Victims of a relentless policy of racial hate, they were debarred even from earning a living. Many hundreds of them lost or gave up their lives.

It was to rescue as many of them as possible that the Lord Baldwin Fund for Refugees was set up; and already some thousands have been brought over and given sanctuary and training, while awaiting re-emigration to a land of freedom overseas. (They are not allowed to take the jobs of British workers here.) But there are still many thousands left behind in Germany, calling to you to get them out. Will you not give something to the Lord Baldwin Fund, and thus give these hapless people back the right to live?

TEAR OUT THIS FORM NOW

Here is my gift to the Lord Baldwin Fund for Refugees

Name: ________________________________

Address: ____________________________________________

Amount £ __________ by cash/cheque/postal or money order to The Lord Baldwin Fund, 22 Charlesworth House, London, W.1.

Cheques etc. should be crossed and made payable as follows:

**LORD BALDWIN FUND FOR REFUGEES**

The Executive Committee consists of representatives nominated by the Church of England, the Roman Catholic Church, the Federal Council of Free Churches, the Church of Scotland, and the Jewish Community.

**T.S.B. 39**

This advertisement is one of a series issued by the Committee of the Lord Baldwin Fund to tell the public about its aims and activities.
Selling the concept of brands.

The Swedish advertising industry and branding in the 1920’s

*Would YOU have left them to their fate?*

They are calling to you for rescue—600,000 of them, many of them little children. In the land that gave them birth they have been stripped of all rights and the right to earn a living. Hunted, degraded, slowly starved—if we leave them to their fate the only mercy they can pray for is a speedy death.

The Lord Baldwin Fund for Refugees has been set up to give temporary shelter to these poor victims of hate until they can be permanently settled overseas. While here they will not be allowed to take the job of British workers or receive unemployment benefit.

Will you not help to give them back the right to live? Send your donation to Lord Baldwin now—before it is too late!

---

Here is my gift to the Lord Baldwin Fund for Refugees.

Name: ________________________________

Address: ________________________________

Amount: £_____________ d__________

Notes: (Please write in BLOCK CAPITALS and make out in payable words.)

Tear out this form and send it with the money to the Lord Baldwin Fund for Refugees, 7, St. James's Street, London S.W.I.

**LORD BALDWIN FUND FOR REFUGEES**

*This advertisement is one of a series issued by the committee of the Lord Baldwin Fund to tell the public about its aims and activities.*
Selling the concept of brands.

The Swedish advertising industry and branding in the 1920’s

Figure 10

Eighth Advertisement: The Times (1939u).

*Let them smile and play again*

**Save 1,000 Refugee Children on**

**‘MOTHERS’ DAY’**

* May 13th, 20th, or 27th *

*(according to district)*

‘Mothers’ Day’ is the day appointed for a great and special effort in support of the Lord Baldwin Fund for Refugees—to rescue another 500 Christian and 500 Jewish children. Please do your very best to make your local contribution a bumper one. There are still nearly 70,000 children in Germany—Christians as well as Jews—so persecuted that they are not even allowed to play in the public parks. Help to get them out—before it is too late!

**Issued by the Lord Baldwin Fund for Refugees**

**Bloomsbury House, London, W.C.I**
Visualizing Winchester: A Brand History Through Iconic Images

Terrence H. Witkowski
Department of Marketing, California State University, Long Beach, USA

Abstract

Purpose – To write a visually documented brand history of Winchester Repeating Arms through a cultural analysis of iconic images featuring its lever action rifles.

Design/methodology/approach – This study applies visual culture perspectives and methods to the research and writing of brand history. Iconic images featuring Winchester rifles have been selected, examined, and used as points of departure for gathering and interpreting additional data. The primary sources consist of sample photographs from the 19th century and films and television shows from the 20th century. Most visual source materials were obtained from the Library of Congress, the Smithsonian Institution, the Buffalo Bill Center of the West, and the Internet Movie Firearms Database. These have been augmented by written sources.

Findings – Within a few years of the launch of the Winchester brand in 1866, visual images outside company control associated its repeating rifles with the settlement of the American West and with the colorful people involved. Some of these images were reproduced and sold to consumers in the form of cartes-de-visite, cabinet cards, and stereographs made from an albumen prints. Starting in the 1880s, the live “Wild West” shows of William F. Cody and his stars entertained audiences with a heroic narrative of the period that included numerous Winchesters. During the 20th century and into the present, Winchesters have been featured in motion pictures and television series with western themes.

Research limitations/implications – The historical research is in its early stages. Further interpretation of the selected images is necessary and additional primary data sources need to be discovered and analyzed.

Originality/value – Based largely on images as primary data sources, this study approaches brand history from the perspective of visual culture theory and data. The research shows how brands acquire meaning not just from the companies that own them, but also from consumers, the media, and other producers of popular culture.

Keywords – Winchester, brand history, visual culture theory, iconic images, Internet Movie Firearms Database

Paper type – Research paper

Introduction

Over time, a brand and its semiotic markers – brand names, emblems, and other identifiers – acquire multiple meanings, some of which may hold deep cultural relevance when they express mythological dimensions of national identities (Holt, 2004, 2006). These mythic stories frequently originate and are repeated through company sponsored advertising, promotional ephemera, personal selling, and public relations. Yet, brand myth and meaning are also produced by various popular culture media including newspapers, magazines, novels, motion pictures, television, radio, and music. Customers comprise a third force curating brand meaning. They share brand experiences with one another in person, through letters, by telephone, and electronically, and sometimes form enthusiastic brand communities that create rituals and traditions to further transmit meaning (Muniz and O’Guinn, 2001). These three sources or authors of meaning – company, popular media, and customers – borrow from and influence each other over time. Brand myths can be conveyed verbally and in writing, but also can be developed visually through associations with iconic images, especially those of national heroes, historical figures, and celebrities (McCracken 1989).

This paper explores the visual history, meaning, and larger myths associated with one of America’s most venerable brands: Winchester. In 2016 Winchester Repeating Arms celebrated 150 years as a company. Named after industrialist Oliver F. Winchester, his eponymous lever action rifles and other firearms acquired associations with great events in American history, especially the settlement
of the West. Company controlled messaging played an important role in this transfer of meaning (McCracken 1986), but as far back as the 1870s popular literature, live shows, and photography – later followed by motion pictures and television programs – were appropriating Winchesters for their own purposes and, in so doing, influencing the ideas and symbols embodied in company communications. This mediated heritage has had a powerful effect on the meaning of the brand. Winchester has inspired visual consumers who have come to associate its rifles with favorite characters and their star players in movies and on television. In addition, for many years the brand has aroused acquisitive impulses among individual collectors, who have formed a dedicated brand community, the Winchester Arms Collectors Association (WACA, 2017). Winchester firearms and brand ephemera have received a place in the permanent collections and the temporary exhibitions of public museums (Rattenbury, 2004). The brand and its followers also have motivated research and writing on Winchester firearms and related products as collectors’ artifacts (Webster, 2000), and on the company’s business history (Houze, 1994; Williamson, 1952; Wilson, 1991).

This paper provides an account of Winchester’s visual brand history based on an analysis of iconic images that appeared popular media. It will begin with a brief overview of Winchester’s company led product, marketing, and promotional history. Next, the paper will describe the visual theory foundation of the primary research, and how the data was selected and analyzed. Subsequent sections will then cover five groups of images: Roosevelt’s rifles, brand tribes, western women with Winchesters, celebrity sharpshooters, and Winchesters in film and on television. The final section discusses some implications and limitations of the research.

**Winchester product, marketing, and promotional history**

Born in Boston, Oliver Fisher Winchester (1810-1880) began his business career in Baltimore in 1830, first as a building contractor and then, three years later, as a retailer of men’s furnishings. In 1847, now married with three children, he sold his store and moved the family to New Haven, Connecticut, where he started manufacturing men’s dress shirts in partnership with John M. Davies, a leading importer and jobber of men’s furnishing in New York City. Increasingly successful, in 1855 Winchester invested in the Volcanic Arms Company, also in New Haven, which was developing repeating pistols and carbines firing cartridge ammunition. These new types of weapons made a major technological advance over the single-shot, percussion (cap and ball) firearms then in use. In 1857, Winchester took over all the assets and reorganized the concern as the New Haven Arms Company. During the Civil War, the company achieved renown selling the Henry Rifle, named after gunsmith Benjamin Tyler Henry (1821-1898) who improved upon the earlier lever action models. In 1866 the company was renamed the Winchester Repeating Arms Company, which now under the owner’s brand name, manufactured a long line of distinctive and well-made lever-action rifles that became instrumental in the so called “winning” of the West (Houze, 1994; Williamson, 1952; Wilson, 1991).

Oliver Winchester’s biography has importance because telling stories about brand founders is one of the hallmarks of an iconic brand (Holt, 2004; Witkowski 2016). Unlike Eli Whitney, Eliphalet Remington, Samuel Colt, and Horace Smith and Daniel B. Wesson, who were also prominent brand patriarchs in the 19th century U.S. firearms industry, Winchester was neither an inventor nor a skilled machinist. He was an entrepreneur who “knew rather little about the mechanics of firearms and ammunition. His ability lay in his skill as a salesman, his grasp of financial matters, and his choice of subordinates who could advise him on technical matters” (Williamson, 1952, p. 21). The undated photograph of Winchester in Figure 1 depicts a good-looking, well-dressed, even dapper man in his middle age. He is clean-shaven at a time when many men sported copious amounts of facial hair. The Winchester Repeating Arms website (2017) claims this photo came from the Olin Corporation.

Winchester lever actions sold very well, but the company also made many different types of rifles, shotguns, and other arms, including great numbers of bolt action and semi-automatic rifles used in the two World Wars. Winchester fulfilled orders for over one million military small arms during World War I (Wilson, 1991), but this created a long-term problem, for the extra plant capacity built to manufacture the rifles could not later be carried by civilian sales alone. Thus, after the Great War, the company adopted a strategy of utilizing its factory space, metal working equipment, and industrial skills to make new product lines and thus generate added revenue streams. Winchester in the 1920s manufactured and lent its name to a wide variety of non-firearm consumer goods including cutlery, shop and garden tools, paints and brushes, radio and flashlight batteries, lawn mowers, refrigerators, fishing equipment, sporting goods, and ice and roller skates (Gole and Gole, 2014; Williamson, 1952).
The slogan – “As Good as the Gun” – was adopted for these goods in 1927. Along with the new product lines, the company opened Winchester branded retail stores to sell this merchandise. This manufacturing, brand extension, and retail strategy was costly from the start and few lines made money. With the onset of the Great Depression the company failed and went into receivership in 1931. In December of that year, the Olin family’s Western Cartridge Company purchased the Winchester assets and brand at auction (Williamson, 1952).
Restructured, the company survived and even prospered from the large contracts with the U.S. government for M1 rifles and carbines during World War II. By 1964, however, production costs of the classic designs were becoming unsustainable in the face of price competition from foreign-made firearms. New lines were introduced, but consumers did not receive them favorably and Winchester damaged its reputation for quality (Wilson, 1991). After a prolonged strike in 1979-1980, Olin sold the New Haven plant to the employees who incorporated as the U.S. Repeating Arms Company and made Winchester branded products under license. This venture failed in 1989 and Belgium’s Herstal Group acquired the company. In 2006, the New Haven factory was closed and Winchesters were no longer made in the U.S. (Mulligan, 2006).

Winchester brand promotion started with its sales organization, which consisted of salesmen, who called on jobbers (wholesalers), and missionaries, who called on dealers and retailers (Williamson, 1952). The latter group distributed advertising matter and a variety of sales promotion ephemera including calendars, posters, and counter displays to its distributers. One Winchester specialty was the cartridge board, a picture-framed display of different caliber ammunition that its rifles could accommodate. The missionaries also worked club shoots, tournaments, and county fairs where they set up tents and booths to display products, distribute information, and sell ammunition. Many of the missionaries, who were dubbed “missionary salesmen” after 1900, were crack shots themselves.

Winchester further spread its fame by employing expert marksmen and women to garner publicity for its guns. In 1901, for example, Winchester hired Adolph “Ad” Topperwein (1869-1962) of San Antonio as an exhibition shooter. Two years later, Topperwein married Elizabeth “Plinky” Servaty (1882-1945), who had been working in the ammunition-loading room in the Winchester plant. She turned out to be an even better shot than her husband and set a trap shooting record at the 1904 St. Louis World’s Fair. The couple set a variety of shooting records and performed fancy position shots, such as riding a bicycle while throwing up glass balls and shooting them with a rifle bullet. A 1917 brochure for a Topperwein shooting exhibition promised “A Thrill With Every Shot” (Houze, 1994, p. 190). They continued to work for the company until 1940 (Williamson, 1952).

Winchester advertised its rifles and shotguns in a variety of ways. Rattenbury (2004, p. 20) illustrated a black and white printed broadside 18 x 11½ inches (46 x 29 cm) from 1868. Heavy on text, and with the tagline boasting “two shots a second,” the rifle illustrations are rudimentary woodcuts. By the mid-1870s, woodcut images of the rifle had become more prominent, while the text was reduced to just a few exclamatory statements, such as “The Strength of all its Parts, The Simplicity of its Construction, The Rapidity of its Fire” (Rattenbury, 2004, p. 20). Winchester placed ads in national magazines, mostly targeted at shooters, hunters, and gun enthusiasts, and also in trade publications aimed at dealers. Consumer titles included Forest and Stream, The Companion, National Sportsman, and Outdoor Life (Webster, 2005).

The company soon introduced more sophisticated illustrations and Winchester became the most prolific distributor of chromolithographed artwork in the firearms industry (Rattenbury, 2004). The technology of chromo or color lithography became quite sophisticated by the 1870s and led to a tremendous explosion of promotional ephemera across industries in the U.S. (Jay, 1987; Last, 2005). Among these, illustrated Winchester calendars appear to have been quite popular. Webster (2005) illustrates all 53 corporate calendars printed between 1887 and 1934 and a selection of 17 Winchester Store calendars printed between 1921 and 1930. The pages for the months took up about a third to a half of the calendar area, the remainder consisting of visually striking illustrations, predominantly of western hunting scenes, all in bright colors. Up to 1901, illustrations on corporate calendars consisted of two or more separate vignettes. Starting in 1912 only one scene was used, which gave the visual even more impact.

Winchester commissioned original artwork for these calendars including, in 1892, 1893, and 1894, works by renowned western painter and sculptor Frederic Remington (1861-1909). The 1894 calendar in Figure 2 dramatically portrayed three ranchmen protecting their cattle from wolves (top) and two hunters in a canoe being surprised by a moose (bottom). Remington and other artists indelibly associated Winchester rifles with the theme of man’s ultimate domination of the natural West (Rattenbury, 2004). In a larger sense, Remington and his work helped to hook the public on such mythic images of the West (Murdoch, 2001). Today, original Winchester calendars are in such high demand from collectors that their prices have soared, which has led to the printing and sale of inexpensive reproductions for those who just want the look.
Additional chromolithographed promotional ephemera included wall posters and banners; signs, case inserts and die-cuts; five-panel window displays; two-sided counter signs; booklets, brochures and

Figure 2. Winchester calendar with art by Frederic Remington, 1894. Buffalo Bill Center of the West
archives flyers; envelopes; and counter pads (Webster, 2005). Winchester further supported its dealers through sales conventions and visual merchandising support for the design of window displays and store arrangements (Williamson, 1952). The introduction of plate glass in the latter part of the 19th century greatly enhanced the promotional and myth-making powers of storefront visualizations. Firearms have visual power and, along with stacks of ammunition boxes and other accouterments, promote themselves nicely in store window settings. The full color, five-panel window displays were extraordinary promotional tools. Constructed of color illustrations on paperboard set in a wood frame, each panel in a set was a poster-sized 40 x 19 in. (102 x 48 cm) and required eight feet (244 cm) of display area (Webster, 2005). Winchester distributed them to its dealers over the years 1920 to 1928. Webster (2005) reproduces 29 one-sided and 47 two-sided sets, which he believes accounts for about 80 percent of the total made. Of the ones shown, 20 are for firearms and shooting and the remainder for various Winchester branded consumer goods. As shown in Figure 3, these window displays were and still are very striking works of commercial art.

Starting in 1964, Winchester began manufacturing commemorative versions of its original models and, through 1991, had marketed over 50 commemorative issues selling over one million guns (Wilson, 1991). Commemoratives created a new market of arms collectors and this sales success is a testament to the power of the Winchester brand and its associations in the minds of consumers. History and heritage were central themes: “The basic categories in commemorative Winchesters are statehood, territory, or country anniversaries; historic events, people, organizations, businesses, or law enforcement groups; American Indians: and Winchester factory anniversaries” (Wilson 1991, p. 279). Commemorative Winchesters are frequently bought and sold on today’s market. Made for collecting rather than for shooting, condition is an important determinant of value. It is difficult to say whether they have been appreciating assets, but certainly they are a store of value and are quite liquid, albeit with high transaction costs when sold through dealers or at public auction.

Visual culture, data, and analysis

Visual theories bring a deeply cultural perspective to the understanding of images and their relevance to the symbolic dimensions of brand history. Drawing from postmodern thought, visual studies have emphasized a multiplicity of interpretations – by artists and audiences; by race, gender, and social class; by viewers in the past and in the present – and have considered the processes through which image producers and consumers negotiate and generate meaning (Barnard, 2001; Mirzoeff, 1999; Rose, 2012; Schroeder, 2002; Sturken and Cartwright, 2002). Giving this burgeoning field a thorough review is beyond the scope of this paper. Suffice it to say that the visual culture orientation herein should provide a distinctive flavor to research and writing on brand history, and should yield original insights.

The photographic visual data for this study were assembled via searches of Google Web and Google Images based on a number of different keywords (e.g. “Winchester”, “Theodore Roosevelt”) suggested by the secondary literature. The search process was largely opportunistic and definitely not random sampling from a particular universe of visual data, such as issues of a magazine. Most visual source materials from the 19th century were obtained from the Library of Congress, the Smithsonian Institution, and the Buffalo Bill Center of the West. Pinterest boards provided some information, but this site has limited usefulness for historians since users only occasionally identify their image pins in terms of time and source of publication. The Internet Movie Firearms Database (IMFD, 2017) was searched for images of Winchesters in movies and on television. The IMFD relies upon some 300 volunteers who have catalogued models of firearms, brands, actors, movies, television series, and video games. Many of its articles have uploaded ample visual evidence of Winchester firearms. The IMFD is searchable and has become a resource for Hollywood prop masters, gun collectors, and fans (Keegan, 2012).

Following Rose’s (2012) outline of visual methodology, analysis of the selected images entailed asking questions about their 1) production, 2) content, and 3) intended audience. The circumstances of production refer to the creators of the visual representations and what may have been their intended purpose. Inquiry about the content of the images involves careful consideration of their composition and their historically and theoretically relevant features. Audience questions include how potential viewers in the past may have understood visual representations and related them to other texts, images, and ideologies, an analytical concept Sturken and Cartwright (2002) label as “intertextuality.”

For the historian, a questioning attitude is important because, like other primary sources, visual data too can be misleading. When image-makers created works, their renderings were influenced by...
Figure 3. Five-panel window displays. (Top) Winchester directed dealers to display the Christmas gifts side for the weeks of December 7-25, 1925. (Middle) Junior Rifle Corps side was to be displayed December 26-January 4, 1926. Cowan's Auctions sale May 2, 2007. (Bottom) How a display looked in a Winchester Store window (Williamson, 1952, p. 352).
visual conventions that structured how they interpreted the world around them. The expectations of potential audiences and interests of consumers further shaped visual content. Moreover, the nature of the research process may introduce interpretive bias. Determining the creators of the images is not always possible. Visual data have aesthetic qualities and polemical content that can elicit powerful, possibly emotional responses from the research analyst (Witkowski, 2004). On the plus side, when visual data are included in research reports, both authors and readers have the opportunity to examine the evidence together (Burke, 2001). Finally, and just for the record, the author does not own any Winchester rifles, branded products, or ephemera, nor does he collect antique photographs or vintage movie memorabilia.

Roosevelt’s rifles
Perhaps the most famous and enthusiastic Winchester customer in history was Theodore Roosevelt (1858-1919), who served as the 26th President of the United States from 1901 to 1909. He purchased his first Winchesters in 1881 soon after graduating from Harvard. They were special order Model 1876 rifles engraved and stocked to his specification and probably costing twice that of plain Winchesters (Schreier 2016). He purchased two more in 1883, one of which he praised in Hunting Trips of a Ranchman (1885), a book (his second) he wrote that recapitulated his incessant hunting while ranching in North Dakota. Roosevelt wrote about his Model 76 .45-75 half-magazine Winchester.

The Winchester, which is stocked and sighted to suit myself, is by all odds the best weapon I ever had, and I now use it almost exclusively, having killed every kind of game with it, from a grizzly bear to a big-horn. It is as handy to carry, whether on foot or on horseback, and comes up to the shoulder as readily as a shot-gun; it is absolutely sure, and there is no recoil to jar and disturb the aim, while it carries accurately quite as far as a man can aim with any degree of certainty; and the bullet, weighing three quarters of an ounce, is plenty large enough for any thing on this continent (Roosevelt 1885, pp. 34-35).

Winchester picked up on this endorsement and a vignette in the lower left of its 1888 promotional calendar showed Roosevelt killing his first grizzly in the Wyoming Territory’s Big Horn Mountains (Rattenbury, 2004). Later, Roosevelt took a Winchester Model 1895 U.S. Army carbine to Cuba during the Spanish-American War where his fame soared as the hard-charging (and reckless) Colonel of the Rough Riders. Once he became President in 1901, however, he forbade the company from mentioning his name in its promotional material (Houze, 1994). After his presidency, Roosevelt brought a number of Winchesters along on his eleven month African hunting expedition in 1909-1910. He wrote accounts of this trip for Scribner’s Magazine, which were later incorporated into another book, African Game Trails (Williamson, 1952). In the October Scribner’s Roosevelt mentioned the Winchesters he and his son, Kermit, had carried. The company straightaway quoted this passage in one of its own advertisements (Houze, 1994, p. 170). Numerous photographs depict Roosevelt with his Winchesters (see, e.g., Wilson, 1991). The Teddy Roosevelt wax model (played by Robin Williams) that comes to life in a Night at the Museum (2006) carries a Winchester Model 1894 (IMFDB, 2017).

In the summer of 1884, following the death of both his mother and his first wife on the very same day, Roosevelt had left New York filled with melancholy to spend time at his ranch in the Dakota Territory. He returned to New York in July 1885 to find Hunting Trips of a Ranchman receiving excellent reviews. He stayed two months, went back west, but then returned again in November (Goodwin, 2013). Figures 4 and 5 show two photographs of Roosevelt taken in New York City in 1885 by George Grantham Bain (1865-1944). Roosevelt was portrayed wearing a deerskin hunting ensemble and holding what appears to be the custom Winchester Model 1876 described in his book. Tiffany’s made the silver-hilted hunting knife in 1884. Roosevelt had received some kidding for wearing fancy duds on his ranch, but he worked so long and hard that he gained much respect and the men overlooked his attire. In the photos he did not wear his spectacles. Because of near-sightedness he was a mediocre marksman, which made having a repeating rifle all the more important (Schreier 2016). The digital copy of Hunting Trips of a Ranchman inspected for this research included still another pose from this photography session and suggests that the sitting was for publicity purposes. The public imagination now associated Roosevelt with the West. An 1889 cartoon by Thomas Nast shows Roosevelt, then serving on the U.S. Civil Service Commission, as a cowboy riding a bucking bronco representing the spoils system Roosevelt tried to reform (Goodwin, 2013).
Figure 4. Theodore Roosevelt sitting, 1885. Prints and Photographs Division, Library of Congress, Washington, DC. http://www.loc.gov/pictures/item/2009633128/
Figure 5. Theodore Roosevelt posing, 1885. Prints and Photographs Division, Library of Congress, Washington, DC. [http://www.loc.gov/pictures/item/2009633164/]
The Roosevelt association was certainly good for the Winchester brand. He was and remains a very popular figure in American history and the vigorous manliness he symbolized and espoused resonated strongly in his day. Around 1900, some commentators were decrying the feminization of a national culture where women managed the household and wielded a major influence in the raising of their sons. Historians have contended that many men felt oppressed by industrialization, loss of work independence, hierarchical companies, dull office and grueling factory routines, and job threats from immigrants, freed blacks, and women entering the workforce (Kimmel, 1996; Rotundo, 1993; Swiencicki, 1998). Hunting adventures could compensate for these threats to manhood, but of course at a cost to wildlife.

**Brand tribes**

The consumer culture theory literature identifies different types of consumption communities. “Brand communities,” for example, focus on a specific branded good or service. They are based on a structured set of social relationships among admirers of a brand who share “consciousness, rituals and traditions, and a sense of moral responsibility” (Muniz and O’Guinn, 2001, p. 412).

“Consumption subcultures” (Schouten and McAlexander, 1995), in common with brand communities, exhibit structure (e.g. hierarchies of commitment and authenticity), ethos (e.g. spirituality and core values), and socialization and transformation of self. However, subcultures of consumption are more activity than brand focused and often have associations with outsider status (Canniford, 2011; Muniz and O’Guinn, 2001). “Consumer tribes” also involve socially connected use of products and services, but lack the moral component, social hierarchies, and long-term existence of brand communities. Tribes are more transient and hedonic (Canniford, 2011). Regarding Winchesters, Native Americans arguably formed a consumer community or brand tribe, as this section heading puns.

Indigenous peoples in North America had shown a special fascination with firearms since they first encountered armed Europeans in the 17th century (Axtell, 1999; Bellesiles, 2000) and needed all the firepower they could obtain in the bloody conflicts in the West that escalated after the Civil War. “By the 1870s, Indians were among the repeater’s most zealous fans, and were widely (but falsely) believed to be better armed than the soldiers sent to fight them” (Rose, 2008, p. 7). Surviving rifles and original period photographs provide both tangible and visual documentation of a Winchester brand community among Native Americans. For example, Indians decorated the stocks of some Winchester rifles they owned with brass-headed tacks arrayed in rows and patterns. The Smithsonian Institution has several Winchesters that belonged to war chiefs including the Model 1866 carbine surrendered by Sitting Bull in 1881 (Peterson, 1967).

The Smithsonian’s National Anthropological Archives also contain several photographs of Indians with Winchesters, two of which are shown in Figure 6. On May 10, 1875, John K Hillers (1843-1925) took the top, 4 x 3 in. photograph near Okmulgee, Oklahoma Territory. Hillers, known for his images of the American West and its native peoples, spent much of his career working for the U.S. government (Getty Museum 2017). This photo shows a Cheyenne brave, possibly named Hu-Ni-Wa-Ta-Nist or Feathered Wolf, sitting on a blanket draped over a rock, wearing only his breechcloth, and holding a Winchester Model 1866 carbine in his lap. The Smithsonian copy was mounted on a 14 x 18 in. page containing photographic images of 15 other Indians, part of a large scrapbook of the American West assembled between 1863 and 1900 by the artist James E. Taylor (1839-1901). The bottom image, by Alexander Martin (1841-1929) in 1885, shows a group of five sitting Utes visiting “Denver of Little Crow.” The man on the left cradles a Winchester. This second photo is a studio portrait in the form of a stereograph card, 4 x 17 in., consisting of two offset images that, when viewed through a hand-held device called a stereoscope, gave the perception of depth in three dimensions (Smithsonian Institution, 2017). Stereographs – also called stereograms, stereoptican, or stereo views – were a popular medium for education and entertainment in the late 19th century and a significant body of work survives. Although the guns in these pictures may have been props supplied by the photographer, their deliberate inclusion would still speak of a widely held public imagination that connected Native Americans to Winchesters. A search for biographical information on Alexander Martin has thus far not been successful, but his name is attached to numerous photographs in public collections.

While researching this paper, more than dozen different photos of Indians with Winchesters were located. Figure 7 illustrates two additional ones included in public auctions in 2016. Cowan’s Online Auction sold the top photograph (7 x 9 1/2 in.) on October 17, 2016 for $1800 including buyer’s premium. Cowan’s description of this lot said the man was likely Aatsista-Mahkan (ca 1833-1911).
Figure 6. Winchester brand tribes. (Top) Cheyenne Indian, 1875; (Bottom) Stereograph of Ute Indians visiting “Denver of Little Crow,” 1885. Source: National Anthropological Archives (Smithsonian Institution, 2017).
Figure 7. Winchester Brand tribes. (Top) Running Rabbit and Wife, ND. Cowan’s Online Auction October 17, 2016, Lot 375. (Bottom) Geronimo, Son, and Two Picked Braves, 1886. Bonhams, April 11, 2016, Lot 282.
chief of the Biters band of Blackfoot Indians from southern Alberta, Canada. “Running Rabbit” is written in the lower margin and the nicely dressed woman wrapped with a blanket is apparently his wife. The image setting must have been a photographer’s studio since the background appears to be a painting of an outdoor scene. Note the tack-decorated 1866 Winchester carbine, the tack-decorated knife sheath, and other such adorned items.

Bonham’s in New York sold the lower albumen print photograph (4 ¾ x 8 1/8 in.) on April 11, 2016 for $3750 including buyer’s premium. The Library of Congress Prints and Photographs Online Catalog also contains a copy. Taken south of Tombstone, Arizona in 1886 by Camillus S. Fly (1849-1901), it shows Geronimo on the right and from left to right his brother-in-law Yanozha, his son Chappo, and Yanozha’s half-brother, named Fun. Yanozha and Chappo hold Winchester carbines, while Fun and Geronimo cradle single-shot cartridge rifles. Geronimo (1829-1909) was an Apache leader who became famous for his long resistance to the U.S. military. Fly took numerous photos of Geronimo and his men on March 20 in Cañon de Los Embudos just south of the Arizona Territory in Mexico. Though still hostile, they were parleying with General George Crook to end the war. The April 24, 1886 issue of Harper’s Weekly published two photos on its cover (Van Orden, 1989; Vaughn, 1989). Both of the images illustrated in Figure 7 are examples of cabinet cards, another popular medium in the latter 19th century. Stereographs, cabinet cards, and the smaller format cartes-de-visite attest to the consuming public’s hunger for visual images including those of Native Americans. By 1900, however, their popularity was in sharp decline due to competition from increasingly well-illustrated magazines.

Since the late 1700s, American shops, brands, advertising, promotional materials, and sports team mascots have frequently appropriated the names and images of Native Americans. Winchester does not appear to have done so all that often, but Figure 8 presents a notable exception from 1967. This foldable cardboard sign, about 5½ feet high, promised extra Winchester barrels as a premium with the purchase of any Model 1200 or 1400 shotgun. It reproduced the image of a cigar store Indian, a long-standing caricature that played upon the association of Indians with tobacco. The sign’s copy stated “Heap Big Savings! Ugh, hunt'em all: Waterfowl, upland game, deer. Shoot'em trap and skeet.” The highly stylized Native American dialect, which emerged from films and other popular culture references, was common in the mid 20th century until objections to its implicit racism drove the usage off the market. This item was listed on eBay for $529 in January 2017.

Western women with Winchesters

A couple of dozen good photos have been found of characters from the old West brandishing Winchester rifles. For example, an iconic tintype (ferrograph) from about 1879-1880 shows William H. Bonney – better known as the outlaw Billy the Kid – with a Model 1873 Winchester. Other extant photos include some striking images of intrepid hunters, Texas Rangers, and assorted lawmen all armed with Winchesters (see Wilson, 1991). For purposes of this paper, just two photographs will be considered. They depict two very different women, Mary Fields and Pearl Hart, holding Winchesters.

Despite the lily-white image of settlers portrayed in popular media, African Americans had a rich history in the west. Some had gone there before the Civil War, in some cases as slaves, and many more followed later. They supported themselves as ranchers, cowboys, cavalry troopers (the “Buffalo Soldiers”), black lawmen, and black outlaws. All were armed and many owned Winchesters. In the 1890s, blacks wanting to settle in the newly opened Oklahoma Territory encountered severe hostility from whites and needed guns for self-defense. A journalist wrote: “the colored men in Oklahoma mean business . . . They have an exalted idea of their own rights and liberties and they dare to maintain them . . . I found in nearly every cabin visited a modern Winchester oiled and ready for use” (cited in Johnson, 2014, p. 132). In Montana Territory, one Mary Fields (ca. 1832-1914), a six-foot tall former slave, acquired an outsized reputation for her drinking, card playing, and gun fighting skills. Also known as “Stagecoach Mary” after becoming the first African-American to be employed as a mail carrier by the U.S. Postal Service, a photo from circa1895 shows this imposing woman with a Model 1876 Winchester carbine (Figure 9).

Unlike Mary, who earned money serving the public, the petite Pearl Hart (1871-1956?) became famous for robbing a stagecoach. Born Pearl Taylor to an affluent family in Lindsay, Ontario, she ditched boarding school and eloped at age 16. Her husband soon became abusive and Pearl left and reconciled with him several times. She bore him two children who were sent off to live with her mother then residing in Ohio. Pearl’s husband worked at the 1893 Chicago World’s Columbian Exposition. Some reports say Pearl became enamored with Buffalo Bill’s Wild West Show, then
Figure 8. Winchester foldable cardboard sign, 1967. Listed on eBay January 2017.
Figure 9. Mary Fields and her Winchester Model 1876 carbine, circa 1895. Source: http://www.blackcowboys.com/maryfields.htm

performing daily on 15 leased acres adjacent to the fairgrounds (Braun 2014). She left her husband again, lit out for Colorado and other western towns where she supported herself as a cook and probably as a prostitute. She eventually found her way to the mining town of Globe, Arizona where on May 30, 1899 she and a male friend, Joe Boot, robbed a stagecoach. Captured by a posse on June 5, Pearl was
taken into custody and sent to Tucson. While awaiting trial in October, she gave an account of her life to *The Cosmopolitan: A Monthly Illustrated Magazine*, which published the story, “An Arizona Episode,” in the October 1899 issue. At her trial, the jury voted for acquittal, allegedly after hearing her explain she needed money to visit her dying mother. The judge would have none of this. Pearl was retried, convicted, and sentenced to five years in Yuma Territorial Prison. In December 1902 the governor pardoned her provided she leave Arizona. It has been rumored that Pearl claimed to be pregnant. Her whereabouts after 1928 are unclear, but she is reported to have died in 1956.

The photograph of Hart in Figure 10 appears frequently via Google searches, but exactly how, where, and by whom it was taken remains uncertain. Wilson (1991) believed it taken after her release from prison. However, the 1899 *Cosmopolitan* article reproduced this and five other photographs of her, strongly suggesting that a professional photographer took them for the publication while she was still incarcerated. One picture, captioned “as she appears in the jail yard,” showed her seated in front of the same block wall shown in Figure 10. Thus, the Winchester rifle she held, along with the pearl handled revolver in her belt, were borrowed props deemed appropriate for a western character. The *Cosmopolitan* article captioned this image “guarding camp.” Female bandits were rare at the time and the media attention she attracted from the *New York Times* and other newspapers earned Hart a larger cell and other amenities. In this and three other photos she dressed as a man, while in two others she wore long skirts, shirtwaist blouses, and bonnets typical of the period. Some of her outfits also may have been loaned. Women’s attire was contested in the 1890s. Clothing reformers challenged the impositions (tight corsets, ridiculous bustles) of Victorian dress codes and the bicycle-riding craze spurred demand for less restrictive female attire (Aronson, 1952). Adding still another exotic touch, two photos show her holding her pet wildcat. Hart’s exploits were later referenced in western pulp fiction, an early film, a play, a musical, a song, and a historical fiction *I, Pearl Hart* written by Jane Candia Coleman (1999).

**Celebrity sharpshooters**

William F. “Buffalo Bill” Cody (1846-1917) served in the Union Army for two years, scouted for the U.S. cavalry during the Indian Wars, and killed thousands of bison for the Army and for the Kansas Pacific Railroad. In 1872, he received the Congressional Medal of Honor for his gallantry in scouting. That year the handsome and gregarious Cody also began stage acting in a touring Wild West show. The 1875 Winchester catalog featured a photo of him with a rifle. After he began his own Wild West show in 1883, Cody spread the brand’s fame by staging exciting shooting exhibitions. Cody and star performer Annie Oakley fired Winchester lever action rifles with great skill and so made appealing ambassadors for the brand. Soon an international celebrity, Cody frequently visited the Winchester plant in New Haven to procure rifles and ammunition for his shows. These events were sensations in their heyday and Cody took his performers to Europe eight times, thus introducing the Winchester brand to foreign audiences. With increasing competition from motion pictures, audiences eventually declined and Cody’s last show was staged in 1913.

Cody may have been one of the most photographed men in the world in his day and numerous portraits show him with Winchesters. Most of these were publicity stills and many appear to have been reproduced as cartes-de-visite and cabinet cards and sold to fans. The top photo in Figure 11 of Cody seated with a Model 1873 Winchester was taken in 1903. Then about 57 years old, Cody and his troupe were performing at Olympia Stadium in London, England. Given the union jack flag and Cody’s similar appearance, the bottom photo also appears to have been taken about the same time. In it, Cody assumed the persona of an alert western scout, a theatrical pose he must surely have performed hundreds of times. Original albumen print photos like these appear frequently on the collectors’ market, usually costing a few hundred to a thousand dollars or more at auction. These were popular images when first created and remain so today. Many reproductions starting at about ten dollars can be purchased from eBay sellers.

Cody and his Winchesters became legendary characters in popular fiction. From 1860 to 1920, inexpensive “dime novels” (some cost just a nickel) and weekly pulp magazines published a great number of Western stories. This highly popular genre shared stock characters (plainsmen, cowboys, outlaws) and stock discourses (progress of civilization, national destiny) (Jones, 1978). Buffalo Bill and his Winchester rifles figured prominently in these fictionalized versions of frontier life for many years (Williamson, 1952). The typically lurid cover art of one such tale, “Buffalo Bill’s Mascot, or, The Mystery of Death Valley” (no date) shows the hero firing a Winchester at savage Indians, and another cover, “Buffalo Bill’s Desperate Mission, or, The Round-Up in Hidden Valley” (September
15, 1906), has Cody using his Winchester to free a girl captured by Indians. “These predecessors of later-day ‘comic books’ were read eagerly by a large audience of youngsters, who were undoubtedly impressed by the effectiveness of a Winchester in the hands of their hero, and determined some day to own such a gun themselves” (Williamson, 1952, p. 186). Popular culture references to Cody have been quite copious. Today, Cody, Wyoming is the location of the Buffalo Bill Center of the West, a complex of five museums – Buffalo Bill Museum, Plains Indians Museum, Whitney Western Art Museum, Cody Firearms Museum, and Draper Natural History Museum – and a research library. The heart of the Cody Museum is the Winchester corporate collection, which came west from the New Haven headquarters in 1976.

Despite the accomplished manliness implicit in shooting, the most famous deadeye in late 19th century American life was the unassuming yet very athletic, five foot tall Annie Oakley (1860-1926) who became the star attraction at Buffalo Bill’s Wild West Shows from 1885 to 1901. Her husband, Irish immigrant Francis E. Butler (1847-1926), was also a sharpshooter and the two performed together, but recognizing her celebrity power, Butler wisely accepted playing second fiddle to his wife and became her manager and publicist. Their marriage lasted 50 years. For the portrait in Figure 12, she stood in front of a painted backdrop of Indian teepees holding a Model 1892 Winchester. She wore a western style skirt and hat and on her blouse were pinned what were probably shooting medals. Oakley made her own clothes and though she did not bare any skin, some of her outfits were quite form fitting (unlike the looser garment shown in Figure 12) and shorter than typical women’s street clothes of the period (PBS.org 2005). Born Phoebe Ann Mosey in Ohio, Oakley was a stage name. One of her fellow performers, the Indian Chief Sitting Bull (c. 1831-1890), nicknamed her “Watanya Cicilla” or “Little Sure Shot.” Oakley suffered from serious injuries she sustained in a 1901 train accident and in a 1922 auto mishap. Today, this accomplished woman has become something of a feminist icon even though she did not support woman’s suffrage and presented herself as a proper Victorian lady.

Like that of Buffalo Bill, the life of Annie Oakley has received many references in popular media including the 1946 smash Broadway production Annie Get Your Gun starring Ethel Merman (1908-1984) with music by Irving Berlin (1888-1989). The hit 1950 movie version starred blonde Betty Hutton (1921-2007). Winchester advertising does not appear to have deployed Oakley’s image during her lifetime, but in 1983 the company produced 6000 Annie Oakley Model 1894 Commemorative Rifles in .22 caliber. Oakley’s name and image did appear on posters for Buffalo Bill’s Wild West and a search of Pinterest revealed a cigarette trade card that featured her name and likeness. Photos of her frequently appeared in period cartes-de-visite and cabinet cards that today are desirable collectibles.

Winchesters in motion pictures and television

The “closing” of the western frontier in the 1890s coincided with the invention and rapid commercialization of motion pictures. In one of the very earliest, 20-second shorts, filmed November 1, 1894 at the Black Maria studio of the Thomas Edison Company in West Orange, New Jersey, Annie Oakley demonstrated her formidable shooting prowess with two Winchesters. Other acts from Buffalo Bill’s Wild West were also recorded (see videos in the Cody Archive, 2017). Edison (1847-1931) and his team intended these short films to be seen via a kinetoscope, a device where one person at a time could peer at the moving picture through a viewer on its top. The first kinetoscope parlor had two rows of machines and opened in New York City in 1894. Similar establishments quickly materialized from Chicago to San Francisco. The first public screening of a film via projection did not occur until late 1895 in Paris when the Lumière Brothers presented a program 20 minutes in length. The commercial success and technical and narrative innovations of The Great Train Robbery (1903), produced for the Edison Company, launched the movie Western genre (Slotkin, 1992), which continued highly popular throughout most of the 20th century and has been revisited regularly in the 21st. Shooting off firearms became an exciting cinematic staple and Winchesters have been used as props in many films (see extensive lists in IMFDB, 2017).

Winchester models have appeared in dozens and dozens of films and often became linked to famous actors. For example, in eleven different films from Stagecoach (1939) to The Shootist (1976), leading actor John Wayne (1907-1979) brandished a Model 1892 carbine (see Figure 13) (IMFDB, 2017). Wayne himself became something of a western icon. After years of small parts in low-budget westerns, playing the “Ringo Kid” in the highly influential Stagecoach, by the renowned film director John Ford (1894-1973), was his breakthrough role. The carbine in Stagecoach was the shorter
Trapper” model and was fitted with a large lever loop that enabled the shooter to cock and reload with just one hand, an exciting trick for audiences to see. Wayne also used the same large lever model in *Circus World* (1964), *El Dorado* (1967), and *Rio Lobo* (1972) (IMFDB, 2017).

In the classic *Winchester ’73* (1950), the namesake rifle, a highly engraved “one of a thousand” specimen, was itself a main character (Figure 14). Set in 1876, the story tells of several men who coveted the prized rifle, above all an obsessed Lin McAdam, played by much beloved actor James

---

**Figure 12.** Annie Oakley. Photograph by D.F. Barry 1894. Buffalo Bill Center of the West archives.
Figure 13. John Wayne as the Ringo Kid in *Stagecoach* (1939). IMFDB (2017)
Figure 14. James Steward shooting the custom rifle in *Winchester ’73* (1950). IMFDB (2017).
“Jimmy” Stewart (1908-1997). McAdam won the rifle at a Fourth of July target competition, but it was soon stolen and then passed through different hands, usually with disastrous consequences for the recipient, until Lin finally recaptured it. This film with its emphasis on the psychology of the characters helped to reinvigorate the western as a cinematic staple. In the process, Slotkin (1992) argued, it fetishized the weapon. According to the IMDb (2017), Model 1873 Winchesters appeared in 56 films, mostly but not exclusively westerns, from 1937 to 2015. Perhaps the most famous placement was in High Noon (1952) where Marshal Will Kane, played by Gary Cooper (1901-1961), can be seen checking out some of them in the Sheriff’s office. John Wayne, James Stewart, and Gary Cooper were all staunch Republicans and some of this partisan meaning may have been transferred to the Winchester brand through the celebrity-product association (McCracken 1989).

Figure 15 shows Winchesters in two early 21st century films highly recommended by this author. In Brokeback Mountain (2005), young and handsome shepherders Ennis Del Mar (Heath Ledger) and Jack Twist (Jake Gyllenhaal) shot a .30-30 caliber Winchester Model 1894 rifle while attending to their eventful summer job (IMDb, 2017). Outside the Western genre, a Winchester Model 1866 played a prominent part in the climactic scene of the zombie comedy Shaun of the Dead (2004) when a desperate Shaun (Simon Pegg) took it from a rack above the bar in “The Winchester” London pub. Accidentally discovering it was loaded and operable, he valiantly used it to fend off approaching zombies until running out of ammunition (IMDb, 2017).

Numerous vintage Winchester lever actions have appeared on dozens of television Westerns in the U.S. ranging from Lawman (1958-1962) to Deadwood (2004-2006) (IMDb, 2017). Arguably the most noteworthy Winchester performance as a supporting actor was on The Rifleman (1958-1963). In this series widowed Civil War veteran and New Mexico Territory rancher Lucas McCain (Chuck Connors) wielded a Model 1892 Winchester saddle ring carbine with a modified large lever loop that enabled one handed reloading (Figure 16). The unforgettable opening credits showed the lanky star walking forward, the rifle butt almost in his crotch, firing off 12 rounds in five seconds (click Rifleman Clip or visit IMDb, 2017). The Freudian implications of this image are beyond the scope of this paper. Connors (1921-1992) was an imposing man nearly six and a half feet tall who had played both professional basketball and baseball and became a well-regarded television actor. He too was a Republican. Ironically, The Rifleman story was set in the early 1880s, about ten years before this model originally came to market.

**Implications and limitations**

During the last quarter of the 19th century, the Winchester brand received much free publicity via photographs associating its rifles with Theodore Roosevelt, Native American warriors, and other western characters including female celebrities and jailbirds. These images appeared on a great many different cartes-de-visite, cabinet cards, stereographs, and other photographic formats. At the same time popular novels and live performances reenacted the stories and myths of the “winning of the West” and frequently invented new ones (Slotkin 1992). Portrait photos of star performers like Buffalo Bill and Annie Oakley were also avidly consumed. Early motion pictures retold the western saga and later movies and television again visualized the Winchester heritage for mass audiences. In the process their creators added new elements (male love, one hand cocking via a modified large lever) previously outside the mythical narrative. These cultural references in popular media were often intertwined with the company-sponsored communications and together did much to transfer meaning and heritage to the brand over time.

Consumer perceptions of the Winchester brand have depended upon cultural context. Some cultural elements have been relatively unchanging over time. Centuries of broadly favorable public sentiments toward the right to keep and bear arms, which are enshrined in the 2nd Amendment to the U.S. Constitution and protected by minimal firearm regulation, have clearly encouraged gun ownership in America. This cultural constant has enabled Americans to experience closer, more tangible connection with firearms than could people in other societies where individual gun ownership has been frowned upon. Yet, other cultural contexts have changed over time with consequences for the meanings and associations attributed to Winchester. Hunting big game, for example, does not appear to have the broad social support in the new millennium that it once accrued in the 19th and early 20th centuries, and so pictures of grinning nimrods cradling their Winchesters and other guns next to dead trophy animals probably appeal to fewer and fewer Americans. The role of Winchesters in the Indian Wars also has taken on different meanings as the larger culture has re-considered its treatment of Native Americans.
Study of Winchester brand history through iconic images contributes to understanding the foundations and evolution of contemporary U.S. gun culture. For many of the collectors who form Winchester's brand communities, connecting to the past is very important. Indeed, the term “heritage” is frequently deployed in, for example, the WACA mission statement (WACA, 2017) or in titles, such as Arms Heritage Magazine. Note, however, that heritage and history are very different in that the former seeks to inquire into the past, whereas the latter celebrates it and uses it to serve present purposes (Lowenthal, 1998). The cultural values that generally male and conservative arms collectors have cherished, say, manly competence and rhetorical independence from government, can be displaced onto firearms from the past (Belk, 1995; McCracken, 1986). The dramatic illustrations of
Winchesters in popular culture media helped build the brand and its communities and suggest the highly visual nature of contemporary U.S. gun culture (Witkowski, 2013).

The research conducted so far does not purport to be an exhaustive account of all visual cultural references relevant to Winchester’s brand history. Winchester firearms have long had associations with target shooting, exotic safaris, and military weapons. Still, embodying in tangible form the romance and mythology of the West clearly has been their most significant meaning transfer activity. Indeed, in 1919 artist Phillip R. Goodwin created an image of a rugged cowboy in buckskins astride a galloping horse, cradling a Winchester rifle that soon became the brand trademark (Winchester Repeating Arms 2017). Further examination of vintage iconic images featuring Winchesters needs to be undertaken. Although much evidence has been found online, supplemental visits to the archives of museums and research libraries should prove fruitful.

References


Smithsonian Institution (2017), “Hu-Ni-Wa-Ta-Nist? (Feathered Wolf?) wearing breech cloth and with Winchester rifle; near Okmulgee” (NAA INV 01600812) and “Ute Indians visiting Denver of Little Crow” (NAA INV 09859500), National Anthropological Archives, available at: [http://collections.si.edu/search/results.htm?q=winchester+rifle&dsort=&view=&date.slider=&tag.cstype=all&start=0](http://collections.si.edu/search/results.htm?q=winchester+rifle&dsort=&view=&date.slider=&tag.cstype=all&start=0), (accessed January 15, 2017).


“The Greatest Leaders in Extension Work”: The Role of Extension Work in Developing Rural Female Consumers in Early 20th Century New York

Mary Ellen Zuckerman

School of Business Administration and Economics, College at Brockport, SUNY, N.Y.

Abstract

Purpose – This paper looks at the role extension services carried out by home economics departments, specifically the department at Cornell University under the direction of Martha Van Rensselaer, played in raising consumer awareness among rural farm women.

Methodology/Approach – This paper uses primary source material from the papers of Martha Van Rensselaer at Cornell University as well as secondary sources focused on the development of agricultural extensions services, the field of home economics and the history of Cornell.

Findings – This paper finds evidence that the extension services offered by Cornell’s home economics department reached thousands of rural farm women in New York State and exposed them to new products and processes for homemaking. This raised awareness in their minds of the emerging goods being marketed nationally.

Implications for future research – More research could fruitfully be undertaken to document the activities of home economics extension services provided at other universities across the nation to paint a fuller picture of the information being provided to thousands of rural women in the first decades of the twentieth century.

Keywords – Extension Services, History of Home Economics, Consumer history, Martha Van Rensselaer, Cornell University, Farm Institutes

Paper Type – Research paper

Introduction

In the late nineteenth and early twentieth century United States, farm families, often living in isolated locations, had limited knowledge about the new products and conveniences starting to appear in national markets. While commercial sources sought to reach these rural customers, a more pervasive and trusted source of information came from agricultural and home experts from state universities. Schools of Agriculture, many created under the provisions of the 1862 federal Morrill Act, identified ways they could reach farmers with information to aid them in increasing output, improving quality and more reliably producing food for the nation. Agricultural Schools ran winter courses, created informational bulletins, sent representatives out to talk with farmers’ groups, and held Farmers’ Institutes at their Colleges. All these activities ultimately fell under the title of “extension services”. These extension services played an important role in developing the rural consumer market.

Initiatives to improve farm methods eventually broadened to include a focus on farm families and farm life. Agriculture Schools began communicating with farm wives about ways to improve housework efficiency and quality of home life. These outreach efforts coincided with the establishment of home economics courses and departments in Agricultural Schools. Paralleling the work focused on the mostly male farmers, activities targeted at the home exposed farm wives to new equipment, products, and ways of conducting housework and other farm chores. Unintentionally, experts developed the farmwife consumer market through informational activities such as educational bulletins, short winter courses, women’s meetings at Farmers’ Weeks and Institutes, and demonstration agents and lecturers fanning out from the Colleges. These efforts expanded the farm wives’ horizons, creating in them a willingness to seek out new products and processes. Extension activities occurred in states across the country, developing a farmers’ wives market more ready to accept advertisers’ advice about new products. The abundant information
cultivated a fertile field for advertisers who began reaching rural housewives through women’s and farm journals (Prawl, et al., 1984).

The work done by Martha Van Rensselaer (1864-1932) through the Home Economics department at the Agricultural School at Cornell University provides a window into the manner in which these preparatory activities developed, into how these seeds were planted. The programs run by Van Rensselaer communicated about and demonstrated the latest methods and equipment for rural housekeeping. She educated women about changing their household routines and prepared them for the next step of purchasing new products.

Van Rensselaer’s professional experiences as a County School Commissioner in western New York and as Director of the Farmer’s Wife Reading program and home extension work at Cornell gave her rich insight into the needs and desires of farm women. She penned bulletins and circulars that came out from Cornell’s Home Economics department, reaching thousands of women across the state. She started reading clubs (eventually numbering over 300 throughout New York State), lectured at regional institutes and visited women in their homes to determine topics of interest. She strongly considered consumer opinions and preferences, modifying and adding subjects as needed. She established a short Winter Course at Cornell for women. She regularly encouraged farm wives to respond to her with problems they wished to see discussed in her bulletins and courses.

A program targeted at farm wives, created by Van Rensselaer and her colleagues in the Home Economics department, initially called the Homemakers’ Conference (later Farm and Home Week), held during Cornell’s Farmers’ Week, offers a particularly interesting example of creating awareness in the rural women’s market. A well-organized Farmer’s Week took place at Cornell University in 1908. The first Homemakers’ Conference, aimed at women, was added the following year. This combined event proved successful and lasted at least through the 1940s. In its early years this week of demonstrations, lectures, questioning and socializing showed farmer and farmers’ wives the most up-to-date ways to perform farm work. Farm families saw in action new products, services and the latest conveniences. Being shown and provided information about these new pieces of equipment by the credible experts from the School of Agriculture, including the home economists, undoubtedly caused the farm families to think more favorably about possibly investing in these unfamiliar products. The demonstrations and lectures prepared this market of consumers, providing them with data in the initial, information gathering stage.

Marketers have written about the role of home economists in educating consumers about rational decision making. However, scholars have focused less on the background work done by home economics experts in developing an awareness about new products and a thirst for information about them. Instead scholars have emphasized the role those experts played in helping homemakers (the chief consumers) sort through information to make appropriate choices, more directly supporting consumption. While many home economists’ role eventually changed and sharpened, taking on the task of mediating between housewives and the marketplace, much of the field’s early work focused on scientific homemaking with emphasis on sanitation (bacteriology), nutrition (chemistry) and home management skills (drawing on scientific management work) to lessen physical effort expended by farm wives. However, as could be seen during Cornell’s Farm and Home Week, scientific housekeeping on the farm would indeed include the use of new equipment and products to achieve optimal results (Nystrom, 1929, pp.15, 69-70; Zuckerman and Carksy, 1990; Craig, 1944; Tomes, 1998).

For Van Rensselaer and her colleagues at the Cornell School of Agriculture, their educational focus on improving the quality of life for farm families through the introduction of better agricultural and domestic science principles included showing products and goods that might help. However, the School’s public funding by the New York State legislature precluded staff from identifying or indicating preferences for any particular brands of goods. Understandably, this caused tensions. Manufacturers would have much preferred that the Home Economics department test and recommend their products. And consumers would undoubtedly have welcomed some guidance from trained experts on which brand to buy. But Van Rensselaer and others in the School adhered to the “no recommendations” policy. In the end, it meant that the Cornell department (then School, finally College) of Home Economics maintained its focus on educating homemakers as producers and conservers of home and family, albeit with a consumer role, and spent less time on emphasizing homemakers’ role as consumers actually making purchases. But outreach work in
Agricultural Schools, Extension Work and the Efforts to Inform Farm Households

The impetus to reach rural families with helpful information stemmed from several factors. By the late nineteenth century agricultural experts at universities advocated the application of science and technology to farm problems. The advent of electricity, although not widely available on farms, showed the possibilities of a future farm with work made more efficient and less burdensome. Telephone, radio, Rural Free Delivery and better roads all promised an end to the isolation on farms as well as providing access to more information and products. Railroads and special postal services such as Star Routes allowed mail and goods to be conveyed more easily to outlying farm homes (Holt, 1995).

Universities and the federal government paid attention to the need for improving quality of agricultural production and life on the farm. The growth of Agricultural Schools provided a cadre of experts to assist in educating farm families. The development of the new field of home economics provided a growing group of educators focusing on improving the home, with a number looking specifically at the plight of rural women. While manufacturers attempted to advertise to consumers, much information farm families gained about new products and methods came from the experts at university Agricultural Schools. These trained staff, committed to education and often imbued with the era’s Progressive beliefs in the key role played by experts and faith in scientific information for progress, sought to reach farm families in whatever way they could to spread news about the latest agricultural improvements (Holt, 1995, pp. 22-24.).

Farm work and life had also attracted the attention of the federal government. Federal legislation provided funding which promoted agricultural and home economics research, education and demonstrations of best practices. The Morrill Land Grant Act of 1862 promised that each state could receive land to support an existing or newly created institution of higher learning focused on mechanical and industrial arts (practical subjects). The Hatch Act of 1887 expanded on this legislation, creating agricultural experiment stations in connection with the Morrill Act institutions. This attention to agriculture and farm life, with the money to back it up, bolstered the establishment of Agricultural Schools.

Home economists, as experts on home affairs came to be called, were hired by colleges as early as the 1870s, in Midwest land grant institutions such as those in Kansas, Illinois and Iowa (East, 1980, p.45; Goldstein, 1994, p.29). Home economics departments, often started in Schools of Agriculture, benefitted from the funding given to those Schools, as well as the synergy of the united focus on farm life. The need to train boys and men in the newest agricultural methods was paralleled by the need to educate farm girls and women about the most scientific, efficient and sanitary ways to run the farm home; women played a partnering role in the farm operation, perhaps more so than in urban homes. By 1914, with the passage of the Smith-Lever Act, Congress explicitly recognized the field of home economics, making an annual appropriation for extension work carried out for agricultural and home economics education. Demonstration agents could be hired to take best practices out to homes and farms, showing farm women how to live and produce more efficiently. Three years later the Smith–Hughes Act provided federal funds to support agricultural, home economics and vocational education. By 1920 every state or territory except Alaska had an agricultural school, and all ran extension services (Holt, 1995, p.25). Extension work at these Agricultural Schools included writing and disseminating informational bulletins, offering short winter courses for farmers, sending out staff to lecture and demonstrate new techniques, running demonstration trains complete with equipment across states, and holding Farmers’ Institutes. After 1914 extension work also included the county agent systems funded by Smith-Lever. These pieces of federal legislation allowed home economics education, research and knowledge to progress, guaranteeing that farm women would continue to receive the most updated homemaking knowledge possible from Home Economics departments and schools, as well as from commercial sources.

The field of Home Economics had been gaining momentum as a coherent discipline in the last decade of the nineteen century, culminating in the Lake Placid (NY) meetings. In 1899 Melvil Dewey, a politically connected New York State librarian, and his wife Anna brought together the most prominent individuals in the home economics field. The group moved to shape and define the new field, ultimately giving it a name (Home Economics) and, after meeting for several years,
birthing a new, national association, the American Home Economics Association (AHEA, in 1909). The home economists at the early Lake Placid meetings emphasized educating women in their role as housewives. They focused on sanitation, nutrition, health, efficiency and creating a home that would foster citizenship. These leaders also recognized that informed consumption was becoming a part of the homemaker’s job (Craig, 1944, p.20; Goldstein, 1994, pp. 32, 39).

**Developments at Cornell University**

Cornell University had been at the forefront of efforts to bring information to farmers. Cornell’s outreach programs were flexible, non-technical and did not lead to a certificate, allowing students to choose the topics and mode of instruction they desired (True, 1928, p.44; Rose, 1969, p.12). Extension activities taken on by Cornell included both reaching across the state to educate farm families where they lived, and centralized information offered at the Cornell site. Initiatives included a popular Reading Course for Farmers with a correspondence component, a Home Nature-Study course, Junior Naturalist clubs for boys and girls and lectures and demonstrations provided by Agriculture School staff across the state at local institutes and meetings. The School had maintained a state funded experimental demonstration station since 1894.

Liberty Hyde Bailey, a horticulture professor who came to Cornell in 1888 and served as Dean of the School of Agriculture from 1903 to 1913, actively supported extension work at the School. He took charge of its Home Nature-Study course in 1897. Bailey believed strongly in bringing technology and scientific method to farming so that the farmer and his family could prosper. He saw rural life as critical to preserving American values, something he espoused as a leader in the Country Life movement. Bailey’s focus on the family unit as well as the feedback he received from readers of the tens of thousands of Farmer’s Reading and Home Nature Study course bulletins, showed him the necessity of providing farm wives as well as farmers with scientific information (Rodgers, 1965, pp.236, 237). This movement to educate farm wives by providing scientific data from knowledgeable sources fit in with the Progressive reform ethos of the time. And as the federal funding and Bailey’s own Country Life movement ideology attest, experts believed that the success of the farm home contributed directly to the success of the farm. This recognition of the key role played by farm women made them a consumer market eventually to be tapped.

Anna Botsford Comstock, employed by the Extension division for the Youth Nature Study project, knew Van Rensselaer from the Southern Tier in New York where they had both grown up, and recommended her to Bailey for the proposed Farmers’ Wives Reading project. A thirty-six year old former Commissioner of Schools for six years in Cattaraugus County, New York, Van Rensselaer had demonstrated familiarity with rural households and experience in administration. She joined the Extension Service as an educator in 1900.

Clearly Cornell School of Agriculture had deep roots in extension work prior to the passage in 1914 of the Smith-Lever Act. Van Rensselaer was stepping into an existing organization of educational outreach to farmers when she joined Cornell. She could draw on the experience the Cornell faculty had with farm men. She also had the guidance and support of Liberty Hyde Bailey, a person whose philosophy about educating for quality of life on the farm she resonated with.

**Farmers’ Wives Reading Club**

When joining the Cornell School of Agriculture Extension Service Martha Van Rensselaer held no college degree but had taught for ten years prior to her election as School’s Commissioner, so she understood how to communicate and educate. She herself had little skill as a housekeeper, but she know how to listen and to identify problems. As County School Commissioner Van Rensselaer had become familiar with the leaflets put out by Cornell’s Home Nature-Study program (Percival, 1957, p.5).

Van Rensselaer’s initial step in this extension program specifically aimed at women began with sending out a letter to 5,000 women, under Bailey’s name, asking them about possible areas where they needed help, suggesting “Saving Steps”, the topic ultimately chosen for the first bulletin. In his cover letter Bailey specifically stated: “…We want each of you to talk back, even though you feel called upon to tell us we are wrong” (Scholl, 2008, p. 151).

They received 2,000 responses, data Van Rensselaer carefully studied. Using letters such as these as a basis, and not hampered by preconceptions from having academic training in home economics, Van Rensselaer built the correspondence courses from the ground up, in response to
her constituency. While respondents paid nothing for the actual bulletins (state monies covered this cost), they did pay postage if they wrote back. This initiative embodied true two way communication, with bulletin recipients asked their opinions of the published material and thoughts on other potential topics. Women responded eagerly, pouring out their concerns and questions, revealing isolation, drudgery, a passionate desire to improve the lives of their families as well as themselves and desirous of contact with the outside world. This correspondence built trust. As one writer poignantly stated, “Although you have not heard from me, I have not lost my interest in your work. Please don’t forget me and I’ll try to write oftener. If you have any new lessons, please send them as I do do enjoy them” (Rose, 1969, p.26). The bulletins, with their information and questions focused on farm women’s interests, as well as highlighting the importance of the farm wives’ opinions, tapped into a strong need. Welcoming the attention, one rural reader expressed her feelings: “I cannot tell you what it means to me to think that someone cares. My life is made up of men, men and mud, mud. Send me the bulletins and remember me in your prayers” (Percival, 1957, p.7). Eventually, there would be over 300 Cornell study clubs, each averaging 25 members, largely comprised of rural housewives. These activities planted the seeds of information for farm families about ways, with new products and without, to improve their endeavors.

When asking for additional funds to print extra bulletins needed for the Farmer’s Wives Reading Course, Van Rensselaer noted this strong desire for information: “I wish the whole Woman’s work could be developed as the demand calls for it. I could provide pages of correspondence from farmers’ wives, showing that they are eager for the work. I wish we had an appropriation which would allow of this correspondence course among the women of the state, and having Home Institutes through the winter, and a Short Course in Domestic Science for girls…Farmer’s wives and daughters are good material to work upon” (MVR to Mrs. Dewey, 1/30/1904, Box 12, MVRP). Clearly a market existed for the information, a pent up need, which marketers could capitalize on.

Van Rensselaer understood the difficulties faced by rural women from her time as School Commissioner and her work visiting the study clubs across the state. But to gain more formal knowledge about the nascent home economics field she also started attending the Lake Placid conferences, putting herself in touch with experts and learning from them. She took classes at Cornell in areas related to home economics, eventually earning her undergraduate degree. Like her supervisor Bailey, Van Rensselaer fit the Progressive model. She was optimistic about the role of expertise, education and information in bringing about positive change. Some improvements could come without expenditure of dollars. As Van Rensselaer knew from her home visits, the simple area of energy expenditure by the housewife was critical. Her bulletin on housewives’ steps is in line with the focus taken by others involved in the scientific management side of home economics, including another non-academic home economist, Christine Frederick. This focus on scientific management by home economics began before the influence of consumer culture layered onto housework the importance of consumption.

Eventually Van Rensselaer issued about five bulletins per year, on topics such as sanitation, food, home furnishings, children on farms and cleaning; mundane perhaps, but the stuff of these women’s lives. The bulletins contained reading assignments and questions, as well as advice about forming study clubs. Van Rensselaer herself traveled across New York state visiting farm women and their clubs, both providing information and seeking guidance on topics of interest, “trying to satisfy through talks the growing demands of an awakening public for information on the subjects related home and family life…” (Rose, 1969, p.27).

**Short Winter Course**

Another extension outreach that Van Rensselaer modified for farm women was the short winter course. Cornell had begun offering short winter instruction for farmers as early 1892-1893. By the time Van Rensselaer came to Cornell this three month, non-credit winter course enrolled over 100 farm men yearly, providing practical training and information on farming techniques (Rodgers, 1965, p.211; Rose, 1969, p. 30).

In 1905, Dean Bailey suggested that similar winter courses should be offered for women on the subject of home management. Van Rensselaer created a curriculum centered on topics of interest to farm women, and launched it in 1906, creating another venue for women to receive scientific home making information. Van Rensselaer called upon contacts developed at the Lake Placid Conferences she had been attending to select the august speakers (MVR to Mary Abel,
In the first year luminaries of the home economics world including Anna Barrows, Isabel Bevier, Maria Elliott, Ellen Richards, Marion Talbot and Mary Schenck Woolman lectured the farm women, who eagerly put aside their daily round of work to learn new and improved ways of keeping their homes clean and attractive, of feeding their families and raising their children. These instructors traveled from MIT, Chicago University (University of Chicago), and Teachers College (Columbia), a testament to the dedication of the professions’ leaders, Cornell’s reputation and the determination of Van Rensselaer. She herself gave a lecture on household equipment.

A great deal of publicity heralded the Winter Course, with letters sent out, as well as notices to newspapers across the state. Forty people signed up the first year, and additional individuals came to various lectures, attracted by the distinguished experts and topics. Following her usual course of soliciting feedback, Van Rensselaer sent Winter Course participants a survey asking what they liked, what improvements they wanted to see, and for additional topics and day/time preferences.

The next year, when Dean Bailey forgot to include the winter course in the annual budgeting process, Van Rensselaer was forced to cut back her expenditures. She remembered that Flora Rose, a chemist studying nutrition at Teachers College in New York City, had written inquiring about work. Rose could come teach at the Winter course for a small travel budget. She traveled to Ithaca and after successfully lecturing was offered the position of Director of the Home Economics department by Dean Bailey. Rose demurred, pointing to the energetic and successful Van Rensselaer. Bailey protested Van Rensselaer’s lack of academic credentials, but ultimately supported the two women in being co-directors, roles they held until Van Rensselaer’s death in 1932. They also became life partners.

New York state residents took these winter classes at no cost. Expert instructors would “provide instruction in cooking, furnishing, general housekeeping, home sanitation, reading, the relation of the home to the school and church and other social forces” (Rose, 1969, p.32). While the titles of the lectures appear dry and purely informational, not massaged by advertising expertise, they clearly spoke to the intended audience of those trying to productively and positively raise a family on a farm. Here women saw equipment demonstrations, even though particular brands could not be named. But if they learned new techniques and ways to improve housekeeping, these women would turn to purchasing items.

The extension efforts educated women and men about possibilities beyond their own farm, communities and knowledge, preparing them for their stepping into the world of consumption. As Van Rensselaer said in her 1909 report to Dean Bailey, “Both men and women in the state seem equally interested in instruction which places the home upon a better business basis and provides more helpful surroundings” (MVR to LHB, 1909, Box 16, MVRP). Van Rensselaer also advocated for better practical facilities at Cornell for educating these women, for example noting that the home economics department needed a real house to appropriately teach women: “We look forward to having a kitchen and dining room which will present the difficulties and advantages which a woman will meet in her own home, such as difficulties of plumbing, lighting, heating and the problems of decorating and furnishing rooms” (MVR to LHB, 1909, Box 16, MVRP). Through such an appropriately equipped facility they could provide some guidance on how to be educated consumers.

**Home-Maker’s Conference/Farm and Home Week**

In 1909 Cornell held its first week-long Home-Makers Conference (eventually titled Farm and Home Week in 1928). The previous year the Extension Division had put on a weeklong Farmer’s Institute. This initiative had arisen out of farmers’ desire for more education and the chance to discuss the latest methods of farming, new equipment, wisdom about crops and livestock and conditions in the market (Colman, 1963, p.210). While regional farmer’s institutes had been held across the state for decades, running such an assembly at the university allowed easy utilization of the full faculty and equipment of the Agriculture School. About three hundred individuals registered that first year, although more attended specific sessions.

Such farmer’s institutes had gained popularity across the nation in the 1880s and 90s, reaching the height of their success in the early 1900s. The Institutes were set up either by state Departments of Agriculture or Agriculture Schools as a way to communicate the latest research findings, equipment and innovations in agriculture. By 1914, one source notes that over 8,000 such
institutes ran annually and estimated that more than 3 million people attended (Prawl et al., 1984, p.15). Mailings, programs and notices in local papers advertised the meetings. By 1896 a national organization, the American Association of Farmer’s Institute Workers, had been established. Recognizing the importance of these institutes, in 1901 the United States Department of Agriculture’s Office of Experimental Stations appointed a Farmer’s Institute specialist.

Railroads supported these institutes, offering special rates to attending farmers and their families. Railroad companies believed that bringing farmers to Institutes, as well as sending out demonstration trains, would increase agricultural production, which then had to be shipped over the rails (Holt, 1995, pp.27, 28). Trains used in extension demonstration work became so popular that by 1906 they had run in 21 states. These fully equipped demonstration units showing farming and housekeeping techniques and equipment attracted widespread attention, developing and whetting farm families’ consumer appetites, even as they brought them information. In New York State Cornell equipped such trains as part of the extension service, sending out five in 1909-1910, reaching about 30,000 people over four railroad lines. Informational bulletins were stocked, including some of Van Rensselaer’s publications aimed at farm women (Colman, 1963, pp.207-208). Some trains specifically targeted housewives, including one in 1910, called “The Victory Special” where Van Rensselaer noted the demonstration agent would talk upon such topics as “milk in the diet, labor saving devices, care and cooking of fruits and vegetables…” (MVR to Daniel Witter, 10/22/1910, Folder 30, Box11, MVRP). However, the trains could not provide the range of information that a centralized institute could.

Institute sessions and speakers devoted to women had appeared by the 1890s. Sometimes the women’s portions were called “cooking schools, and food preparation.” In Wisconsin women’s sessions on “butter making, the dairy, fastening ends and binding edges, and education of farmers’ daughters” appeared. Other topics covered for these proto-consumers included “labor-saving devices, better sanitary conditions, better methods of preparing and preserving foods, care of the sick, and beautification of the home.” Missouri, Iowa, Kansas, Colorado, Wisconsin, Georgia, Illinois, Maryland and Nebraska all engaged in activities to bring information about better homemaking techniques to rural housewives in the years immediately after the turn of the century (Craig, 1944, pp.17-18, 23-24, 37). In 1910, the first year of Cornell’s Homemaker’s Institute, of the reported 5,651 Farmers Institutes held nationwide, 444 created programs targeted at women.

New York State began experimenting with holding separate Women’s Institutes across the state in 1906, under the guidance of Mrs. Helen Wells, who had been deeply involved with the Women’s Institutes funded by the Canadian government. As an employee of the State Agriculture institution and author of the Farmers’ Wives Reading bulletins, Van Rensselaer participated regularly as a member of this five person program fanning out across the state to bring informational messages to farm women about cooking, sanitation, efficiency and beautification of the home. In fact, Van Rensselaer had been invited to lecture at an Institute in Guelph, Canada as early as 1903, an assembly the local newspaper christened a meeting of “The Goddesses of the Household” (Clipping dated 12/9/1903, Folder 32, Box 11, MVRP). These gatherings, often affiliated with the local Grange, were extremely well received; the five run across NY State saw an average of 146 participants, and one welcomed almost 500 attendees. Several assemblies ended with resolutions to formally petition the state legislature to allocate separate funding for these Women’s Institutes. However, most regional institutes, at the behest of the NY state director for Farmer Institutes, shifted to the model that Cornell employed, holding the women’s conference at the same time as that directed to men (The Sun, 4/7/1907, n.p.; MVR to Rachel Colwell, 12/22/1908, MVRP). And these regional Institutes, where experts traveled out to participants, faced limitations in their ability to demonstrate equipment; a centralized conference allowed for showing items more effectively.

At Cornell’s 1908 Farmer’s Week, targeted at farm men across the state, the Home Economics department participated minimally, with Van Rensselaer and Rose preparing steak for the attendees and giving an occasional lecture. Dean Bailey, Van Rensselaer and Rose all agreed on the desperate need that farmer’s wives had for a centralized informational gathering of this kind. The next year, Van Rensselaer and Rose successfully organized the Cornell Homemaker’s Conference which became a well-known and well-attended annual program, running simultaneously with Farmers’ Week. Students and faculty prepared well in advance for the lectures, demonstrations, and exhibits. Special train rates were offered and affordable housing arranged in Ithaca for the visitors. This second Cornell Institute, with the women included, ran
during the last week in February, a quiet time for farm work. The joint meeting proved popular, with 1,200 people registered and an estimated additional five hundred actually attending. Specialized groups and associations also met during this week, including pastors, poultry farmers, plant breeders and drainage associations (Colman, 1963, pp. 210-211).

Van Rensselaer was well positioned to organize and promote the institute, drawing on her contacts from the Lake Placid Conference and other state organizations, as well as the subject and organizational skills she’d been using so effectively at Cornell (MVR to Annie Dewey, 12/2/1910. Box 12; MVR to Miss Crawford, 6/17/1912, Box 20, MVRP). At the December 1909 meeting of the AHEA, she presented a paper on “Instruction by means of Printed bulletins and Institutes” (Program, 1909, in Folder 31, Box 12, MVRP). She promoted Farmer’s Week to those she communicated with on other matters, writing in 1911 to the Chairwoman of the Household Economics committee of the General Federation of Women’s Clubs, “I wish you might be with us during Farmer’s Week. We expect to have a good program” (MVR to Mrs. Olaf Gulddin, 2/16/1911, Box 12, MVRP). In 1914 Van Rensselaer pointed to Farmers’ Week and the Home-Maker’s Conference as a shining example of what could be accomplished in the extension service, inviting a potential extension worker to the conference to get a clear picture of the job (MVR to Miss Margaret O’Leary, 12/23/1913, Box 12, MVRP).

Van Rensselaer and Rose called on students from the Winter course, past and present, for help in organizing the Week: “The Homemakers’ Conference has been organized for two or three years and officered by women of the state. At a business meeting held at the end of the last Conference during Farmers’ Week it was decided that the Winter Course students in Home Economics would have a keener interest and would be in closer touch with plans for the program and the exhibition, etc. than any other women in the state.” This reflects the ongoing assessment and evolution of the Week as well as Van Rensselaer’s promotional talent. She continued: “… it seems desirable as years pass by to have some means of keeping up the acquaintance with our students who leave our Winter course classes. It was therefore decided that the officers of the Van Rensselaer Club which is organized from the Winter Course students should be the officers of the Homemakers’ Conference and assist the Home Economics staff in the preparation of the program and carrying out the details of the meeting” (MVR to Miss Crawford, 5/31/1911, Box 20, MVRP). Van Rensselaer thus found a strategy to increase attendance and participation in the Farmers’ Wives week, while developing membership across the state, through having the Winter Course participants become part of the Farmers’ Wives week group. Her ongoing contact with participants strengthened the credibility of Cornell and its experts. These activities supported Van Rensselaer’s vision about educating a community of farm women across the state and at different points throughout their lives.

The 1913 agenda for the Homemakers’ Conference, held in the Assembly room of the new, state-funded Home Economics building, focused on topics commonly seen in conferences run by the emergent home economics field. Flora Rose started off with a detailed discussion about the nutritive value of milk, pointing out the low cost of milk produced on the farm. The next speaker followed up with a talk on the care of milk in the home. In stressing the importance of consuming only milk free from bacteria, he noted that it was best to buy the beverage in bottles, with the containers completely washed and sterilized. The audience received a mixed message here, with speakers telling them to use both milk from the farm and in bottles from the market. A compromise of course was to bottle the farm milk in sterilized containers (Program of Homemaker’s Conference, 1913, Box 16, MVRP).

Other topics reflected the scientific management strain of home economics, with one lecturer laying out the need for a well-planned house, because “on a good arrangement of this depends the proper carrying out of the functions of the home---such as the preparation of food, the home management, sanitation and happiness” (Program of Homemaker’s Conference, p.2, 1913, Box 16, MVRP). This speaker, as well as Van Rensselaer the next day, stressed the need to save steps and rationally assess the home for any energy saving changes that could be made. Van Rensselaer encouraged farm wives to make tools, clothing and overall work arrangements as convenient as possible, and to use good time management. Other topics included learning about “Dressing and Trussing a Chicken,” a demonstration on using candies to create a dessert, Flora Rose talking about bread, and lectures on home beautification, decorating, art work and the importance of reading.
A number of these topics received coverage in the bulletins the extension unit distributed (Program of Homemakers’ Conference, 1913, Box 16, MVRP). Attendees learned about bulletin topics such as the need to rid the home of dust (and any ornamentation, furniture, rugs, curtains, floor surfaces that attracted and held dust), and “the scourge of the pest,” as well as food hygiene and laundry hygiene. Van Rensselaer herself noted in 1912 that Farmers’ Week brought a large group of people interested both in agriculture and “Scientific homemaking,” which these topics addressed (MVR to Mrs. Trowbridge, 2/20/1912, Box 16, MVRP). Lighter fare appeared as well, with music from a local singer and a play by young women enrolled in the Home Economics department.

For the February 1913 Farm and Home Week, Van Rensselaer and Rose had promised that all attendees could be fed at the cafeteria in the new Home Economics building they had moved into that fall. This promise proved difficult to keep, as much of the up-to-date equipment for the cafeteria had not yet been installed. But Van Rensselaer and Rose managed to organize their staff and students to provide food for the guests, showing off the equipment that was present and the modern furnishings. At future gatherings all the new conveniences, equipment and ways of preparing nutritious food and efficiently cleaning up could be demonstrated in this new building for the Farm and Home participants.

Home Economics staff and other faculty from the School of Agriculture dominated the program with a sprinkling of local experts, hands-on demonstration agents and state officials. For example, Van Rensselaer noted, “Miss Barrows, I think, is one of the best demonstrators in the country. She has been here for that purpose and delighted the women. She is on the Farmer’s Institute staff this Year (1910), giving two days in the week to the work” (MVR to Mrs. Addie B. Guldlin, 12/3/1909, Box 12, MVRP). More nationally known names appeared occasionally, adding to the Institute’s credibility. In 1918, with the war effort on, social activist Jane Addams and Julia Lathrop of the Children’s Bureau of the Department of the Interior both appeared at the conference (Conservation Program, February 11-16, 1918, Boxes 16, 23, MVRP). In the 20s, politicians such as Governor Franklin D. Roosevelt and Nellie Taylor Ross, former governor of Wyoming participated at what was called by then Farm and Home Week (New York Herald Tribune, February 17, 1929, n.p.; and “Program of 21st Farm and Home Week Announced, n.d., n.p. both in Box 16, MVRP).

Large numbers flocked to hear experts and well-known figures provide useful information and ideas. An analysis of the 1915 Farmers’ Week noted that 3,077 individuals had registered, an increase of 526 over the previous year. 31% of these were women, and “This proportion of nearly one-third women is said to be due mainly to the courses in home-making, offered by the department of home economics” (Press Release, Attendance at Farmer’s Week, A-24, Box 16, MVRP). People traveled to the Cornell campus from all but three New York state counties (Rockland, Hamilton and Queens, the latter two, the analysis noting, being largely urban). Nineteen states and Washington DC also sent participants; some representatives even came from Japan. Sessions were well attended and handwritten notes on the program indicate that the inadequate seating needed to be increased the following year (Rose, 1969, p.52).

Materials from organizations outside Cornell appeared at the Homemakers’ Conference. Van Rensselaer wrote to an interested party, “I would suggest you send me a few copies (of her bulletin) to be placed upon exhibition during Farmer’s Week which occurs February 19th-24th. We have a Homemakers’ Conference at that time... There are a large number of farm women who are interested in progressive things and I shall be glad to place these bulletins where they will be seen” (MVR to Mrs. Harriet Bishop Waters, 2/3/1912, Box 12, MVRP). Outside organizations coming to Farmers’ Week tended to be governmental or not-for-profit entities, rather than commercial businesses. Participating groups included the Home Bureau, The Red Cross, the Consumer’s League, the Children’s Bureau, the U.S. Department of Labor and New York State Department of Education, among others (List of organizations, n.d., Box 16, MVRP).

By the 1920s book exhibits could be seen. Here there exists evidence that seeing products at the Farm and Home conference led to purchases, even though attendees couldn’t buy the volumes there. Cornell librarian Dorothy Riddle reassured a publisher who had sent books for display, “Although we are unable to make sales at the Book Fair owing to this being a state college, we do have very definite proof that a large number of sales are made as result of the books being seen here. Could you have seen the hundreds of people who sat at the tables taking notes of authors, publishers and prices for the sole purpose of buying books either individually or for their
clubs, or for recommendations to their local libraries, I think you would feel repaid for the effort you put into sending these books to us” (Dorothy Riddle to Robert F. Evans, 3/2/1930, Folder 12, Box 16, MVRP).

Farmers’ Week exposed both men and women to farm equipment and household products (including books) that could be purchased, so got them thinking about buying. At an opening session in 1911, the building where the women met was decorated with flags and bunting but also with various types of “implements” used on the farm (Daily Union, Schenectady, March 23, 1911, n.p., Box 16, MVRP). Demonstrating the uses of these equipment, ways of preparing foods, cleaning and decorating the home, making clothes and efficiently carrying out the homemaker duties transmitted a persuasive message. The setting felt personal and the speakers had expert credibility in the eyes of their audiences, as well as a sense of familiarity, as many of the product demonstrators had, like Van Rensselaer, experienced rural life. The need to buy appropriate utensils, equipment, storage containers, and cleaning supplies for the most efficient and hygienic home was communicated powerfully to the audiences (Holt, 1995, p.48; Tomes, 1998, p.197).

In reflecting on the weeklong conference, an Ontario county farmer commented on the utility of the information gained: “You know they have a meeting called Farmers’ Week down at Cornell each year and two years ago I went. At first I thought I couldn’t afford it but my wife thought it would do me good. I intended to stay two days but I found I could stay an extra day for what I had planned to spend, about ten to twelve dollars, and what I picked up down there helped me so much that year that when it was time to go last year I just made Martha, that’s my wife, go with me. Well, I believe that’s been our best farm investment” (“Farm and Home Week,” Ralph H. Wheeler, n.p., Box 16, MVRP).

Not all men felt as positively about the women’s week. Some farmers expressed hostility toward the home economists and the suggestions they had about sanitation, nutrition and efficient household management. In her time spent in farm households Van Rensselaer had learned that often the home received the lowest priority, with dollars spent instead on agricultural equipment and innovations. Ever pragmatic, Van Rensselaer realized that the best way to engage farmers concerning the needs of the home was to involve her male colleagues, already speaking at the Farmer’s Week. While some farm women had their own money, earned by side businesses such as dairy products or crafts, many depended on their husbands for dollars so the men needed to be persuaded (Tomes, 1998, p.200).

By 1930, audiences could listen to radio broadcasts of parts of Farm and Home Week. Van Rensselaer’s contacts continued to pay off, and in 1930 Frances Perkins (at the time in the Albany, NY Department of Labor) came to speak. Eleanor Roosevelt appeared in the years 1932 through 1939, and New York Governor Franklin Roosevelt continued his visits in 1930 through 1932.

However, changes came to extension services overall, in large part due to changes in government funding of programs. Use of Federal funds for Farm Institutes was discouraged, as the government sought to professionalize the educational messages to rural households, ensuring that they came from expert sources. And commercial sources of information expanded at this time, with the growth of mass advertising.

At Cornell, the study clubs died out with the onset of the strong county demonstration agent system in the teens. The informational bulletins that had been part of the Farmers’ Wives Reading Club continued, but focused on particular projects, to support and strengthen the county extension workers. The Home Economics School stopped running the winter course in 1923 because of lack of resources: budget cuts in the teens, the need to support the every growing residential program and the fact that this type of program failed to qualify as “extension work” all led to its demise.

But the Farm and Home conference continued on. Its model, with people coming to the experts and their demonstration equipment rather than the experts coming to them, worked well for the College of Home Economics. This ran counter to the national trend. However, Farm and Home Week at Cornell continued to be held annually through 1960, except during 1944, 1945, and 1947. While they existed these Institutes met information and technical needs, provided an excellent venue for communication and created an appetite and a developed market for goods, equipment and conveniences on the farm.

Commercial Interests
In all the communication about the latest equipment, products and ways of managing life on the farm, what role did the manufacturers of those products play? In the Farm and Home Week, as well as through the bulletins, lectures to groups across the state, winter course and regular four year curriculum, Van Rensselaer and the other home economists at Cornell provided advice and guidance about the most scientific, efficient and up-to-date methods of housekeeping. In so doing, they often referenced new products and goods that manufacturers were bringing to market. However, even if they had wanted to recommend particular brands of goods or get into the business of testing products and certifying them, Van Rensselaer and her colleagues could not. The fact that they were funded by public monies, through the state of New York, constrained them, in a way that the entire School of Agriculture was limited (Colman, 1963, p.211).

Adherence to this policy at times seemed variable. For example, at the early Farm and Home Week, Van Rensselaer shows herself responsive to a suggestion to include a particular book providing information on the “fireless cooker,” a convenience widely promoted in the early 20th century. Replying to a farmer’s wife, Van Rensselaer wrote, “I like very much Miss Mitchell’s book on Fireless cooking. We shall have a demonstration on fireless cooking and I am glad of your suggestion to have the book where it can be seen and bought, if desired.” Van Rensselaer then notes that they will have an exhibition of examples of good and bad furnishing schemes, also observing that women have written in with questions about washing machines among other topics. Farm wives had in their minds the emerging products, and they looked to the college for guidance. This fit with Van Rensselaer’s view of her extension work, as she hoped “the women will learn to call upon the college for information the same as the men are doing in connection with their farm work” (MVR to Mrs. G.M. Wells, 1/14/1910, Box 16, MVRP).

However, demonstration of product use had to be carried out carefully. Van Rensselaer herself settled on the criteria of educational value as the measuring rod to be used. She described the tricky road the state-supported Agriculture School tred in getting out the best information to incipient consumers: “We have found, however, that household conveniences interest people greatly. Manufacturers are generally very glad to put their wares on exhibition. We take the ground that we cannot enter into it from a commercial standpoint, but we can show what we think is good from an educational standpoint and speak a good work (sic) for labor saving devices” (MVR to Mrs. Trowbridge, 2/20/1912, Box 16, MVRP). The issue of product testing and endorsement affected not just home economics but all the agricultural areas. Van Rensselaer needed to comply with the Agriculture School policy, while also meeting the needs of the farm wives she served. She reconciled this by showing the new conveniences, but only after she and her staff were convinced of the utility and soundness of the products and without specifically endorsing a particular brand. The trust bond she and the home economics staff built up with their constituency remained unblurred by advertising pressure, since the School had financial support from the state.

Van Rensselaer emphasized the educational criteria noted above, and felt that by keeping those principles in mind, the extension staff could display products. The Fireless Cooker demonstration actually followed an informational day of presentations on the selection and cooking of meats by Flora Rose and an exhibition on cereals. Van Rensselaer herself showed the features of the Fireless cooker, including the overnight cooking of a whole ham in the appliance (sampled by the attendees). A fireless dinner pail for working men’s lunches also appeared. Other sessions featured the operation of laundry equipment as well as how to use a vacuum cleaner “by which method the task of housecleaning is expected to be reduced to a science” (“Women’s Share in Farmer’s Week,” Rosamond F. Harper, 2/26/1908, n.p., Box 16, MVRP). However, no overt approval of brands by staff appeared.

Van Rensselaer explained the “no brand or product recommendation policy” to Mr. C. E. Pruyn of the Elmira Water, Light and Railroad Company in 1912. Referencing the upcoming Farmers’ Week, where they would be hosting some two or three thousand farmers and their families, she notes, “Our Home Economics Department makes it a point to put on exhibition labor saving devices during that week as we have many visitors on our floor. We emphasize in our teaching the use of power but our problem is largely a rural one, and while electricity will be used on the farm someday, there are many people who come here to whom it would not appeal. However, some of the visitors see possibilities even for farmers and we have visitors who are living where they have electric power. For them a few pieces would be of interest showing electricity as a power. We shall have the Syracuse Easy Washing Machine with electric power. We own a Simplex toaster. Should you wish to send anything for exhibition during the week we shall
be glad to take care of it and have it where it will be seen.” Van Rensselaer recognized that seeing items could develop a taste among consumers even when they couldn’t immediately purchase the product if not yet linked up to electricity.

This seems promising for businessman Pruyn. However, Van Rensselaer went on, laying out the policy mandated by their-state funded status, which actually seems peculiarly unhelpful in some ways to the very state citizens it is trying to protect: “We are a state institution; we can have no commercial interest in exhibiting anything and do it entirely from an educational standpoint. We cannot, therefore, have any special demonstrating. The Syracuse Easy Washer will be put up and operated without any one here to explain it. It stands for itself. (Emphasis added). It would never do for us to use the college as an advertising medium. We thus hold ourselves in readiness to speak for or against labor saving devices. We favor anything that is good because we think it will help women to solve their household problems. I have told you the whole situation frankly in order that you may know where it is best to send anything for this purpose” (MVR to Mr. C.E. Pruyn, 2/14/1912, Box16, MVRP).

This pattern of including products and demonstrating on them without naming brands continued. A 1919 program notes exhibits for Economical household furnishings, clothing and millinery, equipment for stain removal, the economical kitchen, and Fireless and steam pressure cookers and their meal possibilities (Program for 1911 Home-maker’s Conference, February 11-14, p.8, Box 63, MVRP). They showed these equipment and goods but carefully refrained from endorsing or giving detailed explanations on how to use items.

Despite the restrained amount of specific product information that could be gleaned from this Home Conference week, the visual presence of these labor saving devices and home enhancements helped develop consumer desires, if not preferences. Certainly it motivated some individuals to seek out additional information from manufacturers and sales people. Gaining the initial information from a trusted source, such as the state university college, may in fact have increased farm women’s belief that these products would be valuable. These relatively isolated and rural individuals trusted friends and family, but many also placed confidence in the home economics department at Cornell, where the staff, led by Van Rensselaer, had expended so much energy reaching out to them.

At Farmers’ Week Van Rensselaer recognized the increasingly popular topic of how the housewife could be an educated and savvy consumer. She lectured and provided opportunity for shared discussion on the subject of how women keeping house for their families should think about spending their money. However, Van Rensselaer’s focus stayed very much on practicalities and budgeting, not product placement and expanded consumption. In the very first session of the 1911 Farmers’ Week, Van Rensselaer opened with a discussion on “The Cost of Living.” She emphasized the need to understand the costs involved in keeping a household in food, clothing and other day-to-day items. She argued that women should study these costs and know the differences between buying and selling prices (Daily Union, Schenectady,3/23/1911, n.p. Box, MVRP). This revealed her approach to the topic of consumption and the housewife.

Inability to provide manufacturer information and guidance was not the only situation where working for a state agency imposed restrictions. Despite numerous requests, Van Rensselaer could not directly mail the informational bulletins produced by her extension division to anyone outside the state. She hit upon ways around this, such as having printers sell the bulletins, or going through the Chat auqua organization. When Van Rensselaer served for six years as Homemaking editor of Delineator in the early 20s, she and her staff would provide detailed descriptions of labor saving devices, implements to enhance homemaking, but could not let Delineator readers know the brand name so that they might purchase the exact product being shown (MVR to Mrs. Olaf Guldlin, 8/18/1909, Box 12, MVRP; Scholl, 2008, p.152; Zuckerman, 2013).

Van Rensselaer reiterated the School position and her awareness of the need for caution around commercial enterprises to Teachers’ College home economics faculty member Benjamin R. Andrews, when inquiring of him about an organization which had invited Van Rensselaer to appear on the program: “We are perfectly agreeable to this, but I have had an idea that this may be a commercial enterprise and while I shall respect it if it is I want to act advisedly….The question naturally arises as to whether we wish to lend our influence and assistance in a commercial enterprise. As you know there are constant opportunities for this and an institution should not appear in this light” (MVR to Benjamin R. Andrews, 4/12/1910, Box 12, MVRP).
Despite not publicly endorsing products, Van Rensselaer and her staff kept up with the latest appliances and equipment for the home so they could appropriately train their students. For example, in 1910, when planning for the new home economics new building, Van Rensselaer and Rose traveled out west to visit other institutions, taking particular note of kitchens, as they wanted to the best possible equipment in their new demonstration kitchen. Gaining knowledge of possible items available commercially was essential (MVR to Mrs. Dewey, 8/11/1910, Box 12, MVRP).

Conclusion

From the beginning of the twentieth century, through its extension services, Cornell University provided information to farm wives about new, scientific methods for keeping healthy, sanitary and efficient homes. Led by Martha Van Rensselaer, with support from co-director Flora Rose, at the behest and direction of Agricultural School Dean Liberty Hyde Bailey, Cornell’s home economics extension service created home reading programs and study clubs for farm wives, short winter courses and a Home Makers’ Conference during the Farmers’ Week.

Winter courses and institutes, reading material and clubs, for men and women both, conveyed factual information, but more importantly, different ways of thinking about farm problems. As a Cornell brochure put it: “Education consists largely in broadening one’s sympathies and in giving him (the student) new means of attacking any problem” (Cornell Winter Course, 1909-1910, p.1, Box 20, MVRP). These new ways of reasoning included expanding the mind to include the idea of purchasing. This did not form the only or even the main thrust of the curriculum, but it definitely comprised a segment of the education.

Using new conveniences logically resulted from the scientific housekeeping and efficiency propounded by Van Rensselaer and other home economists. When appliances and utensils could in fact make housekeeping easier, farm wives needed to be exposed to and informed about these pieces of equipment, just like the male farmers needed to learn about equipment that could improve output and reduce labor in the fields and barns. Home economists like Van Rensselaer presented these tools in their role as experts in social science, a part of the Progressive movement. While Cornell University did not explicitly link its information and demonstration to consumerism, rather laying claim to informational education, they did in fact help develop the consumer market.

After this exposure to the newest pieces of equipment and products, in addition to the latest information on ways to budget, keep the home sanitary and can foods, and think differently about homemaking, it is difficult to imagine that interested farmers’ wives would not seek out additional information for purchasing products, if not immediately, then in the future. They would fail to receive much brand specific data from the College of Agriculture’s Home Economics department but their newly whetted consumer appetites could seek information from other venues. Fruitful sources could be local newspapers, magazines, family members or neighbors, or commercial outlets such as storekeepers, salesmen or paid advertising.

Overall, the early extension services, such as those provided by Martha Van Rensselaer’s department of Home Economics, provided information, community, exposure and a sense of validation for the rural individuals they targeted. Although prohibited from offering specific product information, Van Rensselaer and her staff raised the awareness of the recipients of these services as to the goods and services beyond their farms which could lessen their work burden and allow them to create more hygienic, healthful and attractive homes.

References


Van Rensselaer, Martha, Papers (MVRP), A Guide to the New York State College of Home Economics Records, 1875-1979, archival papers, (23-2-749), Division of Rare and Manuscript Collections, Cornell University Library, Ithaca, NY.


Extended Abstracts
How to sell Nuclear Energy to the public in the 1950s

Maria Elena Aramendia-Muneta
Department of Economics, Universidad Pública de Navarra, Spain
Joseba De la Torre
Department of Economics Universidad Pública de Navarra, Spain
Maria del Mar Rubio-Varas
Department of Economics, Universidad Pública de Navarra, Spain

The purpose of this paper is to identify the marketing measures that both Spanish Leaders and foreign lobbies took in the 50s to spread the idea that there was a need for nuclear energy.

At the end of the 40s, Spain was struggling to recover from a dark and complicated period where the Spanish were living under hard conditions (food rationing, military dictatorship and international isolation, among others). Under those circumstances, Spain was looking for a solution for its energy shortage.

Spain was under the tremendous influence of the government of the United States of America, as it was its main and almost only ally in the beginning of the 50s. Therefore, the media was a market mirror and created an image of demand and wish of the Spanish public undercover by the military regime, as well as creating new stories and a new approach to the public in order to advocate public relations (Ewen and Ewen, 1992; Hovland and Wilcox, 1989; Jackall and Hirota, 2000; Kennedy, 2005).

By the mid1950s, over 30 per cent of the population had no formal education (just 45 per cent of the Spanish population had completed primary education). Due to this, the best means of reaching the public was through visual images. The first media used was Noticiarios y Documentales Cinematográficos commonly known as NO-DO. Franco’s regime had created NO-DO in November 1942 with the purpose of overseeing all non-fiction film productions. Until 1976, broadcasts were mandatory at the beginning of any film in cinemas nationwide (Ramírez Martínez, 2008). The second media was the exhibition “Atoms for Peace” with the aim of promoting the transcendence of nuclear energy usage. Finally, another attempt was made to build a unison between advertising and chocolate, leading to a connection between Nuclear Energy and children.

We identify three main target consumers in the strategy of accepting the implementation of Nuclear Energy as real solution to solving energy shortage and above all, as the key to developing the country: scientists, the general public and children.

The next step of the research is to match the different media strategies to the three identified groups. The main media was NO-DO, for this purpose we analysed all the videos from 1950 to 1959. Sixty seven of the ones shown during that decade had content related to Nuclear Energy.

The first group are scientists, who were the future employees who would be building nuclear facilities and those who would have to present the idealised image of Nuclear Energy to the public. The NO-DO videos content, present Nuclear Energy as an application to the field of medicine to a great degree, which was one of the most worrying issues in that decade throughout the country.

The second group was the general public. Among the videos, the USA is presented as the future saviour of the country. One of the promoting images was the American submarine powered by Nuclear Energy that went to the port of Barcelona and where the Spanish received them with open arms. Embracing Nuclear Energy was embracing the USA, symbolizing a promising future. Another key issue was presenting other countries who were already using nuclear energy, such as Colombia and France. They showed that former colonies of Spain had already implemented this technology, along with our neighbours.

Regarding the exhibition “Atoms for Peace”, the display was presented as a part of the NO-DO to the general public that could not visit the exhibition, given that the fair was held in Bilbao, Madrid and Seville. The U.S. government played a major role in this event, providing the footage and presence in the inauguration ceremony, in main part to the American ambassador in Spain (Mr. Lodge). In the opening ceremony in Bilbao, he claimed Spain to be “this great Spanish nation .... also has as a goal to use the great energy power at our disposal to enrich the life of humanity”. He also presented the treaty
between Spain and the USA about nuclear energy for civil use, which enfaсed the use of nuclear energy for peace.

For the USA, it was also important to befriend Spain to gain another ally in Europe against the Soviet Union (the enemy at that time) (Schwartz, 1997). The Cold War was a period where the USA helped European countries to sell their economic values (Tadajewski and Stole, 2016).

In the exhibition, the very same topics as in NO-DO were displayed: medicine, the creation of energy and American aid. This event was designed for scientists, general public and schools, but it was also a scenario for new electric companies, that would build nuclear facilities nearby.

Finally, children in this decade were strongly influenced by NO-DO, through the means of mandatory broadcasts previous to any film and then through “el album atómico” (the atomic album), which was an album of collectible stickers that children could obtain if they sent 50 chocolate wrappers of the brand Amatller with the slogan “The sciences advance, but... today as yesterday Chocolates Amatller”. As remarked in the ad published in ABC journal 1958, number 16970, the goal of receiving “el album atómico” was having fun, learning and eating chocolate, of course. It is important to remark that most children at that time, could hardly afford to buy chocolate and could only occasionally go to the cinema.

NO-DO used subliminal advertising for the Spanish population. The fear and paranoid climate in the USA (Fullerton, 2010) launched new ways of broadening their political horizons in Europe and NO-DO was an extraordinary tool to advertise Nuclear Energy, where Spanish regime collected American information and broadcasted it through NO-DO. It is recognized that during the Cold War, subliminal advertising was part of mind control and manipulation strategy (Samuel, 2016). In that way, consumers were influenced and started to believe what the Spanish government told them. All NO-DO videos were a source of information. This source of information, we can consider as advertising, and therefore it helped consumers to be cultured (Castillo, 2005). As it was mandatory to watch NO-DO videos before each film, Franco’s government tried to force the Spanish, to view the kind of information they wanted and they thought that the population needed to know.

References
Signaling to Market Baroque Merchant Books

Klaus Brockhoff

WHU – Otto Beisheim School of Management, Burgplatz 2, D 56179 Vallendar, Germany

Extended abstract

Full-page frontispieces were published in a few books during the Baroque period. It is obvious that the production of a copper etching for the frontispiece was expensive, particularly if relatively well-known artists were involved. Why would publishers do this at substantial expense? It is suggested that some publishers chose such frontispieces as the particular marketing technique of signaling.

The Baroque period covers roughly the 17th century and the first half of the 18th century. During this period books were sold uncut and unbound. Thus, it was cumbersome to learn about their contents. Theoretically speaking, the books had more experience and credence characteristics (Akerlof 1970; Nelson 1970) than present-day books. Little of the content could be revealed by elaborate title pages. Further information could be found by interested book dealers and potential buyers if a picture was printed on the frontispiece. This could signal elements of the content. Signaling theory was developed by Spence (1973) with an application to the field of human resources. It was applied to other fields including marketing, and in particular to the announcement of new products (Devinney 1988; Boulding and Kirmani 1993; Ernst and Schnoor 2000). Signaling is of particular interest for contracting products or services with the above-mentioned characteristics.

We identify two functions of signals by analyzing a convenience sample of Baroque merchant books. First, a collection of Baroque books for merchants was identified. Book merchants carried a surprisingly numerous number of titles during the period as evidenced by a catalogue (Enslin 1824). For more coverage, I searched electronic data sources, such as MDZ (Bayerische Staatsbibliothek, Münchner Digitalisierungszentrum: www.digitale-sammlungen.de) or gallica.fr. While the first electronic source contains books of any European language collected in the Bavarian State Library, the latter source is restricted to French literature. It was then identified whether any of the books carried a full-page frontispiece or not. All books which qualified in this way were further analyzed.

We hypothesize that these frontispiece pictures provided potential book dealers and readers with deliberately chosen signals in an economic sense. The following can be observed: For technical reasons books in the Baroque period have relatively more experience and credence characteristics than books in later times. Therefore, efforts to reduce asymmetry of information on content and quality between sellers and potential buyers should be helpful to market books. Content and quality can be signaled by a full-page frontispiece. Production of a frontispiece is obviously expensive, particularly if known artists are involved. Thus, the frontispiece can serve as a signal.

We further hypothesize that signals could have two functions.

Firstly, signals can give hints at content, and possibly also at the quality of work. This might enhance the willingness to buy a particular book (or to barter it, which was an alternative way of wholesale book trades). Few authors make it explicit that they wanted to signal the content of their work by a frontispiece. One example is an explanatory poem included by the author in Böckler (1683). More often, this intention is not made explicit. However, the scenes depicted can easily be related to the content at large or even more specifically to individual chapters of the work. The latter is particularly prominent in the first edition of Jacques Savary’s “Le parfait négociant … ” from 1675 (Figure 1).
Secondly, by referring to great teachers, saints or even God in the pictures, the authors might strive to avoid criticism or communicate particular expertise. With respect to natural science literature this was called establishing an “amulet function” (Harms 1978). For the “amulet function” to serve its purpose it is necessary that the allegoric symbols are correctly understood. It might be questioned whether this type of signals could have been understood by the contemporary merchants. To assume interpretive abilities is plausible for two reasons. First, iconographic literature was available, and one of the leading works found many editions and translations (Ripa 1603). This established standards for interpretation. Second, the formal education of merchants included such items as understanding the meaning of the elements in coats of arms (Ludovici 1768). Coats of arms also use allegoric elements.

Figure 1: Frontispiece of Jacques Savary, Le parfait négiant … (1675) with overlay of references to chapters (by the author)

One of the examples for the signaling of the “amulet function” is a book by Straccha (1622). He presents two famous law teachers plus a number of well-known locations where the content might be applied, and an allegorical figure of Fortune governing a globe.

Furthermore, one might ask whether authors who published a larger number of books would use identical frontispiece pictures to build a personal brand. The case of Marperger (1714, 1715a, 1715b, 1723) can be studied in this respect. He is said to have authored about 70 books. His case does not show indications of personal branding. The topics of the frontispieces change according to the contents of the books. Only one of the topics is unrelated to the book’s content.

One might argue that in modern times book covers could assume a function similar to the Baroque frontispieces by “offering … a positive impact on the perceived ability to form some impression of a book” (Meisenberg 2014). This impact, if any, is insignificant. This is explained by the scarcity of designs, which in many cases display financial symbols, business people or mathematical
formulas (Meisenberg 2014). These cannot possibly be interpreted as signaling contents. Because today content can be communicated easier than in the Baroque period there may be no need for more richly illustrated covers.

Similarly, authors or publishers in the Baroque period may have decided against expensive signals via frontispieces because they could not evaluate the response to these signals. Whether this explains the almost complete disappearance of such signals in the second half of the 18th century is an open question. This leads to the assumption that a concept like signaling survives only if the effects of the concept can be demonstrated or measured.

In summary, it is interesting to observe that a theoretical concept developed rather recently had been intuitively developed and used about 300 years earlier.

References


Enslin, T. C. F., Edt. (1824), Bibliothek der Handlungswissenschaft oder Verzeichnis der vom Jahre 1700 bis zur Mitte des Jahres 1824 in Deutschland erschienenen Bücher über alle Theile der Handlungskunde und deren Hilfswissenschaften ..., (Enslin), Berlin/Landsberg an der Warte. (Reprinted by: amazon.co.uk, no year)


Marperger, P. J. (1714), Nothwendig und nützliche Fragen über die Kauffmannschaft ..., Balthasar Otto Boseck, Leipzig and Flensburg.

Marperger, P. J. (1715a), Getreuer und Geschickter Handels-Diener ..., Peter Conrad Monath, Nürnberg and Leipzig.

Marperger, P. J. (1715b), Wohl-unterwiesener Kauffmannsjung Oder: Gründliche Anweisung ..., Johann Leonhard Buggel, Nürnberg:.

Marperger, P. J. (1723), Trifolium Mercantile Aureum, oder Dreyfaches Güldenes Klee-Blatt der werthen Kauffmannschaft ... (published by the author), Dreßden/Leipzig.


Savary, J. (1675), Le parfait négotiant ou instruction générale..., Louis Billaine, Paris.

Straccha, B. (1622), De Mercatura Decisiones, Et Tractatus Varii De Rebus Ad Eam Pertinientibus ... [Sold at] Cornelium [Cornelius], Colonia [Cologne].
The role of universal expositions in the diffusion process of three innovative technologies in France: 1867-1937

Marie Carpenter
*Télécom Ecole de Management, Evry, France*

Patrick Luciano
*Université Paris-Dauphine, Paris, France*

The growing mass media coverage of the annual Consumer Electronics Show (CES) held in Las Vegas every January bears witness to the role that new technologies are playing in the daily lives of consumers worldwide. Decades of research on the diffusion of innovations have generated much insight into the processes of adoption of new technologies (Rogers, 2003), but much remains to be explained (Hall, 2004), particularly in relation to the movement from introduction to take-off when a new technology crosses “the chasm” (Moore, 1991) and moves from adoption simply by early adopters into the businesses and households of the early majority. While diffusion processes of innovations have undoubtedly become more complex and multi-faceted in recent years (Peres et al, 2010), certain fundamental questions regarding the reasons for take-off remain common across many different technological sectors.

In particular, the role played by early adopters has been found to differ in different cultures and countries (Trellis et al, 2002) and more recently, depending on whether the new technology is platform-based or non-platform based (Frattini et al, 2013). In their historical examination of eight innovations in consumer high-tech markets Chiesa and Frattini (2011) focus on the commercialization practices of the firms introducing the products and find evidence of the key role played by the adoption network and the attitude of early adopters. They argue, however, that further research of this type is needed to enhance understanding of how the attitudes of early adopters impact the success of a radical innovation in the high-tech area. It has been argued more generally that examining the emergence of past innovations can illuminate our understanding of the potential impact of today’s new technologies (Marvin, 1988). In the field of platform technologies, a historical comparison of telecom platforms show that interesting insights can be generated by comparative historical research into the elements that explain the regular emergence of such ecosystems at different times and in different parts of the world (Carpenter, 2013).

Universal expositions have played a significant role in the history of diffusion of innovations, in particular from the 1851 Crystal Palace Exhibition when “world’s fairs took on the important role of disseminator of new technology and manufacturing processes vital for a country’s economic development and wealth creation” (Tamilia, 2007, p.230). Presenting a new technology at such an exhibition can be considered a key communication channel for an innovation during the introductory phase of its life cycle. In addition, the appearance of such new technologies in Universal Expositions corresponds to the period in the diffusion process during which the innovation should move from what are termed innovators to early adopters.

A comparative study of the introduction of three new technologies in France between 1876 and 1937 is therefore proposed to enhance understanding of the role played by early adopters and the early majority in the diffusion of technological innovations. The primary object of investigation will be how the new technologies of electricity, the telegraph and the telephone were presented to the French public at the seven universal expositions held in Paris during this period and the press coverage given to these presentations.

The diffusion in France of these three technologies is interesting to compare. Despite their obvious interest in improving the lives of French citizens and with each given significant promotion during the period of the six universal exhibitions and one ** exhibition covered by the research, the pace of adoption of the innovations was significantly different with electricity diffusing rapidly, the telegraph relatively rapidly after a difficult star and the telephone only achieving mass diffusion in France many decades after other nations.

In 1881, 1889 and 1900, Paris was the centre of interest in the promotion of the diffusion of electricity with international exhibitions that introduced, respectively, standard units for measuring electricity and
the first electric meter. These technological developments were primarily of interest to professionals but they laid the groundwork for the rapid future deployment of a mass electricity network throughout French households. The advantages of electricity to humanity were presented notably in artist Raoul Dufy’s huge fresco of the “Fée Electricité” (Electricity Fairy) for the 1937 exhibition, in Paris.

Although Samuel Morse first visited France in 1837 to promote his patented invention of an electric telegraph transmission system, it was not until the 1850s that the French administration began to construct the network. Mass adoption of the electric telegraph began in earnest with a significant drop in prices decided in 1854 and national deployment, even to remote rural areas, was achieved by the 1870s. For this communications technology, France thus became a forerunner in Europe (Bertho, 1981).

The opposite is true for the telephone. The first presentation of Bell’s invention was in Europe was 1878 at the Universal Exposition in Paris. Subsequently, however, France neglected to deploy the technology amid a decade of “chaotic” in-fighting with the administration of the post-office and the telegraph service and a failed attempt at private networks that ended in the nationalization of the service in 1889. Subsequent decades of neglect by the PTT did little to enhance the density or quality of the service, which remained marginal in France until the impressive catch-up phase under the French telecom administration in the 1970s (Carpenter, 2011). Even still, the market orientation of the telephone industry in France continued to lag behind that of other countries with comparable levels of economic development for a further decade (Luciano and Volle, 2015).

Early expositions clearly played a role in diffusion of innovations by displaying the wonders of a new technology to huge numbers of admiring visitors. The impact of such expositions, however, was not equally relevant to all such technologies and this may be linked to the choice of application made to illustrate the advantages of its adoption, to the competing technologies already available and the relative cost of such alternatives. Finally, each exposition occurs in a broader societal context, in which the conditions for adoption of the technology may not have been met. Citing Le Boulanger from 1889, Carré (1991) points out that the use of the “théatrophone” to illustrate the potential use of the telephone potentially corresponds to a stereotype in which the adopter of such a new technology is looking for sources of distraction or seeking to distinguish themselves from others rather than seeking a real service. He goes on to seek out the true early adopters of the telephone in France between 1876 and 1914 – and those who resisted its roll-out and adoption – and calls for a more realistic and systematic look at the true dynamics of the stalled diffusion of this important technological innovation in France during this period.

The proposed research will thus conduct a critical analysis of the historical material covering the presentation of the introduction of three technological innovations in France over the period of the seven universal expositions. Particular attention will be paid to the attempts made by providers of the new technologies to target innovators and early adopters and to attract interest from the early majority. The impact the universal expositions will be examined in the broader context of societal, political and technological dynamics that were having a parallel influence on the adoption of the technological innovations in France.

A significant amount of historical research has already been done on the role of universal expositions with regard to the diffusion of the telephone and electricity in France between 1867 and 1937 (Beltran and Carré, 1998, Bertho-Lavenir, 1989 Caron and Bertho, 1983 Carré, 1989 and 1991 and Leguy, 1987). The information from these rich sources will be adapted to a comparative analytical framework of diffusion of innovation during this period for the three technologies under investigation: electricity, the telegraph and the telephone. In addition, all documents available for consultation at the Bureau International des Expositions (BIE) in Paris will be exploited to enhance existing insights into the type of presence and the activities that were carried out during these different expositions by the suppliers of these technologies and their networks.

Finally, as part of its digitalization project of documents considered to be part of the French written heritage, Gallica, the Bibliothèque Nationale de France (BNF) has scanned the national newspapers and a limited search function is available. For the period concerned, four newspapers are considered to cover a significant section of the French readership of daily newspapers:

1. *Le Journal*, published from 1892 to 1928
2. *Le Petit Journal*, published from 1863 to 1944
3. *Le Petit Parisien*, published from 1876 to 1944
4. *Le Matin*, published from 1882 to 1944
A content analysis of these newspapers will be conducted to investigate the processes by which the innovations were communicated through different channels at different time period among different segments.

References
MacKenzie has recently written of British travel guide books of the nineteenth and twentieth centuries as,

relentless textualisation of dominion and control, expressed through the places and incidents and forms of both past and present through which that imperial power was supremely expressed (2005, p. 26).

These seemingly innocuous aids to the traveller were rich in a much greater narrative that used these means to further express the identity of the nation and draw people towards an understanding of where that State stood on the world stage. In this manner, commercial means were used to further national ends with marketing communications efficiently reinforcing the broader rhetoric of the moment. This paper explores some of these ideas through the marketing of British shipping lines from the mid-nineteenth century through to the end of the 1960s. In effect, as Zuelow has written of World Fairs, beyond their prime motivation or purpose, these events ‘helped to define the presentation of national spaces, places, and people’ (2016, p. 94), and in similar fashion the marketing materials examined here, whilst ostensibly designed to sell a product, fulfilled a similar role.

Massey has captured these broad points most effectively in suggesting how each nation’s shipping line ‘accentuated the national identity of the home country’ (2009, p. 209). This was notably expressed in the design ethos of the Cunard Line (the main focus of this paper) where they used their ships to project their own ‘stately premises in the English shires’ (Wall, 1978, p. 99). However, they were also more broadly influenced by the market in which they operated and the ramifications of their approach went far beyond merely perpetuating their selfish world view. An emphasis on tradition and heritage in shipping line marketing was notably enhanced and exaggerated in the interwar period.

During the 1920s, American passengers began to predominate: whilst US immigration legislation may have severely impacted on west-bound passages, it opened up a whole new market for those keen to return to the “old country”. In seeking to grow this market, shipping lines focussed on “old home traffic” making a clear distinction between the American of today and their forebears. The marketing of these shipping lines concentrated on the experience of travelling “back” as lending an air of old world culture, luxury and snobishness. The newly rich from across the Atlantic, it was suggested, could gain kudos through immersion in the cultural traditions of the old world and marketing produced by the British shipping lines claimed the best place to start that was on-board their ships. This marketing suggested an identity for wealthy American travellers relative to the old country. By these means, the great wealth of literature produced by these lines for their transatlantic service drew on historical narrative and historicisation to provide a sense of legitimacy and reassurance. This marketing extended beyond merely filling passenger lists and, it is argued, went as far as playing a part in creating an identity for Americans relative to the “Old Country”:

the [tourism] industry contributed significantly to the formation of difference. It allowed promoters to concoct something new, to market a sense of what made one country distinct from another (Zuelow, 2016, p. 102).

For the purposes of this paper, the various sources of promotional literature are read relative to this grander, and perhaps unimagined role, of establishing, reinforcing and perpetuating national greatness, and setting up a very distinct idea of what “British” meant.
Objectives
This paper considers the manner in which national characteristics and a sense of national identity were expressed through the development, deployment and promotion of products. It uses as a case study British shipping lines operating from the mid-nineteenth century, up to the coming into service of Cunard’s QE2 in 1969, to explore how Britishness was expressed, with what purpose, and to what ends.

Building on previous research which questioned the efficacy of the British approach to the marketing of their shipping lines, this paper has a particular concentration on the White Star/Cunard Line to reveal the rationale behind this approach which placed a sense of Britishness at its core, and a very distinctive impression of the British national character. In time this became fundamental to the identity of the Line and despite a good deal of rhetoric that heralded the coming into service of the QE2 in 1969 as being a distinctive break from that and a real effort to present a new, modern sense of Britain, a leaflet produced to promote her maiden voyages in 1969 continued to stress Cunard’s ‘impeccable British service’ (‘Join the QE2 on her Glamorous Maiden Voyages 1969’. Emphasis added).

British seafaring is set against a backdrop of tradition and heritage. This paper explores how these themes were used in the marketing of Cunard’s transatlantic service from the end of the nineteenth century up to 1969. What is revealed is the centrality of British, or more specifically English, character as a key motif differentiating the service offered by Cunard.

Method
The material drawn in for this paper comes from a number of key archives: the Cunard Archive at the University of Liverpool; various shipping company papers held at Glasgow University Archives & Business Records Centre; and a wide range of promotional materials held at the Mariners’ Museum, Newport News, USA. The key focus has been on promotional brochures and leaflets, alongside other ephemera. This has been read in depth in search of descriptions of ship interiors and the general experience to understand how the nationality of those ships is embedded into those propositions, and how significant that is in relation to a distinctive marketing story. This is set alongside the extant literature which sets out the historiography of nationalism through the period in question and the wider context regarding the business of shipping, the external context and pressures, to establish further the rationale and motivation for such an approach.

Contribution
The paper adds a further dimension to other histories which identify shipping lines as sites of national pride where ships projected a clear identity. This is especially found to be clearly embodied in the design of Cunard vessels, then further articulated in the promotional literature which accompanied them. Thus, the Campania which came into service in 1893 expressed British might via an opulent interior in English Baronial style. It quickly became apparent that promoting Britishness could be an important marketing tool, differentiating Cunard in an increasingly competitive market.

This paper builds on the work of others noting the actual design of ships interiors through this period to understand how this was interpreted and promoted via marketing. Thus, beyond the physical manifestation of these interiors, meaning is layered on top of this to speak to a specific constituency of potential customers to provide added meaning to the consumption experience. For those who may not have otherwise have been aware, passengers are advised that the Smoking Room of Cunard’s Aquitania was derived from a Christopher Wren interior at Greenwich’s Royal Naval Hospital. Later, with the launch of the Queen Mary, the traditional manor house credentials of that vessel are accentuated, marketing a ‘manifold British tradition’ which was believed to be crucial to attracting the right sort of customers, making ‘modern luxury warm and inviting, by the intuitive deftness of the true British servant’ (The Queen Mary: World’s Newest and Fastest Liner, c.1934 (emphasis added)).

References
Join the QE2 on her Glamorous Maiden Voyages 1969, Cunard Archive University of Liverpool MS15.05719.
The Queen Mary: World’s Newest and Fastest Liner (c.1934), Cunard Archive University of Liverpool, D42/PR12/1.

Office Space: Organising the Australian Advertising Agency in the 20th Century

Robert Crawford
School of Media & Communication, RMIT University, Australia.

Speaking about his agency’s recent relocation, Mark de Teliga, the managing director of the Ball Partnership, explained that the move was not simply about better or more commodious premises:

Clients prefer to deal with a company that is accessible and in a place that affords some comfort. They often bring their own customers too – and they don’t want to ring them along to a hole in the wall and say: “This is our agency”. The environment is critical to getting the message across (Maiden, 1986, p.2).

As images are advertising’s stock in trade, it is little surprise that advertising agencies might appreciate the importance of their own image and its significance to clients and competitors alike. In an industry where expenses are divided between staff costs and rent, the office would become a key part of the agency’s image. To this end, the success of the hit television series *Mad Men* was, in part, based on the program creators’ close attention to the image of the agency’s office (Dunbar, 2010). For the advertising agency then, the office is something more than a mere workplace; it is an integral expression of an agency’s identity. This relationship illustrates the claim by renowned office architect, Frank Duffy, that offices ‘reveal the values of those who build them and work in them’ (Duffy, 1980, p.255). Moreover, it also demonstrates Per Berg and Kristian Kreiner’s claim that buildings ‘have become powerful managerial tools as well as tools of production’ (1990, p.43).

In his survey of the office design and history, John F. Pile notes that the ‘functions of the office all have to do with two activities, which can be summarized as communication and control’ (1969, p.5). Observing that ‘offices are geared … to transfiguring the events of an unequal, uncontrollable and unpredictable outside world into paper and process, and minimising distraction from the task at hand’, Gideon Haigh’s (2012) more recent history of the office similarly emphasises the degree to which the office seeks to structure, order, and control workers as well as the work that they undertake.

Communication is therefore a means to this end. As JoAnne Yates (1989) has demonstrated, the processes of formalising communication were integral to the establishment of management systems that underpinned the growth of commercial enterprises. With the control of communication forming a fundamental part of the agency practice, the agency’s office and operations offer unique insights into the office and its historical development.

In *Reimagining Business History*, Philip Scranton and Patrick Fridenson contend that spatiality offers business historians a fruitful, if under-examined, field of inquiry (2013, 227-31). Studies such as Stephanie Decker’s (2014) account of the impact of architecture on collective memory or A.E Kirby and A.M. Kent’s (2014) exploration of store design to convey brand identity illustrate the ways in which spatiality and material culture provide a unique perspective of the past. Historical accounts of the office as a work space have largely emphasised the experience of the clerk. Informed by Harry Braverman’s ‘deskilling’ thesis (1998), these studies have explored the changing status of the clerk as well the feminisation of the office space (Attewell, 1989; Cohn, 1985; Davies, 1982; Guerrero Wilson, 1999; Heller, 2008; Lowe, 1987; Nolan, 1992). Such narratives have led Nikil Saval to assert rather pessimistically that ‘the story of white-collar work hinges on promises of freedom and uplift that have routinely been betrayed’ (2014, p.6). In their study of administrative routines within the early twentieth century office, Ingrid Jeacle and Lee Parker (2013) suggest that such changes are part of a broader shift. They contend that the ‘modern office’ with its ‘obsession with system’ reflected the ‘spread of scientific principles from factory floor to office desk’ (p. 1075). This transfer, they add, has attracted relatively little scholarship, where the focus has centred on the ‘machinations of manufacturing rather than the affairs of administration’ (p. 1075). A similar emphasis can be discerned in Christopher Wright’s (1995, 2011) pioneering work on the management of labour Australia.
While these accounts offer an important perspective of Australian advertising agency operations, they only capture part of the story. Divided into three interconnected spheres – agency administration, client service, and advertisement production – agency work consists of multiple tasks. Noting that ‘labour strategies might involve combinations of practices at a variety of levels which could prove complementary but also contradictory’, Wright suggests that the clerk’s experience only offers a partial insight into multifaceted firms like the advertising agency (2011, p.22). To this end, management history offers an additional and revealing approach. In claiming that management’s influence lay in its capacity ‘to monitor and coordinate the activities of a number of business units more efficiently than … market mechanisms’, Alfred Chandler underscores the need for considering management’s contribution to the office’s development (2002, p.11). Management and organisational studies scholarship concerning the office offers new approaches to understanding the office’s historical development. Henry Mintzberg’s ‘ad hoc’ model (1979) thus reveals the importance of recognising the need for flexibility within the agency environment as well as the need for control. Building on these concepts, Barry Haynes’ study of office productivity contends that ‘the quest for productivity improvements has led to two different paradigms, the control paradigm and the enabling paradigm’ (2007, p.452). Other studies have similarly noted these paradigms, particularly the inherent tension between them. Gareth Morgan (1997) and Katherine Chen (2012) have therefore noted the degree to which the desire to control can adversely affect creativity. Arguing that ‘the office building is a product of the spirit of the age’ (2001, p.325), Juriaan van Meel and Paul Vos’s study of ‘funky’ offices identifies similar concerns. However, their uncertainty about the longevity of the creative space in the face of financial pressures suggests that the enabling paradigm ultimately runs second to the controlling paradigm – a perspective that this paper seeks to confirm. Taking up Jackie Dickenson’s call for historians ‘to reveal the cultural factors and influences that affect the finished advertisements in order to provide more nuanced understandings of the interactions between advertising and society’ (2014, p.326), this paper briefly charts the evolution of the advertising agency office in Australia over the course of the twentieth century. By using the fleeting references to agency operations and layouts contained in the agency documents, autobiographies, and the trade and popular press, along with insights gleaned from oral history interviews with former agency staff, this paper reveals the ideas informing the organisation and functions of the advertising agency’s offices and, indeed, their impact on the work done by the agency. Over the course of the twentieth century, the structure and operations of Australian agencies can be classified into three distinct periods, where a particular function or department held sway: the account service period (1900s–1960s); the creative period (1960s–1980s); and the management period (1980s–1990s). In examining the advertising agency’s changing organisation, layout, location, and aesthetic appearances, this paper not only offers an alternative perspective of the advertising agency business, it also demonstrates the importance of material culture for historians working in the marketing field.

References
Cunard across the Atlantic, an ‘impeccable British service’.


Dunbar, P. (2010), “Revealed: The incredible attention to detail on TV’s most stylish period drama Mad Men,” *Daily Telegraph*, 26 September, available at: more: [http://www.dailymail.co.uk/femail/article-1315217/Revealed-The-incredible-attention-TVs-stylish-period-drama-Mad-Men.html#ixzz4c1gEaTUT](http://www.dailymail.co.uk/femail/article-1315217/Revealed-The-incredible-attention-TVs-stylish-period-drama-Mad-Men.html#ixzz4c1gEaTUT)


Consumer Ethnocentrism and Consumer Animosity: A Literature Review

Maya F. Farah  
Hospitality Management and Marketing Department, Adnan Kassar School of Business, Lebanese American University, Beirut, Lebanon

Nour Mehdi  
Hospitality Management and Marketing Department, Adnan Kassar School of Business, Lebanese American University, Beirut, Lebanon

This literature review attempts to build a broader understanding of consumer ethnocentrism and consumer animosity while highlighting their historical and evolutionary perspectives. This paper identifies four possible inquests that hamper the tackled research ground: (1) the lack of systematic assessments and comprehensive summaries in the field, (2) the dominance of quantitative research topics, (3) the scarcity of historical reviews, and last but not least, (4) the lack of a well-developed understanding of the link between local producers, ethnocentrism, and animosity.

The concept of consumer ethnocentrism originated in 1906 when Sumner introduced it to refer to the way a certain ethnic group perceives itself at the center of the world, rating other ethnic groups accordingly (Balabanis and Diamantopoulos, 2004, Bizumic, 2014). Initial studies on ethnocentrism emerged in the late nineteenth century and focused mainly on human sociology and psychology whereby one’s civilization is treated as the cultivated, superior point of reference, while other societies are considered crude in nature (Evans, 1894; Bracq, 1902).

Sumner’s (1906) study is commonly assumed to be the first to directly discuss ethnocentrism and identify the presence of both in-groups and out-groups; this division was accompanied by positive attitudes towards one’s in-group, including loyalty and favorable behaviors, and negative attitudes towards various out-groups, accompanied with unfavorable and judgmental behaviors (Balabanis and Diamantopoulos, 2004). The most commonly used definitions of ethnocentrism are those proposed by: (a) Sumner (1906), based on in-group versus out-group concepts; (b) LeVine and Campbell (1972) who stressed on the cooperation among in-groups and the lack of contact and cooperation among out-groups, and (c) Shimp and Sharma (1987) who discussed how purchasing imported products is morally wrong because it affects the domestic economy, leads to a loss of jobs, and is by and large unpatriotic.

Extensive research in the consumer ethnocentrism field led to consumer animosity being introduced in the 1990s as a new factor affecting consumers’ willingness to purchase foreign goods without necessarily altering the quality perception related to these goods, thereby threatening marketers worldwide (Klein and Ettenson, 1999). The concept of animosity is rendered both to the psychology and sociology fields. In the 1990s, consumer animosity was still a new concept for companies, and marketers became interested in exploring how animosity could affect consumer purchases in international markets and what are the triggers behind it (Klein and Ettenson, 1999).

The concept of consumer animosity was first introduced to the marketing field in 1998 by Klein, Ettenson, and Morris through the proposition of the Animosity Model of Foreign Product Purchase (AMFPP). The latter defined animosity as “remnants of antipathy related to previous or ongoing military, political or economic events” and differentiated between animosity and consumer ethnocentrism based on the fact that the former exerts negative influences on consumers’ purchase decisions, and ultimately their willingness to buy (Klein et al., 1998, p. 90; Cai et al., 2012; Nes et al., 2012).

Consumer animosity can be divided into a taxonomy of four types (Jung et al., 2002; Ang et al., 2004) based on both the animosity source (situational versus stable) and the locus of manifestation (personal versus national)—namely, (a) national stable animosity, (b) personal stable animosity, (c) national situational animosity, and (d) personal situational animosity (Cai et al., 2012). In addition, the latter concept is a four-dimensional construct consisting of war, economic, political, and people animosity.

The concepts of ethnocentrism and animosity have been researched quite heavily throughout the literature. Although diverse scales were proposed over the years, not all of them are still utilized nowadays. Accordingly, the most widely used scales in consumer ethnocentrism and consumer
Consumer ethnocentrism and consumer animosity are respectively, Shimp and Sharma’s (1987) *Consumer Ethnocentrism Tendencies Scale (CETSCALE)* and Hoffmann, Mai and Smirnova’s (2011) *Animosity Scale*.

The papers reviewed largely indicate the presence of a significant positive relationship between consumer ethnocentrism and animosity. It must be noted that a total of 15 studies treated both ethnocentrism and animosity as distinct, independent constructs that differ both conceptually and demographically, and that have no direct relationship to one another (Klein, 2002; Esso and Dib, 2004; Shankarmesh, 2006; Ben Mrad and Kozloskihart, 2014). Nevertheless, even though they are treated as independent variables, both concepts are found to significantly impact consumer purchase intentions and product judgment regardless of an individual’s perception of product quality (Brown and O’Cass, 2006; Nakos and Hajidimitriou, 2007).

Consumer ethnocentrism and consumer animosity are so broad that their effects can be tailored not only toward the marketing field given their significant influence on marketers’ activities and decisions, but also toward the business sector in general. Given their tremendous effect on consumers’ daily life, these two concepts should be taken more seriously by individuals interested in the business domain—whether managers, producers, international investors, or entrepreneurs.

References


Sumner, W.G. (1906), Folkways: a study of the sociological importance of usages, manners, customs, mores, and morals, Ginn And Company, Boston, MA.
Marketing for Immigrants: the Case of Argentina

Karen F. A. Fox
Department of Marketing, Leavey School of Business, Santa Clara University, Santa Clara, California USA

Introduction
Few independent countries have employed marketing techniques as part of a concerted strategy to attract immigrants who would settle and contribute to the country’s long-term development. Argentina stands out as an exception, because its leaders recognized the necessity of immigration in the early nineteenth century and enshrined immigration in the country’s 1853 constitution. Argentina received more than seven million immigrants between 1870 and 1930, mainly from Spain and Italy. This paper addresses the marketing strategies and tools Argentina used during the second half of the nineteenth century to attract immigrants.

Barriers to immigration before 1853
Spain controlled much of South America as its colony for centuries and tightly restricted immigration. The end of Spanish rule in 1816 was followed by decades of anarchy and bloody civil strife, continuing through the dictatorship of Juan Manuel de Rosas from 1826 to 1852. Under Rosas immigration beyond Buenos Aires was forbidden and contact with foreigners was discouraged (Jefferson, 1971, 46). Nonetheless there were some foreign merchants and others who came from England, France, Germany, Ireland, and elsewhere and who settled permanently in Buenos Aires and small provincial cities. Only with Rosas’ defeat and exile to England in 1852 was Argentina able to turn to the issue of national development (Sarmiento, 1961).

Immigration as an asset to Argentina
At its 1816 independence Argentina’s population of half a million souls was mainly indigenous people spread out over half its territory, rough gauchos tending semi-wild cattle scattered in remote outposts, and impoverished descendants of Spaniard colonists and soldiers. The country’s vast territory—the eighth largest country by land mass—offered rich natural resources and a varied climate for agriculture and animal husbandry.

Development meant that this land and its resources needed to be put to productive use, and the question was, By whom? Several of Argentina’s leading thinkers had traveled abroad and envisioned what modern Argentina could become if it could attract immigrants from more developed countries in Europe.

Domingo Faustino Sarmiento, exiled by Rosas, had spent the 1840s thinking about how to create a progressive country. He traveled to Europe and the United States, closely studying progressive models of education and writing reports on what he learned (Sarmiento, 1970). For him education for elites was not enough; he urged mass education for national development, and emphasized attracting British, German, and other Western Europeans as immigrants because he expected they would be more educated and technically advanced. Therefore, these countries were targeted as locations to establish information agents for recruitment.

Juan Bautista Alberdi, acknowledged as the Father of the Argentine Constitution, looked to the Industrial Revolution in England as a model for development. He was convinced that natural population increase would be inadequate, and in his view Argentina’s existing human resources were incapable of creating the progressive change required.

“Put a roto [“broken”], gaucho, or cholo [“gangster”] from our current popular masses through the transformation of the finest system of education; in a hundred years you will still not make of him an English worker who works, consumes, and lives a dignified, comfortable life. ....You will have neither order nor popular education, except by the influence of introduced masses with ingrained habits and good education” (Alberdi, 1852, 90)
He concluded that immigration from developed European countries should be the priority and he enshrined this in the Constitution.

The Constitution of 1853, the legal framework for immigration

The Preamble to the 1853 Constitution welcomed immigrants with expansive language: “The land is open “to all the people of the world who want to live on Argentine soil.”

Argentina’s leaders targeted European immigrants, without regard to social class. Section 25 of the Constitution states: “The Federal Government shall foster European immigration; and may not restrict, limit or burden with any tax whatsoever, the entry into the Argentine territory of foreigners who arrive for the purpose of tilling the soil, improving industries, and introducing and teaching arts and sciences.”

The invitation to European settlers was undergirded by constitutional guarantees that foreigners would enjoy all the civil rights of citizens, in work, property ownership, travel, religion, legal rights, and in all other respects (Argentine Constitution, Section 20). Foreigners were not obligated to become citizens, but could become naturalized citizens after two years of residence. To consolidate its stature among the already-developed countries, Alberdi urged Argentina to forge treaties with them, to position Argentina by association as a significant country.

In the first years after the Constitution, immigration was slow. For a decade (1852-62), Buenos Aires established its own government. A group of businessmen connected with banking and commercial interests in Buenos Aires formed a committee to promote immigration. They obtained, with government funding, a place to accommodate up to 150 immigrants. There poor immigrants were housed and fed for four days at no charge. Committee members would go aboard immigrant ships carrying more than one hundred passengers, and offer them aid in finding employment (Castrillo, 1991, 39-40). The Argentine Confederation, on the other hand, aimed to attract settlers to cultivate the agricultural lands in the interior, and they did this by fostering the creation of agricultural colonies.

Programs to recruit immigrants from 1862

By 1862 the constitutional framework created the basis for inviting immigrants to settle in Argentina. Land and work were plentiful, and immigrants were eligible for land grants. Over time investment in transportation created rail networks and expanded shipping to bring people and goods for import and export. But beyond establishing these conditions, the Argentine government had to actively recruit immigrants abroad, and then welcome them on arrival and facilitate their relocation and employment.

Product: Benefits offered.

Immigration in the 1853-1870 period emphasized commercial colonies. Companies and individuals could apply for land grants on condition that certain immigration requirements were satisfied. A typical contract granted or sold land to enterprise that agreed to settle at least 500 families within a five-year period, immigrants who would till the soil. The enterprise sought to export wheat or other raw materials produced by the colonists.

For example, a typical contract in the province of Santa Fe transferred land for an agreed-upon price per square league, with a commitment to settle fifty foreign families within two years, fifty more foreign families within three years, and fifty more by the fifth year. Enterprises were motivated by profit from the eventual resale of the land to settlers and through a share of the agricultural production of their colonists. The typical enterprise provided new colonists with basic housing, tools and equipment, animals, and seed on arrival.

Price: Tempering the cost of immigration. The cost of immigration from Europe to Argentina included transportation, arrival and transition assistance, settlement, and eventual land title acquisition. Moreover, there were the unavoidable physical and emotional costs that inhere in moving to a new land and culture. Many immigrants were able to pay their own fares. Even for those who could not, the cost of passage was not a determinant factor in an immigration decision, because often the colony manager would pay the passage and the new immigrants would repay the advance when they sold their first harvest (Stewart, 1971, 179). The cost of fares declined substantially when sailing ships were replaced by steamships. In fact fares were so modest and the work opportunities for Italian-Argentine farm laborers were so great, a significant number would actually work two growing/harvest seasons in two hemispheres by “commuting” between Argentina and Italy each year.
Arrival, reception, and placement. In the early years of immigration (1850s-1870s) immigrants would disembark at the port and often had nowhere to go. Some limited temporary lodging existed, but Guillermo Wilcken (himself an 1851 immigrant from Schleswig-Holstein) saw pathetic new arrivals huddled in the streets near the port for several days, awaiting some contact for employment. Wilcken’s concept, finally realized in 1911, was the Hotel de Inmigrantes, a new construction providing dignified lodging, laundries, dining rooms, and medical services, as well as transitional services for job placement and onward travel.

Settlement and land title. European immigrants often settled in colonies that included fellow countrymen. In many instances kindred groups arrived together to start or join an agricultural colony. For example, four hundred Italian Waldensians disembarked on an isolated bank of the Parana’ River in Santa Fe Province and from there walked and rode carts the final twenty miles to Alexandra Colony. Shared patterns of life from Waldensian enclaves in Italy eased the transition. Agricultural settlers sought land ownership, and in parts of Argentina this was achievable, but many others were disappointed.

Place: Transportation infrastructure. Mid-century rapid expansion of the national rail system and increased shipping via inland rivers were essential to colonization, enabling movement of people and goods, including shipments to urban and overseas markets.

Promotion. A prospective colonist might first get word of immigration opportunities from a hired agent of the Argentine government. In 1869 Argentina had five such official agents stationed in Europe, each paid a monthly salary and expenses, and shortly thereafter the country hired five more. By 1872 there were a total of eight. The agents’ job was to attract prospects, and to do this they prepared “propaganda periodistica” (promotional materials to appear in publications), as well as booklets describing Argentina, its people, topography, climate, railroads, as well as the system of government and the advantages that Argentina offered to European immigrants. The materials almost always included the jobs most needed, salaries, the price of food, and opportunities to obtain land (Kleiner, 1983b, 9-11).

Official agents in Europe also aimed to influence other intermediaries, for example, talking with priests and other clergy who, through their contacts with the working classes, could influence them to consider the advantages of settling in Argentina (Kleiner, 1983b, 16). A report in the same year—1875-stated that Argentina’s official immigration agents in Europe were losing prestige because local people confused the official Argentine agents with the plethora of aggressive maritime agents of shipping companies and the aggressive commercial agents who were paid by the “head,” essentially selling prospective immigrants to the highest-bidding country at set prices. These maritime and commercial agents were accused of being “traffickers of human flesh” [trafican tes de carne humana] (Castro, 1971, 136; Kleiner, 1983a, 34).

Word of mouth was the most potent recruiter of immigrants: “There is no propaganda for immigration like the prosperity of the immigrant” (Stewart, 1971, 48). Letters to family and friends in the Old Country reporting that an immigrant “could quickly acquire a large tract of good land, in a mild climate, where the products of the soil were in high demand at a high price” would bring more (Stewart, 1971, 180). “Once a nucleus of prospering colonists was established, with actual title to land that brought them good returns, their letters home brought numbers out in the steps” (Stewart, 1971, 180). Of course, the opposite was also true: When poor crops or financial crises diminished profits, immigration slowed quickly and immigrants became emigrants, many returning to their countries of origin.

Competition and competitive strategy. Argentina’s quest for European immigrants encountered competition. Other countries were actively seeking settlers and by the 1870s they had agents and programs in England and European counties. For example, Francisco Torrome’, Argentina’s official agent in London, reported in 1876 that Canada, New Zealand, Australia, and the United States were offering inducements such as free land to English-speaking prospective immigrants. The agent noted that Argentina was “at a comparative disadvantage” [en desventaja comparativamente] with respect to these countries, and that Argentina’s government should provide English farm families with regularly scheduled steamship transportation to redirect the flow of immigrants to Argentina. Furthermore Torrome’ reported that agents of the British government were spreading “propaganda” denouncing the Argentine government’s claims that immigrant colonists could expect to receive fertile land (Kleiner, 1983b, 20).
Evaluation of results. Argentina attracted immigrants from many countries, but most immigrants came from Spain and Italy. While laborers and tradespeople primarily settled in Buenos Aires, where work was plentiful and well paid, the government’s primary concern was to settle the interior of the country.

To assess the effectiveness of its colonization efforts, the Comision Central de Inmigracion named Guillermo Wilcken as Inspector of Colonies to visit Argentina’s agricultural colonies, to assess their functioning; to compile statistics on people, crops and animals; to pass judgment on their overall success and the reasons for it; and to make recommendations for urgent support needed by each colony, such as construction of schools and provision of better means of transport to move agricultural produce to market.

Wilcken’s site visits from January through May 1872 yielded a 350-page report Las Colonias which includes maps of each colony and extensive statistics and details, evidencing keen observation. Orta Nadal (1975, 482) describes the report as “a scientific, thorough, and objective report on the economic, social, and cultural situation in which [Wilcken] found the colonies during his official visit....” His report has been “amply cited, consulted, and utilized in every subsequent investigation on the theme, up to the present, for its high scientific value.”

The immediate impact of Wilcken’s report was the creation in May 1872 of the Labor Office [Oficina de Trabajo] charged with preparing and distributing constantly updated information about needs for workers, salary levels, and working conditions that would provide useful orientation in Europe for agents, agencies, and immigrants themselves. In 1873 Wilcken pushed for creation of an asilio, a place where arriving immigrants could stay upon arrival, before moving on to distant places. He called for an integrated system of services for these new arrivals, and pointed out that Argentina had to match the offerings of the United States in that regard.

In January 1874 President Sarmiento disbanded the Commission on Immigration, vesting in Guillermo Wilcken all responsibility for immigration.

In October 1876 the National Congress adopted a new Law on Immigration and Colonization, “a true advance in its epoch....and whose conceptions and successes transcended [Argentina’s] borders” (Orieta, 1991, 25). According to Sergio Sampedro, Director of the Museo de Inmigracion, this law was a direct result of Wilcken’s report and the law remained in effect for over a century (Sampedro, 2016; Orieta, 1991, 26).

The new law abandoned the earlier predilection for European immigrants, declaring that immigration was now open to “every worker, artisan, factory worker, farmer, or professor ... under sixty years of age and of good morals and attitudes.” The new law administratively systematized the country’s policies and strategies on immigration through the entire process from recruitment in the place of origin through arrival in the new place and provision of housing, food, and health assistance (Orieta, 1991, 26).

Selected References
Alberdi, J.B.(1852), Bases y puntos de partida para la organización política de la República Argentina. 
Castro, D.S. (1971), The development of Argentine immigration, 1852-1914, University of California, Los Angeles, CA.
Devoto, F.(2003), Historia de la inmigracion en la Argentina, Sudamericana, Buenos Aires, Argentina.
Gerstner, L.O.(2008), El alojamiento de inmigrantes en el Rio de la Plata, siglos XIX y XX: Planificacion estatal y redes sociales, Revista bibliográfica de geografía y ciencias sociales, Universidad de Barcelona, Spain.
Sampedro, S. (2016), consultation with the Director of the Museo de Inmigracion, Buenos Aires, Argentina, December 20.
The Changing Focus of Marketing: The Application of Maslow’s Model of Needs to the Analysis of Cunard Advertising Between 1910 and 1940

Graham P. Gladden
School of Humanities and Social Science, Liverpool John Moores University, U.K.

Introduction
Communicating an understanding of, and indeed, influencing the needs and aspirations of potential customers is key to a business’ future. The academic foundations of this understanding were first laid in 1930s when Murray developed a complex listing of over forty physiological and psychological needs and traits (Murray, 1938, pp.142ff; Murray, 1955, pp. 63ff). There have been other proposals but the most well-known descriptor of human needs was developed by Maslow in the 1940s. Discussed in more detail below, it has a simplicity and a certain resonance with everyday behaviour that encourages its continued use.

Whilst there is no evidence that, in later years, Cunard used Maslow’s model to support their interactions with customers, it provides a useful framework to analyse the development their marketing approach. Using this, a delineation can be made between needs such as safety, common to all passengers, and the more nuanced demands of social context and esteem which differed across the spectrum of the company’s passengers.

The period under discussion was one of social change, impacting the very structure of Cunard’s business. Whilst retaining their appeal to established customers (businessmen and the elite of First Class), the company needed to respond to the hopes and expectations of an emergent middle class (Glynn & Oxborrow, 1976, p.49). The first half of the 20th century was characterised by these people becoming wealthier and their incomes more reliable (Susman, 2003, p.111; Goodman & Gatell, 1972, p. 13). To encourage this new clientele, companies like Cunard had to compete with other goods and services for a proportion of the new-found prosperity.

This paper, using examples from film, posters and brochures, will illustrate how the company communicated its ability to meet and, indeed, influence the changing needs and aspirations of these “passengers-to-be”.

Methodology and approach
Understanding needs and aspirations
Often depicted as a pyramid, the levels of Maslow’s hierarchy are shown in Table I (Schiffman & Kanuk, 2007, p. 99).

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Maslow’s Hierarchy</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Self Actualisation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Esteem Needs</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Social Needs</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Safety Needs</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Physiological Needs</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table I Maslow’s Hierarchy
Although described as a hierarchy (Maslow, 1943, p. 370) there is no implication that the needs of each level must be met fully before the individual is motivated at a higher level. In fact, both Maslow and other authors (Schiffman & Kanuk, 2007, p. 97) have pointed out that individuals ‘progress’ when any level is met to an acceptable degree. Indeed, the dominant need can be an ever-shifting priority depending on an individual’s situation at any point in time (Clarke, M.C. et al., 2007, p. 936).

Several authors have built on Maslow’s original concepts to take account of more recent research dealing with concerns over a focus on innate individual needs and the ‘downgrading’ questions of social interaction and culture’ (Trigg, A.B., 2004, p. 393), the distinct between self-esteem and esteem for others (Rowan, J, 1998, p.82) and the relatedness between individuals implicit in self-actualisation (Handley, S.J. & Abell, S.C., 2002, p. 52).

In ‘Consumerism in Twentieth Century Britain’, Hilton outlines three categories of goods (and by extension, services): those ‘associated with luxury, with necessity and with affluence’ (Hilton, M, 2003, p. 19). An individual’s allocation of any particular goods or service to any one of these categories will be affected by personal circumstances and influenced by social patterns, class and gender. What is exciting to one maybe part of ordinary life to another and today’s luxury can become tomorrow’s norm. This was certainly the case for Cunard from the late 1800s to the end of the 1930s as ‘luxury’ spread down through the classes of accommodation: what had once been appropriate in First Class became the norm in Third (McCart, N., 1990, p.72 & p.185). In Hilton’s terminology, ‘luxury’ had become ‘necessitous’. ‘Necessity’ also has a contextual categorisation (Trentmann, F., (2004), p. 377). Owning a car may be a luxury for the city dweller but in suburban America, lack of public transport makes car ownership a necessity. Slater, reviewing the differences between luxury and basic needs, extends these concepts by defining ‘basic needs’ as those ‘necessary for cultural participation’ (Slater, D., 1997, p. 135). Once these are attained, ‘luxury’ takes on a symbolic meaning defined by the cultural context, providing some measure of social status. Increasing ‘luxury’ consumption can be linked to greater individual aspiration (Karlsson, N. et al., (2004) p. 764), suggesting, at least for some individuals, a self-reinforcing cycle of consumption.

Interpreting the images
Cunard’s marketers may have had at an implicit model of their would-be passengers’ needs and aspirations but no evidence of this has been found. Nevertheless, the company’s marketing materials, particularly visual media, provide a valuable source of evidence regarding their approach.

Historians, for example, Watts and Harrington, have used a semiotic approach to aid the understanding of historic advertising and marketing strategies. Watts (Watts, D.C.H., 2004, p. 47) discusses how the London and North Eastern Railway promoted what he describes as ‘deep’ England. The company encouraged in a sophisticated way, a well-defined set of passengers – the middle classes – to visit places and, moreover, to follow, perhaps to aspire to, a certain life style when so doing. However, the ability to influence has limitations; posters, Harrington (Harrington, R., (2004), p. 22) argues, may have directed passengers’ thinking but could not control their decision making to the point of unquestioning acceptance. Rather, there is a complex interplay between the ‘producer and the consumer of tourist space’ (Meethen, K. et al., 2006, p. 19) – advertising posters encouraging travel by opening the potential traveller’s mind to ‘uncalculated desires’.

The importance of these connoted meanings in visual communication grew during the 1920s as style and image replaced the more functional representation of products (Stole, I.L., 2006, p. 22). Advertisements with appeals to logic halved in the thirty years to 1930 (Roa, H., 1998, p. 926); instead products were increasingly associated with lifestyle and aspiration. Advertisements became ‘social tableaux’ intended to reflect not the life of consumers (Marchand, R., 1986, pp. 164-205) but to reassure and to guide their choices in the complex, modern world (Marchand, R., 1986, p. 336).

Key findings
From the launch of its first steamship in 1840 Cunard built its reputation on safety and reliability, Samuel Cunard himself decreeing

“Your Ship is loaded; her speed is nothing, follow your road, deliver her safe, bring her back safe – safety is all that is required” (Maxtone-Graham, J., 1972, p. 5)
As the market grew, the dominating position built up by the company was challenged by the arrival in the 1860s of the White Star Line with a focus on the wider needs of passengers and their experience of the voyage. Ships had been getting bigger and, uniquely, Harland (the ship designer and builder behind the new line) recognised that with size came the opportunity for greater comfort, saying, “Comfort at sea is of even more importance than speed” (Fox, S., 2003, p. 229). However, speed could not be completely ignored and in the last quarter of the nineteenth century Cunard began the construction of so-called express liners, recognising that the market was to become one of safety, comfort and speed.

This market reached its zenith in the interwar period, described as the golden age of passenger shipping, both for the design of the vessels (Owen, C., (1979), pp 24 ff; Votolato, G., (2007), pp 118 ff.) and the numbers of people who travelled (APSC, 1937).

Cunard’s advertising promoted its ability to meet the full range of customer transport needs as described by Maslow. Images of both ship and crew were used to connote a sense of security and safety. Further, given the societal mores of the period and the limited space aboard ship, illustrations and descriptions of ships and life aboard confirmed that everything would be done to assure the passengers of their social needs. Indeed, life aboard would be very much akin to the more agreeable aspects of the familiar world of life ashore.

To encourage the new middle-class clientele aboard Cunard advertised a new class, Tourist Third, allowing people to travel “in great comfort and some luxury and with congenial people” (Cunard, circa 1926). It was expected that the allure of now-affordable travel would encourage visits to destinations hitherto only accessible to the wealthy and privileged (Coons, L. & Varias, A., 2003, p. 29) and a new style of promotion emerged to support this market growth.

Research Limitations
Poster material is widely available though it is sometimes difficult to date precisely. There are good sources of information in Cunard house magazines and other documents in the Cunard Archive at Liverpool University. However, during the period under discussion much of the advertising design work was done in house and, regrettably, none of that and any linked correspondence is thought to survive.

Originality and Value
As far as I can establish, there has not been any significant analysis of how the images in shipping line advertising were used to influence potential customers although there has been some discussion of posters’ visual content (Coons, L. & Varias, A., 2003, pp 158 ff; Maxtome-Graham, J., 1989, p 27).

In contrast, this study uses an integrated analytical model to show how and why posters and other visual material facilitated the construction of a context in which potential customers would be assured of the meeting of all their needs and aspirations, communicating more than just the obvious statements of onboard luxury, ship size and destination exoticness.

References
Atlantic Passenger Steamship Conference, Passenger Carryings, (1937), Unpublished manuscript, Cunard Archive, D42/GM20/1/4/12, University of Liverpool, Liverpool.
Cunard, The North Atlantic Liner, (circa 1926), Cunard Archive, D42/PR4/46/7, University of Liverpool, Liverpool.


Motor Town Wolverhampton: The Rise and Fall of the Sunbeam Brand, 1888-1935

Richard A. Hawkins
Department of History, Politics and War Studies, University of Wolverhampton, U.K.

Abstract

Purpose – The purpose of this paper is to explore the rise and fall of one Britain’s pioneer motor vehicle brands, Sunbeam of Wolverhampton.

Design/methodology/approach – The Sunbeam company archive has not survived. So this paper is based on other primary sources held at the Wolverhampton City Archives and newspaper reports and advertising.

Research limitation/implications – The lack of surviving company records is a research limitation. Nonetheless, it is possible to conclude from the available sources that had Sunbeam not merged with a French competitor in 1920, that it is possible it might have become a major British motor car manufacturer, and Wolverhampton, a British Detroit.

Keywords – John Marston, Sunbeam, cycles, motor car manufacturing, Wolverhampton

Paper Type – Research paper.

Introduction

The Sunbeam Motor Car Co. of Wolverhampton was founded by John Marston. Marston was born in the small Shropshire market town of Ludlow in 1836, the son of a pharmacist and local politician. Marston was educated in schools in Ludlow and London. In 1851, at the age of 15, his parents apprenticed him to Alfred Darby’s ironworks at Coalbrookdale, Shropshire. The apprenticeship was not a success and later that year he was apprenticed to the prominent Wolverhampton tinsmith and japanner, Edward Perry. Marston successfully completed his apprenticeship in 1859 and acquired a japanware, tin and ironplate works. In the course of the next two and half decades Marston built a successful business. However, during the mid-1880s the japanware business went into decline. In 1887, Marston, who was an enthusiastic cyclist, realized he could transfer his tinsmith’s expertise to the manufacturing of cycles. The following year he registered the brand name Sunbeam and started producing cycles. He renamed his Wolverhampton factory Sunbeamland (Hawkins 2013). Marston’s cycle business was an immediate success and he opened a showroom and depot (maintenance yard) in London in 1889. Three more depots were opened in 1895. The company later claimed that “In all the chicanery of the cycle boom, they were the one firm which remained true to legitimate traditions and resisted all the blandishments of the company promoter (The Times 1905).” This suggests Sunbeam was a trusted brand for cycles.

In 1899 Marston moved his business to a larger factory, the Moorfield Works, on Upper Villiers Street (Sunbeam 1924, p. 48.). He was persuaded by his trusted lieutenant, Thomas Cureton, to experiment with the production of a prototype motor car. Cureton produced two prototype motorcars before Marston decided in 1900 to begin the production of motor cars. Marston decided to extend his Sunbeam brand by using it for motor cars too. The first Sunbeam motorcar catalogue, entitled All about a Motor Car, was published in the same year, to promote Cureton’s second experimental car. The following year Sunbeam entered into an arrangement with Maxwell Maberly Smith (1869-1934), an architect and amateur designer, to manufacture his prototype car, the Sunbeam Mabley. Its unusual body closely resembled the early Victorian ‘S’ sofa (apparently designed to provide proximity with propriety for the reserved young people of the period) (The Times 1932; 1933; Heal 1949, p. 515). It ‘was the first Sunbeam to enter series production. The Sunbeam Mabley was remarkable in that its wheels were laid out in a diamond formation, this design feature was intended to prevent the car from skidding. The car’s two middle wheels were the driven wheels while the two end wheels were for steering. The driver sat in the back, steering by means of a tiller. It was powered by a 2.75 h.p. de Dion engine, giving the car a top speed of 18 mph. The Mabley sold for £130 when it first went on sale and approximately 130 of the cars were built (Getty Images 2017).’ The following year the remaining metalware and japanning business was sold to enable the company to focus on vehicle production. In 1902 Thomas C. Pullinger joined the firm as works manager. He persuaded Marston and Cureton to import some French cars to
learn from the more advanced French motor car manufacturing industry. Subsequently for several years engines and gearboxes were imported from Lyon to be mounted on chassis manufactured in Wolverhampton (Heal 1949, p. 515).

In 1905 the Sunbeam Motor Car Co. Ltd. was founded to take over John Marston Limited’s motorcar manufacturing business (The Times 1916). A new and more powerful model designed by Angus Shaw, chief of the newly established drawing office, was produced. Sunbeam quickly became a leading British motorcar producer. In February 1909, Louis Coatalen (1879-1962), a Frenchman, was employed as Sunbeam’s chief engineer on the recommendation of Thomas Cureton, the managing director of the Sunbeam Motor Car Co. One of the cars he designed, the four-cylinder “Nautilus”, had overhead valves, nickel chrome steel connecting rods and an air compressor. Years later when the “super-charger” was hailed as a new development which would revolutionize engine efficiency, Sunbeam was able to point out that it had successfully exploited the idea in 1909 (The Times 1933). During the early years of the British motor car manufacturing industry the motor car was a luxury good. This was also the case in France. The French industry had found that a successful way to establish and promote a motor car brand was to produce racing car models and compete in motor car races. Sunbeam adopted this form of marketing to promote its brand. Coatalen designed a succession of Sunbeam racing cars to compete in motor car races. In 1912 Sunbeam racing cars won prizes in both the Coupe de l’Auto and Grand Prix in Dieppe, the first British victory since 1902. This placed Sunbeam in the vanguard of British motor car manufacturers for the next 15 years (Heal 1949, pp. 515-516).

Marston retired in 1916. He died of a cerebral hemorrhage on 8 March 1918 at his summer home in Llandrillo-yn-Rhos, Denbighshire. The John Marston, Ltd. cycle business was sold in 1919 to Explosive Trades, Limited in order to pay death duties on Marston’s estate (The Times 1920a; van Harten and Marston, pp. 88-90). The following year the Sunbeam Motor Car Co. Ltd. was merged with A. Darracq and Co. (1905), Limited to form S.T.D. Motors, Limited (The Times 1920b). In 1926 the racing activities of S.T.D. group were transferred to France and Coatalen’s attention was henceforth mainly focused on the French division of the combine. With the absence of the racing cars, the British division lost momentum and its technical leadership was no longer maintained. With the onset of the Great Depression of the 1930s the firm experienced financial difficulties from which it never recovered. In 1935 Sunbeam cars ceased to be manufactured in Wolverhampton (Heal 1949, p. 516). It is possible had Sunbeam not merged with a French competitor in 1920, it might have become a major British motor car manufacturer, and Wolverhampton, a British Detroit.

References

Getty Images (2017), http://www.gettyimages.co.uk/detail/news-photo/this-car-was-designed-by-maxwell-maberley-smith-and-was-the-news-photo90744818?#this-car-was-designed-by-maxwell-maberley-smith-and-was-the-first-to-picture-id90744818 (accessed 15 March 2017).


Sunbeam Motor Car Company (1919), Twenty Years of Sunbeam Achievements in Peace and War, Sunbeam Motor Car Co., Ltd., Wolverhampton.


The Times (1905), ‘Sunbeam Bicycle Advertisement’, 13 May, p. 6.


The Times (1916), ‘Chancery Division: The Use of the Trade Mark “Sunbeam” for Motors’, 4 July, p. 3.


The Times (1932), ‘A Run for Veteran Motor Cars’, 18 November, p. 11.

Accidental Marketers: The Product Orientation of Early Christianity

Mick Jackowski
Clayton Daughtrey
Jeffrey Lewis

Department of Marketing, College of Business, Metropolitan State University of Denver

Roger Layton (2015) wrote that “for marketing history to flourish as it should…it is essential to rethink the idea of marketing, widening and deepening the set of social phenomena that it embraces.” (p 549). We now find a growing body of work that expands the history of marketing across myriad societies that existed long before the dawn of the industrial revolution. With such examples as analyses of commercial vessels dating from 1500 B.C. (Twede, 2002), Plato's Republic (Shaw, 1995), and Nabataean supply chains (Hull, 2008), the history of marketing has been traced back to the days of antiquity.

However, in an analysis of religion-related research published in the Journal of Macomarketing from 1981-2014, Drenten and McManus’ (2016) found that more work needs to be done regarding the influence of marketing on religion. Accordingly, an attempt was made in this study to learn if and how marketing impacted the start-up growth of the most widely practiced religion in the world, Christianity. The authors analyzed the years 0 - CE 312, after which Emperor Constantine made it a legal religion in the Roman Empire.

The birth of marketing thought has traditionally been placed near the start of the twentieth century (Southerton, 2011). When examining an organization that predates this beginning by almost 2,000 years, marketing ideas (Hollander et al., 2005) should be considered, instead of the discipline itself. As a means of discovering these ideas, a dual triangulated, mixed methods research (MMR) study was conducted. MMR involves forging an overall or negotiated account of the findings that brings together components of the conversation.

Contemporary content analysis uses a juxtaposition of quantitative and qualitative methods (Hamad et al., 2016) to gain more insight into the meaning of the data. This MMR approach was chosen because relying on prior studies is sometimes the only realistic approach when conducting historical research (Merriam, 1988). To increase the validity of findings, a confirmatory approach of using at least two sources of evidence and methods were used to seek convergence and corroboration. And triangulation guards against a study’s findings being “an artifact of a single method, a single source, or a single investigator’s bias” (Bowen, 2009, p.28).

Therefore, the books of three religious scholars--Diana Butler Bass (2009); Justo Gonzalez (2010), and Diarmaid MacCulloch (2010)—were chosen to analyze. These books were chosen because they: a) represented the outcomes of rigorous research performed by religious scholars; b) provided historical background intertwined with the activities of early Christians; and c) presented a more objective perspective than could be expected from analyzing original source documentation created by early Christians. Additionally, three coders examined the sections of each book that documented the first 300 years of Christianity after the death of its founder, Jesus of Nazareth.

Part of this method is the recognition that interpreters bring their own pre-judgements to the analysis (Higgs et al., 2012). Three coders were used to discount these personal biases. Reviewers followed the protocol of hermeneutic inquiry that uncovers “meanings and intentions that are, in a sense, hidden in the text” (Crotty, 1998, p. 91). In document analysis, the data takes the form of “…excerpts, quotations or entire passages—that are then organized into major themes, categories, and case examples…” (Bowen, 2009, p. 28). Because little previous research exists on the use of marketing in the early stages of Christianity, inductive content analysis was used to create categories of marketing principles (Elo and Kyngas, 2007). The reviewers employed open coding, that is, taking notes on aspects of the text they felt applied to principles found primarily in the field of marketing and placed them into groups.
However, an overemphasis on confirmation undercuts the potential of triangulation to generate further questions and understandings (Archibald, 2015). After each researcher examined each text, they met to discuss the data and reduce the number of groups by collapsing those that are similar or dissimilar into broader higher order categories (Elo and Kyngas, 2007).

The three authors identified evidence that were placed in the following categories: core product; brand management; price; place; promotion; segmentation; target marketing; and positioning. The analysis revealed that Christianity benefitted from various aspects of promotion (31.5%) and the core product (21.5%)—the tenets of Christianity itself—was a focus of the fledgling organization.

An aspect of the marketing product is brand management, but the coders felt that it revolves more around ancillary parts of the core product, rather than the product itself. For this reason, brand management (16.9%) was given its own category. Examples of positioning (12.2%), segmentation (6.7%), place (5.9%), target markets (3.5%), and price (2.0%) completed the log of categories.

A handful of marketing philosophies have influenced the profession over its history. Leading up to the mid-1950s, marketing focused internally on either a product or sales orientation (Harrison-Walker 2014). These mindsets placed management’s emphasis on, respectively, the core product or aggressively selling it without much regard to whether consumers wanted or needed it. The focus then shifted to identifying customer needs. This market orientation (McCarthy & Perreault, 1984) is now the cornerstone of marketing thought and a necessary component of the more recent brand orientation (Harrison-Walker 2014).

Based on the predominance of promotion found in this study, along with the religion’s oft-held belief that the initial followers of Jesus were the primary salesmen that led to its far-reaching acceptance, one might falsely believe that early Christianity predominantly used a sales orientation. Upon closer inspection, though, the reviewers found that the primary promotional tactic found in the documents was word-of-mouth. It seems that although the early salesmen of Christianity did try to build a following for their new religion, they were often unsuccessful. The people they did convert, however, thought enough about their newfound service that they told each other about its features in ever-increasing numbers—an effective viral marketing campaign.

Based on this viral component and that the combined references to product and brand management, accounted for 38.2% of the marketing ideas garnered from the documents—the authors argue that the leaders of the early Christian church prescribed to a product-orientation of marketing. Contemporary marketing thought might preclude brand management from inclusion in a product orientation because this principle accounts for the needs of consumers. However, reviewers felt that brand symbols were created to better explain the product (e.g., literature, crucifix) without regard for needs in the market. This position is substantiated based on the more limited consumer-centric evidence discovered, such as segmentation, target marketing, and positioning, which accounted for only 22.3% of the collected data.

References


Marketing Ancient Histories in the Early Modern World

Freyja Cox Jensen
University of Exeter, United Kingdom

This paper seeks to explore and elucidate the ways in which ancient histories were marketed in early modern England and Europe, in order to further our understanding of the ways in which these histories shaped cultural practices in the sixteenth and seventeenth centuries. It also attempts to shift the direction of classical reception studies. At present, the focus in the field remains largely literary (Braden et al., 2010; Gillespie, 2011; Cheney and Hardie, forthcoming). Yet the material realities of the books containing classical histories, and the ways in which their pages were constructed, affected the reception of the classical world just as much as the words in which the texts were written. Using a more empirical approach, this historical investigation emphasises the importance of commercial concerns for the study of texts; it therefore generates conclusions of importance for historians of economics and political culture, as well as literary scholars and students of the history of the book.

Engaging with a range of CHARM’s themes, the paper draws upon early printed material; primarily, upon the printed editions of classical histories produced in continental Europe in the first two centuries of the handpress era. Often, the physical appearance of a book was its key selling point. Publishers had to decide on a format for the books in which they invested, in order to appeal to the right market. Small editions could be carried around in pockets for easy reference; large folios were impressive, and were bought as status objects, rather than merely as reading material. The consumer’s subsequent treatment of the book shows us a further aspect of the perceived value of the text: bought as loose pages, early modern books were then bound by their owners according to their own tastes and pockets, and a huge, two-thousand page folio could be made to look even more impressive with a beautiful and costly binding.

Networks of scholars across Europe worked to produce ever more detailed, critical editions of these histories by authors such as Caesar, Suetonius, and Livy. On the title-pages of these works, which effectively served as advertisements for the text, the stationers printing the books made reference to previous scholarly editions, arrogating to their current author the intellectual glory of former editors and translators, in order to add authority to their own endeavours. By the later sixteenth century, so great was the legacy of previous scholars that the very titles and sub-titles of the texts ran to several lines, in order to include the illustrious pedigree of the text on offer to the prospective customer.

Moreover, these books were intended to appeal to a trans-national community of readers who shared an identity as educated gentlemen, using the classical past to better understand how to perform their civic duty in a humanist age. So strong was this identity that it was jealously guarded by certain elements in intellectual society:

There is a sort of Morose Gentlemen in the World, who, having at the price of many a sore Lashment, possess'd themselves of the Greek and Latin Tongues, would now very fain Monopolize all the Learning in them…(Wheare, 1685, sig. A3v-4r) [2]

It is clear from the extant records of book purchase and ownership that consumers believed themselves to belong to an international intellectual elite, participating in a shared Latinate culture that transcended vernacular linguistic boundaries. Wills containing information about private libraries indicate that English scholars and gentleman eschewed English vernacular copies of ancient histories, preferring to own the respected editions printed on the European mainland, editions with commentaries produced by such internationally renowned figures as Justus Lipsius. Perhaps this is also a reason why English stationers did not bother to produce their own classical-language editions, choosing rather to print almost exclusively in the vernacular: the scholarly market was already well-served by the acclaimed editions pouring from the European presses, and they could not compete.

Indeed, so successful was the marketing of classical texts by making reference to illustrious editors that several printers sought to capitalise on the success of their competitors by devious practices, mis-attributing texts and editions to famous scholarly figures. This was an age before copy-right, but such
behaviour certainly earned the censure of the international scholarly community. Meric Casaubon, son of the famed Isaac, in the address accompanying his edition of Florus’s *Epitome of Roman History* published in 1658, tells of such a book that came into his possession:

having a desire to furnish myself with as many different Editions of Florus as came in my way: among others, I lighted upon that of Leyden, *Ex officina Adriani Wyngaerden*, an. D. 1648 (Florus, 1658, sig. B5r)

Casaubon had two objections to this edition. Firstly, it purported to be a scholarly work and was advertised with the great names on the title page, such as Gruter and Salmasius. In fact, it was nothing of the sort, being a poor edition by one Mr N. Blanckardus. This inaccurate marketing was not the only crime of which the edition was guilty; for, where Casaubon expected to see explanations of how and why the text had been altered or corrected by its editor:

instead of that, you may find perchance a long story of the *ligue of France* against Henry the III. or how the Palatinat was lost, and King James deluded by the Spaniard (Florus, 1658, sig. B6r).

Had the edition been textually sound, this would not have been so grave a failing, as Casaubon goes on to explain, saying that:

I do not except against as of it self altogether impertinent or improper: but I doe not think the Margins of Books very proper for such politick Discourses and Speculations; when the Text itself is left in such obscurity and ambiguity (Florus, 1658, sig. B6r).

This particular consumer, then, was highly displeased with one particular edition of ancient history; he believed that not only should texts contain what was advertised on the title page, but that marketing a book as a critical edition implied that the work would be of a particular quality. But other examples of interaction with marketing practices suggest that a buyer’s relationship with a book could be more complex. The library catalogues of institutions such as the colleges of Oxford and Cambridge indicate that their founders were also keen to possess the famous, ‘best’ editions produced in the major printing cities of Europe, for their intellectual cachet.[2] Individual scholars, however, often appear to have been less discriminating. When Archbishop Narcissus Marsh opened his library to the public in the early eighteenth century, it contained four editions of Plutarch’s *Lives*; one was a respected continental edition published as a large folio Basel in 1550, another was a tiny epitome published in Geneva in 1590, and the other two were English translations from the later-seventeenth century. The same is true for other ancient histories: some editions are important and valuable, others small, cheap and poor by comparison. All clearly appealed to Marsh at some point in his book-buying career, but precisely what marketing strategy persuaded him to buy them, is still unclear. The marketing, and the purchasing, of classical histories in the early modern period was clearly a complicated and multi-layered business: a business that can has much to teach us about the culture and values of Renaissance society.

Notes

[1] This is Edmund Bohun’s introduction to Degory Wheare, *The Method and Order of Reading Both Civil and Ecclesiastical Histories* (London, 1685), Wing W1592, sig. A3v-4r. The book is a translated and expanded version of the text based on Wheare’s inaugural lecture as Camden Professor of Ancient History at Oxford, which appeared as *De ratione et methodo legendi historias* … (London, 1623), *STC* 25325

[2] For example, St John’s College, Cambridge MSS U1 and U4, library catalogues from c.1637 and 1640.
References
Florus, L (1658), The history of the Romans, By Lucius Florus, from the foundation of Rome unto Caesar Augustus, London, Wing F1370.
Wheare, D (1685), The Method and Order of Reading Both Civil and Ecclesiastical Histories, Charles Brome, London, Wing W1592.
The Mouse That Roared: Cyclecars versus the Ford Model T

D.G. Brian Jones
Professor of Marketing, School of Business, Quinnipiac University

Alan J. Richardson
Odette Research Chair and Professor of Accounting, Odette School of Business, University of Windsor

Mark Tadajewski
Professor of Marketing, Durham University

Extended Abstract

**Keywords:** marketing history, cyclecars, branding, segmentation, positioning

**Introduction**

The Ford Model T is an automotive icon that needs little introduction. The Model T was produced from 1908 through 1927, sold worldwide, built in factories in 32 locations in North America and in 12 overseas of which the largest was at Trafford Park, Manchester, UK (Riley *et al.*, 2008). During its production run there were over 16 million Model Ts manufactured including almost 300,000 in the UK. For ten of its 19 years of production the Model T outsold all other cars combined. It is generally considered to be the first affordable automobile introducing “motoring for the masses”, and in 1999 was named the most influential car of the 20th century in the Car of the Century competition (Cobb, 1999).

In the early 20th century automobile world, the Ford Model T was a superpower. Between 1910 and 1921 a hybrid form of transportation was developed combining the technology of motorcycles with the utility of automobiles. These so-called “cyclecars” were at the height of their popularity between 1910 and 1914. Most cyclecar manufacturers assembled vehicles in small batches and did not attempt to vertically integrate with parts manufacturing. Cyclecars were conceived as a low cost alternative to the common, much larger and more expensive automobiles available at that time. Various official definitions of cyclecars have in common the following features: light weight - vehicle weight of less than 780 pounds (compared with the Model T which weighed about 1,200 pounds); small engines - an engine with displacement of less than 1100 cc or 67 cubic inches, typically air-cooled, two cylinders (compared with the 177 cubic inch, 20 horsepower, inline four cylinder engine of the Model T); narrow - a narrow track of roughly 36 inches (width from wheel to wheel, although there were a few cyclecars that actually operated on two wheels in line using gyroscope-based training wheels to stabilize the car at low speeds) compared with the Model T which had a track of 56 inches; a clutch and multiple forward gears, and belt or chain driven. Cyclecars typically seated one or two people either side by side or in tandem although some did seat four. The Ford Model T Touring, the most popular style of Model T, was a four-seater and the Runabout style had seating for two or three. The emphasis for cyclecar manufacturers was on simple construction for low cost purchase and maintenance, and economical operation. The emphasis for the Ford Model T was basically the same.

In 1911, there were only a few cyclecar manufacturers in England and France, and none in America. By 1914, there were over 100 brands manufactured in Britain and about the same number in America (Caunter, 1970, p.35). The cyclecar ‘craze’ of the mid-1910s was an attempt to democratize automobile ownership by making cars that were smaller, less expensive, and more economical to maintain and operate than standard touring cars. The cyclecar movement was referred to by many in the automotive trade as “the new motoring”. It was the mouse that roared.

It would appear that Henry Ford was well aware of the competitive threat posed by the cyclecar manufacturers. In 1914, noting the number of upstart cyclecar manufacturers, he quietly built a three-quarter scale Model T with a wooden frame and then had it prominently displayed around Detroit which, of course, fueled the rumor mill that Ford was going into the cyclecar business. He never announced that he was, but he never denied it. According to one automotive historian, Ford’s cyclecar-sized Model T had a “chilling effect on the amount of capital available for cyclecar enterprises and contributed significantly to their [ultimate] death” in the U.S. (Vance, 1989, p.G2). Except for a small number of cycle-sports-car manufacturers (Jones and Richardson, 2016), the cyclecar was a “brief small-car blip in North American auto history” (Vance, 1989). The post-WWI demise of the cyclecar is generally attributed...
to Ford’s Model T which offered consumers a ‘real’ car at a price competitive with most cyclecars (Church, 1982; 1994; O’Connell, 1998; Richardson, 1977; Thirlby, 2010; Vance, 1989; see also Table III).

**Purpose, Source Material, and Method**

In this research, we compare the segmentation, targeting, and brand positioning of British and American cyclecar brands with the Ford Model T through their development and promotion of unique product attributes and use of advertising appeals in order to challenge the common wisdom that Ford killed the cyclecar movement.

A recent study (Jones and Richardson, 2017) of the origins of sports car marketing used content analysis of 205 print advertisements (1912 – 1921) of British and American cyclecars to identify and analyze product attributes used to position those brands together with advertising appeals in order to evaluate brand marketing strategies. They used factor analysis of that data set to identify brands of cyclecars that shared specific brand attributes and created a perceptual map based on those revealed positioning strategies. Cyclecar positioning attributes from that study are summarized in Table I. The advertising appeals in that sample of ads are summarized in Table II, and a perceptual map of brand positioning strategies based on a reduced set of dimensions is included in Figure 1. For each of those sets of results we replicated the analysis for a sample of 27 Ford Model T advertisements (1909 – 1915) and included in the tables below results for the most popular style of Model T – the Touring car, and in Figure 1 the positioning results for all styles of Model T.

Table I: Cyclecar and Ford T Touring Style Positioning Attributes

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Positioning Attributes</th>
<th>Cyclecar Frequency (N=189)</th>
<th>Average Intensity Where the Positioning Attribute Was Used (0 – 3 scale)</th>
<th>Ford T Touring (N=8) Frequency / Intensity</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Operating Economy</td>
<td>67</td>
<td>1.61</td>
<td>6 / 1.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fuel Economy</td>
<td>71</td>
<td>1.54</td>
<td>3 / 1.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Purchase Price</td>
<td>148</td>
<td>1.80</td>
<td>8 / 1.75</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Quality of Design</td>
<td>90</td>
<td>1.58</td>
<td>6 / 2.67</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Comfort</td>
<td>76</td>
<td>1.49</td>
<td>2 / 1.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Reliability of Operation</td>
<td>99</td>
<td>1.72</td>
<td>5 / 1.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Speed</td>
<td>111</td>
<td>1.87</td>
<td>2 / 1.0</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table II: Cyclecar and Ford T Touring Style Advertising Appeals

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Advertising Appeals</th>
<th>Cyclecar Frequency (N=189)</th>
<th>Average Intensity Where Used (0 – 3 scale)</th>
<th>Ford T Touring (N=8) Frequency / Intensity</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Reasons/Benefits (Positive)</td>
<td>62</td>
<td>1.25</td>
<td>4 / 2.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Reasons/Benefits (Negative)</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0 / 0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Product Features</td>
<td>109</td>
<td>1.41</td>
<td>5 / 2.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Slice of Life</td>
<td>33</td>
<td>1.26</td>
<td>2 / 2.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Comparisons</td>
<td>106</td>
<td>1.62</td>
<td>5 / 2.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Testimonials</td>
<td>36</td>
<td>1.79</td>
<td>0 / 0</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Table III: Price Comparison Cyclecars Versus Ford Model T Touring

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year</th>
<th>Average UK Cyclecar Prices (1913 £ inflation adjusted)</th>
<th>Average Ford Model T Prices (1913 £ inflation adjusted)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1912</td>
<td>102.2</td>
<td>190.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1913</td>
<td>122.9</td>
<td>150</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1914</td>
<td>109.9</td>
<td>134.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1915</td>
<td>104.5</td>
<td>120.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1921</td>
<td>73.8</td>
<td>75.9</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Preliminary Findings

Current scholarship suggests that the cyclecar craze of the 1910s was ended by the introduction of low cost ‘real’ automobiles, particularly by the Ford Model T. Henry Ford may not have truly feared the cyclecar manufacturers, but his three-quarter scale Model T and publicity campaign surrounding that prototype suggests that he took seriously their competitive threat to the Model T which targeted the same economy-minded segment of the market as most cyclecars. While the core of cyclecar brand positioning was in direct competition with the Model T, the story of cyclecar failure, and success, is somewhat more complicated and more interesting.

There were many different body styles of the Model T. By far the best selling style was the Touring car which, from 1909 through 1914 accounted for 78% of American sales (McCalley, 2007) and 66% of British sales of Model Ts (Riley et al., 2008). The Runabout style was the second most popular Model T accounting for 18% of American sales and 20% of British sales during that same period although the Runabout began selling in Britain in 1912 replacing the Roadster which sold only in the UK and in small numbers from 1910 to 1912. The Ford Model T Touring car, Runabout, and Town Car were all positioned in the lower left quadrant of our map (Figure 1) suggesting a head to head strategy against most cyclecars brands in the UK. The Ford Model T in both the UK and U.S. was priced similarly to cyclecars (Table III) but was more substantial in construction despite protestations to the contrary in pre-war cyclecar advertisements. That was particularly evident in Ford’s emphasis on quality (see Table I). These conditions made the economy-positioned cyclecars most vulnerable. However, most American cyclecars were located in the upper left quadrant of the perceptual map, strongly positioned on the economy dimension and differentiated from the Model T Touring and Runabout. Some British cyclecar brands were positioned as sports cars (Figure 1 lower right quadrant) which the Ford Model T in its most popular Touring version, and even the Runabout, were clearly not. The Ford Model T Roadster, which sold only in the UK, was positioned in the lower right speed dimension of Figure 1 but did not share with British cycle-sports-cars the body styling of a sports car and, in any case, was discontinued in 1912. Thus, those British cyclecar brands that managed to survive longest may have done so by positioning themselves as sports cars (Jones and Richardson, 2017).

References (sample)


Figure 1. Cyclecar (1910 – 1921) and Ford Model T (1909 – 1915) Positioning Map
Ford bro. car in yellow; product X in red.

1. Ford bro.
2. Product X
3. Performance
4. Economy
5. Comfort
6. Speed
7. Reliability
8. Price
Assembling the Ethnic Identity in the Early Modern Ottoman Society through Clothing Consumption

Eminegül Karababa
Department of Business Administration, Middle East Technical University, Ankara, Turkey

Abstract

Purpose – The purpose of this paper is to understand and conceptualize the ethno-religious identity construction process in an early modern society, sixteenth and seventeenth century Ottoman society.

Design/methodology/approach – Historical data sources such as visual records, travelers’ notes and governmental records are analyzed in this study to show the ethno-religious identity formation. Assemblage theory is utilized to conceptualize the identity construction process.

Research limitation/implications – This study mostly excludes male members of the society because of the uniforms that they wore for their occupations.

Keywords – identity, Ottoman society, early-modernity, clothing, assemblage

Paper Type – Research

Ethnic identities are expressed, produced and reproduced through consumption. (Askegaard et al., 2005; Crockett and Wallendorf, 2004; Oswald, 1999; Peñaloza, 1994; Thompson and Tambyah, 1999). Ethnicity is a relatively new concept (Spencer, 2006), emerged after nation states became dominant form of system of government. In contemporary social theory, an ethnic group is understood as a subgroup within a broader society; its members see themselves as distinct, and they claim kinship and common history, and share symbols such as consumption objects representing the group identity (Cornell and Hartmann, 1998). However, when this concept is applied to the early modern context, religion is more significant than the claims of kinship, culture, or common history in defining ethnicity (Bartlett, 2001). The aim of the current study is to understand and conceptualize the ethno-religious identity construction process in an early modern society, sixteenth and seventeenth century Ottoman society.

Ethnic identity is continuously constructed by group members and others whom they encounter. That is, internal and external definitions of ethnicity are continuously constructed (Spencer, 2006). Ethnic identities are assigned to a group and defined, accepted, resisted, redefined, rejected, or defended by the group members (Cornell and Hartmann, 1998). In other words, groups continuously make assumptions based on the categories of “us” and “them” (Spencer, 2006). Symbolism expressed through dress is a way of representing the categories of “us” and “them” and their characteristics.

This chapter specifically looks at how ethnicities in early modern Ottoman society were continuously constructed through the symbolism of dress. Ottoman context is interesting in the sense that geographically it extended from Crimea to Sudan, from Bosnia to the Persian Gulf, from the Caucasus to Morocco. It was made up of many populations (Fisher, 1971) such as Hungarians, Serbians, Croatians, Bosnians, Albanians, Romanians, Bulgarians, Greeks, Turks, Arabs, Jews, Berbers, Kurds, Laz people, Armenians, and Georgians. Groups had their own shared histories, customs, belief systems, and everyday practices that differentiated them from the others and gave them an identity. Also, interactions between groups in the region resulted in similarities or hybrid formations between groups. The ways that people adorned their bodies, their dress, and their accessories were symbols representing group identities.

This study utilizes European travellers’ notes and their drawings, costume albums, and Sultans’ decrees as data sources. Travelers described and interpreted and sometimes sketched clothing of different ethnicities that they have encountered. Costume albums depict the Ottoman people’s clothing styles according to their social categories such as gender, age, profession, ethnicity. Travellers’ notes and visual data are useful for identifying the dress of different ethnic and religious groups, and how interactions with outsiders construct external definitions of an ethnicity. Sartorial codes show both the state’s interpretation of original ethnic clothing and their role in shaping the ethnic identity. Also, ethnic group’s practices are presented in the texts of these sartorial codes.
To give some examples, the styles of shoes in the Greek islands were interpreted as impractical and the embroidery was indecent. The interpretations not only describe the meaning of the clothing, but also communicated who the people are that were wearing the clothing. That is, they defined this group ethnicity as, for example, tasteless or less sophisticated people. So, if the object was familiar to the outsider, then the person compared the object and its meaning with the objects that exists in his interpretive framework. Dimensions of materiality (style, colour, quality, bodily performances) and their symbolism were utilized in this comparison process, a way for othering to interpret the clothing which communicates the characteristics of the ethnic identity. When materiality which the other came across were ambiguous or did not exist in his interpretive framework (Denegri-Knott and Parsons, 2014), the person generally tried to make sense of it by finding the best fit, such as the German traveller compared Bulgarian villager women’s headwear with the crowns of the Bohemian aristocracy. In such a context, every interaction resulted in a different interpretation depending on who the person was; the culture and background of the person created a new understanding of the ethnic group. That is, ethnicity was always in flux, even in an early modern context. However, this flux was not created by the multiplicity of the market and media resources but due to novel interactions in the early modern context where regional interactions were limited.

Comparison of different ethnicities living in the same region was another process of ethnic identification. Interactions between the groups did not always create distinctive styles for groups but sometimes hybrid identities formed. For example, Jewish people generally mixed their styles with those of the society in which they lived; high-ranking Greek islanders preferred Venetian-style shoes; and Armenians were described as looking like Turks in their clothing style.

In addition, sartorial codes enforcing how different groups should adorn their bodies aimed to externally define ethnicities and religious identities through dress. Peoples’ circumvention of such codes, as everyday practices of consumption demonstrates resistances to the state’s external definition of their ethnicity (Quataert, 1997). Styles, colors, qualities of fabrics and accessories were utilized as signs to identify different groups in the social order (Altnay, 1988). However, the reissuance of these laws also demonstrates that the laws were circumvented, and that Ottoman subjects attempted to create ambiguity and disorder in this identification process through their dress, especially in cities, despite of the concerns of the administration to maintain “unambiguous signs of difference” (Faroqhi, 2010, p. 259). For example, to maintain the hierarchy between the Muslim and non-Muslim communities, non-Muslim men were supposed to wear very modest, dark-coloured clothing, and should not attract attention (Kenanoğlu, 2004).

Ethnic identity is dynamic. This dynamism, later in the article, conceptualized by using assemblage theory. Materials, their meanings, individual’s bodies, their manners and gestures, meanings given by the outsider and the insider, geographical location, constitute human and non-human components of an assemblage of ethno-religious identity that continuously transforms because of different combinations of these components. Boundaries of these assemblages continuously change, include and exclude different components depending on different situations.

References
Assembling the Ethnic Identity in the Early Modern Ottoman Society through Clothing Consumption


The Apparently Endless Nature Of Endless Chain Schemes

William W. Keep  
*Dean, School of Business, The College of New Jersey, Ewing, New Jersey, USA, and*

Peter Vander Nat  
*Sr. Economist (Retired), Federal Trade Commission, Washington, DC, USA*

**Keywords:** direct selling, endless chain, pyramid clubs, pyramid sales, pyramid scheme, Federal Trade Commission, Holiday Magic, Koscot, Dare To Be Great, Amway, Koscot, BurnLounge

**Endless Chain Selling and Research Purpose:**

This paper examines the origin and persistence of endless chain selling and certain governmental failures to regulate illegal applications of the endless chain scheme. *Endless chain selling* became a recognized market phenomenon in the early 1900s (examples below). As the term “endless” implies, such selling employs the perpetual recruitment of distributors to provide a product or service or, early on, a way to obtain these in conjunction with the accumulation of coupons, with no limit for distributor enrollment into the proposed venture.

From the outset the concerns were clear: the potential for local market saturation and a concomitant over-supply of distributors, where those who join early would have the best chance of obtaining non-trivial returns on their investment, and where the general probability of success steadily diminishes towards zero for subsequent recruits. Throughout the process new recruits lack and have no avenue to obtain the requisite information on the size and growth of the distributor network that would permit an evaluation of the likelihood of success. When prosecuted early on, endless chain selling was either characterized as a chain letter in violation of federal mail statues, or a violation of state lottery laws or illegal forms of gambling.

Whether endless chain selling could be declared illegal *per se* by the US Postal Service under its authority to prohibit chain letters was unclear. Acting Assistant Attorney General for The Post Office Department Harrison J. Barrett opined that some chain coupons schemes may be legal (*The New York Times*, 1900b). Much later, in *FTC v Amway Corp.* (1979), a company viewed by many as a classic instance of endless chain selling, including initially FTC legal staff, the Commission subsequently determined Amway’s *multilevel marketing plan* (i.e., sales plan) not to be an illegal business venture.

In this paper we provide certain relevant history to illuminate difficulties encountered in determining what is *illegal* endless chain selling, and then more generally, illegal “pyramid selling” or “pyramid sales schemes” — as the terminology evolved by the 1970s. Historically, except for the recent strong advice to the industry from Chairwoman Ramirez (Ramirez, 2017), there has been a general governmental lack in making this determination clearly, consistently, and decisively. Sober reflection on this lack helps us better understand the industry morass encountered to this day.

**Examples of the endless chain:**

Albert B. Watson was sentenced last night to six months in the Territorial Penitentiary and fined $500 and costs. He worked an ‘endless chain’ swindle, operating under the name of the Ohio Specialty Company of Cincinnati.” The swindle involved first purchasing a ticket from Mr. Watson for 25 cents and then buying four more for one dollar, each to be resold to a family member or friend for 25 cents. A four-dollar pair of shoes would be forthcoming once they, in turn, similarly purchase four tickets. Mr. Watson’s victims spanned more than nine states and the government spent “several thousand dollars” investigating the scheme. Victims “traveled over a thousand miles to give their testimony” (*The New York Times*, 1900a).

Over the next thirty years similar endless chain selling was used to sell streetcar tickets, subway tickets, shirts, rugs, women’s silk stockings, movie theater tickets, watches, and pencils.
However, not all were considered illegal. As noted, the Acting Assistant Attorney General for The Post Office Department opined that some chain coupon schemes might be legal. Post WWII brings similar schemes in selling automobiles, cosmetics, clothing, vitamins, motivational courses, household items, and many other products.

The silk stocking (i.e., hosiery) cases were interesting for two reasons. In 1927 the District of Columbia Court of Appeals found the Tribond Sales Corporation guilty of violating the New York state lottery law. The scheme, prosecuted by the Post Office Department for fraud, would need 1,549,681,956 (i.e., 1.5 billion) investors when it reached the fifteenth level. Of special interest is the Supreme Court’s refusal to overturn this prosecution—a refusal that would reportedly strike “a death blow at ‘endless chain’ selling” (Borah, 1928). More interestingly still is that it did not.

From late 1932 into 1933 the Sheldon Hosiery Company demonstrated the power of endless chain selling, generating within months $200,000 in revenue ($3.6M in 2016 dollars) from 300 cities (The New York Times, 1934a). The case included an actor hired to pose as the company president, as well as a bribery case against a special assistant to the United States Attorney General, presumably to help protect the company during a Postal Office investigation (The New York Times, 1933; The New York Times, 1934b). The success of the endless chain model in selling women’s silk stockings, at the time an often-purchased product, had reached the highest levels of the federal government.

Eighty years later, after a prosecution spanning seven-years, the Federal Trade Commission (FTC) prevailed at the Ninth Circuit Court of Appeals, which declared BurnLounge a pyramid scheme selling downloadable music and related services. The Court’s description of the scheme underlines the parallels with endless chain selling: “nothing more than an elaborate chain letter device in which individuals who pay a valuable consideration with the expectation of recouping it to some degree via recruitment are bound to be disappointed” (FTC v. BurnLounge, Inc. 2014; Ninth Circuit Court, quoting FTC v. Koscot 1975).

Between 1934 and 2014 use of the endless chain model waxed and waned, influenced by the economic and legal environments. Except for a case involving defense savings stamps, the endless chain does not appear much during WWII. In the 1950s multiple automobile dealers used endless chain selling, promising a free or near-free automobile contingent upon recruiting others who joined in pursuit of the same benefit. The Better Business Bureau described the approach a “mathematical monstrosity” (Nuccio, 1960). As described below, the 1970s proved a critical time for identifying (or more precisely, seeking to identify) and prosecuting what has become known as “pyramid schemes.”

**Changing terminology of endless chain selling:**

No longer relying upon coupons to move money, endless chain selling began to operate under new labels, such as the “chain-sales plan,” “pyramid clubs,” “chain referral,” “pyramid sales,” and then “pyramid scheme.” Earl W. Kintner, a former FTC Commissioner and Chairman, and a person thus familiar with deceptive and illegal practices, in 1978 wrote A Primer on the Law of Deceptive Practices (2nd ed.). In the Primer Kintner employs the phrase “pyramid sales scheme” (p. 331) to review several cases, including Ger-Ro-Mar (1974) and Koscot (1975). For each, the FTC used language describing the companies’ programs as illegal “endless chains” and unlawful “pyramid selling.” Further references to “chain letter” schemes, as a wealth transfer mechanism offering no product or service, highlight the reliance on geometric progression for rapid distributor growth.

**Shift in focus and irregular regulatory response**

The Supreme Court’s refusal to overturn the Tribond Sales Corporation decision in 1928 notwithstanding, enforcement and regulatory guidance in controlling endless chain selling has been mixed at best. The transition from endless chain selling to “pyramid sales” occurred in the context of a new wrinkle—the ability to earn income—as opposed to simply acquiring products (shoes, silk stocking, automobiles, etc.). This inclusion, along with very active promotion of an income opportunity, made the evaluation of the scheme more difficult. And far less pejoratively, the promoters described the sales plan as a growing version of the direct selling of products by independent business owners, further called multilevel marketing. By the 1970s endless chain selling was being defended as simply (legal) multilevel marketing/direct selling.

In Ger-Ro-Mar (1974) the FTC prosecuted a multilevel marketing firm for selling a deceptive income opportunity. While the Agency prevailed on deceptive income claims, it failed to convince the appellate court on the allegation of “pyramid scheme.” For the latter, the FTC relied on a mathematical progression regarding the infeasible number of distributors required by the firm’s perpetual
recruitment plan — rather reminiscent of the endless chain calculation in Tribond Sales Corporation. The appellate court held that math alone is not sufficient and that the government must also establish how this (pyramidal) program operates in practice. The court had thus separated: (i) deceptive income claims, established by a factual dearth of earnings (along with company promotions to the contrary), from (ii) a pyramid allegation based simply on an abstract mathematical calculation. The admonition was followed carefully by the FTC in Koscot, 1975. There, the opinion and order included a substantial review of marketing data & promotions; simultaneously, it came down hard against Koscot’s “endless chain” with its “intolerable capacity to deceive.” The Agency established a landmark case upheld by all federal courts that reviewed the matter.

Against the backdrop of the outcome in Ger-Ro-Mar, the Koscot opinion expressed a need for a per se rule at the federal level against endless chains. Specifically, the Commission stated, “the viability of a Federal remedy, however, will depend, if not upon congressional enactment, then upon the willingness of the courts to recognize the serious potential hazards of entrepreneurial chains and to permit summary excision of their “inherently deceptive elements, without the time-consuming necessity to show the occurrence of the very injury which justice should prevent ” (emphasis added; FTC v. Koscot 1975).

On the heels of Koscot, the FTC filed a complaint against Amway in 1975. In the initial proceedings with an administrative law judge, FTC legal staff described Amway’s marketing program as a pyramid distribution scheme within the meaning of Koscot (with pejorative meaning intended) and one that the ALJ rejected in finding “Amway is not in business to sell distributorships and is not a pyramid distribution scheme” (Federal Trade Commission Decisions 1979; Initial Decision, 1978). A final decision came in 1979 when the Commission stated, upon considering in detail both the marketing plan and how it worked in practice (including Amway’s retail sales rule, 70% rule, and refund policy), “We have determined that the Amway Sales and Marketing Plan is not an illegal ‘pyramid scheme’ ” (Federal Trade Commission Decisions 1979).

From Amway ’79 through 1995 there were no FTC actions on pyramid schemes. Apart from Amway ’79, over an approximately 40 year period extending to the present, the FTC has prosecuted 25 pyramid scheme cases, all of which claimed to operate as legal multilevel marketing firms (per Amway ’79’). Of these cases, 22 companies settled, paid penalties and shuttered their doors, while three companies fought the charge in court and lost. While this case-by-case approach has solidified the FTC’s legal pyramid argument under Koscot — carefully addressing how each of these specific programs operated in practice — a long-term legislative solution has yet to appear.

Outgoing FTC Chairwoman Ramirez gave very strong and clear industry guidance in a 2017 letter to the Direct Selling Association (DSA). Referencing the FTC’s 2016 actions against Vemma and Herbalife, she outlined the changes needed to improve the industry: 1) the business model must incentive profitable, verifiable retail sales primarily to non-distributor customers, 2) distributor compensation to be driven by said retail sales, 3) systematic tracking of retail sales to non-distributors customers, 4) compensation limits for sales to distributors for their own product consumption, and 5) elimination of deceptive or misleading earning claims (Ramirez, 2017). The Chair’s felt need to give this range of blunt advice underscores the disarrayed state of the industry.

The authors’ views on the legal arguments in these cases follow from each having served as expert witnesses in the prosecution of pyramid schemes. The second author was lead senior economist in that role for the Federal Trade Commission for 18 years.

Source Material:
Our research relies primarily on historic evidence in the popular press and court proceedings. Historic popular press articles are gathered via key word searches in ABI/INFORM and The New York Times archives. Academic researchers have considered some aspects of the topic and are found in either the archives of legal journals and law reviews or marketing journals.

Sample References:
FTC v. Amway Corp. (1979), 93 FTC 618.
FTC v. Koscot Interplanetary Inc. (1975), 86 FTC at 1180.
The Apparently Endless Nature Of Endless Chain Schemes

Ger-Ro-Mar, Inc., 84 F.T.C. 95 (1974)


_____ (1900b), “CHAIN COUPON SCHEMES LEGAL: Post Office to Allow Mail of this Kind to Pass,” 5 October.


_____ (1934a), “SAYS FEDERAL AIDE TOOK $8,000 BRIBE: Witness at Mail Fraud Trial Charges Money Was Paid for ‘Protection’,” 6 April.


Apples to Apples: 
Corporate Diversification and 
Trademark Troubles 

Steven W. Kopp 
Department of Marketing, Sam M. Walton College of Business, University of Arkansas, USA

Introduction and Background 

The legal manifestation of a brand is trademark. Often, protecting one’s trademark from use by another is fairly straightforward in the United States: whichever user of two similar-appearing brands applied it first in the market gets to keep it. The junior user must find another identifier. However, as companies evolve, strategically and geographically, determining who gets monopolistic ownership of an identifying mark becomes more complex. Companies, especially those with well-known brands, often must devote considerable resources to the legal protection of their brands.

This paper discusses a series of legal cases in a trademark dispute that persisted through three decades of innovation in music and technology. These cases exemplify a situation where companies with trademark-protected brands that pursue diversification or other growth strategies find themselves producing similar fruit and competing with one another for the attention of consumers. Even the most meticulous of legal coexistence agreements may not anticipate the corporate encounters between products that originally occupied different markets. First, the paper provides some background information, defining “trademark” and the branding histories of two companies. Second, the paper provides a detailed analysis of a series of legal interactions between these two companies, each of which rightfully owned the same name, neither of which wished to concede it to the other. Finally, the paper discusses the outcomes and implications of these cases.

Trademark 

Definitions vary globally, but within both Great Britain and the United States, trademark laws were originally intended as a legal means through which consumers could be protected from deception. In both countries, organizations can be taken to court if there exists a “likelihood of confusion” between two marks, especially when visual likenesses are combined with other similarities between the goods or services - retail channels, advertisements, target markets, or other factors. While the laws in both countries have undergone technical changes to accommodate international trade agreements, each is rooted in the need to proscribe consumer confusion as to the source of a product. Both countries have employed “first-to-use” criteria as the basis for senior ownership of a mark.

Two famous Apples 

Apple Corps Ltd. has been known as “the Beatles' record company” since 1968. It uses an apple as a word mark and as a “figurative” graphic symbol – displaying one side of a whole green Granny Smith apple – to identify its music business. The purpose of the business was to provide a holding company for the Beatles' financial and business affairs. Corporate expansions of the company have included electronics, films, publishing, and retail merchandise, but Corps’ record division has been the only profitable component.

Apple Computer was founded in 1976 by Steve Jobs and Steve Wozniak. Apple computers were intended to be used by consumers at home, and the brand was intended to position the product as simple, warm, human, approachable, affordable, and different (“Think Different”). Apple is best known to consumers for its sleek and original computer designs, its groundbreaking online music store, and its iPod music players. Apple’s ambitious diversification strategies, extending its hardware and software globally and technologically, has led to many intellectual property conflicts, including a forty-year struggle with the Beatles.
Long and Winding Road

By the end of the 1970s, both Apple Corps and Apple Computer were not only multidivisional, multiproduct corporations, they were also engaged across national boundaries and into each other’s geographic markets. The Beatles, of course, had been an international “brand” from their first performances in Germany, and Apple Corps distributed records in the U.S. as well as other countries. Apple Computer had begun to sell computers in Europe in 1977.

In 1980, Apple Corps sought to collect royalties on the sales of computer products under the Apple name. The parties negotiated a secret coexistence agreement in 1981 through which each recognized the “similarity between their respective Trade Marks” as well as each parties’ desire “to avoid confusion between their respective business activities and to preserve their respective Trade Mark rights” (Industrial Indemnity v. Apple Computer 1999, p. 823). Apple Computer paid the Beatles for the right to use the Apple name on products within a stipulated “field of use” that did not include music production or distribution.

However, Apple Computer’s corporate expansion soon led to software that could be used to produce music, and its geographic expansion challenged the use of Apple Corps’ trademarks in several countries. Apple Corps sued again. A monetary settlement paid by Computer and re-delineation of corporate Apple usage was drafted, each company agreeing to stay within its own conceptual turf, Computer to stick with the digital and Corps to remain within the musical.

Of course, Apple Computer’s technological efforts grew its markets to include music and video production and distribution, specifically including the iPod (2001), which served as the channel of distribution for digital music. The music was sold through Computer’s online retail innovation, iTunes. Apple Corps found itself competing against Apple Computer in markets composed of both music production and consumption.

Apple Corps sued yet again, and ultimately the UK High Court asserted that consumers could easily distinguish between Computer’s online market and Corps’ non-virtual music market. Rather than appeal (again), Corps settled in 2007. Apple Inc. (formerly Apple Computer) was granted ownership of all trademarks and logos related to the name “Apple.” The original “Apple” Corps music company was to license the use of its original logo and brand name, while Apple Inc. could continue using its name and logos on iTunes.

Some music produced by Apple (records) became available through Apple (computer) retail outlets almost immediately. But it was not until 2010, just in time for Christmas, and just over 50 years after the Beatles’ first performances in Hamburg, the music from the top-selling rock band in history was made available for purchase through the most extensive music distribution system in the world.

It is now safe to say that Apple owns “Apple.” On the one hand, Apple Corps was exceptionally vigilant regarding potential intrusions into its domain: each incremental expansion by the computer company was considered a threat and attacked. At the same time, Apple Computer’s persistent, almost robotic, corporate growth and use of its own marks resulted in its ultimate ownership of all the “apple” symbols. Even while market boundaries were meticulously defined (and agreed upon) over decades by each Apple, geographic and strategic growth made trespass almost inevitable.

References
A Very Special Relationship – the Government and the Advertising Industry in Sweden 1935 to 1990

Erik Lakomaa

Institute for Economic and Business History Research, Department of Marketing and Strategy,
Stockholm School of Economics, Sweden

During the five decades following 1935, the development of the Swedish advertising agency was highly influenced by its relation to the government. Not only was the government an increasingly active regulator of the industry (Funke 2015), but also an important customer to the advertising agencies. Later in the period a major one.1

Advertising has since long played an important economic role and as such been the subject of many business history studies. The government as advertiser has however mostly been overlooked, and the same applies to the Swedish advertising industry. Despite the availability of rich archival sources, business history research on Swedish advertising firms is limited (see e.g. Broberg & al., 2016). ii

The purpose of this paper is to examine the relationship between the Swedish government and the advertising industry, and how the market for government advertising developed over time, with special focus on the role of the advertising industry (and its organizations) in building a market for government advertising.

In addition, the paper intends to further the understanding of public-private relations in the advertising industry in general, an area where research, if not absent, is limited and mainly focused on the democratic implications of the government as advertiser (Dudley, 1947; Mullen & Bowers, 1979; Young, 2007) or on the use of advertising in foreign policy or during war time, including during the Cold War (Berghoff, 2003; Bethune, 1968; Fox, 1975; Griffith, 1983; Lakomaa, 2012; Lykins, 2003; Osgood, 2006; Risso, 2014; Schwarzkopf, 2005; Stole, 2012). Analyzing the corporate side – and the industry’s role in promoting advertising can thereby make a significant contribution to business history research.

This study is based on extensive archival sources including, inter alia, archives of government agencies (Beredskapsnämnden för psykologiskt försvar, BN; Statens Informationssyrelse, SIS)), government committees (Utredningen om psykologiskt försvar); archives from public advertising campaigns (Energisparkampanjen, Högertrafikkampanjen); trade organizations (Federation of Swedish Advertisers, AF; The Swedish Association of Communications Agencies, KOMM); and archives from individual advertising agencies (Gumaelius; Ervaco; Förenade ARE-Bolagen; Svenska Telegrambyrån). In addition, the study draws on a significant amount of previously classified documents concerning the National Information Service, which has been de-classified at the researcher’s request.

The history of government advertising in Sweden can be divided into three phases:

The first phase began with the outbreak of World War 2. Cooperation was then motivated by defense reasons and private advertising agencies took part in the defense effort by providing public service (“preparation”) advertising under the umbrella of the National Information Board (SIS), a government agency. The initiative was the industry’s and the cooperation proved highly beneficial for the industry as shortages, caused by blockades and rationing, caused the civilian advertising market almost to disappear. Here it can be argued that the cooperation with the government during World War 2 probably saved many of the established advertising firms from insolvency, or at least saved the industry structure.

Contrary to the practice in most countries, the Swedish advertising industry was cartelized (since 1915) and the government purchases during the war came to benefit almost exclusively the cartel members (on the cartelization issue, see Åström-Rudberg, 2016). The government even agreed to steer its business to the agencies in proportion to their pre-war market shares. In addition, the government continued to use the cartel’s system for compensation which meant that the advertising agencies acted as an intermediary between the advertisers (e.g. the government) and the newspapers (Newspapers was the primary advertising channel since radio and TV advertising was prohibited in Sweden until the...
This gave the advertising agencies financial support when it was needed the most as the arrangement allowed them to continue charging a commission (usually 15-17%) on all media sales.

After the war, the cooperation continued, albeit related to primarily military matters. Advertising agencies organized in the National Information Service (NIS), now prepared war time advertising for World War 3. The NIS was modeled on both the SIS and the US counterpart, the Ad Council (Fox, 1975; Stole, 2012), the differnece being that NIS was not supposed to be active in peace time. The civilian agencies that formed the cartel agreed to staff this agency, and in some cases they also volunteered significant amount of their executives’ time (Lakomaa, 2012). Later, however, the government begun procuring advertising and media services on more or less commercial grounds.

The second phase, begun in the late 1960:s when the Swedish government started running large public advertising campaigns, the first in connection with the introduction of right side traffic in 1967, and later by campaigns aimed at e.g. energy savings and public health.

Even though the cartel was disbanded in 1965 the government primarily bought advertising services from the large, former cartel-members, thus contributing to keep (most of) them in business (as newly established smaller agencies were taking over much of the commercial market).

The Energy Savings Campaign that run from 1973 to 1982, was especially important as it not only was the largest advertising campaign in Swedish history and very lucrative for the participating agencies, but also since the advertising services was provided by former cartel firms. The campaign therefore also contributed to the conservation of the industry structure.

Finally, the third phase, which begun in the 1970s and where advertising developed into an integral part of public sector activities and where government agencies and municipalities become major buyers of media and advertising services. By the 1980s, most of the large agencies that from 1915-1965 had formed the cartel had disappeared; some of them merged with emerging Swedish firms or with multinational advertising groups, others went bankrupt.

The paper provides, in addition to the history of the relationship between the industry and the government also an analysis on the incentives to participate and the influence of the public advertising market on industry structure and it is found that the state by functioning as customer of last resort (both during world war 2 and later) contributed to conserve the industry structure.

Notes

1 In the 2010:s, the government had become the largest buyer of advertising services in Sweden.
2 Here should also be noted Elin Åström-Rudberg’s ongoing PhD-project

References


Volkswagen’s diesel emission crisis in the United States, which was uncovered in 2014, and addressed increasingly in 2015 and 2016, resulted in a settlement agreement of more than $15 billion in 2016. More fallout has been predicted to come in the future (Cars.com, Fisk et al). While the monetary amounts involved in this settlement appear staggering, the overall impact on the formerly upstanding reputation of Volkswagen may well be even far more damaging.

Another critical problem of a different nature, has also been receiving increasing attention—that of furniture, especially dressers or shelves which have a tendency to tip over, especially when holding heavier items, such as television sets or other similar items. Based on information from the Consumer Product Safety Commission, tip-overs were blamed for the deaths of 49 children in the U.S. in 2011 (Nadolny, 2015). The international home-goods company, IKEA, has been at the center of attention of this issue, although other furniture retailers have also experienced some of the same problems. IKEA had been promoting its solution for the tip-over furniture by providing free wall-anchoring repair kits, mentioning especially its MALM dressers which were involved in at least two recent toddler boy deaths (IKEA Offers, 2015). However, IKEA recently announced in 2016 a settlement of $50 million to be shared among three families all of whom lost a boy no more than two years old who died when the MALM IKEA dresser toppled over on the child. The Company will also be providing additional compensation to children’s hospitals in the three states where these three little boys resided (Guarino 2016). While IKEA continues to state that users of its furniture should be anchoring dressers and other furniture to walls, the company obviously has found that this recommendation is inadequate perhaps also inappropriate or even impossible.

While both of the above descriptions involve international companies, the immediate examples provided here pertain to situations that occurred in the United States. While it may be of some comfort that legal recourse and compensation was ordered, in part based on the foundation of product safety and sustainability that has been established in the United States, the greater expectation is that in the future, such examples may be avoided or curtailed. The following paper provides an overview of the history of product safety and sustainability developed over time in the United States. It is recognized that in the very early stages of industrialization, even the concepts of safety or sustainability were often not even part of the consideration, since Caveat Emptor, let the buyer beware, appeared to be the motto that was followed in the older times. The term, buyer, here did not just pertain to the act of purchasing something, but went beyond to apply to most circumstances, including job opportunities, and other undertakings.

Sustainability was also not something that the early residents of America considered strongly, especially since land in the United States was seen as one of virtually unlimited opportunity with its open spaces and unexplored territories. While the Native Americans apparently had followed many rigorous sustainable practices, such as only hunting or fishing as needed, this conservative approach appeared to be more often disregarded as the United States became settled and developed.

While safety has been certainly sought throughout civilization, the concept of safety was officially identified by Abraham Maslow, in his 1943 hierarchy of needs theory. This theory included five stages; starting with the concept (bottom tier) that the most fundamental needs of human beings focused on physiological (food water, warmth, rest); the second tier involved safety needs (security, safety); the third tier included belongingness and love (intimate relationships, friends); the fourth tier focused on that of esteem needs (prestige and a feeling of accomplishment), and the fifth and highest tier of needs focused on was that of self-actualization (achieving one’s full potential including creative activities) (Maslow, 1943; McLeod, 2016).
Early Safety Items and Activities

This portion of the paper examines the few elements of safety products and services that were identified in the early days of the formation of the United States, apart from the American Revolution and other activities involved with the establishment of America. For example, the Boston Light, the first official lighthouse in the United States, was built in 1716, with its purpose that of assisting ships bringing goods from Europe to safely enter the Boston harbor.

Safety as such did not appear to be a separate topic, but protection was sought, especially for one’s goods or property such as Ben Franklin’s creation of a fire department in Philadelphia (1736) as well as the establishment of the first fire insurance company, named, the Contribution. Shortly after the formation of this insurance company, a competitor, The Green Tree Company, was created, which offered lower premiums to homeowners who took measures to make their homes safer and make firefighting access more available as well. Ben Franklin might well be identified as one of the first Americans to really assist America’s (still basically unknown) quest for safety by also inventing the lightning rod in 1752.

The Industrial revolution throughout the 1800s appeared to be far more focused on production, without much thought to the health or safety of the workers involved in such creation. Factories were not the only areas where workers were laboring under challenging conditions as mills, railroad building and other jobs were increasingly dangerous. Official labor unions increasingly were needed to fight for better conditions for workers. The early industrial revolution involved the establishment of factories and mills, where trade societies (early unions) provided benefits to widows even these societies were not overly concerned with working conditions. The worker was still felt to be responsible for his/her own safety. Insurance was felt to be for property not people. It was said that fire hazards, including the increase due to the growing use of electricity in the late 1800s into the early 1900s was a key reason for the growing focus on safety for the workers.

The Inception and Early Growth of Consumerism in the early 1900s

The late 1800s was a dangerous time. Upton Sinclair wrote The Jungle about the Chicago slaughterhouses, bringing awareness of food-related problems. A key outcome of the attention on food safety was the 1906 creation of the Food and Drug Administration, which continues to this day to monitor and examine consumable safety.

Worker Compensation measures were established in 1908-1911, providing medical support and even death benefits to beneficiaries. This, in turn, encouraged employers to focus on preventing accidents so such payments would not be needed, or at least so that employers would not have to pay these benefits. The Triangle Shirtwaist company fire in New York City in 1911 was a major incident, as 145 lives were lost because employees, generally young women, were unable to get out because escapes were blocked nor could fire equipment could get inside. The first Worker Compensation law was passed at this same time, and a shift toward an increased focus on ways to prevent accidents.

The (U.S.) National Safety Council was formed in 1913 along with the U.S. Dept. of Labor, providing a federal focus on safety for employees. A decade-by-decade timeline of accomplishments and activities by the National Safety Council provides a summary of some of the top contributions of these decades. The Federal Trade Commission was established in 1914, having control over balancing competition in the marketplace, but also providing a monitoring service against deception, with the goal of providing consumers with a safer marketplace.

The first two decades of the 1900s laid the foundation for a focus on safety, although the focus back in that time was more on workplace safety than on products and services designed to provide additional safety measures or benefits especially away from the job. The 1930s brought more attention to safety but primarily through identifying products that would better protect workers, such as steel-toed boots.

Consumerism, Round Two, 1930s to the early 1960s

By 1936, the Occupational Safety and Health Act provided basic health and safety standards, with additional hazards in the workplace being identified and, in many cases, making the workplace substantially safe. With the conclusion of World War II in the late 1940s, the safety focus shifted from the workplace to the home as well as to the vehicles on the roads, since the automobile was now also being studied for additional safety features, such as headrests and seatbelts (1957).
Consumerism, Round Three, the 1960s
The consumer’s Bill of Rights, including the rights to safety, to be informed, to choose, and to be heard, was announced in 1962. As well, an automobile safety focus increased substantially in the 1960s especially through the efforts of Ralph Nader whose 1964 book, *Unsafe at Any Speed*, brought attention to the safety issues found in the overall construction of vehicles. Around this same time, the American Society of Safety Engineers was rising in prominence, along with several other safety-related organizations.

Consumerism, Round Four, the 1970s and into the future
The 1970s marked a decade of federal regulations setting standards but this was also a time when the safety focus shifted even more strongly toward consumer products, such as requiring air bags in automobiles. The Consumer Product Safety Act of 1972 was a major piece of legislation, designed to protect the public from unsafe products or services, as well as to provide recommendations for safer living. One of the laws enacted at this time in 1974 was to create a national speed limit of 55 mph which was found to have brought about a 17% decrease in deaths in one year. Out of this Act came the Consumer Product Safety Commission (CPSC). While legislation provided this Commission with substantial power, there appear to have been challenges between allowing the marketplace to voluntarily create standards versus the Commission which was provided with the power to impose mandatory standards.

The 1980s focused on safe-guarding both the worker and the family. For example, Mothers Against Drunk Driving (MADD) was formed in 1980. The 1990s basically expanded on earlier actions seeking safety for all. Then, the 2000s, especially 9-11-2001, ushered in a new century of safety threats, although the need to continue to improve safety practices in general was also recognized.

Marketing Activities Encouraging Safety
This litany of the development of safety in products and services throughout the past two centuries in the United States has really focused on a description of activities or actions that have brought an awareness of safety (or lack thereof) to those in the marketplace. Technology has played several roles, not only in the development of increased safety but also in providing communication vehicles, ranging from printed messages to the telephone, then to television or movies, and now, today, in terms of a wide spectrum of online communication vehicles.

During the 1800s and even early 1900s, disasters such as large fires, or tragic workplace accidents, appeared to be the source behind dramatic communications which then prompted changes to hopefully protect workers and consumers from similar disasters in the future.

At first, printed materials, newsletters and newspapers provided a wide variety of information to those able to read the papers. The telephone provided local connections as well as ways to pass messages more quickly across the country. The growth and use of television has been powerful for the second half of the 20th century and still provides a strong communication vehicle in today’s marketplace, although this medium is losing impact in comparison to online communications. Ironically, television (along with TV and movie stars and other opinion leaders) appeared to be more persuasive in getting consumers to purchase certain unsafe products (example, smoking cigarettes) than in getting consumers to stop these same behaviors.

Climate Change and Sustainability
The next wave of consumer impact appears to have shifted from just consumerism to the broader area of safety and sustainability. Part of this flow is felt to be due to the greater availability of information, allowing consumers to obtain far more information than ever before about products and services not only in the United States, but around the world. The growth of attention to safety products and services has been a major groundswell of change, which has been reflected in far more protection and benefits for today’s consumer.

Sample References


A Consumer Cooperative between Market and Stakeholder Orientations: The Case of Coop Atlantique, 1912-2016

Bruno Mazieres

Department of Marketing Techniques, University Institute of Technology, University of Limoges, France

Magali Boespflug

Department of Marketing Techniques, University Institute of Technology, University of Poitiers, France

Purpose

The aim of this paper is to explain the survival of Coop Atlantique, one of the last French consumer cooperatives, in the light of both the concepts of market orientation (MO) and stakeholder orientation (SO). Thus, throughout its history, the cooperative has succeeded in adopting orientations that befit the evolution of the various stakeholders involved in the French distribution sector.

The case: Coop Atlantique between 1912 and 2016

The choice of this company has been motivated by different reasons. Firstly, its age: Coop Atlantique is more than a century old since it was created in 1912. Then, its legal status is unusual: as a consumer cooperative, it belongs to its customers—the so-called members or co-operators. Members are in charge of the company with the main objectives of marketing goods at a fair price and ensuring the sustainability of the cooperative. Finally, its market position is unique: it is the last large—about 4,000 employees—consumer cooperative still active in France.

In that respect, it makes sense for us to understand how and why Coop Atlantique has succeeded to survive where so many French distribution companies have failed.

Conceptual framework: market orientation and stakeholder orientation

Both concepts seem appropriate to highlight the evolution of Coop Atlantique. Indeed, during more than a century, the company has moved on the continuum existing between these two concepts, and the quality of its relationships with its stakeholders might explain its sustainability (Kull et al., 2016). If market orientation is mainly based on customers and competitors, stakeholder orientation takes into account all the environmental variables of the company. This provides a broader analytical framework that better meets the needs for studying the historic development of a firm, in particular a cooperative.

Methodology

Our investigation aims at identifying the main periods of the evolution of the marketing strategy of Coop Atlantique (events, decisions, etc.) in a contingent approach involving the identification of different influencing stakeholders. Data collection was based on both primary and secondary sources. Relevant information was taken from books about the cooperative sector and the French distribution industry. We had access to the archives of the company, located in the historic headquarters of Saintes. This documentary research work was completed by several semi-directive individual interviews and focus groups with different stakeholders of the company, such as customers, co-operators, employees, and managers (active and retired).

Periodization finding

We were able to identify three main periods in the evolution of the marketing practices of the cooperative. Each of these periods is representative of the positioning of the company between a market orientation and a stakeholder orientation.

1912-1945 – Genesis and golden age of a cooperative
Coop Atlantique originated in the establishment of La Saintaise, a consumer cooperative located in Saintes (Nouvelle-Aquitaine Region), whose purpose was to provide its co-operators with considerable savings on consumption expenditures. This “fair price” strategy intended for customer-members proved to be a success as the company experienced a dramatic development in the West of France. The first and only point of sale of Saintes gave way to 40 subsidiaries as early as 1922 and the product offering became increasingly diversified (from basic food offering to services such as hairdressers or auto repair shops). The organizational structure succeeded in adapting to this fast expansion: a sales manager was hired as early as 1919 (the company developed its private label products - Coop - in 1928) and both the new head office and several warehouses were built in 1928 to overcome the lack of space involved by growth.

Besides, Coop Atlantique was fully aware of its responsibility as a cooperative. It was attentive to its employees – one of the few French companies not affected by the strikes of June 1936 due to the signature of an innovative agreement – and it got involved in the Community - creation of several service projects dedicated to the youth, disabled, etc. Hence Coop Atlantique was deeply societally oriented with concrete actions proposed by and for its co-operators. Then regulation was made thanks to local communities stakeholders (Bazin and Ballet, 2004).

1945-1985 – A cooperative facing profound mutations

The French distribution sector faced deep changes over this 40-year period and the cooperative had to adapt to stay on the market. First of all, Édouard Leclerc opened the very first “discount” store in 1949, proposing brand-name products at bargain prices: the price image concept, so important in the retailing sector, was born. At the same time, most of the founders of the modern French distribution companies left for America to attend conferences hosted by Bernardo Trujillo, considered as one of the pioneers of the modern distribution principles. Moreover, different legislative and regulatory changes took place in order to provide a more flexible framework to the distribution sector: distributors were now free to buy and resell virtually any item and suppliers could no longer control final sales prices. As a consequence, the sector started to battle for size, with brand-new retail concepts such as supermarkets and hypermarkets. Moreover, this now highly competitive environment resulted in a concentration of the different retail chains and purchasing bodies.

Amid these changes, Coop Atlantique had to adjust its marketing strategy. Previously based exclusively on small-sized convenience stores, the retail network finally reached out to supermarkets and hypermarkets. It took quite a long time (late after its main competitors) as the cooperative needed to convince its members to accept a differentiated pricing policy between its different store formats. This cannot be considered as a waste of time but as a turning point in the history of the company: the other cooperatives that did not manage to get this new pricing policy accepted eventually disappeared. Coop Atlantique was not an exception to the concentration movement and merged with another cooperative called L’Union de Limoges in 1972. Thus, in this period, the company had to tighten up its stakeholder framework to adapt its marketing decisions to the changing of its competitive and legal environments.

1985-2016 – A cooperative facing the reality principle

Until 1985, the store supplying was based on a dozen of corporately owned warehouses. But they had to close due to their non-competitiveness and the company had to use different purchasing bodies. In the end, as a result of the still ongoing concentration movement of the industry, Coop Atlantique had to rely on the Carrefour French Group to supply its stores. The marketing policy of the company was then greatly impacted: all the stores (other than convenience stores) had to be Carrefour rebranded, as well as external communication (leaflets, posters, etc.) and internal communication (in-store advertising and branded products). But serious disagreements on trading conditions led Coop Atlantique to cancel the contract and partner with another French distribution group, Système U in 2012. Hence, in this third period, the company has had to primarily focus on its procurement process, critical to its survival.

Discussion

Studying the history of Coop Atlantique allows us to highlight the evolution of the positioning of a company between market orientation and stakeholder orientation. The company was originally societally oriented, but the hardening of its environment (regarding competitors, regulation as well as procurement systems) led it to the market orientation it needed to survive. Thus cooperative aspects, although key parts of the stakeholder approach, had to be pushed into the background. But today, Coop Atlantique seems to be back in a sustainable situation and redirect its emphasis on its cooperative values by
implementing specific actions (such as dedicated advantages for members, the creation of local committees, an updated website, and the hiring of a special referent for co-operators).

To conclude, the history of Coop Atlantique could be analysed as a swinging movement between SO including several stakeholders (1912-1945), MO (1945-1985), and again SO taking a few stakeholders into account (1985-2016). Finally, the optimal configuration for Coop Atlantique in the future seems to be the one that will conciliate both stakeholder and market approaches (Ferrell et al., 2010; Patel et al., 2016).

References


A Model of Historical Analysis for Solving Marketing Problems

Anthony J. McMullan

Peter Faber Business School, Australian Catholic University, Brisbane Australia

Extended Abstract

Examining the history of marketing thought affords marketing scholars with the opportunity to understand the discipline. A major difficulty in understanding is a lack of methodological tools for evaluations. This paper proposes a new historical analysis model incorporating an Analytical Template to assist the researcher’s examination of historical literature. It is expected to aid in translating concepts into theory, with associated implications for the teaching, study and practice of marketing within organisations and society. The paper advocates for the adoption of the Problem Solving Historical Analysis Marketing Model as a mechanism to promote the use of historical analysis in marketing to solve contemporary marketing issues, explore new marketing topics and expand the discipline’s knowledge base.

Body

The scholastic journey that is the study of marketing’s history of thought is a rich source of information about the discipline. It provides the means and scope by which to traverse and extend boundaries.

It is unfortunate that such an impressive body of work is often left underutilised by the mainstream marketing academic and practitioner and not considered a vehicle by which to explain and evolve the discipline. One reason for this could be the ease of application of a practical model of historical analysis. What is absent from the marketing literature are examples detailing the experience and lessons learnt from applying an historical analysis model to a specific marketing problem. The purpose of this paper is to illustrate such a model.

Several models of historical analysis exist in the marketing literature, for example Savitt (1980); Nevett (1991); and Golder (2000). Each of these models details the steps considered necessary for the conduct of such enquiry. These models can be used as building blocks for an enhanced model of historical analysis called “The Problem Solving Historical Analysis Marketing Model”. The core element of this model is an Analytical Template that assists in collecting data for analysis and the creation of an evidence trail. The template is a crucial and innovative element of a historical analysis model for marketing.

This model can be methodically applied to examine the marketing thought literature. Exploring new topics in marketing such as relationship marketing or service dominant logic or to expand the general knowledge base of the discipline by means of generating fundamental questions, such as, “What is the reason for marketing?” are all within the scope of the model. The objective is to acquire a greater understanding of the discipline through the articulation of new marketing concepts or theory.

In general terms the study of history provides the researcher with an understanding of the rudimentary technique of analysis that the scholar can utilise to examine history. The purpose of which is to inform and provide the marketing researcher with a frame of reference to guide research efforts. The Problem Solving Historical Analysis Marketing Model is presented to direct the marketing researcher’s endeavours when researching marketing’s history of thought literature to solve marketing problems.

History can be written using one of three basic techniques – descriptive, narrative and analysis. The descriptive and narrative techniques aim to recreate the past by providing an account of what happened and are often used in the study of the history of marketing. The analysis technique is different in that it seeks to interpret the past by looking for the significance of, and the relationship between, events. This technique uses the embedded knowledge in history to make meaningful connections for the purpose of addressing contemporary problems, evaluating existing concepts and theories and providing understanding into the future development of the academic domain being investigated.

There are many acceptable ways in which to analyse history; including, studying images, metaphors and symbols, quantitative collective biography, and content analysis (Berringer 1978). Of particular interest is the technique Berringer (1978) refers to as ‘literary analysis’. Literary analysis is a basic...
A Model of Historical Analysis for Solving Marketing Problems

The historical technique used to examine literature for a particular purpose such as answering the question “What is the reason of marketing?” The literature is arranged such that it allows for an analytical tool to be used for historical inquiry.

The benefit of having an understanding of the study of history in general terms is that it bestows upon the researcher a plausible technique which can be used to investigate and delve deeper into domain’s literature. The use of literature as source material for historical analysis has been underutilised by scholars.

By accepting that the history of marketing thought is a practicable learning medium, and by applying a suitable framework of analysis, historical analysis can be used as a foundation for educated and thoughtful discussion of contemporary issues. The motivation for this research is to present a new model of marketing analysis that is capable of utilising the embedded knowledge that sits untapped in the history of marketing thought to solve contemporary marketing problems.

The subject and use of history in marketing is not new. Throughout the development of the discipline, marketing’s history has been an area of interest; albeit, not with the same fervour as other aspects, technical and practical in nature, of marketing endeavour. Researchers have seen the benefit of ‘amplification, synthesis and promotion’ of reviewing marketing’s history of thought (Hollander and Savitt 1983:v). In essence, the recorded history of marketing thought is a usable source of information for analysis as it confers knowledge, such that the scholar can learn from it and make a contribution to the corpus of marketing literature.

By synthesising both the study of history in general terms and more specifically the study of the history of marketing thought, the marketing scholar can benefit from analysing the discipline’s past in pursuit of solving marketing problems. The question for the academic marketing fraternity is ‘Can an appropriate model of analysis be developed that takes the knowledge embedded in the history of marketing thought and turn it into new marketing insight?’ This research demonstrates that by synthesizing the ideas learnt from the study of history in general terms and by building upon existing models of historical analysis in marketing an enhanced model of analysis is possible. The Problem Solving Historical Analysis Marketing Model collects, by means of an Analytical Template, the knowledge that exists in the source material for generating meaningful contributions to the marketing literature.

The intent is not to recreate the past, but to use this model as a means to analyse and interpret the past for the benefit of the future development of the marketing discipline. The model aims to take disparate sources of information from source material for example, journal articles and academic texts, considered case studies, and make sense of them in terms of findings and interpretations to determine related themes. Such a method is consistent with the approach adopted by Jones and Monieson (1990) wherein they conducted their analysis upon marketing and business journals and economic history periodicals.

Conclusion

This paper proposes a new model of historical analysis for application when investigating marketing’s historical thought literature. The Problem Solving Historical Analysis Marketing Model was developed by building upon models found within the literature and enhanced with the inclusion of a specifically designed Analytical Template. This template makes the task of collecting evidence efficient and a more transparent process. Together it is hoped the use of the model and template will encourage active consideration of the history of marketing thought as fertile ground upon which to improve old ideas and develop new insights.

References


Gift Rituals and Nationalism of Wartime Japan

Yuko Minowa  
*Long Island University, Brooklyn, USA*  
Russell W. Belk  
*York University, Toronto, Canada*

Following the “China Incident” at Marco Polo Bridge in 1937, which evolved into the de facto Second Sino-Japanese War, the First Department Store Act amended in 1938 limited store operations including advertising (Miyajima, 2009). In June 1939, the Living Reform Act was enacted, and the prominent seasonal gift giving rituals at midyear (*chūgen*) and yearend (*seibo*) were officially abolished. The sumptuary edict of 1940 further prohibited department stores from selling luxury items. Thus, no advertisements for seasonal gift items could be found in 1940. Nevertheless, an editorial in the December 24, 1940 issue of *Asahi Shimbun* entitled “The Abolishment of Gifts,” reveals that post-offices and train stations were again flooded with year-end gifts for delivery. In the midst of these edicts and an accelerating wartime shortages of supplies, how could people care about maintaining this gift giving ritual?

**Objectives**

This study investigates the shifting discourse and visual rhetoric of consumer rituals in the context of Japanese cultural media leading up to the Second World War. We examine seasonal gift giving in urban cities in wartime Japan. While Japanese historians refer to the period of 1931 (the Manchurian Incident) to 1945 (the end of Second World War) as “The Fifteen Year War,” we specifically focus on the period from 1937 (the China Incident) to 1940 (the Sumptuary Edict). This was a period during which national mobilization policies were enforced through standardized ideological treatments aimed at raising morale. The controlled economy that began in 1937 restricted foreign trade (imports and exports) and domestic capital investment. Slogans for frugality to help the national goals of the state were proliferating, while material supplies were diminishing. Urban cities, in particular, saw a drastic shift. Commercial advertisements instructed the audience on various ways to resolve conflicts between spending for the traditional and wartime rituals and being thrifty in response to the national emergency.

**Significance**

The study is significant in at least three ways. One, no prior study of gift-giving rituals in consumer research seems to have focused on the period of wartime material shortages in Japan. Very few studies are available in related fields (Yamaguchi, 2012). Befu (1984), Ito (2011), Matsui, Minowa, and Belk (2013), Minami (1997), and Rupp (2003) investigate seasonal gift giving rituals in Japan, but none of these works focuses primarily on the ads during the war. Two, the study analyzes the construction of arguments in the media for rationalizing spending for traditional gift giving while instructing readers on being economical. Witkowski (2003) examines the wartime US campaigns preaching frugality to consumers through the poster advertising. Clampin (2009) and Covert (2003) indicate that wartime commercial advertising encouraged consumption and gave practical advice for the sustenance of everyday life, while Loxham (2016) and Stole (2013) emphasize the effect of state propaganda, such as rationing and patriotism, on U.S. and U.K. advertising themes. And Zhao and Belk (2012) examine wartime anti-Japanese advertising in China. None examines the particular consumption context of gift giving during the war, however. Three, this study discusses the aestheticization of gift objects and ad visuals inspired by war-related motifs. Minowa and Belk (2016) examine the contribution of nuanced aestheticization to national identity rhetorics. But, the context of their study is post-postwar Japan at the height of Americanism and internationalization scheme.

**The historical background**

After the Manchurian Incident in 1931, the everyday lives of urban Japanese people did not change immediately (Tipton, 2016). Despite the deepening recession and the worsening poverty of rural villages
from the late 1920s, urban consumers continued their Americanized leisure pursuits in the 1930s. They were engaged with individualistic concerns rather than directing their energies toward the national goals of the state. The changes—the rise of the right wing, the military and ultra-nationalism—were evident, however. The murder of the Prime Minister Inukai in 1932 by naval officers, and the nearly successful coups d’état called the February 26 Incident, by young army officers in 1936, both demonstrated the prominence of the military in Japanese politics by the mid-1930s (Buruma, 2003). Concurrently, since 1932, in order to mobilize and control public opinion in support of the right-wing values and expansionist policies, the military—the Cabinet Information Bureau and the propaganda units of the armed forces—gradually utilized a propaganda strategy called “the diffusion of defense thought” (Sandler, 2001). The officials used the censorship and propaganda through press and radio to guide public opinion.

Perceiving the prolonged campaign, Prime Minister Konoe, appointed shortly before the outbreak of the Second Sino-Japanese War, emphasized the mobilization of the national spirit and guided consumers to sacrifice of their selves for national goals. The ideology was propagated with such slogans as “national unity,” “loyalty and patriotism,” and “dogged perseverance” (Wakabayashi, 2008). Mottos such as “We don’t desire until we win” and “luxury is our enemy” became pervasive subsequently. After the National Mobilization Law was enforced in 1938, not only did it control every aspect of the nation’s capital, but also it changed people’s thoughts about consumption and succeeded in lowering the standard of living (Tamura, 2011). Meanwhile, the revenues of department stores, especially from the sales of luxury items, were manifold, as a result of the consumer’s hoarding due to their fear for hyperinflation and shortage of materials. Luxury kimono fabrics sold fast to be used for barter. It was the enforcement of the sumptuary edict in 1940 that not only prohibited the manufacture and sale of luxury items and expensive necessities, but also mobilized private organizations and demanded the total abolition of luxury display by citizens on the street. After 1940, price and distribution controls became prevalent. As the war continued and expanded to the Pacific, urban consumers relied on rations, black markets, and barter exchanges with farmers.

Methods
This study employs a historical method based on archival research (Witkowski and Jones, 2006). As for the data source, we rely primarily on newspaper advertisements for seasonal gifts and sympathy bags in Asahi Shimbun between 1937 and 1940. The dataset consists of 477 retail and brand advertisements. The advertising copy and the visual content of selected objects are described and analyzed. Other source materials include contemporary photographs that illustrate gifts sold in the department stores, surviving gifts as mementoes in war museums, and memoirs and essays on gift giving during the war, in addition to the record on the sympathy bags by the Patriotic Women’s Association.

Gift Rituals and Nationalism
Within the short period of 1937 to 1940, advertisements for seasonal gifts shifted drastically and quickly. Gifts advertised in the summer of 1938 were still the usual assortments, but both the copy and visuals showed the influence of propaganda. A year later, in the summer of 1939, ads for seasonal gifts mostly disappeared, although some, without explicit indication in body copy, hint at the nature of the product being advertised as seasonal gifts by embedding the images of traditional symbols (e.g., noshi). In the winter of 1940, ads for gifts disappeared except for sympathy bags to be sent to the battlefield. There are four common themes that appeared in the ads examined, reflecting the social values and national goals of the time. They are: compatibility, timeliness, empathy, and sympathy. More than one of these themes could appear simultaneously in an advertisement.

Compatibility. Gifts appealed if they were “in conformity with national policy.” During the war, being economical and being healthy were fundamental goals. They were interrelated. Forming a strong nation requires the healthy citizens. A robust physique was desired. Sickness was equated with being uneconomical—and thus against national policy—due to its costliness. Thus, if the gifts helped to promote health and build a strong physique, the spending was justified. Gifts of personal care items, such as toothpaste, used such appeals. Also, brands promoted their competitive advantage by emphasizing the economic superiority of their products.

Timeliness. Advertisements for some items were couched as “appropriate gifts under the present situation.” The Sino-Japanese war was dubbed the Holy War, in order to justify the unexpectedly prolonged campaign. Some ads called for the abolition of empty formality, while others attempted to
persuade audiences that some gift items could be used in order to extol military prowess and celebrate martial spirit. Such gifts included sake and domestic wine. Being functional and practical without waste (unnecessary features) was considered proper “under the current situation.” And ads for staple food gifts such as soy sauce persuaded the audience by appealing their practical aspects.

Empathy. Some ads argued that gifts were appropriate for expressing support for the family of a soldier fighting at the battlefront. Especially after seasonal gift giving was prohibited in 1939, advertisements argued that gifts could be sent under the pretext of expressing emotional support. The appropriate gifts for this purpose seem to be any regular food gifts, such as soy sauce. But they were portrayed with labels stating “little gifts” [soshina] instead of mentioning the chūgen or seibo gift occasions. They also emphasized that they were timely for the circumstance.

Sympathy. After ads for seasonal gift disappeared, those for sympathy bags remained in 1940. In department stores, special areas were dedicated for the sale of sympathy bags. Department store ads show the use of airplanes, then a symbol of modernity (Wilson, 2000). Gift items preferred for sympathy purposes varied from letters, toys, foods, and medicines to miscellaneous goods. By the time for year-end seasonal gift giving in December 1940, ads encouraged buying of national bonds to support national goals instead of wasteful spending.

References
Miyajima, H. (2009), Kansai modan dezainshi: hyakkaten shinbun kōkoku o chūshin to shite [A history of the Kansai modern design: Department store advertisements and beyond], Chūō kōron bijutsu shuppan, Tokyo.
Wakabayashi, T. (2008), Tatakau kōkoku: Zasshi kōkoku ni miru Ajia taiheiyou sensō [Advertisements for the battles: Asia Pacific War seen in magazine advertisements], Shōgakukan, Tokyo.


Refashioning the Femme Fatale in Vogue, 1892-1900

Yuko Minowa
Long Island University, Brooklyn, USA

Pauline Maclaran
Royal Holloway, University of London, UK

Lorna Stevens
University of Westminster, London, UK

This study critically investigates the alternative interpretations of femme fatale images in the cultural media in marketing history. Representations of femme fatales in 19th century cultural media, such as fin-de-siècle poster advertising, have been studied mostly in European contexts. There is a paucity of study in the American context. The current study focuses on visual representations and discourses around femmes fatales in cultural media, specifically fashion magazines, in 1890s America, a period associate with America’s “Gilded Age” (1870-1914).

Femme fatale
The subject of this study, the femme fatale, is defined as “an attractive and seductive woman, especially one who will ultimately cause distress to a man who becomes involved with her” (OED). Howard and Kopylany (2016) and Simkin (2014) include sexual attractiveness that is used to exercise power over men, while Allen (1984) adds eroticism and exoticism, as well as self-determination and independence, as characteristics of the femme fatale. The Femme fatale is often called a seductress, temptress, sorceress, and compared to such mythological and biblical figures as Circe, Salome, Delilah, Lilith, Medea, Medusa, and Clytemnestra (Luczynska-Holdys, 2013). Without the sexual fatalism attached to the femme fatale, another type, the New Woman—educated, self-supporting, and contestant of dominant sexual morality—emerged as a result of changing socioeconomic conditions in the 19th century, both in the US (Evans, 1997) and in the UK (Stott, 1992).

In the second half of the 19th century, there was a profusion of femme fatales imagery in European literature and art (Bade, 1979). Femme fatale representations in 19th century England ranges from enchantress to muse, the beauty and terror of the female sublime, demons and muses, the vampire in “Laus Veneris,” and so forth, proliferated in the works of Keats, Shelley, Rossetti, and Swinburne, as well as Burne-Jones. It must be noted, however, that the term femme fatale did not appear in England until 1912 in the letter by George Bernard Shaw (Braun, 2012). In art, the femme fatale in Aubrey Beardsley’s illustrations demonstrate de-aesthetized misogynic expressions, exemplified by his illustrations to Salomé by Oscar Wilde (Calloway, 1998).

Femme fatale representations in 19th century France may be traced to the literary works of Balzac who popularized the term fille d’Eve, and animalized, serpentine portrayals of women (Menon, 2006). Maupassant (2004 [1850]) conceptualized another type of femme fatale: non-heterosexual women whose “unnaturalness” drove men to death. In visual art, the femme fatale was a frequently used motif exemplified in the works of Gustav Moreau. In Europe, the 1890s is regarded as the golden age of advertising posters, and the femme fatale was depicted in the works of Toulouse-Lautrec and Alfons Mucha.

In America too, the femme fatale also appeared as a motif of visual art (Prelinger, 2000), literature (Quinn, 2015), and opera (Horowitz, 1994) at the turn-of-the-century. The European influences were evident, however, in terms of motifs and styles. In the visual arts, for instance, Tanner’s (1900) treatment of Salomé illuminates dangerous eroticism, corresponding to that of Moreau. The medieval legend of the knight, flawed hero, Tannhäuser, who fell into the clutches of Dame Venus, not only inspired such European artists as Wagner (1906 [1845]), Swinburne (1866), and Burne-Jones (1873-5) in expressing their conception of femme fatales in different media (i.e., opera, poetry, and oil painting, respectively), but also stimulated American female audiences (Bade, 1979; Horowitz, 1994).
Significance
While there has been ample research on femme fatales in popular culture and literature, very few studies on the representations of femme fatales and the related images in cultural media exist in marketing. Brown, Stevens, and Maclaran (1999) provide the gendered reading of postmodern advertising with a female model, temptress, and derivative of the fin-de-siècle artwork of Mucha. While they discuss its chronological traits as part of postmodernism, their study is not an historical study, however. Witkowski (2004) engages in a visual analysis of American female consumers who exercised consumer agency as female prerogative and responsibility in the mid-19th century. But the focus is the history of gender roles and agency in household consumption. On the other hand, while Scanlon (2013) studies the “new woman,” emphasizing the importance of late 19th century and early 20th century American history, the research is about the contributions of women in advertising agencies, and not the image of those women in the cultural media. Min (2013) also provides historical studies on New Women who were under the influence of Western feminism and advocated free love and marriage, and the elimination of the ideology of feminine chastity. Min’s (2013) study pertains solely 1920s and 1930s Seoul, however.

Methods
This study employs a historical method based on archival research. We rely on images of women on the cover, editorials, and advertisements in Vogue magazine primarily between 1892 and 1900, with additional data published between 1901 and 1907 that capture the remnant influence of the 1890s. At its inception, Vogue was positioned as a social gaze for a Eurocentric elite (David, 2006) and was the arbiter of taste for high society (Scott, 2005). It was published weekly, cost ten cents a copy, and the circulation was about 14,000. The publisher intended Vogue to be the “authentic journal of society, fashion, and the ceremonial side of life” (Kazanjian, 2011, p. 6). We justify the use of Vogue as the data source because fin-de-siècle discourse on woman and femininity—and sexual politics—was closely related to women’s fashion (Steele, 2004). The first editor of Vogue used the magazine’s editorial page as a feminist forum: sex, beauty, and pleasure were the rights of women, and they did not make women weak, or “objects” (Scott, 2005). As our analytical strategy, we employed critical visual and discourse analysis (Rose, 2007; Schroeder, 2006). We observed recurrent types of femmes’ images, following Jung (1961) who derived the concept of archetype based on repeated observation, discovering definite motifs and ideas in myths and fairy tales across cultures. Jung (1963) also used visual images and works of art in the analysis.

Femme Fatale in Vogue
The study proposes an alternative typology of femme fatale archetypes based on representations of femme empowerment and aspirations. Depending on whether the directionality of their empowerment and aspirations is exteriorized or interiorized, and its utilization is pecuniary or sexual, we propose four types of femme fatale: Diana, Venus, Amazon, and Sappho. The typology provides a way to systematically classify femmes fatales’ images through the use of Greek goddess archetypes, a classification in the spirit of America’s Gilded Age cultural aspiration to classicism, in contrast to commonly used Biblical personae whose femme fatale images are frequently portrayed as sexual and evil.

Diana: The Huntress. Sister of Apollo, Diana—or Artemis—was the goddess of hunting and childbirth. In mythology, her encounters with men often entailed the administering of cruel punishments. In New York City, the nude statue Diana the Huntress, raised on top of Madison Square Garden in 1891, marked the highest point on the city’s skyline until 1908 (Tolles, 2009). The first statue incandescently lit in America, she was a much-loved icon of locals. In our data, her empowerment is exteriorized. Her concern is pecuniary. In her reverie, she hunts for fortune, and her suitors are her preys.

Venus: The Seductress. The goddess of erotic love, Venus—or Aphrodite—was the cause of the Trojan War by having Paris abduct Helen, as a bribe to win the “beauty contest.” Her ego subsequently brought much destruction, dismay, and distraught to males. In our data, she resembles a Giorgionesque, secular, healthy and sensual goddess. Or, she may be a “nineteenth century siren”; she uses sexual allure to control men. Her aspiration is interiorized. She can be a “Gibson Girl,” a hybrid of elaborately feminine and annoyingly “mannish”. She is dangerous to her unsuspicuous male prey and her female rivals (Banta, 1987; Scott, 2005).
Amazon: The Warrior. Aspiration is exteriorized. Her sexuality is unbounded. She is one of the “American Girls” who is aspirational but, unlike New Women, is not intellectual (Scott, 2005). In the late 19th century, women who rode horseback were often referred to as “Amazons,” a term which was also applied to courtesans and women thought to be lesbians (Steele, 2004). Thus, while the riding habit was regarded as aristocratic and hence prestigious, it was also perceived as highly erotic, and concurrently, transgressive and masculine. Women riding on bicycles may be classified equally. The sinister smile of the woman in the art nouveau bicycle advertisement, reminiscent of a “Beardsley Woman,” is suggestive of her diabolic reveries.

Sappho: The Self-Reliant. Hailed by Plato as “the tenth Muse,” the earliest female writer in the West, Sappho and her fellow women of Lesbos enjoyed a freedom and an opportunity for education and a career. Their contemporary male counterparts regarded them as “unnatural.” The representation of femme fatales as femme nouvelle was a reflection of male anxiety about women’s changing roles in society. The fin-de-siècle fashion industry, as well as feminism’s founders, was co-opting feminism for profit (Scott, 2005).

References
Tanner, H.O. (1900), Salome, Smithsonian American Art Museum, Washington, D.C.
Conservation and Consumerism: Commercialising the National Trust in the 1960s

Sean Nixon
Department of Sociology, University of Essex, UK

Formed in 1895 with the aim of permanently preserving for the nation land and properties of beauty or historic interest, by the 1960s the National Trust for England, Wales and Northern Ireland (NT) was a well-known institution in British public life, with its central focus the preservation and protection of the English country house. Propelled by the growth of its membership, which more than doubled in the twenty years after the War, and the swelling of visitor numbers to its properties, the NT was forced to confront a number of pressing questions in the 1960s: Should it continue to be run by the largely voluntary effort of a committed but amateur leadership and staff? Should it become a more democratic, participatory mass organization? Where should the balance lie in its focus upon the preservation of country houses and the demands for greater public access? Should the Trust be guided by – to paraphrase one of its critics – the principle of protecting the countryside and coast from the public or for it? These questions and the divisions within the Trust which animated them propelled the NT into conducting a review into how it was run led by Sir Henry Benson, an eminent chartered accountant. The advisory committee that he chaired and its subsequent report to the National Trust’s Council set out significant changes to the governance of the Trust, including the relationship between its ruling council, its executive, full-time officials and members. The Benson reforms also sought to gently commercialize the Trust, expanding its use of public relations and seeking to offer visitors to its properties new consumer-orientated services. In doing so, the NT aimed to accommodate itself to the demands of an increasingly affluent society and to ensure that conservation was tailored to fit the practices of consumerism and the post-war ‘leisure society’.

In exploring these developments, the paper draws on but partly seeks to revise recent research on environmental and conservation organizations. This research has been important in drawing attention to the growing size and significance of these groups and the role they play in giving voice to environmental and conservation concerns. It has usefully placed their long history within a broader understanding of the changing forms of voluntary and non-governmental action and associational and political life. In exploring the success of these groups, the secondary literature has drawn attention to the increasing professionalization and business-like orientation of the whole NGO sector. This is evident in the expansion of full-time salaried staff (as opposed to voluntary staff) within these groups, the development of a career structure within and across the NGO sector, the rationalization and formalization of administrative and managerial structures and the adoption of publicity and promotional techniques drawn from private business. As Hilton et al have shown NGOs in the aid and development sector like Oxfam and those in the housing and anti-poverty field like Shelter pioneered this move towards a more sophisticated approach to marketing and PR through the 1950s and 1960s. In doing so, Hilton et al contend, they stimulated other NGOs to follow suit. This leads them to suggest that the post-war professionalization of NGO activity, particularly in relation to publicity, was shaped by the way NGOs learnt from each other as much as they aped the commercial sector or were transformed by the inexorable process of professionalization.

In the account that follows, I draw on these broad arguments about the professionalization of NGOs in order to explain the transformation of the NT from the mid-1960s. I make extensive use of the National Trust’s archives, including the submission of evidence to the Benson Report and the correspondence Sir Henry had within his fellow committee members. I use this evidence to show how the organizational changes that the Trust underwent following the Benson Report fit squarely into the professionalization thesis. This includes the way Henry Benson’s reforms recommended that the NT expand its use of public relations and grow its commercial activities. Through these reforms Benson sought to turn the NT into a consumer-orientated enterprise. However, understanding the processes that led up to the Benson Report and the ways in which it helped to reshape the Trust also requires that we revise the general account of organizational changed proposed by authors like Hilton et al. In their
account it is the rising tide of professionalization which ultimately floats all organizational boats, including those in the voluntary and charity sector. Such an understanding tends to bracket-off any attention to the social changes specific to the immediate post-war decades that might have provided the catalyst for change. Evidence from the NT archive and government reports into leisure in the 1960s leads me to argue that the pressure for change within the NT was precisely triggered by broader sociological changes. I use this to account for why the National Trust changed when it did. Central here were the effects of growing popular affluence, greater leisure time and mobility. These not only helped to draw more visitors seeking a pleasant day out in scenic surroundings to the Trust’s properties, but also had broader cultural effects. Mass affluence was part of a reorganisation of social hierarchies in the post-war period which challenged established social elites, including aristocratic privilege. As historians and sociologists have shown, upper-class authority was eroded by the democratising impulses of not only the post-war Labour government and its social democratic reforms but also by popular affluence and trends within commercial culture which gave more weight to popular tastes and aspirations. The National Trust, given its patrician leadership, was challenged by these democratising trends and commercial innovations and by the wider climate of cultural modernization. It was this set of cultural and social developments, rather than simply the inevitable logic of professionalization, which provided the conditions in which the Trust was impelled to reinvent itself and modernize and commercialize its ways of working.

Indicative Bibliography
On the Road with Disney: Standard Oil, Advertising, and the 1939 Golden Gate Exposition

Susan Ohmer
Department of Film, Television and Theatre, University of Notre Dame, Notre Dame, USA

Advertising historians are familiar with the many ways that travel around the U.S. has been promoted. Marketers have taken advantage of the physical movement involved in advertising to promote products, as with the Burma Shave signs that populated roadides during the 1930s and that revealed their meaning as one drove by them. The activity of travel itself has been a prominent feature of advertising campaigns in, for example, ads for railroad travel during the 19th century. Advertising has marketed both the process of travel itself and the destinations one could reach by engaging in this activity. Advertising campaigns have also changed Americans’ ideas about leisure, space, and national identity.

This presentation will present a case study of a collaboration between The Walt Disney Studio, the leading animation producer in the United States during the 1930s, and Standard Oil of California, one of the many divisions of the industrial giant founded by John D. Rockefeller in the late 1880s. In the spring of 1939, Standard Oil of California hired the Walt Disney Studio to develop a national marketing campaign to promote travel to the Golden Gate International Exposition in San Francisco. Standard Oil had conducted sophisticated marketing campaigns for its products and service stations since the early 20th century and this alliance with Disney linked the organization to a firm with broad popular appeal to both adults and children.

For the promotion, the studio created ads featuring well-known Disney characters that drove across the country to attend the exposition, stopping at Standard Oil stations along the way. On their journey to California, Mickey, Donald, Goofy, Snow White and the seven dwarfs stopped at historic U.S. landmarks and national parks, from Puget Sound to the Grand Canyon and Yosemite. The advertising campaign appeared as four-page color sections in daily newspapers and children were encouraged to follow the Disney characters by tracking them across a large map of the United States. They could also collect coupons from Disney comic books that they could paste onto the map. This advertising campaign unfolded for over five months in newspapers, comic books, a promotional film Standard on Parade, and in Standard Oil’s own corporate publications. In the course of this promotion, well-known Disney characters became tourists on a journey around the U.S., a journey in which they visited Standard Oil service stations at every step.

Scholars have analyzed Disney’s construction of tourism in Saludos Amigos and The Three Caballeros, films the studio produced as part of the “Good Neighbor” project for Nelson Rockefeller’s Office of Inter-American Affairs. The Standard Oil campaign demonstrates, however, that even before Disney characters became tourists in South America, they toured the United States. This Standard Oil campaign imagines historic monuments and natural attractions as part of a journey through America that Standard Oil could facilitate and mediate through its network of service stations. The Standard Oil promotion developed a car culture for U.S. children who would go on to become the adult drivers of the 1950s and mapped U.S. history and geography as destinations for family leisure fifteen years before the opening of Disneyland.

This presentation draws on methods from cultural geography, critical studies of the west in fiction and film, and studies of car culture and world’s fairs to understand the development and significance of the Disney-Standard Oil collaboration. My talk will include slides of ads, the treasure map, comic books and other artifacts that have been collected over several years. Only a few items from this campaign exist in archives; I have collected these artifacts over the last several years. Thus, the presentation offers material unavailable anywhere else that can shed light on Standard Oil’s promotion of car culture and leisure in the U.S.


The US Battle against Brand Marketing: circa 1929-1980

Ross D. Petty
Division of Accounting and Law, Babson College, Babson Park, U.S.A.

Extended Abstract
In response to the rise of brand marketing in the latter 1800s and first quarter of the 20th century, the United States experienced an anti-brand marketing movement that lasted half a century. The first stage of this movement was a public part of the consumer movement but is often overshadowed by the product safety and truth-in-advertising focus of the broader movement. The consumer movement stalled when the U.S. entered World War II, but brand marketing continued to raise questions as the U.S. government exercised control over goods and materials production during the war. Pent-up demand for branded goods left most consumers with little interest in questioning brand marketing after the war. For this reason postwar brand marketing critiques were largely confined to academic writings and activities within regulatory agencies during the second stage of the anti-brand marketing movement. Ultimately, many of the stage two challenges to brand marketing went nowhere but a few led to regulations that are still in effect today.

This paper examines both primary and secondary historical sources in addition to legal authorities such as statutes, regulations, and court decisions to be the first paper to suggest this two stage “Battle against Brand Marketing.” The first stage started with the 1927 publication of *Your Money’s Worth: A Study in the Waste of Consumer’s Dollars* by Chase and Schlink (1927) which offered a five point critique of brand marketing. First, they denounce the growth of substantially identical brands “without limit so long as advertising pressure is capable of creating demand” in part to satisfy the desire of each marketing agent to have its own exclusive brand. Second, they bemoan the technical complexity of many modern products and note that brand advertising tends to make even simple products appear too complex for the ordinary consumer to understand. Third, brand advertising surrounds simple products with a “halo of characteristics” that don’t exist or don’t contribute to product performance but nevertheless sound important. Fourth, they argue brands are no guarantee of consistent quality because brand marketers are free to change and often do change their formulae and product characteristics. They specifically note that new brands of cigarettes decrease their quality after becoming well accepted by consumers. Fifth and finally, brand packaging thwarts consumer analysis by weights and measures so that some branded products are priced dramatically higher for any given quantity than their unbranded alternatives. Attractive packaging and “shining up the article” also can be used to enhance an offering’s purchase appeal by distracting focus from the actual product itself (Chase and Schlink, 1927, p. 17). They proposed regulation to require advertisers to have scientific evidence to support advertising claims and to standardize products with certified levels of quality so that standardized language would be used to discuss product attributes and performance as well as the quantity provided.

The Food and Drug Administration and the Federal Trade Commission were both active during this period in policing misleading product names that deceived consumers about ingredients or attributes of goods using such names. In 1938, statutory amendments further allowed the Food and Drug Administration to enact identity and quality standards for foods and the Federal Trade Commission to pursue factually misleading advertising without proving injury to competition. However, brand marketers defeated provisions that would have regulated emotionally appealing image advertising that was a common tactic of brand marketing at this time. Such tactics were (and still are) considered too vague to communicate factual claims to consumers and therefore are allowable “puffery” (Stole, 2006). After the war and despite opposition from the Department of Justice, a new Trademark statute was passed that was predominantly pro-brand marketing. A Congressional report on the new bill argued that brand marketing was the essence of competition. While some economists argued that brand marketing raised advertising costs creating a barrier to new entry thereby reducing competition, others responded that promoting a brand identity lowered consumer search costs. By being able to readily identify a product source by the brand identity, consumers could easily find products they wanted or avoid products they did not want. A couple of popular books also peripherally criticized brand marketing (Galbraith,
In addition to this largely academic debate, a number of government initiatives to regulate brand marketing moved forward in stage two.

The broadest initiative involved requiring marketers to not only avoid misleading product names but also require disclosure of accurate product identity information. This occurred in the five “F”s industries: food (Chen, 1992), fine jewelry, furs, fabrics and pharmaceuticals. A related program involved the standardized measurement and disclosure of information to allow consumers to pursue energy conservation. These programs included gas mileage measures for automobiles, “R-values” for home insulation and energy usage for various home appliances. These programs are still in effect today.

Other brand marketing regulatory initiatives were less enduring. In the 1960s, the FTC pursued two brand-driven acquisitions, ordering divestiture of the newly acquired brand for fear that it would become more market dominating due to brand marketing advantages from the acquirer such as advertising quantity discounts and effective access to distribution channels. In the following decade, the FTC pursued two cases involving alleged anticompetitive introductions of new brands. Ultimately both cases were dismissed. The FTC also pursued two market dominating brands for allegedly becoming generic: REALEMON and FORMICA (Ball, 1978). Again, neither initiative resulted in any restrictions on brand marketing. By the early 1980s, the FTC under President Reagan no longer regarded brand marketing as something that needed regulation (outside of its information disclosure programs) and accepted the prevailing view that brand marketing was just another form of rigorous, pro-consumer competition.

In conclusion, this paper proposes the recognition of a two stage “Battle against Brand Marketing” in the United States. The first stage was public as part of the 1930s consumer movement that ended in two significant statutory amendments in 1938. This paper suggests that stage one continued through World War II when some brand marketers opposed challenges to brand marketing during the war. After the war, brand marketing was largely embraced, despite occasional popular books with peripheral critiques of brand marketing and economist studies on advertising as a possible barrier to market entry. The post war stage two of the Battle occurred largely inside regulatory agencies. While some of the information disclosure programs to correct deficiencies of brand marketing continue today, the other initiatives from the 1960s and 1970s are now recognized only as historical curiosities that support this paper’s thesis that the anti-brand marketing movement lasted much longer than previously recognized.

Selected References
The Founding Five: Advertising Women of New York

Krystl Raven  
*University of Saskatchewan, Saskatoon, Canada*

Jeanie Wills  
*University of Saskatchewan, Graham School of Professional Development Saskatoon, Canada*

**Purpose**

This paper utilizes a biographical and leadership lens to examine the history of the founding presidents of the League of Advertising Women (New York), instituted in 1912. This approach highlights the women’s attitudes toward leadership in the creation and foundation of a club, which at its heart, was a feminist collaboration. These women organized and united women to bring social change through education and increased employment and career opportunities within the advertising world. These first presidents, Claudia Quigley Murphy, Ida Clarke, Jane J. Martin, Helen M. Hill and Minna Hall Simmons Carothers were outstanding women in their profession who employed their success and innate leadership skills to form a club which actively aimed to improve the situation of women through networking, education, and employment.

**Design/Methodology/Approach**

This paper uses a number of archival sources from the Schlesinger Library Radcliffe Archives as well as published sources created by the women themselves. These sources help to develop a biographical sketch of the five women. Next the argument will call on leadership theories to demonstrate that the style of leadership the women exerted helped establish an innate feminist vision for the direction of the League.

**Findings**

All five of the founding presidents of the League helped shape the direction of the organization to establish and entrench the right of women to claim expertise in the field of advertising and helped members to gain reputations for competence, mastery of the various elements of advertising, and professionalism. The founding presidents created educational opportunities for other women to join the field and helped spark the creations of similar organizations within North America and established an international network of women in advertising.

**Originality/Value**

Juliann Sivulka’s 2009 *Ad Women* highlights the entrance of women into the advertising world including cursory introductions to several women, including Jane J. Martin. This paper will expand on this overview of historical women to gain a greater understanding of not only these women’s lives but also of their influence within the League and profession.

**Introduction**

In the late 19th and early 20th centuries, before women in America could vote, women entered the work force and the advertising industry creating space for themselves, as both copywriters and advertising managers for several decades. Unlike the men, they had no formal professional organization. The women from New York were refused participation in the men’s club, so a handful of these women created their own space, the League of Advertising Women in 1912. What began with an idea from Christine Frederick and her husband J. George Frederick, managing editor of Printer’s Ink, turned into an organization that has maintained its influence and membership to modern day.
The first board members, and specifically the presidents of the club, helped set the tone of the League. Their leadership and organizational talents guided the board of directors and membership into the creation of a League which aimed to “improve the level of taste, ethics and knowledge throughout the communications industry by example, education and dissemination of information” (League of Advertising Women, 1912). The League’s purpose, to provide professional development and fellowship, also advanced the lives of women. In essence, the New York club became a feminist collaboration. According to leadership scholars Joy Rice and Asuncion Austria, “Collaboration is said to be a hallmark of a feminist process” (Rice and Austria, 2007, p. 157). This paper provides a biographical discussion and examination of the leadership styles and accomplishments of the founding presidents of the Women’s Advertising League of New York who held groundbreaking positions within their profession and in the creation of the League. Historians discussing women in advertising in these early years have acknowledged their entrance into the profession, as well as the changes brought about by women entering the workforce, and have also noted the growth of professional clubs. This paper builds on that scholarship to examine the contributions of individual women to the professional club initiatives.

The Founding Presidents

Claudia Quigley Murphy began her membership with the League of Advertising Women (AWNY) at its first meeting. Born in Michigan, and a successful businesswoman in the advertising world acting as Advertising Manager of the Alabastine Company, based out of Grand Rapids, MI., Murphy created her own legacy within public relations and was one of the first females to hold public relations positions in the industry. She would continue to create an impressive career for herself, specializing in home economics, and publishing advertising literature in the field such as her book on table settings for the Gorham Company.

Ida Clarke also began her membership in the League from the first meeting, acting as secretary and then elected president in 1913 while she was Advertising Manager at Scott & Bowne, makers of Scott’s Emulsion. Clarke created a long-lasting career at the company, remaining for thirty-nine years and earning a large salary for a woman. Her legacy within the League included the creating of programs that invited speakers of prominence, such as Frank Crowninshield, to the League’s annual March Party.

Jane J. Martin has garnered the most interest from historians such as Ad Women (Sivulka, 2008). Martin created a career that was discussed not only within the advertising world but also gained interest from the public. She, like her predecessors, was a member from the beginning of the League and was president for the longest period: 1915-1922. Martin also represented the League at many events worldwide. She was not only respected within the League, advertising women across the nation elected her to be the first woman on the executive board of the A.A.C. of W. Jane’s successful career resulted in a large income working her way from $10 a week to a career that earned $10,000 a year.

Helen M. Hill was working in sales promotion work for the Gravure Service Corp. at the time of being elected as president of the League. She helped launch several important projects with the League including the “Buy Advertised Goods” campaign that aimed to establish women as creators of advertising of consumer goods. Helen also represented the League at the Good Will Campaign that sponsored women’s travel to France in 1923.

Minna Hall Simmons Carothers, like three of the previous presidents, was a long-term member of the League, attending the first meeting and beginning membership shortly after. At the time of being elected president Minna was self-employed as the owner of the Minna Hall Simmons Service and boasted experience in all branches of advertising. Minna was a published author, with a chapter in George French’s 20th Century Advertising which was published in her last year as president. Minna like Jane and Helen also represented the club overseas, and was elected as president of the Federation of Women’s Advertising Clubs of the World.

Contribution To Theory

Despite the sparse attention to advertising women and their organizations at the turn of the 20th century, these women provide great insight into feminist collaboration. By focusing on these women, who created an organization outside of the typical suffragist storyline, historians can claim a deeper understanding of female-led advocacy in this period.

The five women under discussion created several avenues for women to find careers in advertising. Their situating of women as the experts on consumer goods helped create space within the advertising
industry for women. The “Buy Advertised Goods” campaign, created and designed by the League, was aimed to the advertising industry to situate women as the best experts for advertising consumer goods. These groundbreaking campaigns of the League were set not only to increase the League’s esteem but also to create awareness and establish appreciation for women’s expertise with the men and businesses in the industry.

The League also created a series of scholarships establishing educational funds for women. These scholarships, established at the end of Minna Hall Simmons Carothers’ reign as president, are a legacy that still exists providing opportunities to generations of women. These scholarships allowed women to attend New York University, Columbia University, Pace University or other recognized institutes to gain an education in advertising.

The League utilized the travel of members, primarily the founding presidents, to create connections with other women in advertising and other organizations. The elections of members such as Jane Martin and Minna Hall Simmons Carothers to national positions allowed the club’s members to create relationships, visualize the promotion of women on a national scale, and aid the execution of national movements. For example, it was under the leadership of Jane Martin and the League that the International Advertising Association voted to include women on the executive committee. As well the ability to experience advertising abroad and transmit this information to the members of the League would provide the membership an added educational edge in the industry.

These three main League activities organized by the founding presidents showcases the processes of feminist collaboration. These women were not just successful advertising women but helped form and create a feminist movement within the industry with the creation of the League. Exploring these women’s biographies provides insight into the women themselves, women’s roles in advertising, and the role of advertising clubs in this time-period.

References
League of Advertising Women, 1912. "Statement of Purpose", AWNY, 86 216 Carton 2, Schlesinger Library- Radcliffe Institute, Harvard University, Cambridge, MA.


Historical Analysis of the Evolution of Political Marketing in the United States

Minita Sanghvi
Skidmore College, Saratoga Springs, NY, USA

Abstract
Purpose - The purpose of this paper is to provide a comprehensive historical analysis of the evolution of political marketing in the United States. In doing so, we address the discrepancies in the narratives of leading scholars in the field and suggest an alternative chronicle of the evolution of political marketing.

Design/methodology/approach - This paper uses an interpretivist approach studying past texts and thinking to produce a more cogent narrative that allows for further research and reflection on the subject.

Research limitations/implications – This paper represents a starting point in a body of research needed to ruminate on the genesis of political marketing.

Key Words - History, American, Political Marketing, Evolution

Paper Type - General Review

Historical Analysis of the Evolution of Political Marketing in the United States
Political marketing is a broad and burgeoning field in the United States and across the world, fueled by the widespread use of marketing, advertising, and branding concepts in campaigns by candidates, political parties, or Political Action Committees (PACs or Super PACs) (Henneberg and O'Shaughnessy, 2009; Milewicz and Milewicz, 2014; O'Shaughnessy, 1990; Scammell, 1999). Over the years, political marketing has continued to grow its presence in American politics and consequently the field of marketing research (Guzmán and Sierra, 2009; Maarek, 2011; Newman, 1999; Sanghvi and Hodges, 2015).

However, as the field grows rapidly, it is important to take a step back and examine the genesis or the origins of the field. While several researchers have discussed the origins of the field (Maarek, 2011; Lee-Marshment, 2009; O'Shaughnessy, 1990), there are large inconsistencies with their narratives and timelines. To develop a better understanding of the genesis of the field of political marketing, we undertake a historical analysis of its evolution.

Birth and Evolution of the Academic Field of Political Marketing
While the term “political marketing” was first used by Kelley (1956) in his book Professional Public Relations and Political Power, it was actually White’s (1962) analysis of John F. Kennedy’s narrow win in the 1960 election in The Making of the President that provided an intellectual foundation for the field of political marketing (Wring, 1999). Additionally, McGinniss’s (1969) examination of Nixon’s political marketing in The Selling of the President fueled a burgeoning interest in the field. The publication of both books coincided with Kotler and Levy’s (1969) seminal article titled, “Broadening the Concept of Marketing,” which posited that marketing was to provide for and fulfill human needs, and therefore is...
applicable to various organizations such as museums and churches, as well as issues, such as politics (Kotler and Levy, 1969). Around the same time, researchers in political communications and political science began discussing the application of marketing concepts to political campaigns. These developments lead to the combination of research from political science, communication, and marketing that would ultimately create the academic field of political marketing.

However, the birth of political marketing predates the interest in studying how marketing is used to influence political campaigns. Several authors have described the birth of political marketing yet many have varied opinions regarding the actual genesis of the subject matter. In the next segment we trace the origins of political marketing as explained by some of the scholars in the field.

In his book, *Campaign Communication and Political Marketing*, in the first chapter titled “Birth and rise of political marketing in the United States,” Maarek (2011) discusses the birth of the field, the reasons for its growth and even explicates the main stages of the evolution process of political marketing in the United States. Maarek identifies three stages in the genesis of political marketing:

1. **Infancy (1952-1960):** President Eisenhower’s campaign marked the start of political marketing.
2. **Adolescence (1964-1976):** An increased complexity and more refined methods for television audiences.
3. **Adulthood (1980 onwards):** Globalized exportation of political marketing

Here he clearly situates the birth of political marketing to a specific timeline. Maarek (2011) writes, “The 1952 presidential election marks the start of modern political marketing in the United States. For the first time, the two main parties earmarked a special budget for political communication.” To Maarek (2011), the Republican Party’s allocation of funds specifically designated for political communication along with enlisting the services of a public relations firm sparked the transformation into what campaigns look like today.

Thus, according to Maarek’s (2011) the birth of modern political marketing is based on having a specific budget allotted to political communication and using it in advertisements in which the candidate is marketed to the public. However, Lees-Marshment (2009) argues that political marketing is not about political ads, political communication, nor about campaigns. Instead she suggests political marketing is about designing the political product, how it relates to political parties and what it offers to the public. Based on Lees-Marshment’s scope of political marketing, one can determine that Maarek’s (2011) stages may not necessarily be the start of political marketing.

One of the first papers in political marketing written by Kotler (1975) goes to depict the parallels between marketing products and services and the marketing of political candidates, wherein he writes, “The very essence of a candidate’s interface with the voters is a marketing one” (Kotler, 1975, p. 1). Over the years many researchers such as Scammell (1999), and Butler and Collins (1999) have expounded on issues regarding the new political marketing discipline and elaborated on how the “marriage” of politics and marketing may work (Lees-Marshment, 2009, p. 26). In a review of the political marketing field, O’Shaughnessy (1990) breaks the term “political marketing” down into several dimensions. The first being a mechanical level and based primarily on methods and applications. The second is more abstract, focusing on how political marketing reaches the mind of the consumer, allowing the candidate to become a reflection of what the consumer seeks (O’Shaughnessy, 1990). According to O’Shaughnessy (1990) the essence of marketing is reciprocity. That is, consumers are not passive objects and the exchange process is interactive (O’Shaughnessy, 1990).

Working from the definition of exchange theory, Lock and Harris (1996) provide a definition of political marketing as “the study of the processes of exchanges between political entities and their environment and among themselves, with particular reference to the positioning of those entities and their communications” (Lock and Harris, 1996, p. 21). However, by 2009 another definition emerges, proposed by Hughes and Dann (2009) based on the changes in the 2007 American Marketing Association’s (AMA) definition of marketing, which altered the definition to more fully encapsulate the contemporary business and non-business aspects of marketing. Hughes and Dann (2009) define political marketing as “a set of activities, processes or political institutions used by political organizations, candidates and individuals to create, communicate, deliver and exchange promises of value with voter-consumers, political party stakeholders and society at large” (Hughes and Dann, 2009, p. 244).

Based on these definitions, one can assume that the birth of political marketing can be traced back to beginnings much farther back than 1952. In fact, a simple analysis of the history of campaigning in America showcases how marketing strategies have been employed, whether consciously or unconsciously, by candidates and their campaigns since the earliest elections.
Historical Analysis of Political Marketing in United States

In the first decades after the United States gained its independence, political participation was generally limited to property-owning white men. When George Washington was elected for his second term in 1789, only six percent of the American population could vote. In the next decades as free white immigrants to become naturalized citizens, voting rights were expanded, yet the American elite class continued to dominate politics. Given that political candidates did not have to appeal to women, minorities, and many poor whites (as literacy tests were still employed), candidates were expected to be modest and unambitious, as was George Washington.

It was the Founders’ philosophy that “popular campaigning was not only dangerous, it was improper, illegitimate, and unnecessary” (Troy, 1996). Ergo, in the 1800 presidential election between John Adams and Thomas Jefferson, both candidates spent the election campaign on their farms, waiting anxiously for the American elite to make its choice. Though Adams and Jefferson were confined to their homes, associates of their party were not so passive. “One Republican leader bragged to Jefferson that he and his allies had ‘literally sprinkled Georgia and North Carolina from the mountains to the sea’ with pamphlets” (Perloff, 1999, p. 21). Considering Lees-Marshalment’s conception of political marketing, Jefferson’s campaign, or party associates, were clearly pushing their ‘product’ using pamphlets. In contrast to presidential elections, campaigns for congressional and state offices were very much a part of American politics all the way back to elections for the House of Burgesses (Pogue, 2011). Posters, handbills, pamphlets, and speeches at public gatherings such as cockfights or barbeques were commonplace during elections for candidates except the presidential ones (Perloff, 1999; Sanghvi, 2014). Furthermore, the act of Jefferson and Adam not leaving home was the kind of campaigning the public expected from their presidential candidates during this period. Thus, allowing their associates to run the campaign did not mean that political marketing was not being employed in this campaign.

In fact, based on Hughes and Dann’s (2009) definition, the fact that there were a set of processes and activities used by individual candidates for local elections or political parties such as the Federalists and the Democratic-Republican party in support of their candidate “to create, communicate, deliver and exchange promises of value with voter-consumers, political party stakeholders and society at large” (Hughes and Dann, 2009, p. 244) showcases how political marketing can indeed be seen at its earliest in the United States long before 1952.

Conclusion

Although the contemporary political campaign, and political life in general, may seem unrecognizable to that of the 18th century, campaigns have always been about marketing. Initially, candidates only had to market themselves to the American elite. As reforms expanded suffrage, transformed the power of political parties, and new technology enabled candidates to reach voters over novel mediums, the means of political marketing certainly changed; however, the nature of political marketing has remained consistent.

References


Kelley, S., Jr. (1956), Professional public relations and political power, Johns Hopkins University Press, Baltimore, MD.


Making a Market for Mexican Food in Australia

John Sinclair

School of Historical and Philosophical Studies, The University of Melbourne, Australia.

Barry Carr

Institute of Latin American Studies, La Trobe University, Australia.

Research purpose

Given that there is no geographical contiguity, historical connection, or cultural proximity between Australia and Mexico, how are we to account for the remarkable proliferation of Mexican and more vaguely Mexican-style restaurants and tequila bars in contemporary urban Australia, or the now mundane availability of tortillas, salsas and other essential ingredients in supermarkets? Australia is scarcely unique in experiencing such Mexicanization: it is a phenomenon of globalization, but this presentation will trace how the particularities of direct cultural contact, interpersonal networks, and grass-roots entrepreneurism can open up new markets, and how the ground is thus prepared for subsequent large-scale international corporate entry to those markets.

In the burgeoning literature on the concept of cultural globalisation, it has become helpful to distinguish between globalisation “from below”, the agency of grass-roots movements, subcultural groups, and individuals; and globalisation “from above”, that is, the effect of institutions such as global corporations (Falk 1997). Thus, while the arrival of food manufacturing and liquor marketing corporations might account for the appearance of branded tortilla packs in supermarkets and new varieties of tequila in bars, the trend also needs to be seen in conjunction with the transnational social forces which serve to form a potential market for such products, notably migration, travel, and student exchange. This presentation will show how both individuals and corporations have played their roles in establishing a market for Mexican food in Australia. In the initial stage, over the 1960s and 1970s, the individuals were characteristically immigrant entrepreneurs, long recognised in “modernisation” literature as agents of social change. The second stage has been driven more by corporate activities which have fostered a mass market, but without ever displacing individuals, who continue to form the leading edge of the market, buoyed up by a subcultural quest for “authenticity” amongst more cosmopolitan consumers, notably travel-experienced “hipsters” (Schiermer 2104). Recent social theorists point to the significance now assumed by cultural factors such as lifestyle and aesthetics in contemporary consumption, and the expression of personal identity through consumption choices (du Gay and Prike 2002). In this perspective, images matter: however ill-founded they may be in reality, the mystique and associations carried by commonly-circulating images, ideas and stereotypes about Latin America in general and Mexico in particular become a material force in the formation of markets for “Mexican” food and drink.

Perhaps the most striking theme to emerge from the historical analysis to be presented is the relative absence of Mexicans, or even Mexico-experienced Australians, in the making of a market for Mexican food and drink in Australia. Rather, in the initial stage, Americans were prominent, both as entrepreneurs and in forming a market, while in later decades, entrepreneurs and consumers alike have been Australians whose experience of Mexican food has been formed in the United States, not Mexico. Whereas Mexican cultural influence in the U.S. is readily attributable to immigration from Mexico (and Mexico’s prior occupation of the western and southwestern U.S.), comparable “ethnic” influences in Australia have come instead from quite different immigration source countries in Europe, the Middle East or Asia: Greek, Lebanese, Turkish, Chinese, Indian, Vietnamese, for example, all of whose restaurants and food cultures have flourished. Yet while the volume of Latin American immigrants to Australia has increased since the end of the 1990s, all people of Latin American origin still now amount to less than half a percent (0.05%) of the total population, and Mexicans are amongst the least of them (del Rio 2014).

While immigration cannot account for the vogue in Australia for consuming Mexican food and drink, in recent decades there has been increased personal movement and contact between
Australia and Latin America, notably for tourism and education. As the age of mass tourism has matured, Australians in their late teens, 20s and 30s especially, have been looking to destinations other than the traditional Europe and Asia. Coming in the other direction, in the case of education, there has been an appreciable increase in the number of visas issued to students from Latin America (Burgess 2014). While the number of Mexican and even all other Latin American students is too small to provide the major clientele for the very many Mexican restaurants and bars in Australian cities, travel by young adults who are a major driver of the vogue for things Mexican and more broadly “Latino”, appears to be a significant factor, both in motivating entrepreneurs and in creating a market for them. However, the presentation will argue that it is not so much Mexico itself, or even Latin America, but the “Latinised U.S.” (Ramos and Segal 2004), or what some Mexican-Americans have called “Greater Mexico”, which inhabits the cultural imagination of many Australians, particularly those in their 20s and 30s, in matters of food, drink and other cultural consumption.

Australia has a special place in the history of the globalisation of Mexican food, according to Jeffrey Pilcher’s Planet Taco: A Global History of Mexican Food. Taco Bill, a restaurant opened on the subtropical Gold Coast in 1967 by Bill Chilcote, who had come from California to embrace the surfing subculture of northern Australia, is believed to be “the granddaddy” of Mexican-style restaurants established outside the U.S. (Pilcher 2012, 166). Chilcote imported a tortilla-making machine, and engaged in various local promotional activities to introduce his “Tex-Mex” style of food to locals. However, he soon found that the most enthusiastic clientele was amongst expatriate Americans around the country who sought him out, including the U.S. embassy, which he would supply via airfreight to distant Canberra. The large number of secondary school teachers which some state governments recruited from the U.S. in the late 1960s and early 1970s also played a significant role (Chilcote 2006). As in subsequently developed international markets, American personnel in Australia played a crucial intermediating role in building demand for Mexican food, but with the significant qualification that the food culture being imported was “not so much Mexican American as American Mexican”, thus constituting “an entirely new dimension to the concept of cultural imperialism” (Pilcher 2012, 166-167).

Taco Bill’s initial monopoly on the manufacture of tortillas enabled him to develop, in a very casual way, a number of franchised restaurants down the eastern states, but a significant challenge was to come from John Bergbauer, an Australian entrepreneur who, without ever having visited Mexico, began importing tortillas and a range of other ingredients from the U.S. in the 1980s (Bergbauer 2014). Again, Taco Bill’s own Australian franchisees and former staff branched out to establish their own stand-alone restaurants, such as Mexicali Rose in Melbourne (Stevens 2016). By the turn of the century, a new phase was emerging, with Mexicans entering the field, such as restaurateur Arturo Morales and the entrepreneurs behind artesan tortilla manufacturers El Cielo and La Tortillería in Melbourne. More characteristic of this phase, however, has been the arrival of the Mexican multinational Mission Foods (Gruma Corporation) in the large-scale manufacture and distribution of Mexican foods. Similarly, while Australian companies such as Mad Mex and Zambrero have established successful national franchise operations in the past decade, more symptomatic of this global era is Gomez y Guzman, a chain of franchised and company-owned Mexican restaurants being strategically developed not only in Australia, but across Asia, owned by a consortium of private investors, including former McDonald’s Australia executives Peter Ritchie and Guy Russo (Kitney, 2014).

Source material

The presentation is based on a number of primary sources gathered in field research, notably interviews with the late Bill Chilcote and the present owner of the Taco Bill franchise, Stan Teschke, undertaken in 2006. Other primary sources are more recent interviews with importer John Bergbauer, and restaurateurs Arturo Morales and Tom Stevens. Secondary sources in relevant historical, sociological and cultural studies are as specified below.

Sample references

Bergbauer, John. 2014. Interview with Barry Carr and John Sinclair, Melbourne, 7 November.
Chilcote, Bill. 2006. Interview with John Sinclair, Melbourne, 22 November.


Kitney, Damon. 2014. “McDonald’s old boys beef up the burrito”, The Australian, 11 August.

Morales, Arturo. 2014. Interview with Barry Carr and John Sinclair, Melbourne, 6 November.


Stevens, Tom. 2016. Interview with John Sinclair, Geelong, 16 February.

Teschke, Stan. 2006. Interview with John Sinclair, Melbourne, 16 November.
William Lever: Marketing Pioneer

Jeannette Strickland
Department of History, University of Liverpool, UK

Mark Twain said that there is no such thing as an original idea, merely new twists and combinations. The vast corpus of published work on the history and development of advertising and marketing could be seen to lend credence to the view that there is nothing new in the world of advertising. From early works such as Smith’s guide to advertising (1863) and Sampson’s history (1874), the field now encompasses a wide range of themes including imperialism and colonialism (McClintock, 1995); domesticity and cleanliness in advertisements (Loeb, 1994); the psychology of advertising (Dill Scott, 1909; Packard, 1957); advertising as an element of the commodity culture (Blaszczyk, 2002; Richards, 1990); and the links between advertising and mass production (Church and Clark, 2001; Laird 1998).

Whilst William Lever features in many of these works his role as an advertiser and marketer has not been explored fully. Close examination of his voluminous business correspondence held in Unilever Archives is starting to reveal new insights into the influences on Lever’s approach and helping to explore whether he was merely an accomplished imitator, an original thinker or a skilful innovator. This paper will examine the techniques used by Lever to advertise and market his brands and argue that these were mostly drawn from examples already in use in America, as well as from other British entrepreneurs such as Thomas Barratt, managing director of A&F Pears, so that Lever’s key skill lay not in devising original ideas but in spotting someone else’s good idea and developing it.

William Hesketh Lever was born in 1851. In the same year the Great Exhibition was held, designed as a showcase for Britain’s manufacturing innovation, bringing the names of many brands to the public’s attention for the first time. Despite the advances of the industrial revolution however, in the late nineteenth century, most businesses, like his father’s wholesale grocery company where Lever started his career, were still family-run serving local markets. Very few were national and even fewer international, although Hannah (2007) believes that British firms were more global than their counterparts in other countries, even America, and Wilson (1957) and McKendrick (1960) argue that some small scale entrepreneurs were flourishing from the early years of the industrial revolution, in particular Wedgwood who was selling his goods globally in response to the growth of consumer demand for high quality products.

Notwithstanding the boom in advertising from the mid nineteenth century, soap manufacturers, according to Norris (1990), were slower than other producers to embrace the opportunity and, contrary to the popular image of Lever, he was not the first to develop marketing techniques to promote soap. The archives show that Thomas Barratt was using a wide range of publicity devices from the 1870s in Britain and overseas, including slogans and catchphrases, and endorsements by celebrities and medical practitioners, setting aside $35,000 in 1888 for American advertising. In comparison, the owners of Sapolio soap in New York were already spending $400,000 pa on advertising in 1896, a massive rise from $15,000 in 1871 (Norris, 1990). Barratt’s infamous use of fine art, starting with Bubbles, was copied by Lever, who purchased Frith’s New Frock only two years later. Barratt was influenced by the marketing techniques of American entrepreneurs like Benjamin Babbitt and the showmanship of PT Barnum, as was Thomas Lipton in developing his grocery business. At the same time, however, American culture was seen as a threat to language, values and traditions in Europe.

For Lever, however, America was the land of technical modernity. The archives reveal that much of his inspiration came from America through frequent visits and a constant supply of information from his staff there, as well as regular supplies of newspapers and periodicals. He made his first trip in 1888 using the opportunity to visit agencies to arrange the sale of Sunlight Soap and “to gain some idea of American selling and advertising methods, for, even then, advertising was taken more seriously in America, both by manufacturers and consumers, than it was in England” (Lever, 1927). Whilst there Lever bought the rights to an advertisement entitled “Why does a woman look old sooner than a man” from Frank Siddall, a Philadelphia soap manufacturer for £2,500 and changed it from a plain press advertisement to a more eye-catching one by adding an image and some colour.

Taking his lead from the toilet soap market, Lever’s great innovation was to sell, under a recognisable brand name, individually wrapped bars of household soap, previously sold in pieces cut from a large
block in the grocer’s. Within only seven years of Gair’s invention of the cardboard box, Sunlight was being packaged, with a reward offer of £1000 printed on the box to anyone finding any impurities in the soap. Sunlight also lathered better than its competitors, adding to its popularity. Lever Brothers expanded rapidly, developing 24 brands between 1893 and 1910 (Church and Clark, 2001), and establishing offices across the world. Lever also took full advantage of the recent Trade Marks Registration Act to defend his intellectual property vigorously from as early as 1885, marking him out as a more aggressive marketer than his peers.

This paper will also look at the reaction of other soapmakers, who saw Lever’s techniques as part of the incipient creep of Americanisation. They viewed with contempt his introduction of a scheme to exchange soap wrappers for gifts (first used in America in 1851), but were forced to follow suit or lose market share. As a result Lever’s relationship with the Soap Makers’ associations was often frosty and frequently at arms’ length. Lever’s correspondence demonstrates that he was constantly open to the idea of new technologies to improve his business and, that whilst he was a skilful innovator, he was also an original thinker and an accomplished imitator.

References: primary
Unilever Archives & Records Management, Unilever plc, Port Sunlight, Wirral, UK: Leverhulme Business Correspondence; Lever Brothers Ltd business records, including minute books, annual reports, in-house magazines and advertising; A&F Pears Ltd, advertising records; United Kingdom Soap Makers’ Association, minutes and correspondence; and Northern Soap Makers’ Association, minutes and correspondence
The Leverhulme Archive, Lever Family Estate Office, Thornton Hough, Wirral, UK: William Lever’s diaries

References: secondary
Blaszczyk, R.L. (2002), Imagining Consumers: design and innovation from Wedgwood to Corning, The Johns Hopkins University Press, Baltimore
Packard, V. (1957), The Hidden Persuaders, Longmans, London
Origin and Evolution of the Department Store, pre 1900s

Robert D. Tamilia
Honorary Professor of Marketing, School of Business, UQAM, Montreal, Canada

Introduction
Retailing has a long history and the department store is just one among other retail innovations that took place from the mid 1850s and beyond. Examples are magasins de nouveautés, the general store, mail order houses, the chain store, the supermarket, the discount store or the shopping mall, among others.

The department store presents a fascinating story especially its emergence during the second half of the 19th century. Notwithstanding the huge amount of published literature on the department store over the past decades, this paper adds but just another piece of the puzzle toward a better understanding of its history and contributions to our ever changing market economy. This innovative retail icon has contributed much to the way we shop today and how it changed numerous business practices. After more than 150 years of existence, this important retailing institution is now in the decline phase of its retail life cycle. There’s a need to look back and study how this icon of retailing first emerged where and why. Historical analysis of the department store has tended to narrow the focus on France, England, Germany, the U.S., and even Canada, but not so much on a cross continent approach.

The study of the historical development of the department store is an adventure into relatively unknown or unexplored territory, at least for the marketing discipline. The study of the department store requires the researcher to look at this retail institution in terms of how it came about, why, who were the major players, how it affected and how it was affected by society’s other social institutions, not only here but across continents as well. It behooves the retail historian to be aware of a literature that is often eclectic, esoteric, multidisciplinary, spread across continents, and available in many languages (mostly English, French, and German). It is similar to putting together a giant puzzle with tangential and missing pieces that complicate our understanding of the evolution of this important retail institution and its contributions to society.

Research Purpose
The paper presents new information sources that shed light on the emergence of this retail icon, pre 20th c. Previous definitional attempts of the department store have already been proposed in the literature (Tamilia and Reid 2007). A fortuitous result of this effort enables the paper to revise some of the arguments presented earlier that question the conventionally accepted wisdom of the store’s Parisian origin. The Parisian’s grands magasins, notably le Bon Marché, were not fully operational department stores, even before the 1870s. Going against this historical fait accompli in retailing is not an easy task, given its long acceptance in the literature.

Source Material
It is very demanding for historians to be aware of published material written in different languages across continents and over time. Yet some of that information would alter their hypothesis about the origin of the department store. There is a limit on the extent to which a researcher can access the vast literature published over decades, even in this age of the internet and availability of electronic data banks. Unlike other knowledge areas, historians, in general, are more likely to publish their findings in textbooks rather than in journal articles. This publishing tendency of the profession makes it more demanding for others to be apprised of many important historical research findings of the department store that are discussed often in only but a small part of a textbook, often less than a few pages.

I have found numerous instances of conflicting information, historical mistakes, errors of commission and errors of omission to the point that an understanding of the origin of the department store becomes confusing. It behooves the researcher to be extra vigilant when locating research material supporting some historical events or facts. The information provided in a text might be incomplete because the historian’s research interests might lie elsewhere. It is not a question stating unequivocally who was first but rather, how did a small retail store, precursor of the department store, morphed into a much larger store enough to be called a department store? In other words, what is so unique and particular about the
business model of the department store which is unlike other retail institutions? This business model is not static and needs to be fine tuned over time to respond to changes due to the vast assortment of goods offered. Modern store technologies need to be implemented to enable the store to be managed and organized accordingly.

Definitional Issues

The department store’s history is still unclear, at least to me, with competing explanations as to its origin. Its etymology is plagued by a plethora of terms used across many languages which can be confusing. For example, a department store has been called a bazaar, an emporium, a village shop, or a monster store by various authors. Some have called 19th c. arcades and even the 1851 Crystal Palace Exhibition as a department store. Some of the confusion is perhaps due to the terminology used across languages. For example, not all Parisian grands magasins are department stores but all department stores are big stores. Why did historians label le Bon Marché a department store, at least initially, rather than use another expression, such as a dry goods store, or simply a big store? The expression “department store” was first used in the literature in 1897, or almost a half a century after Parisian stores were labeled as such.

The French called it a grand magasin, often neglecting to add “de nouveautés” to the name. Yet the store signage often contained the later expression. Why is it that as early of 1853, Boucicaut’s Bon Marché was called a department store when Boucicaut had never worked for the store before? In fact, the Videau brothers owned and operated le Bon Marché since 1838 in the same location. Boucicaut became a partner only in 1853. Prior to his joining the store, he worked for other retail establishments and was even a traveling salesman in his younger years. When he partnered with the Videau brothers, the store was not even a dry goods store but a specialized store offering a narrow assortment of goods (Bourienne 1989). Similarly, Wanamaker’s Grand Depot was not even a dry goods store when it first opened in 1876 but a specialized clothing store for men’s clothing. It took some years for this store to morph from a specialty clothing store catering to men, then to women and kids, and by adding more merchandise for sale until it became a department store (Appel 1930).

A department store is a special kind of business model, one which deals with a vast assortment of merchandise offered for sale. But is this the only unique criterion that transforms a dry goods store or a magasin de nouveautés into a department store? There are many other criteria that need to be considered. If adding more merchandise for sale is the deciding criterion that defines a department store, then Amazon.com would need to be called a department store given the slogan of the “everything store”.

Miramas (1961) argued that Boucicaut was the first to organize his store by departments. Yet the literature reveals that management by departments already existed in dry goods stores long before, and in America no less (Hunt’s Merchants’ Magazine 1847). Yet, the department store has many other distinguishing features beyond the number of merchandise lines available. Other unique characteristics need to be explored in this paper ranging from distinguishing features in America no less (literature reveals that management by de

Selected References

Since the 1980s, scholarly work on great exhibitions and world expositions has flourished, with one historian recently calculating that an average of 63 works of “exposition studies” are published annually (Geppert, 2010). It has long been recognised that these events provide valuable insights into the development of modern consumer culture. Walter Benjamin’s observation that “world exhibitions were places of pilgrimage to the fetish commodity” and were instrumental in establishing “the universe of commodities” (Benjamin, 1939) paved the way for much future research. London’s Great Exhibition of 1851 has been identified as a milestone in the “spectacularization of the commodity”, creating new ways of representing goods — and new ways of looking at them — which would later be developed both by department stores and the advertising industry (Richards, 1991). Thereafter, Paris took the lead, and the Exposition Universelle of 1900 offered “a scale model of the consumer revolution”, appealing “to the fantasies of the consumer”, and presenting material goods as “focal points for desire” (Williams, 1982).

Unsurprisingly, these “mega-events”, as they have been dubbed, have commanded the lion’s share of academic attention (Roche, 2000). But they inspired hosts of smaller exhibitions which were popular and significant affairs in their own right. In 1908, the inaugural year of the Daily Mail’s Ideal Home Exhibition, Londoners could visit a remarkable variety of attractions, ranging from the Hungarian, Mexican, and the “Orient in London” exhibitions, to events devoted to cars, lace, postage stamps, tobacco, clothing, and toys, while confectioners’, grocers’, chemists’, and brewers’ exhibitions were also held (Ryan, 1995). Although some of these might sound like rather specialised affairs, such was the popularity of exhibitions that audiences were eclectic, with trade shows often “gatecrashed” by members of the public (Ryan, 1995). Stepping outside the realms of the “mega-events” thus provides an opportunity to examine the ways in which a wide variety of economic actors adopted the exhibition format to publicise themselves to a general audience. In the early twentieth century, companies were beginning to develop public relations strategies to counter growing criticism of corporate capitalism (Heller, 2016), and exhibitions should be seen as one of the most important interfaces between capitalism and the public.

Given its centrality to the development of consumer society, it is particularly significant that the advertising industry was part of the expository trend, staging major exhibitions in 1920, 1927, and 1933, after a series of smaller shows between 1899 and 1914. These events have suffered the general neglect from historians experienced by trade exhibitions more generally, with the only significant treatment to date by Stefan Schwarzkopf (2008). Just as one of the functions of the great expositions was to legitimise capitalism (Richards, 1991), so smaller trade exhibitions can be seen as legitimating devices, designed to convey particular messages to the public, and to confirm the status of the trade in question. Schwarzkopf gives a valuable account of these messages, and how they evolved over the interwar period. But he is principally interested in the exhibitions as one element in advertising’s wider efforts to promote itself in the early twentieth century, notably by means of publicity campaigns in newspapers and on the hoardings, and by annual conventions. There is scope to say more about the advertising exhibitions as distinct and, in some ways, unique forms of communication. As Peter Hoffenberg notes, exhibitions are interactive experiences, “public, mass-oriented, collective”, which were every bit as influential as shared reading experiences in moulding identities (2001). Their characteristic blend of education and entertainment is particularly important, for rather than a distraction from the educational message, the entertainments meant that the message could be communicated in innovative and compelling ways (Greenhalgh, 1988).

Much has been written about how commodities were made to come to life in the world fairs. But advertising had a problem when it came to exhibit: it did not produce commodities of its own, merely two-dimensional representations of them. Though the representations it produced helped to mould the desires and stimulate the fantasies of consumers, filling an exhibition hall with them would not suffice:
this would not be an exhibition, but a gallery. This paper explores how advertisers managed to convert advertising into three dimensions, highlighting the diverse ways in which organisers and the participants in these exhibitions found new symbolic methods of demonstrating advertising’s social, cultural, economic, and political importance: in other words, making advertising “come to life”.

Extensively researched using both the trade and the general press, the paper has three main sections. First, it examines how exhibitions legitimised branded goods. It was widely believed at the time that branding increased the price of goods, and that its main function was to thrust low-quality products onto the public. The exhibitions challenged these attitudes, encouraging people to view brands as a guarantee of quality, reliability, and economy. They had a range of methods to achieve this, from “pageants” of characters made famous by advertising, to the “Advertisers House”, crafted from and stocked entirely with advertised goods. Second, it examines how exhibitions worked hard to associate advertising with modernity, through the visual design of the exhibition space, and by presenting attractions like the “Shop of the Future”, which gave Londoners a chance to experience self-service shopping for the first time. Third, it explores how the exhibitions encouraged visitors to understand and appreciate the advertising industry by turning the hidden processes behind advertising into a spectacle, from the copywriters who wrote the persuasive appeals to the machinery which printed the newspapers.

Though reception is hard to recover through the existing sources, the advertising exhibitions attracted hundreds of thousands of visitors and were major spectacles. The paper assesses reasons for their popularity, and their complex and sometimes contradictory role in legitimising consumer culture. It argues that the exhibition form presented advertisers with a means of projecting a set of ideas, and encouraging a set of feelings, about advertising far more persuasively than could ever be achieved in the context of a newspaper article or indeed an advertisement. Yet exhibitions also threatened to display too much. Some industry insiders feared that inviting the public “behind the scenes” might weaken advertising’s effectiveness, concerns which may have contributed to the exhibition’s fall from favour after the 1930s. Though the advertising exhibition did not establish itself as an annual ritual in the way that rival attractions like the Ideal Home Exhibition did, by helping to insinuate advertising into British culture, and by influencing the look and feel of modern consumer landscapes, its impact should not be underestimated.

References
Hoffenberg, P.H. (2001), An empire on display: English, Indian, and Australian exhibitions from the Crystal Palace to the Great War, University of California Press, Berkeley and Los Angeles, California.
Marks and Spencer’s CSR Approach to Promotion of Healthy Eating

Yumiko Toda
College of Commerce, Nihon University, Japan,
John Dawson
The University of Edinburgh, U.K.

Extended abstract
This study examines the Corporate Social Responsibility (CSR) approach of Marks and Spencer (M&S) to tackle eating issues. CSR is quickly becoming common sense in many industries, and the question is not if a company will commit to CSR, but the type of CSR practices they will conduct as strategic actions, and the compatibility of value creation capacities of companies and CSR activities. After reporting a sharp fall in full-year profitability in 1999, M&S included CSR as part of its recovery plan and made all efforts to promote a new brand image as a CSR company under the well-known Plan A scheme. They have conducted a wide range of CSR activities aiming to accomplish customer satisfaction, improve environmental problems, contribute to local communities, and benefit their employees. For these efforts, M&S has received several CSR related awards and successfully established its reputation as a representative CSR company.

M&S’s CSR activities include many fields, and covering them all is beyond the scope of this study; therefore, we focus on a food related issue such as healthy eating. There are two reasons for selecting this issue among other CSR activities of M&S. First, the British government’s appeal to tackle diet related health problems to reduce national medical expenses, and an important aspect is the promotion of healthy eating. Second, the Department of Health (2005) argues that the food industry has a corporate social responsibility to promote healthy eating. In 1930s, Simon Marks, the son of the founder, built M&S into a British retailing icon, was influenced by Chaim Weizmann, the leader of the Zionism movement, and supported the idea of company as a community and corporate social responsibility. As early as the 1930s, he established M&S’s corporate identity as a retailer that contributes to customers and society. Subsequently, M&S enthusiastically conducted CSR activities such as supporting charities in local communities in the 1960s, and job training to reduce youth unemployment problems in the 1970s and 1980s. It was in 1974 when M&S used the term CSR in their annual report for the first time; however, its roots took hold in the 1930s.

Then, we illustrate M&S’s direction of CSR since the 2000s. After the company’s profits were reduced by about 50% in 1999, M&S focused on CSR as one of the main dimensions of their business strategy, and made a new start as a CSR company aiming to increase corporate value by solving environmental and social problems. In 2003, M&S organised a CSR committee, which was a board level corporate governance group to provide leadership on CSR. The committee developed a CSR framework and principles and initiated CSR activities. M&S published their first CSR Report the same year. Furthermore, it established a long-term CSR strategy known as Plan A in 2007, a 200 million GBP ‘eco plan’ with 100 commitments under five headings: climate change, waste, sustainable raw materials, fair partner, and health. Plan A was a 5-year plan at the time; however, M&S revised their
existing commitments and launched a new Plan A 2020 in 2014. We briefly overview their new CSR strategy outline, which began in the 2000s and continues today.

In the final section, we focus on M&S’s CSR activities in promoting healthy eating. We mention that M&S launched a ‘count on us’ healthy food range in 2005, which has low fat and low calories, and introduced the Eat Well sunflower label on food products in 2006 to help consumers choose foods that contribute to a balanced and nutritious diet. The logo complies with strict nutrition criteria and fits within the healthy eating guidelines of the British government’s Eat Well Guide. In January 2006, M&S launched the ‘Look behind the label’ marketing campaign designed to show how its products are sourced and produced in an ethical and responsible manner. This campaign not only aimed at healthy eating but also embraced fair trade in general, and included reducing salt content and calories in food products. In the early 2000s, M&S introduced several campaigns to promote healthy eating; however, after introducing Plan A in 2007, they have not tackled these food related issues in their CSR activities very enthusiastically. It seems that this problem is now at a lower priority level in their CSR scheme. We note that ‘health’ issues are not treated as important problems in Plan A in recent years, despite diet related problems being a significant social issue in the United Kingdom. The food business of M&S contributed to more than half their turnover and is the most important business unit today. They have marketed a healthier ready meal; however, the range and number of items remain limited thus far. If M&S focuses on developing healthier foods and promoting healthy eating habits, it will expand the emerging market of health-conscious consumers and contribute to achieving a dominant position in the market. M&S’s healthy food items will contribute in improving diet related problems create a major source of competitive advantage in their strategic CSR. We conclude that if M&S focuses on food related CSR, it can take full advantage of effective synergies with their food business.

References
Plate 1. White Bronze monument, Yarmouth, N.S.

Plate 2. Detail of monument showing customization plate

Plate 3. Monument dates to 1890

Women’s Advertising Club Newsletters: Building Communities of Practices and Instilling Club Philosophies

Jeanie Wills
Graham School of Professional Development, University of Saskatchewan, Canada

Abstract: This paper demonstrates how the newsletters produced by women’s advertising clubs in the early 20th century played a crucial role in developing and shaping advertising women’s professional identities by uniting women advertising practitioners into a professional discourse community.

Purpose – The research purpose of this article is to examine how women’s advertising clubs in the early 20th Century used their club newsletters to enculturate their members into the clubs’ professional discourse communities. In turn, the newsletters helped members construct and maintain professional identities. The first advertising club for women was the Women’s Advertising League of New York founded in 1912 with clubs for women springing up nationwide shortly thereafter. The Philadelphia Club began in 1916 and was a leader in advertising education for women as well as in other initiatives designed to benefit women’s professional practice and shore up their professional identities. These clubs aided the women in building professional networks, socializing the women into the trade of advertising through education designed by the clubs for their members, and teaching women how to both claim and demonstrate expertise. The advertising club newsletters were main contributors to building these professional discourse communities.

Design/methodology/approach - Archival sources and selected publications provide the material that will document and reconstruct the process of professional identity-building for ad-women working in the 1920s and 1930s, focusing especially on the Philadelphia Club of Advertising Women and its newsletter, Adland News.

Findings: The clubs’ newsletters combined conventional elements of a newsletter genre with personal news about members to create a community which helped women construct and express a professional identity.

Key Words. Women’s advertising clubs; Philadelphia Club of Advertising Women; Adland News; Newsletters; Professional discourse community; Communities of practice;

Paper Type: Research paper

Introduction

Far more than just social clubs, the women’s advertising clubs of the early 20th century gave women the opportunity to build networks, to learn how to position themselves as members of a specialized discipline, and to strengthen shared ideology and socialization processes. This research will focus on the Philadelphia Club of Advertising Women’s newsletter as representative of how the club newsletters engaged audiences in communities of practices which transformed members’ identities. According to Wenger, “collective learning results in practices that reflect both the pursuit of our enterprises and the attendant social relations. These practices are thus the property of a kind of community created over time by the sustained pursuit of a shared enterprise (1998, p. 45). The newsletter contributed to building a community of practice and, thus, to transforming identity.

Women’s advertising club membership was exclusive. Potential members had to provide references, be nominated for membership, and be approved by committee. The clubs required that their members be actively engaged in advertising practice, accepting only ad-women who worked in buying, selling, purchasing or creating advertising. The refused membership to clerical workers. While advertising practitioners were not accorded the same professional status as doctors, engineers, or lawyers who had a governing body that accredited them and monitored practices, the ad-women were practicing a “profession” in that they had to participate in specialized training. “‘Professional’ may include any individuals who have undergone some specialist training in the workplace” (Kong, 2014, p. 2). A crucial component of membership in a profession was the ability to adopt the discursive
practices that would mark them as members. Professional discourse is the “language produced by a professional with specialist training to get something done in the workplace” (Kong, 2014, p. 2). The ad-club newsletters reproduced professional discourse and modelled for the members how to communicate their professionalism. Communication occurs not only through discursive practices, but also through activities, for example, community involvement, educational activities, and sartorial practices. The newsletters communicated ideal professional behavior in all these areas through announcements about club activities in the community, identification of guest speakers, notices about courses available to or delivered by the members, and through photographs of members engaged in these practices.

The women’s advertising club newsletters were instrumental in building communities of practice which, in turn, contributed to transforming members’ identities as professional women and as club members. The newsletters helped create and sustain interconnection among women and between various clubs. They helped to negotiate the women’s professional identities in terms of membership in the social community of an advertising club. Finally, they enculturated the members into an “in group” of advertising professionals.

**Newsletters: Conventions of a genre**

Newspapers as a genre are designed to impart news of a community to its members. The women’s advertising clubs used newsletters to inform club members about historic activities and future events. The newsletters informed club members about upcoming events either for or of interest to club members. They announced opportunities, called for volunteers to sit on committees. They provided links to other national and international clubs, as well as announced news and professional development opportunities offered by the Advertising Federation of America, the nation’s advertising governing body. Furthermore, publications like *Adland* gave members experience as editors, news gatherers, and sales people who sold advertising space in the newsletters. Finally, the newsletters provided services of a personal nature uniting club members into a community by offering news and announcements about member’s lives including engagements, marriages, births, bereavements, and career moves. The newsletters announced who was having visitors from far away, who was going on holidays and to what locale. They celebrated anniversaries important to members such as years in the club and work anniversaries. Newsletters help to bind and unite a community and the ad-clubs’ newsletters were no different.

**Newsletters: An aid to building professional networks**

The women’s ad-club newsletters aimed to build professional networks among its members in a variety of ways. For example, the *Adland News* released the names of both proposed and new members. It offered luncheon committee reports that explained where the committee members met and what they accomplished. These announcements demonstrated how members were useful to the club’s overall mission of promoting advertising and advertising education but in turn how the club unified members to accomplish common causes. Aside from building alliances among members, the newsletters enabled members to develop professional contacts with women’s clubs in other cities, with members of the governing advertising federation, and with international members. For example, in the April/May 1936 *Adland News*, the editors announce the 32nd Annual convention of the Advertising Federation of America. They suggest how to travel, where to stay, and offer names of other women who are planning to attend. This announcement noted that the British Advertising Association has been invited as well as a delegation from continental Europe. The newsletters played a role in providing members with opportunities to widen their contacts in advertising both nationally and internationally thus contributing to the women’s knowledge of the breadth of the professional in which they worked.

**Newsletters: As vehicles to socialize and educate members**

Another significant function of the advertising club’s newsletter was to socialize members into implicit club philosophies. The newsletters helped to create and reinforce adherence to the values held by the clubs. For example, a 1935 *Adland* issue announced a performance of Anna Steese Richardson’s play called “Let’s Scrap it” performed by club members. The play dramatized arguments that responded to consumer movements that indicted advertising. The club’s involvement in mounting a production of the play gave both actors and audience members the opportunity to observe strategies to defend advertising. The PCAW’s involvement in radio plays were another way that its members were coached
to attitudes that reflected the club’s philosophies. The club started a radio program called “Famous Philadelphia Women of Yesteryear” which eventually expanded to become “Famous Women of Yesteryear” and included women from all over the country. The club members researched famous women’s lives, wrote scripts that dramatized those lives, and then voiced the plays. This radio series promoted women’s accomplishments and contributions to the life of the nation.

**Newsletters: Instruction in expertise**

Finally, the newsletters instructed members in avenues to claim expertise and competence. First, the topics the newsletters discussed helped members to understand how to build and demonstrate expertise and competence by participating in events that developed communities of practices. The newsletters of 1936 announced and promoted club members’ participation in giving talks about different elements of advertising on radio station WDAS.

The newsletters promoted the PCAW’s advertising courses, student successes, and faculty expertise. By April 1936, the club was celebrating its ninth anniversary of running advertising classes and *Adland News* announced, “Classes have concretized ideals and practical expression to further the study of advertising in all its branches;” the faculty has grown from ten instructors to forty, and “more than 500 young women have learned about advertising from us.” The newsletters publicized club achievements. At the same time this promotion revealed the characteristics of professional and successful women. A professional identity was realized through working in the advertising industry, demonstrating expertise publically, participating in club community activities, and championing other women’s careers.

**Conclusion**

Communities of practice are built informally and socially. Members are coached in practical skills necessary to build competence, in attitudes necessary to members to create success, and in subject matter and language necessary to join in community conversations. The women’s advertising newsletters integrated club members into communities of advertising practice by teaching them about the club’s mandates, the members’ interests and skills, and in how the members interacted publically to promote advertising.

**Bibliography**


Email Addresses for CHARM 2017
Authors and Participants

Aimé, Isabelle: i.aime@ipag.fr
Aramendia-Muneta, Maria Elena: elena.aramendia@unavarra.es
Arnberg, Klara: klara.arnberg@ekohist.su.se
Åström Rudberg, Elin: elin.astromrudberg@phdstudent.hhs.se
Barriga, Pablo: barriga_ortiz@wifa.uni-leipzig.de
Beard, Fred: fbeard@cox.net
Bendle, Neil: neilbendle@ivey.ca
Boespflug, Magali: magali.boespflug@univ-poitiers.fr
Branchik, Blaine: blaine.branchik@quinnipiac.edu
Brockhoff, Klaus: klaus.brockhoff@whu.edu
Buchwitz, Lilly: Lilly@Buchwitz.com
Carpenter, Marie: marie.carpenter@telecom-em.eu
Clampin, David: d.j.clampin@ljmu.ac.uk
Crawford, Robert: robert.crawford@rmit.edu.au
Das, Roshni: f14roshndiidmri.ac.in
Farah, Maya: mfarah@lau.edu.lb
Fox, Karen: kfox@scu.edu
Gladden, Graham: g.p.gladden@ljmu.ac.uk
Hawkins, Richard: r.a.hawkins@wlv.ac.uk
Hayes, Mick: mick.hayes@port.ac.uk
Ingene, Charles: caingene@ou.edu
Iyer, Gopalkrishnan: geyer@fau.edu
Jackowski, Mick: mjackows@msudenver.edu
Jones, Brian: bjon@quinnipiac.edu
Kalamas Hedden, Maria: mkalamas@kennesaw.edu
Karababa, Eminegul: eminegul@metu.edu.tr
Keep, William: keep@tcnj.edu
Kopp, Steve: skopp@uark.edu
Lakomaa, Erik: erik.lakomaa@hhs.se
Laporte, Marie-Eve: laporte.iae@univ-paris1.fr
Larsen, Val: larsenwv@jmu.edu
Liebrenz-Himes, Marilyn: liebrenz@gwu.edu
Macarlan, Pauline: pauline.macarlan@rhul.ac.uk
Martin, Charles: charles.martin@wichita.edu
Mazieres, Bruno: bruno.mazieres@unilim.fr
McMullan, Anthony: tony@truck-industry-council.org
Medi, Nour: nour.mehdi@lau.edu
Minowa, Yuko: ykmn@gmail.com
Mollanger, Thomas: thomas.mollanger@gmail.com
Neilson, Leann: leann.neilson@carleton.ca
Nixon, Sean: snixon@essex.ac.uk
Ohmer, Susan: sohmer@nd.edu
Okamoto, Keiko: okamoto@keiko@gmail.com
Petty, Ross: petty@babson.edu
Pressey, Andrew: a.pressey@bham.ac.uk
Raven, Krystl: krystl.raven@usask.ca
Risdwiyanto, Andriya: andriyarsidwiyanto@gmail.com
Sanghvi, Minita: msan@skidmore.edu
Sinclair, John: j.sinclair@unimelb.edu.au
Skreekumar, Hari: hari@iimtrichy.ac.in
Strickland, Jeannette: Jeannette.Strickland@liverpool.ac.uk
Tamilia, Robert: rtamilia@yahoo.com
Taylor, James: james.taylor@lancaster.ac.uk
Toda, Yumiko: yuming0713@me.com
Van den Bossche, Astrid: astrid.vandenbossche@sbs.ox.ac.uk
Vander Nat, Peter: pnwvdn@verizon.net
Wachholz, Jacqueline: j.reid@duke.edu
Wills, Jeanie: jeanie.wills@usask.ca
Witkowski, Terrence: witko@csulb.edu
Zuckerman, Mary Ellen: mzuckerman@brockport.edu